Illuminating Irish American Identity: Harry Clarke Stained Glass Studios' Ecclesiastical Commissions in the USA c.1950 - 1970

Ph. D.

2023

Paul Donnelly

Volume 1

I declare that this thesis has not been submitted as an exercise for a degree at this or any other university and it is entirely my own work.

I agree to deposit this thesis in the University's open access institutional repository or allow the Library to do so on my behalf, subject to Irish Copyright Legislation and Trinity College Library conditions of use and acknowledgement.

I do not consent to the examiner retaining a copy of the thesis beyond the examining period, should they so wish (EU GDPR May 2018).

Signed:

Tá an tráchtas seo tiomnaithe do m’athair John Donnelly (1930 – 2022)
‘Fear uasal agus Scoláire’

Summary

Clarke Studios was established in 1930 and operated as a business making stained glass for more than forty years after the death of its founder, the artist and illustrator Harry Clarke (1889 – 1931). In that period windows were made for clients worldwide, the majority of which (more than six hundred) were executed for clients in the United States. Research into the Clarke Studios business archive reveals that the primary source of patronage was a cohort of Irish American priests who were building new churches in the 1950s and '60s. This thesis focuses primarily on the cluster observed in California where the majority (more than four hundred) of the windows made by Clarke Studios exist.

Further research revealed that the achievement of this degree of patronage relied on two related endeavours - the push by the Clarke Studios to enlarge its business reach and the pull by Irish American Catholic clergy who wanted Irish artworks in their church buildings. This discovery determined the high-level goals of this research, namely, how Clarke Studios operated as a business to sell and deliver their work to patrons in the United States, what was the extent of the stained glass commissions, and why did patrons want Irish stained glass in their churches.

The company built on the Harry Clarke 'brand' and although they promoted their work through advertising and direct contact with prospective clients, their greatest selling point was already-installed stained glass work which was promoted by existing clients. The company's manager William Dowling fostered good relations with patrons, and a number of these became the Clarke Studios greatest allies in winning new orders.

The core subject of this research relates to the meaning that can be found in the commissions – why patrons chose Irish stained glass. The study takes a joint material culture and art-historical approach to examine how Irishness and Catholicism was expressed by a segment of Irish Americans through the display of Irish-made art objects in their religious buildings. Investigating the subject through the lens of material culture provides a framework to study the windows as objects representing the aspirations of Irish American

clergy in the period. The art-historical lens examines the style and content of the windows to determine the aesthetic achievements of the artists and the extent of visual expressions of Irishness in the finished work.

This thesis argues that the choice of Clarke Studios as a supplier was driven by two main aspirations. Firstly, the desire of patrons to enhance an aspect of the Irish American cultural identity by having high quality Irish craft on display in their churches which would enhance the standing of Catholic Irish Americans in society. These finely produced Clarke Studios windows were indicative of the sophisticated capabilities of Irish artists in terms of style, erudition and complexity, and this was presented as reflecting one cultured aspect of Irishness. The second aspiration was more nationalistic, where patrons wished to support Ireland economically by buying Irish-made products, thus creating income for Irish craftspeople. Detailed case studies in this thesis present evidence which illustrate these differing motivations for a representative number of commissions.

Overall, this thesis demonstrates that Clarke Studios was commissioned because of the patrons Irish connections which they sought to reference through the integration of Irish visual and material culture into church buildings using the medium of stained glass. This enabled them to include symbols of their Irish heritage in everyday American life, signifying the agency this segment of the Irish diaspora had achieved in American society.

The findings of this enquiry have created new insights into the history of Irish craft and its role in Irish American history. The results highlight a new international dimension of Irish art history and how, with the resurgence of stained glass making in Ireland from the early decades of the twentieth century, the quality of Irish craft held its own on a global stage. The research also enlightens aspects of the making and meaning of this Irish craft. It shows that for a cohort of Irish American priests it was a valued way of making a positive and affirming statement about what it was to be Irish in twentieth-century America.

Acknowledgements

I am indebted to a number of people and institutions who have helped me during this research project. My supervisor Dr Angela Griffith has not only advised and challenged me for the past two years, but has also been responsible for encouraging my interest in the study of art history for more than a decade. I would also like to thank my supervisor for the first half of the project, Dr Yvonne Scott. These two women brought different, but complementary, perspectives to the research, which is reflected in the final work. Through the course of my research a number of colleagues at TRIARC, the Department of History of Art and Architecture and the wider TCD community have been very helpful in terms of sharing resources and ideas related to the topic. I would like to thank in particular Dr Aoife Brady and Dr William Shortall who have been very supportive at different stages of the project. I would also like to acknowledge the work of the staff at the Department of Manuscripts and Archives in TCD in their role as custodians of the Clarke Studios archive. A number of individuals have generously shared their time and their knowledge about the work and operation of Clarke Studios. I would especially like to acknowledge the support of Mary Clarke (R.I.P.) and other members of the Clarke Family. Thank you also to the many people who have shared photographs of the Clarke Studios work. I would also like to thank the Terra Foundation for American Art and the Thomas Dammann Junior Memorial Trust who provided financial support for my research in the United States, and Rita Spillane in Sacramento for her generosity. Finally, without the practical and emotional support from my family this thesis could not have been completed. Thank you Helen, Sinéad, Aisling and Róisín, I share this accomplishment with you all.

Completing this research has been an eventful journey, dealing with illness, the COVID-19 pandemic and bereavement. Having the support of friends, colleagues and family has made that journey possible. It has been a highly rewarding experience from which I have gained a great deal in terms new knowledge, new friendships both professional and personal, new skills, new interests and a deeper understanding of what it is to be Irish.

Table of Contents

Summary 4
Acknowledgements 6
Abbreviations 10
List of Illustrations 11
Introduction 16
1. Research Goals and Approach 20
1.1. Research Goals 20
1.1.1. Review of Current Literature 20
1.1.2. Research Aims 23
1.1.3. Scope of Research Questions 23
1.1.4. Central Research Questions 24
1.2. Research Approach 26
1.2.1. Theoretical Framework 26
1.2.2. Research Structure 38
1.2.3. Research Sources 40
1.2.4. Methodological Approach 44
1.3. Thesis Structure 46
1.4. Note on the Clarke Studios Correspondence 48
2. Clarke Studios 50
2.1. Introduction 50
2.2. Part One – Clarke Studios as a Business 53
2.2.1. Background and Early Years 53
2.2.2. Harry Clarke's Influence and Style 56
2.2.3. Case Study 1, Part 1 - Harry Clarke Vs Clarke Studios Style 70
2.2.4. Walter and Harry Clarke's Directorship of the Business 78
2.2.5. Managing the Business after Clarke's Death 82
2.2.6. Studios Organisation and Personnel 88
2.3. Part Two – The Clarke Studios Work in the United States 95
2.3.1. The Harry Clarke Factor 95
2.3.2. The Clarke Studios Style 97
2.3.3. Case Study 1, Part 2 - Harry Clarke Vs Clarke Studios Style 102
2.3.4. Company Name 110
2.3.5. Advertising, Promotion and State Support 111

2.3.6. Winning Orders 124
2.3.7. The Competition for Commissions 128
2.3.8. Executing Commissions for the United States 133
2.4. Part Three – Demand Drops – The Final Years 145
2.4.1. Sales Visit to United States 1968 145
2.4.2. Stained Glass Demand in Ireland 153
2.4.3. Studios Closure 158
2.5. Chapter Conclusion 159
3. Patronage – The Demand for Irish Stained Glass in the U.S.A. 163
3.1. Introduction 163
3.2. Catholicism in the United States 164
3.2.1. Catholicism in Nineteenth Century America 165
3.2.2. Growth in American Catholicism in the Twentieth Century 168
3.2.3. The Demand for Priests and Religious 169
3.2.4. Parish Building 174
3.2.5. Choosing Irish craft 180
3.3. Initial Clarke Studios Commissions 190
3.3.1. Sacred Heart, Sacramento 191
3.3.2. St Brigid's, San Francisco 195
3.3.3. St Ambrose, Los Angeles 196
3.3.4. St John's Seminary, Camarillo 200
3.4. Progression of Commissions 201
3.4.1. Sacramento Diocese 201
3.4.2. San Francisco Diocese 205
3.4.3. Los Angeles Diocese 208
3.5. Chapter Conclusion 223
4. Meaning in Stained Glass 227
4.1. Introduction 227
4.2. Irish Immigration in the Nineteenth Century 229
4.3. Irish Americans in the Twentieth Century 235
4.3.1. Common Bonds 235
4.3.2. Changes in American Society 236
4.3.3. Post World War II Opportunities 242
4.3.4. The Irish in Public Life 246
4.3.5. Portrayal of Irish in Popular Media and Culture 248

4.3.6. Ireland on Display at World's Fairs 252
4.3.7. Twentieth Century Irish Americans - Summary 284
4.4. Expression of Irishness in Stained Glass 285
4.4.1. Church-Building as a Cultural Expression of Irish Identity 286
4.4.2. Irish Arts and Crafts Movement 289
4.4.3. Finding the Meaning in Commissions 291
4.4.4. Case Study 2 – St Brigid's San Francisco 293
4.4.5. Case Study 3 – St Timothy's Los Angeles 301
4.4.6. Case Study 4 – Mary Star of the Sea, San Pedro 315
4.4.7. Comparison with other Commissions 324
4.5. Chapter Conclusion 325
Conclusion 327
Bibliography 343
Primary Sources 343
Secondary Sources 345

Abbreviations

CRO	Companies Registration Office
CTT	Córas Tráchtála Teoranta (The Irish Export Board)
DATI	Department of Agriculture and Technical Instruction for Ireland
DMSA	Dublin Metropolitan School of Art
MS(S)	Manuscript(s)
MSGR	Monsignor
NAI	National Archives of Ireland
NLI	National Library of Ireland
RDS	Royal Dublin Society
SGAA	Stained Glass Association of America
SS	Saints
TCD	Trinity College Dublin
TRIARC	Trinity Irish Art Research Centre

List of Illustrations

All images by Paul Donnelly unless otherwise stated.

Figure 1. Locations of Clarke Studios stained glass in the U.S.A. and Canada. (Map data copyright Google 2022).

Figure 2. Locations of Clarke Studios stained glass in the Greater Los Angeles area. (Map data copyright Google 2022).

Figure 3. Clarke Studios, *St Patrick* 1950 (detail), St Ambrose Church, Los Angeles, CA.

Figure 4. Joshua Clarke & Sons, *Sacred Heart* 1908, St Patrick's Church, Ballyhaunis, Mayo. (Image: McLaughlin Studios).

Figure 5. Harry Clarke, *The Unhappy Judas* 1913, Collins Barracks, Dublin.

Figure 6. Harry Clarke, *Visitation* 1924, Balbriggan, Co. Dublin.

Figure 7. Harry Clarke, *St Stephen* 1922, Gorey, Co. Wexford.

Figure 8. Joshua Clarke & Sons, *St Columbkille* (design), Our Lady, Star of the Sea Church, Sandymount, Dublin. (TCD Library).

Figure 9. Harry Clarke, *St Colmcille* 1915, Honan Chapel, Cork. (Image:

Jozef Vrtiel).

Figure 10. Harry Clarke, *St Brendan* (Judas panel) 1916, Honan Chapel, Cork.

Figure 11. Images and description of Harry Clarke work in Roulin, *Modern Church Architecture* (1947). (Source: https://archive.org/).

Figure 12. Quote from Roulin on Clarke Studios advertising leaflet.

Figure 13. Harry Clarke, *The Blessed Virgin in Glory* 1923, St Josephs, Terenure, Dublin. (Image: Jozef Vrtiel).

Figure 14. Harry Clarke, *The Blessed Virgin in Glory* 1923 (detail Blessed Virgin).

Figure 15. Harry Clarke, *The Blessed Virgin in Glory* 1923 (detail, Judith).

Figure 16. Harry Clarke, *The Blessed Virgin in Glory* 1923 (detail, *Adam and Eve*).

Figure 17. Colwyn Morris, *The Miracle at Cana* 1965, St Edwards Church, Seattle. (TCD Library).

Figure 18. Glazier in Harry Clarke Studios glazing shop leading a window. (TCD Library).

Figure 19. Clarke Studios, *Eucharist* and *Confession* 1962, St Elizabeth's Church, San Francisco.

Figure 20. William Dowling, *Work and Play* 1959, Drimoleague Catholic Church, Cork.

Figure 21. William Dowling, *Joyful Mysteries of the Rosary* 1955, Chapel of the Dominican Sisters of the Perpetual Rosary, Lancaster, PA. (Image: Mary Donnelly).

Figure 22. William Dowling, *Presentation in the Temple* 1938, Dominican Convent, Wicklow.

Figure 23. William Dowling, *Child of Prague* 1969, Mary Star of the Sea Church, San Pedro, CA.

Figure 24. William Dowling, *Crucifixion* 1970, Our Lady of Guadalupe Church, La Habra, CA.

Figure 25. William Dowling, *Immaculate Conception* 1940, Holy Ghost Fathers, Kimmage, Dublin.

Figure 26. William Dowling, *Immaculate Conception* 1955 (design), St Brigid's Church, San Francisco, CA. (TCD Library).

Figure 27. William Dowling, *Immaculate Conception* 1955, St Brigid's Church, San Francisco, CA. (Image: Finmata).

Figure 28. William Dowling, border detail, St Brigid's Church, San Francisco, CA. (Image: Finmata).

Figure 29. Terence Clarke *Immaculate Conception* 1965, Immaculate Conception Church, Sacramento, CA.

Figure 30. Clarke Studios advertisement in *Capuchin Annual 1958*.

Figure 31. Clarke Studios design on cover of St Ambrose booklet, Los Angeles, CA. booklet.

Figure 32. Clarke Studios promotional leaflet, 1953.

Figure 33. Richard King, *Our Lady of Sorrows* 1938, Sacred Heart Church, Sacramento, CA.

Figure 34. Photograph of Ecclesiastical Exhibition 1959. (TCD Library).

Figure 35, Earley & Co., *Crucifixion,* c*.* 1960s, Mount Argus Church, Dublin. (Image: Parish website).

Figure 36, Earley & Co., *Assumption,* 1955, Basilica of St John the Baptist, St Johns, Newfoundland. (Image: Parish website).

Figure 37, Watson & Co., *Our Lady of Lourdes*, 1944, St Patrick's Church, Millstreet, Cork. (Image: Patrick Comerford).

Figure 38, Watson & Co., *St Ita*, 1944, St Ita's Church, Gortroe, Cork. (Image: Cork Churches website).

Figure 39, Clokey & Co., *Christ with Youth*, 1950, St Columb's Cathedral, Derry. (Image: Andreas F. Borchert).

Figure 40, Clokey & Co., *Elisha with his Servant at Dothan*, 1945, St Augustine's Church, Derry. (Image: Andreas F. Borchert).

Figure 41, Clokey & Co., *Christ as Young Man and Christ as Adult* (detail), c. 1956, Fisherwick Presbyterian Church, Belfast. (Image: Church website).

Figure 42. Gabriel Loire, *Trinity, Crucifixion* 1965, St Patricks College Chapel, Drumcondra, Dublin. (Image: Archiseek).

Figure 43. Joseph Tierney, *St Patrick* 1940s, St John's seminary, Camarillo CA. (Image: https://stjohnsem.edu/main-chapel).

Figure 44. Richard King *St Margaret Mary* 1931 (pencil design and colour sketch), Sacred Heart Church, Sacramento, CA. (TCD Library).

Figure 45. William Dowling, *St Ambrose* 1951, St Ambrose Church, Los Angeles, CA.

Figure 46. Terence Clarke, *Our Lady of Knock* 1962, St Elizabeth's Church, San Francisco, CA.

Figure 47. William Dowling, *Our Lady of Knock* 1956, Knock Church, Mayo.

Figure 48. Glass painter at work in Clarke Studios. (TCD Library).

Figure 49. Terence Clarke, *Solomon Dedicates the Temple* 1960, Church of St Andrew Memorial, London, Ontario. (Image: Rev. Marty Levesque).

Figure 50. Terence Clarke, *Resurrection* 1955, St Anthony's Church, Long Beach, CA.

Figure 51. Terence Clarke, *Ascension* 1955, St Anthony's Church, Long Beach, CA.

Figure 52. William Dowling, *New Jerusalem* 1953, St Mary's Mausoleum, Sacramento, CA.

Figure 53. György Kepes, East Window 1968, Cathedral of St Mary of the Assumption, San Francisco, CA. (Image: Finmata).

Figure 54. Helen Moloney, *St Brendan* 1964, Star of the Sea Church, Desertgeney, Donegal. (Image: Inishowen News).

Figure 55. Sheila Corcoran, *Stations of the Cross* 1964, Our Lady Queen of Heaven Church, Dublin.

Figure 56. Exterior 1967, Church of the Annunciation, Finglas, Dublin.

Figure 57. Interior 1970, Church of the Holy Spirit Greenhills, Dublin.

Figure 58. Chancel window 1967, Cathedral of St Mary and St Anne, Cork.

Figure 59. West window 1967, Cathedral of St Mary and St Anne, Cork.

Figure 60. William Dowling, *Flight into Egypt* 1970, Our Lady of Guadalupe Church, La Habra, CA.

Figure 61. Richard King, *St Patrick* 1932, Sacred Heart Church, Sacramento, CA.

Figure 62. Interior with St Patrick window in top-centre, Sacred Heart Church, Sacramento, CA. (Image: Karl Vostrez).

Figure 63. Clarke Studios, *Christ with Children* 1953, St Ambrose Church, Los Angeles, CA.

Figure 64. Terence Clarke, *Resurrection* 1953, Carnew Church, Wexford.

Figure 65. Richard King, *Ireland's Homage* 1939, St John's Seminary, Camarillo, CA.

Figure 66. William Dowling, *Bishop Coat of Arms* 1950, St Mary's Mausoleum, Sacramento, CA.

Figure 67. William Dowling, *Chartres Madonna* 1952, St Mary's Mausoleum, Sacramento, CA.

Figure 68. Interior, Our Lady of Mercy convent Chapel, Auburn, CA.

Figure 69. Clarke Studios, *Works of Mercy* 1952, Our Lady of Mercy Convent Chapel, Auburn, CA.

Figure 70. Max Ingrand, *Christ Sends out Apostles* 1961, former diocesan seminary, Orangevale, CA. (Image: John Boll).

Figure 71. Clarke Studios, *Symbols of the Passion* 1953, St Agnes Church, San Francisco, CA.

Figure 72. Earley & Co., *Madonna and Child* c. 1950s, St Agnes Church, San Francisco, CA.

Figure 73. Terence Clarke, *SS Francis and Jude* 1961, St Elizabeth's Church, San Francisco, CA.

Figure 74. Interior, St Elizabeth's Church, San Francisco, CA.

Figure 75. Interior, St Timothy's Church, Los Angeles, CA.

Figure 76. Clarke Studios, *Ascension, SS Philip and John* 1959, St Timothy's Church, Los Angeles, CA.

Figure 77. Terence Clarke, *Resurrection* 1955, St Anthony's Church, Long Beach, CA.

Figure 78. Terence Clarke, *Immaculate Conception* 1956, Immaculate Conception Church, Monrovia, CA.

Figure 79. David Clarke, *St Thomas* 1957, Immaculate Conception Church, Monrovia, CA.

Figure 80. David Clarke, *St Augustine and Saints* 1957, St Augustine's Church, Culver City, CA.

Figure 81. Exterior, St Augustine's Church, Culver City, CA. (Image: Parish website).

Figure 82. Chancel, Mary Star of the Sea Church, San Pedro, CA.

Figure 83. Terence Clarke, *Miraculous Draught of Fishes* 1959, Mary Star of the Sea Church, San Pedro, CA.

Figure 84. K*illing the Goose That Laid the Golden Egg, by Thomas Nast, 18 November 1871. Harper's Weekly. (Image: Museum of Fine Art Houston via public domain license).*

Figure 85. Irish Village entrance, World's Columbian Exposition 1893, Chicago, (Source: Frank Day Robinson, Huntington Library).

Figure 86. Irish lace, crochet and needlepoint displayed at St Louis World's Fair 1904. In Irish Industrial Exhibition World's Fair St Louis 1904 Handbook Part II.

Figure 87. Views of Irish Industrial Exhibition Chicago World's Fair 1933.

Figure 88. Official World's Fair Pictorial Map (detail). (Image: David Rumsey Map Collection).

Figure 89. Exterior, Irish Trade Pavilion, New York World's Fair 1939. (Image: New York Public Library Collection).

Figure 90. Sean Keating mural for Irish Trade Pavilion, New York World's Fair 1939. (Image: Gandon Editions).

Figure 91. Earley & Co, *Annunciation* 1939, St John's Seminary Camarillo, CA.

Figure 92. Irish Craftworkers, *SS Brigid, Patrick and Colmcille* 1939, St John's Seminary Camarillo, CA.

Figure 93. Richard King, *Madonna and Child* 1939. (photograph of design). (TCD Library).

Figure 94. Archbishop Cantwell visits Irish exhibit at New York World's Fair, 1940. (National Catholic Welfare Conference News Service, June 1940).

Figure 95. Sample of script from Margaret Stokes *Early Christian Art in Ireland* (1894).

Figure 96. An example of a Dun Emer tufted rug. (Image: Adams Auctioneers).

Figure 97. Seamus Murphy, *St Brigid*, St Brigid's Church, San Francisco, CA. (Image: https://www.hungryones.com/).

Figure 98. Sanctuary with Dun Emer carpet, St Brigid's Church, San Francisco, CA. (Image: Finmata).

Figure 99. Clarke Studios, *St Brigid* 1948, St Brigid's Church, San Francisco, CA. (Image: Finmata).

Figure 100. Clarke Studios, *St Mel* 1948, St Brigid's Church, San Francisco, CA. (Image: Finmata).

Figure 101. William Dowling, *Coronation of the Virgin* 1951, St Brigid's Church, San Francisco, CA. (TCD Library).

Figure 102. Interior, St Brigid's Church, San Francisco, CA. (Image: Finmata).

Figure 103. Altar and reredos, St Timothy's Church, Los Angeles, CA. (Image: Robert Greer).

Figure 104. William Dowling, Terence Clarke, *Blessed Virgin, St Joseph* 1951, Church of St Francis, Cork.

Figure 105. William Dowling, *Annunciation* 1953, St Timothy's Church, Los Angeles, CA.

Figure 106. Terence Clarke, *Annunciation*, 1967, St Louis Church, Waco, TX. (Image: Foster Stained Glass).

Figure 107. Terence Clarke, *Our Lady of Guadalupe* 1957, St Timothy's Church, Los Angeles, CA.

Figure 108. Clarke Studios, *St Junipero Sera*, St Timothy's Church, Los Angeles, CA.

Figure 109. Terence Clarke, *Symbols of the Evangelists* 1956, St Timothy's Church, Los Angeles, CA.

Figure 110. Terence Clarke, *SS Fachtna, Patrick, Finbarr* 1956, St Timothy's Church, Los Angeles, CA.

Figure 111. Terence Clarke, chancel windows 1959, Mary Star of the Sea Church, San Pedro, CA.

Figure 112. Interior, Mary Star of the Sea Church, San Pedro, CA.

Figure 113. Terence Clarke, *St George* 1959, Mary Star of the Sea Church, San Pedro, CA.

Figure 114. William Dowling, *St Brigid* 1960, Mary Star of the Sea Church, San Pedro, CA.

Figure 115. Prayer card for Mother Cabrini.

Figure 116. Clarke Studios, *Mother Cabrini* 1960, Mary Star of the Sea Church, San Pedro, CA.

Introduction

In 1930 Harry Clarke (1889 – 1931), recognised as one of Ireland's leading artists of the early twentieth century, renamed the church decoration and stained glass making firm he had inherited from his father as 'Harry Clarke Studios'.[1] In a relatively short career of a little more than fifteen years, Clarke had achieved a significant international reputation as a book illustrator and was one of Ireland's most celebrated stained glass artists.[2] One of his ambitions for Clarke Studios was to expand his reputation in stained glass beyond Ireland and Britain to achieve international recognition for same.[3]

Although Clarke died in January 1931, during his lifetime and after, Clarke Studios became one of the most important Irish art businesses in the twentieth century, producing hundreds of stained glass windows for patrons in Ireland and overseas.[4] The company continued to operate under the same name for more than forty years after Clarke's death making work which was regarded by its clients as being distinctive, of high quality and a testament to the artistic legacy of its founder.[5] Furthermore, as the company's orders outside Ireland grew, Clarke's desire to make the stained glass work of Clarke Studios known internationally was realised.[6] This was achieved under the stewardship of the company's board and William Dowling (1907 – 1980), the manager of the business for more than thirty years. Dowling was a key

[1] In 1921 Harry Clarke and his brother Walter (1887 – 1930) inherited the Stained Glass and Church Decoration business 'Joshua Clarke and Sons' from their father who had established the business in Dublin in 1886. In 1930 the company split with Harry taking over the stained glass production and Walter taking over church decoration. The full name of the new stained glass company was Harry Clarke Stained Glass Limited, which became more commonly known as 'Harry Clarke Studios', sometimes shortened to 'Clarke Studios'. In this thesis 'Clarke Studios' will be used.

[2] Clarke's first stained glass commissions were for the Honan Chapel, Cork in 1915.

[3] Paul Donnelly, 'Legacy and Identity: Harry Clarke, William Dowling and the Harry Clarke Studios', in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds.) *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish state* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019), 305.

[4] Information relating to orders is collected from the Harry Clarke Studios Order Book, TCD MS 6060, and various items of correspondence sent by the Clarke Studios, held in TCD MSS 6001 – 6038.

[5] This testimony, which will be elaborated on in this thesis, is drawn from the company's correspondence records held in the Harry Clarke Studios business archive at TCD Library.

[6] Stained glass by the Clarke Studios is installed in locations in Australia, Britain, Canada, Kenya, New Zealand, Nigeria, South Africa, Trinidad the United States and Zambia. The destination of each order is taken from the Clarke Studios Order Book TCD MS 6060 and from various items of correspondence.

figure involved in the history of Clarke Studios, having a central role in terms of dealing with the complexities of the business.[7]

Clarke Studios was a family business. Harry Clarke's widow Margaret, his two sisters Florence and Kathleen and two of his children, Ann and David, made up the membership of the board of the company.[8] All financial matters and items of business significance were dealt with by the board.

A significant portion of the business archive of Clarke Studios is held in the Library of Trinity College Dublin.[9] Items held include drawings and plans, details of orders and sales, correspondence sent and received by the company, photographs of designs and stained glass windows, and miscellaneous printed material either produced by the firm such as advertising leaflets or used by them such as images of religious works of art.

An initial examination of the company's order books and correspondence by the author showed that while Clarke Studios was moderately successful at finding commissions during the 1930s and 1940s (mainly in Ireland and Britain) it was primarily overseas orders which kept the company in business between 1950 and 1970. In that period an estimated thirty-five percent of the commissions (by volume) received for stained glass came from clients in Ireland.[10] In the same period fifteen percent of the company's commissions came from overseas locations such as Australia, New Zealand, Africa and the Britain.[11] The remaining fifty percent of the Clarke Studios' business came from United States and it is an investigation of this phenomenon that is the subject of this research.

The Clarke Studios archive held in TCD Library reveals timescales, sequencing and the geographic spread of commissions received by the

---

[7] Dowling role will be described further in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*).
[8] Margaret Clarke until her death in 1961 and Kathleen Clarke until her death in 1965. Ann, David and Kathleen were shareholders until the company closed in 1973. Companies Registration Office records, National Archives of Ireland, CRO 2013/80/172.
[9] Some of the material was donated to Trinity College Library by the Clarke family in 1973 and other items were acquired by the Library from Harry Clarke's son David Clarke in October 2002.
[10] These statistics on commissions extracted from TCD Library documents relating to Costing and Sales - MS 6074, MS 6075, MS 6076, MS 6079 and multiple correspondence records from the period 1950 to 1970.
[11] Ibid.

company. Information in the archive indicates that the first United States commission received by Harry Clarke was for nine chancel windows in the Catholic church of St. Vincent DePaul in Bayonne, New Jersey in 1929.[12] In May 1931 a commission was received for two windows in the Sacred Heart Church, Sacramento, California.[13] Work for these sites continued on an ad-hoc basis until the mid-1940s but did not lead to other U.S. commissions at the time. Clarke Studios exhibited work in the Irish Industrial and Trade Pavilion at the 1939 World's Fair in New York, from which it was hoped that further interest in their stained glass would emerge. However, it was not until the post-World War II period when a large growth of Catholic church-building occurred in the United States that the company received a significant number of orders from a variety of locations across the country. The most prolific period for Clarke Studios was during the 1950s and 1960s when over six hundred windows were commissioned for thirty-four sites in North America (figure 1). The majority of these were for locations on the West Coast, with other commissions coming from locations in New York, New Jersey and Texas.

This thesis focuses primarily on the group observed in California where more than four hundred windows are installed in three clusters of locations - Sacramento, San Francisco and Los Angeles (figure 2). A number of Catholic churches in these cities have full schemes of Studios windows made by Clarke Studios, for example, St. Timothy's parish church in Los Angeles which has sixty windows on site, and the Sacred Heart Church in Sacramento in which all twenty-one windows on display are made by the company.[14] The availability of a rich source of contextual information about these commissions in the Clarke Studios archive makes this group in California a good choice for study as it offers the opportunity to analyse in detail a region with a high concentration of installed work, and where Clarke Studios were in competition with other stained glass makers, both American and European, for business.

The overall purpose of this research is to analyse and explain this heretofore neglected phenomenon of artistic endeavour which developed and made the

[12] TCD MS 6060 Orderbook 1926 – 1950.
[13] Ibid.
[14] A full list of locations discovered in California is given in Appendix 1.

most of existing links between Ireland, the Irish diaspora and the Catholic Church in the United States in the twentieth century to benefit both the business of Clarke Studios and the needs of their clients. This analysis will be facilitated by a combination of archive research, local history research and an examination of relevant social, economic and religious practice developments of the period. This includes consideration of how the work of Clarke Studios was impacted and informed by factors such as the social and cultural embedding of Irish Americans in the United States, and developments in art and architecture as they pertain to stained glass window design.

Drawing primarily on the recorded correspondence interactions between key individuals involved in the process, this thesis provides an historical insight into one aspect of the narrative of Irish American cultural and religious relations in the twentieth century.

1. Research Goals and Approach

1.1. Research Goals

1.1.1. *Review of Current Literature*

The starting point for this research is the Clarke Studios business archive held in the Library of Trinity College Dublin. The improved accessibility of the archive resulting from a digitisation project (2014 – 2017) has revealed a significant story of Irish craft export success in the mid-twentieth century.[1] An initial survey of information from the archive by this author in 2013 revealed the extent and geographic reach of the Clarke Studios business at a high level. This initiated a more detailed examination of the Clarke Studios work, which was published in the form of an MPhil dissertation in 2014.[2] That dissertation looked at number of examples of the Clarke Studios' work over a forty year period, considering the reasons for the company's success and ultimate decline. The findings of that research project prompted the more the detailed investigation of Clarke Studios business addressed by this thesis.

A review of texts relating to Irish stained glass indicates that research published to date has focused either on individual artists, individual locations or historical surveys of installed windows. At the forefront of this research has been Nicola Gordon Bowe's seminal work *Harry Clarke: The Life and Work* (1989, 2012) and her biography *Wilhelmina Geddes: Life and Work* (2015). Lucy Costigan and Michael Cullen's *Strangest Genius, The Stained Glass of Harry Clarke* (2010) builds on Gordon Bowe's work by documenting and describing images of all Clarke's stained glass in a single volume. A detailed exploration of Harry Clarke's work which considers both his stained glass and graphic work in the context of the development of the Irish Free State is published in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds.) *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish State* (2019). Other biographical studies on Irish stained glass artists include Ruth Sheehy's *The Life and Work of Richard King: Religion, Nationalism and Modernism* (2019)

[1] The digitisation of the Harry Clarke Studios Archive was a 'demonstrator project' for the Digital Repository of Ireland, a national digital repository for Ireland's humanities, social sciences, and cultural heritage data. Details of the project are published online at https://dri.ie/demonstrator-projects/harry-clarke-studios-archive, (accessed 4th January 2022).

[2] Paul Donnelly, 'The Rise and Fall of Harry Clarke Stained Glass Limited' (MPhil Dissertation, TCD, 2014).

and journal publications on artists including Evie Hone and Patrick Pollen.[3] With the exception of work undertaken by Sheehy (2019) on the artist Richard King (1907 – 1974) and Bateman (2019) on Clarke Studios work in Africa, the only other research that explores the extensive contents of the Clarke Studios archive, and which relates to the post-Harry Clarke period, was in the limited context of this author's MPhil dissertation.[4] This is a gap in the published knowledge of the history of Irish stained glass.

Literature which describes stained glass at individual locations includes Virginia Teehan and Elizabeth Wincott Heckett (eds.) *The Honan Chapel: A Golden Vision* (2004), Laurence Walsh OSCO *Lumen Christi – The Stained Glass Windows of Mount Saint Joseph Abbey* (2009), as well as many local history publications such as Patricia Curtin-Kelly's *Harry Clarke & His Legacy: The Stained Glass in St. Joseph's Church*, *Terenure* (2017). Although these volumes focus on stained glass installed in specific locations they do not give a wide-ranging view of the work of Harry Clarke or the Clarke Studios.

The history of Irish stained glass is addressed in publications such as Michael Wynne's *Irish Stained Glass* (1977) and Nicola Gordon Bowe, David Caron, Michael Wynne (eds.) *The Gazetteer of Irish Stained Glass* (1988, 2021). The latter volume provides a comprehensive guide to the significant stained glass works that can be found in Ireland, on a county-by-county basis. It also includes informative essays on the development of stained glass in Ireland through the twentieth century and provides biographical notes on a number of Irish artists working in the period. John Hearne's (ed.) *Glassmaking in Ireland* (2011) includes a description of the studio which launched Ireland's stained glass-making ventures in the twentieth century – An Túr Gloine. The comprehensive survey of Irish art, *Art and Architecture of Ireland* (2014) references the production of twentieth-century stained glass but only in the context of work done for Irish patrons. These volumes

[3] For an article on the work of Evie Hone see Nicola Gordon Bowe, 'Four Green Fields' in *Irish Arts Review*, Vol. 30 (3), (Autumn 2013), pp. 108-111. For Patrick Pollen see Nicola Gordon Bowe, 'Patrick Pollen Metaphysician in Glass', in *Irish Arts Review*, Vol. 28 (2), (Summer 2011), pp. 102-107.
[4] Fiona Bateman, 'Clarke Studios and the Foreign Missions: Windows with 'A Very Irish Look' in Africa' in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds) *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish State* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019).

provide a baseline of endeavours in Irish stained glass in the twentieth century, and inform this research in terms of describing the business context in which Clarke Studios operated and the people involved in the trade in Ireland.

While these publications enlighten the subject of Irish stained glass they mostly consider the contributions of individual artists, and less on the work of the studio as a collective. Furthermore, while some artists based in Ireland were successful in winning commissions outside the country, no research to date has identified or analysed overseas commissions of the scale won by Clarke Studios. Therefore, enabled by insights primarily gained from the Clarke Studios archive, this research will address two significant gaps in the history of Irish stained glass, namely, the study of Irish stained glass as the product of a business concern, and the extent of the international dimension of the craft, with particular reference to the largest market, the United States.

The second aspect of the research concerns the patronage of the Clarke Studios stained glass. While many volumes, listed below in section 1.2.3 (Research Sources), consider the history of American Catholicism and the Irish in America, none deal specifically with the patronage of ecclesiastical art by the Irish diaspora. The cross-cultural ties that bind the United States and Ireland are considered in Eimear O'Connor, *Art, Ireland and the Irish Diaspora* (2020) which studies the development of Irish art in the early twentieth century, focusing on the secular work that connected the two nations in the period 1893 – 1939. Another text which explores these ties is Vera Kreilcamp, *Making it Irish* (2016), which features a selection of essays associated with a major exhibition of Irish Arts and Crafts at Boston University in 2016. While these texts, and others listed in the Bibliography, deal with aspects of cross-cultural exchanges between Ireland and the United States, none specifically consider the circumstances which led to a significant amount of ecclesiastical patronage for Irish stained glass. This gap will be addressed by this thesis which will add to the existing narratives of Irish American history.

1.1.2.*Research Aims*

This work sets out to expose a hitherto untold story of Irish artistic endeavour in the twentieth century. The research examines the operation of Clarke Studios on a day-to-day basis, including how the Clarke Studios' artists dealt with the 'tension' between maintaining Harry Clarke's creative legacy, his modernist aesthetic, and serving the commercial and ideological requirements of both the studio and patrons. The subject also deals with the religious patronage of art. The role of Ireland's religious diaspora working in their adopted countries while still maintaining strong religious and cultural links with Ireland will be examined, as will defining and contextualising their understanding of 'Irishness', and the challenges of expressing the same visually. The research presents a new history of Irish stained glass outside of Ireland and it provides new perspectives on the development and impacts of immigrant art and craft in the United States. The research will reveal the extensive close ties that existed between the United States and Ireland, including Catholic church networks, during the period in question, both at a religious and at an artistic level, and will make an important contribution to the understanding of this shared history.

1.1.3.*Scope of Research Questions*

Initial investigations of the Clarke Studios' client list in the 1950s and '60s indicated that the majority of the Clarke Studios' American clients were Irish American priests, most of who were born and educated in Ireland.[5] That discovery directed this research to focus on the patronage of Irish art and craft by a section of Irish pastoral missionaries working in the United States in the mid-twentieth century. Specifically, to identify the extent of that patronage and to search for recognisable meanings that can be discerned from the stained glass commissions, including the commissioner's role in contributing to an Irish American cultural identity.

Given their function, it is unsurprising that all the subject matter of the windows commissioned references Christian iconographies, church teaching,

[5] As discovered in various items of correspondence sent by the Clarke Studios, held in TCD MSS 6001 – 6038.

or religious doctrine.[6] However, this research reveals that despite ethnic diversities among U.S. church communities, several of the features in the stained glass design owe much to Irish and European artistic traditions, with some containing elements of Irish ecclesiastical art referencing medieval iconography and design.

The research questions are structured to examine the topic from three perspectives – the 'push' by Clarke Studios to win business, the 'pull' by American patrons to have Irish stained glass in their churches, and the resulting 'meanings' that can be discerned from the presence of the Clarke Studios' windows in those churches.

1.1.4.*Central Research Questions*

The first question addressed by the research is how did Clarke Studios identify and create opportunities to sell stained glass in the American market, and how did the company win a significant amount of patronage for its work in this region into the 1950s and '60s? Answering this question requires an understanding of how the company was set up and run as a business, which is described in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*). It will also reveal the importance of the 'Harry Clarke' name and reputation in winning commissions, and the degree to which the Clarke Studios' artists adapted and developed the Clarke style to serve the needs and tastes of their patrons. Finally, the Clarke Studios business closed in 1973, and examining the changing needs and tastes of patrons at this time will reveal the factors which led to the closure.

The second question relates to the patronage of Irish craft by American clients. What were the circumstances that created the demand for Irish stained glass in the 1950s and '60s, how did Clarke Studios respond to that demand and what was the extent of the resulting patronage? Key to answering this question is to understand the growth in Catholicism in the United States in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, and how this led to an increase in power and influence of Irish American priests in the American Catholic Church.

[6] Information relating to the subject matter for each window is drawn from correspondence records in the TCD Harry Clarke Studios Archive, and site visits to each location.

The final question addressed by the research is to determine the meaning inherent in the commissions. There are several potential reasons why Clarke Studios was commissioned which are not mutually exclusive and hence the motivation behind each commission had elements of all the following factors: that the stained glass was an overt display of the Irish connections of its patrons which they wanted to express in the aesthetic strategies and iconographies presented in the stained glass; that their purchase was a way of supporting the Irish craft industry and consequently Ireland's export economy; that the windows functioned as indicators of a high-quality aspect of Irish American culture, generating a degree of pride, thus agency, for the patrons.[7] This subsequently raises the question as to the how much the commissioning of Irish stained glass for Catholic churches in that period reflected how Americans of Irish origin, or descent, saw themselves as a distinctive, progressive and value-contributing group, worthy of their upward advance in American society. Thus, the thesis traces the increasing agency of the Irish in the United States in the twentieth century, which facilitated the presence of Clarke Studio windows there. To achieve this requires an examination of the social, cultural, economic and religious practice environment in the United States which led to commissions. These factors are interdependent and it is the examination of each, and the relationships between them, which will identify the intrinsic meaning in the commissions.

In summary, answering the research questions will determine how Clarke Studios operated as a business to sell and deliver their work in the USA, what form did the stained glass delivered to patrons in California take and what was its extent, and the reasons why they were commissioned to do so. This will reveal the circumstances that enabled Clarke Studios, over a twenty year period, to create stained glass which was visually appealing and was valued because of its association with Ireland and the artistic legacy of Harry Clarke.

[7] Another potential meaning that is possible is the Irish Government's promotion of Ireland's national image abroad. With the exception of one episode relating to the *Irish News Agency* described in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*), there is little evidence to suggest that this was a major factor in the Clarke Studios operations. For a more detailed discussion on this subject see William Shortall, *Art and the Irish Free State - visualizing nationhood (1922-1934*), (PhD Thesis, TCD, 2020).

1.2. Research Approach

An investigation of the phenomenon of the Clarke Studios achievement in finding a market for its work in the United States falls into a number of spheres of research. These fields, which focus on or are associated with transcultural topics include: Religious Studies – the study of religious behaviours and beliefs, in this context how they relate to the ethnic background of pastoral missionary priests in the United States;[8] Irish Studies – the study of cultural, social and political endeavours of Irish people, in this case the experiences and practices of an Irish arts and craft enterprise and Irish immigrants in the Unites States; Business Studies – the study of marketing, design and management of an international craft business; Material Culture – the study of physical objects used by a society, in this case stained glass in Catholic churches; Irish Art History, in this context the national and international agency of Irish Arts and Crafts products. While touching on all of these associated areas of study, this research takes a joint material culture and art-historical approach to investigate how aspects of Irish and Catholic identity were expressed through the display of Irish-made art objects in religious buildings in the United States.[9]

1.2.1. *Theoretical Framework*

As previously noted, this thesis aims to explore and explicate this endeavour from material cultural and art-historical perspectives. At a high level, examining the subject through the lens of material culture provides a mechanism to study the windows as objects representing the aspirations of Irish American clergy in the period. The art-historical lens examines the style and content of the windows to determine the aesthetic achievements of the artists and the extent of visual expressions of Irishness in the finished work. While either approach would be informative in its own right, both are complementary to each other and the use of both provides deeper insight into the meaning to be found in the stained glass.

[8] As defined by Hogan, the mission of 'pastoral missionaries' was to care for the spiritual needs of already-baptised Catholics and the mission of 'evangelical missionaries' was to convert non-Christians to Catholicism. Edmund Hogan, *The Irish Missionary Movement: A Historical Survey, 1890 – 1980* (Dublin: Gill and Macmillan, 1990), p. 2.
[9] The rationale and format of the research approach will be described in more detail in the next section.

Religious imagery produced for ecclesiastical settings and images produced as 'art' (that is, for gallery display, exhibition or sale) have by the twentieth century different functions and have to comply with different rules. While Clarke Studios emphasised the artistry involved in designing and making their stained glass (discussed further in section 2.3), it is worth noting that the creativity involved in producing religious imagery for Church patrons differs from that involved in producing secular art. In general, artists producing secular art established their reputations either by producing good quality work which conformed to established practices or by finding contemporary means of expression for their work. Whereas these approaches are appropriate when dealing with artworks destined for patrons, exhibitions or sales rooms, it can be at odds with producing work for Catholic Church patrons who required standard imagery intended to underpin standard devotional teaching.[10] Artists producing religious work were expected to deliver imagery in a form that was recognisable to the client and which was familiar to its audience, rather than unfamiliar objects designed to express the creative autonomy of the artist. As Gamboni (2007) observes, in the early twentieth century "the normal conditions of commission, creation and reception of church decoration and liturgical objects had long been in contradiction with the very definition of artistic activity".[11] Therefore, religious imagery and images produced in the context of 'fine art' have different functions and have to comply with different rules – one determined by art critics and the art market, the other determined by the Church.[12]

Material Culture

Prown (1982) describes material culture as the study through objects of the beliefs, values, ideas, attitudes, and assumptions of a particular community

[10] The requirements of the Roman Catholic Church in relation to imagery and how this affected the work Clarke Studios designed for their clients will be discussed further in section 2.2.2.

[11] Dario Gamboni, *The Destruction of Art: Iconoclasm and Vandalism since the French Revolution* (London: Reaktion Books, 2007), p. 235.

[12] This subject is discussed in detail by Gamboni (2007), chapter 12. Of particular relevance is the discussion on the conflict between the relative precedence between aesthetic and religious criteria in the evaluation and legitimisation of art associated with the Church, and how it changed over time.

or society at a given time.[13] In order to position material culture within the broad range of academic disciplines, the *Journal of Material Culture* (1996), in its introductory editorial, broadly defines the approach as the "investigation of the relationship between people and things irrespective of time and space".[14] Berger (2016) asserts that culture is based on communication between peoples, and that objects embody various cultural values and achievements of those people.[15] From this Berger describes the value of using a material culture lens to analyse aspects of society, suggesting that we can use material objects to help gain insights into the cultures that produced them, giving us a means of understanding better those cultures.

The *Handbook of Material Culture* (2006) describes the diverse range of fields of study to which material culture analysis can be applied.[16] In the context of this research, material culture is concerned with the study of the properties of stained glass objects and how those objects relate to conscious ideas and intentions held by the people involved in their commissioning and making.[17] As Godson (2003) states when introducing a study into the material culture of Catholicism in nineteenth-century Ireland, the investigation is predicated on the belief that objects are not only significant in the sense that they in some way 'reflect' social worlds, but that they constitute them.[18]

Specific material culture texts in an Irish context which inform the approach adopted in this thesis are Godson, Brück (eds), *Making 1916: material and visual culture of the Easter Rising* (2015), and Godson, *Charting the material culture of the 'Devotional Revolution': the Advertising Register of the Irish*

[13] Jules David Prown, 'Mind in Matter: An Introduction to Material Culture Theory and Method.' *Winterthur Portfolio*, Vol. 17 (1), (1982), p. 1.
[14] Editor, 'Editorial', *Journal of Material Culture*, Vol. 1 (1), (1996), p. 5. The goal of *Journal of Material Culture* was to create a forum which would encourage cross-fertilisation of ideas and approaches between people concerned with the material aspects of social relations, thus providing an environment for discussion across fields of study such as archaeology, anthropology, art history, sociology and architecture. Ibid pp. 5-6.
[15] Arthur Asa Berger, *What Objects Mean* (London: Routledge, 2016), p. 17.
[16] Christopher Tilley, 'Introduction', in Christopher Tilley, et al (eds) *Handbook of Material Culture* (London: Sage, 2006), p. 4.
[17] Ibid.
[18] Lisa Godson, 'Catholicism and Material Culture in Ireland 1840 – 1880', in *Circa*, No. 103 (Spring, 2003), p. 38.

Catholic Directory, 1837–96 (2016).[19] The former addresses a significant episode in modern Irish history, the 1916 Easter Rising, from the perspective of a variety of objects and images associated with the event. Through a number of case studies which consider a range of material objects connected with the Rising, a set of narratives around the event and its subsequent impact in terms of related discourse and commemoration has been created.[20] While not directly linked with this research, the volume provides an example of how the material culture approach facilitates a cohesive examination of a topic from differing fields of study – in that volume, archaeology, design history, photography, history of art and museology – all of which contribute to a deeper understanding of the subject.[21] This method informs the research in this thesis by indicating that a single approach to the topic is not sufficient to gain insight. Specifically, Irish stained glass installed in American churches forms part of the material culture of Catholicism and there are a number of potential dimensions to the study of these objects. Stained glass made by Irish hands, the style of which is derived from the work of Harry Clarke, brings an Irish art-history dimension to the objects. When the stained glass is commissioned by Irish American priests it brings a transcultural element to the analysis of the objects. The stained glass commissioned by Irish American priests and installed in churches in the United States adds other dimensions to the research in terms of religious studies, Irish Studies and business studies.[22] Therefore, adopting a material culture approach facilitates this multidisciplinary approach to the subject, better enabling the articulation of

[19] Lisa Godson, Joanna Brück (eds), *Making 1916: Material and Visual Culture of the Easter Rising* (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2015). Lisa Godson, 'Charting the material culture of the 'Devotional Revolution': the Advertising Register of the Irish Catholic Directory, 1837–96', in *Proceedings of the Royal Irish Academy: Archaeology, Culture, History, Literature* (2016), Vol. 116C, pp. 265-294.

[20] Lisa Godson, Joanna Brück (eds), *Making 1916: Material and Visual Culture of the Easter Rising* (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2015), p. 2.

[21] One essay which does touch on themes explored in this research is Róisín Kennedy, 'The Capuchin Annual: Visual Art and the Legacy of 1916, One Generation On', in Lisa Godson, Joanna Brück (eds), *Making 1916: Material and Visual Culture of the Easter Rising* (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2015), pp. 153 - 163. This essay considers how the Annual acted as a vehicle to disseminate and bring the work of the Irish artist Jack B Yeats, whose work included themes relating to Irish independence, into the public sphere in Ireland and globally.

[22] Religious Studies includes, for example, the pastoral missionary work of Irish priests, and the power of Irish clergy in the American Catholic Church. Irish Studies includes, for example, the perceptions of the Irish in American society, and the public display of Irish material by the Irish diaspora in the United States. Business Studies includes, for example, winning and fulfilling overseas orders.

the intentions of the patrons in commissioning stained glass, and therefore the meaning inherent in these objects.

A text which is more aligned with this research is *Charting the Material Culture of the 'Devotional Revolution'* (2016).[23] This paper argues that an analysis of the products advertised by businesses that served the religious market in Ireland in the period 1837-1896 indicates some of the ways in which new religious practices became embedded in nineteenth-century Ireland.[24] By way of a case study, the research examines advertisements in the *Irish Catholic Directory* of the period to explore the role that this material had in illuminating the culture of Catholic practice in the period, and how it was changing. One of the conclusions of the research relates to how religious goods were used to reflect an aspiration of Irish clergy to change devotional practices among Catholics in Ireland.[25] Specifically the research reveals how clerically directed devotional practices and the drive to systematise piety was mirrored in the fabrication of standardised and reproducible products, and the evidence for this change was contained in advertisements for religious goods.[26]

This mode of enquiry, examining how public-facing objects reflect a cultural position or statement of people involved in its creation and display, lends itself to the subject of this research – how Irish stained glass reflected the social, cultural and religious objectives of Irish American clergy, and by extension the Irish diaspora, in the United States. The case-study methodology is adopted in Chapter Four (*Meaning*), where the findings of a select, but representative, number of commissions will be analysed in order to discover the inherent meaning behind this phenomenon. The case studies will describe specific projects, outlining the extent and content of each, and the motivation which drove the patronage.

In summary, for Godson's case study the material objects are the advertisements, and the cultural insight is what those objects reveal about

[23] Lisa Godson, 'Charting the material culture of the 'Devotional Revolution': the Advertising Register of the Irish Catholic Directory, 1837–96', in *Proceedings of the Royal Irish Academy: Archaeology, Culture, History, Literature* (2016), Vol. 116C, pp. 265-294.
[24] Ibid. p. 292.
[25] Ibid.
[26] Ibid.

the people involved creating and responding to the advertisements. In this research the material objects are the stained glass windows and the cultural insight is what those objects reveal about the people involved in their commissioning and making.

Art History

Using a prescribed theoretical approach to an art-historical analysis provides a set of tools which assist in framing a specific inquiry, ensuring that the set of questions raised to engage with the subject is adequate to provide appropriate insight into the topic.[27] The use of a framework also helps avoid generalisation by channelling the analysis (both visual and contextual) into a more focused examination.[28] This allows the analysis to engage more in interpretation rather than just description, thus facilitating testing of any hypotheses put forward.

As Preziosi (2009) states, art objects have come to possess the status of historical documents in the sense that each is presumed to provide significant, often unique and, on occasion, deeply revealing evidence for the character of an age, nation, person, or people.[29] In this context the object could be construed as a means by which the intentions, values, attitudes, ideas, political or other messages, or by extension the maker's social and historical contexts were conveyed, by design or chance, to targeted or circumstantial beholders.[30]

As described by D'Alleva (2005), several theories have developed to assist the analysis and interpretation of art objects including positivism, formalism, iconography and semiotics.[31] Each of these approaches has merits and warrants consideration of its usefulness for this research.

Positivism, which has its roots in the work of the French philosopher Auguste Comte (1798-1857), does not deal with interpretation of an object but in the

[27] Anne D'Alleva, *The Methods and Theories of Art History* (London: Laurence King Publishing, 2005), p. 7.
[28] Ibid. p. 11.
[29] Donald Preziosi, 'Art History: Making the Visible Legible', in Donald Preziosi (ed), *The Art of Art History: A Critical Anthology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), p. 7.
[30] Ibid. p. 9.
[31] Anne D'Alleva, *The Methods and Theories of Art History* (London: Laurence King Publishing, 2005), p. 10.

facts associated with it.[32] The approach relies on the discovery of specific details about an object and does not attempt interpretation to find any meaning associated with those facts. It relies on texts to enable the production of descriptive explanations of artworks, including their formal qualities, the history of their making, listing of motifs and symbols, the biography of the artist, and other associated details.[33] While this approach may be useful for basic understanding of the content of, in this case, a stained glass window, it is not sufficient in order to understand the context of its making, as is required by this study.

Formalism commonly refers to an approach to the analysis of art objects which favours their formal qualities over other aspects of a work's production, reception, subject-matter, or thematic significance.[34] Formalists argue that the key to understanding (and enjoying) an artwork rests in the perception of its formal qualities (composition, material, shape, colour, line) and that the political, social and economic conditions which affected its making were irrelevant to the experience of looking at the work.[35] An early proponent of this approach was Heinrich Wölfflin (1864 – 1945) who, focusing on renaissance and baroque art, developed an approach which aimed to understand "the mode of perception which lies at the root of the representative arts in the various centuries", and that the way to explore this dynamic was through rigorous formal analysis based on pairs of opposing principles (e.g. linear vs. painterly, open vs. closed form, planar vs. recessive form).[36]

However, in terms of achieving the primary goals of this research, to understand the role and form of patronage of the Clarke Studios and the company's response to the needs of its clients, requires interpretation of the artworks to discern the meaning present in the work. In order to derive this meaning a formalist approach alone would not be adequate as in this case it is the contextual factors of production and construction that inform their

[32] Ibid.
[33] Ibid.
[34] Donald Preziosi, *The Art of Art History: A Critical Anthology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), p. 575.
[35] Anne D'Alleva, *The Methods and Theories of Art History* (London: Laurence King Publishing, 2005), p. 19.
[36] Heinrich Wölfflin, *Principles of Art History,* 7th edition, (1950: Dover Publications, 1950), p. 14.

history. While the form of the artwork contained in the windows is important, the objective of this research is to explicate this facet of Irish art history by examining the social, religious and art historical context in which they were made.

Where the formalist approach is more useful in this thesis is in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*), where the practices adopted by Clarke Studios in designing and making stained glass windows are examined. This requires an understanding of the techniques used in the craft which are specific to the medium. In addition, a formal approach to comparing the style and design work of Harry Clarke with the later work done by the Clarke Studios' artists will be adopted. This will be illustrated through the use of a case study which will analyse examples of work done by Harry Clarke and later work by William Dowling (1907 – 1980) and Terence Clarke (1917 – 1968).

Iconography/Iconology

Iconography is the study of images to identify the presence of subjects, symbols and motifs in an artwork.[37] The process of identification requires that the viewer has knowledge of the conventions associated with the image. For example, in the discipline of art history the image of a man in rough clothing with long hair standing by a river is generally, in western society, deemed to represent the biblical figure of St John the Baptist. Through the work of the art historian Aby Warburg (1866-1929) and his students, an iconographical approach was developed specifically for the analysis of art objects. One of Warburg's students Erwin Panofsky (1892 - 1968) developed a method for analysis of an artwork based on the study of both the iconography of the work (its subject matter and symbolism) and its iconology (the cultural basis for its meaning). In Panofsky's opinion:

> In a work of art, 'form' cannot be divorced from 'content': the distribution of colour and lines, light and shade, volumes and planes, however delightful as a visual spectacle, must also be understood as carrying a more-than-visual meaning.[38]

[37] In art history, a symbol is an object or a picture that is used to represent something. A motif is an image or another visual or structural device that is used to develop a theme.
[38] Erwin Panofsky, Meaning in the Visual Arts (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1970), quoted in Donald Preziosi (ed), *The Art of Art History: A Critical Anthology* (London: Oxford University Press, 2009), p. 259.

This approach makes Erwin Panofsky's work on iconology an appropriate theoretical framework on which to base the art-historical inquiry involved in this research.

A central aspect of Panofsky's approach to art historical inquiry is through what he terms 'Modes of Knowledge', which describe how meaning is derived from art objects.[39] According to Panofsky, in order to derive the intrinsic meaning in a work the art historian applies their personal knowledge of the history of styles, the history of types (the concepts expressed by different styles), and the history of cultural symbols (how certain styles expressed cultural tendencies at a particular time and place) to the object(s).[40] This knowledge is gained through the art historians familiarity with objects (their real-world experience), their knowledge of texts (literary sources which describe themes and concepts), and a form of knowing Panofsky termed 'synthetic intuition', or the familiarity with the 'essential tendencies' of the human mind, which are conditioned by the interpreter's understanding of the history of cultural symptoms appropriate to the subject.[41] The interpretation of cultural symptoms of the subject requires investigation of documents historically related to the works, which Panofsky summarises as documents bearing witness to the political, poetical, religious, philosophical, and social tendencies of the personality, period or country under investigation.[42] Panofsky states:

> We deal with the work of art as a symptom of something else which expresses itself in a countless variety of other symptoms, and we interpret its compositional and iconographical features as more particularized evidence of this 'something else'.[43]

In the context of this research, the 'something else' is the transcultural history of the patronage of Irish art by a diaspora of Irish priests in the United States in the mid-twentieth century. This framework was initially

[39] Donald Preziosi, 'Mechanisms of Meaning', in Donald Preziosi (ed), *The Art of Art History: A Critical Anthology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), p. 217.
[40] Ibid.
[41] Erwin Panofsky, *Studies in Iconology: Humanistic Themes in the Art of the Renaissance* (Oxford: Westview Press, 1972), p. 16.
[42] Ibid.
[43] Ibid. p. 8.

developed by Panofsky with reference to art of the Renaissance period.[44] The approach is relevant to this research as in many cases the iconography included in the stained glass designed by the Clarke Studios' artists is inspired by Renaissance images, in addition to Gothic, Medieval, Baroque and Irish Revivalist influences in keeping with the Clarke Studios approach to design.[45] This methodology facilitates the framing of specific lines of inquiry which guides the research to discover meaning in the stained glass windows, and thus enable the synthesis of a new history of this phenomenon.

In particular, given the nature of the Irish American background of the Studio's patrons, it is assumed that there are specific cross-cultural references present in the designs which identified them as being of Irish origin. A number of the stained glass windows that are in the scope of this research contain aspects of iconography that contain a commonly recognisable Irish component, such as Irish saints and symbols recognised as typifying so-called Celtic culture. Iconographic analysis will describe the principal subject matter of selected windows and also the symbolic elements contained therein. This visual evidence, and the arrival at same, will be supported by the discovery of supporting textual information from relevant sources such as the Clarke Studios business archive and local histories from relevant locations where the stained glass is installed.

This is where the material culture and art-historical approaches merge in this research. As noted earlier, the material culture approach investigates the motivation behind the patronage and commissioning of the windows as objects and the art-historical approach investigates the extent to which the content of the windows explicitly reflect this motivation.

[44] Erwin Panofsky, 'Studies in Iconology' in Donald Preziosi (ed), *The Art of Art History: A Critical Anthology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), p. 228.
[45] In addition to previous work the Clarke Studios' artists or Harry Clarke had done of the same subject, they used a variety of textual sources to inform a design, including books, pamphlets, images from magazines and prayer leaflets. A number of these source images are retained in TCD MS 11182/1400/3.

Semiotics

Semiotics, at its highest level of definition, is the study of signs. These signs could be words, images, sounds, gestures and objects.[46] While semiotic analysis can be applied in many areas of study such as literature and music, in the area of art history it can be used to consider meaning and how the artist and others went about creating those meanings.

As described by D'Alleva (2005), signs have codes upon which interpretation takes place.[47] These codes are the conventional rules of correlation between a sign and an object or meaning.[48] The interpretation formed by the viewer is possible because the latter knows what things usually mean in the culture in which the sign functions. Translation from one 'language' into another, for example from an image into words that explain it, works by virtue of the knowledge of such expressions.[49] Therefore, semiotic analysis requires the application of interpretive codes, the defined set of meanings associated with elements of the artwork which are brought by the viewer, in order to form meaning in the work.

The application of semiotics to the discipline of art history was developed and refined by the work of Norman Bryson (b. 1949) and Mieke Bal (b. 1946). In their view, semiotics advances the theory that human culture is composed of signs, with each sign standing for something other than itself, and people continually interpret those signs to make sense of them.[50] The core of semiotic theory is the definition of the factors involved in this permanent process of signmaking and interpreting, and the development of conceptual tools that help to grasp that process as it goes on in various arenas of cultural activity.[51]

Another influential figure whose work in the 1960s shaped discourse on semiotics as it relates to cultural studies was Roland Barthes (1915 - 1980). Aiello (2020) comments that Barthes was the first semiologist to look at signs

[46] Roland Barthes, *Elements of Semiology* (New York: Hill and Wang, 1968), p. 9.
[47] Anne D'Alleva, *The Methods and Theories of Art History* (London: Laurence King Publishing, 2005), p.32.
[48] Ibid.
[49] Mieke Bal, Norman Bryson, 'Semiotics and Art History', *The Art Bulletin*, Vol. 73 (2), (1991), p. 191.
[50] Ibid. p. 174.
[51] Ibid.

and their meaning as dynamic elements of a social and cultural fabric, focusing on 'texts' made of non-linguistic signs, particularly visual images.[52] As with iconography, the goal of his approach to visual analysis is to answer two fundamental questions: what do images represent and how, and what ideas and values do the subjects represented in the image stand for?[53] The main difference between the two approaches is that iconography uses both textual and contextual criteria for arguing symbolic meaning in the object, while the approach of Barthes and his followers restricts itself mostly to textual criteria, to pointers within the image itself, and the context is brought by the viewer not the maker.[54] In semiotics the context is provided by cultural codes which are the rules which govern the ways in which those who make and view images discern their meanings.[55]

These associated approaches of iconography and semiotics are discussed in detail in van Leeuwen (2011) which concludes that both frameworks are particularly useful for investigating the representational and symbolic meanings of the people, places and things included in different kinds of images.[56]

For this thesis, which looks at the artworks in through the lens of Irish Americanism, while accepting that semiotic analysis can offer some insight in terms of reception of the work, that is not the primary focus of this research which concentrates on the iconography of the images and the contextual information provided by correspondence records created during the commissioning process. One major challenge of this project is to analyse, understand and expose significant aspects of what the Clarke Studios archive is revealing about the business, its stained glass, and its

[52] Giorgia Aiello, 'Visual Semiotics: Key Concepts and New Directions'. in Luc Pauwels, Dawn Mannay (eds), *The SAGE Handbook of Visual Research Methods* (London: Sage, 2019), p. 369.
[53] Theo van Leeuwen, 'Semiotics and Iconography', in Theo Van Leeuwen, Carey Jewitt (eds), *The Handbook of Visual Analysis* (London: Sage, 2001), p. 93.
[54] Theo van Leeuwen, Carey Jewitt, 'Introduction', in Theo Van Leeuwen, Carey Jewitt (eds), *The Handbook of Visual Analysis* (London: Sage, 2001), p. 3.
[55] And, as part of a shared system of culture, most individuals are able to draw from the same codes to interpret and understand images. Giorgia Aiello, 'Visual Semiotics: Key Concepts and New Directions'. in Luc Pauwels, Dawn Mannay (eds), *The SAGE Handbook of Visual Research Methods* (London: Sage, 2019), p. 370.
[56] Theo van Leeuwen, 'Semiotics and Iconography', in Theo Van Leeuwen, Carey Jewitt (eds), *The Handbook of Visual Analysis* (London: Sage, 2001). For another discussion of the relationship between iconography to semiotics, see Christine Hasenmueller, 'Panofsky, Iconography and Semiotics', *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, Vol. 36 (3), (1978), pp. 289-301.

clients. From that perspective iconographical readings are the most useful method for helping to position what these works are and what they meant. The aim of this research is to provide that insight, paving the way for deeper theoretical investigations of the commissions to be undertaken. Semiotic discussions on the works would therefore be an informative area of study in the future.

1.2.2.*Research Structure*

As stated above, initial research on the Clarke Studios' correspondence revealed two aspects to company's export success – the push by Clarke Studios to enlarge its business reach, and the pull by Irish American Catholic clergy who wanted Irish artwork in their church buildings. Further research indicated that buying from Clarke Studios was not solely a business transaction but that the selection of Irish stained glass for new buildings also had another purpose in terms of reflecting the enhancement of the standing of the Irish in American society.

Thus, the key to understanding the success of Clarke Studios in winning significant orders in the United States lies in an appreciation of three related factors which drove demand for their work: the circumstances which led to the presence of Irish missionary priests and their patronage of Irish art during a period of rapid growth in the Californian Catholic population; the business and artistic response of Clarke Studios to the potential in this market; and the desire of Irish American patrons to use Irish art and craft to accentuate their social and cultural standing in American society through the means of material and visual culture. The research is broken into two strands, the first relating to Clarke Studios as a business and the second relating to the patronage of Irish craft and the inherent meanings in completed works.

The Clarke Studios strand considers how the company emerged from the Irish Arts and Crafts Revival, one of the goals of which was to establish an indigenous stained glass industry. Research findings will summarise how the aims of the Revival included the replacement of imported stained glass with Irish-made products, and the promotion of an Irish identity through native craft design. Although Watsons of Cork and a number of Dublin-based

stained glass businesses such as Earley and Co. and Joshua Clarke & Sons were already operating in the late nineteenth century, the Revival led to the establishment of new Irish stained glass studios, including An Túr Gloine and Irish Craftworkers, and also a number of young artists working as individuals in this medium such as Harry Clarke and Wilhelmina Geddes (1887 – 1955).[57]

From the late 1920s Clarke Studios sought business both in Ireland and abroad, particularly targeting the United States for new work. In that context, this research examines the setting up of the business, focusing on the desire of its founder Harry Clarke to expand the business outside of Ireland and the extent to which this aspiration continued after his death in 1931. The research examines the actions Clarke Studios took to enable it to win and deliver orders to American clients, and the challenges it encountered in doing so. The research will consider how Clarke Studios relied on and exploited Harry Clarke's reputation as an artist and how successor artists at the company maintained his design approach and aesthetic, though adapting when required to needs of patrons. The motivations and role of the Irish State in supporting Clarke Studios (and others) in winning business abroad is also considered. Finally, it examines the factors which led to a fall-off in US commissions and the closure of the business in 1973.

The second research strand considers the dynamics which led to the commissioning of Irish stained glass in the United States from the perspective of the Clarke Studios' patrons. To establish the context of this patronage, the history of Irish immigrant participation in American society is described in order to outline the progress of Irish Americans in the twentieth century. This includes a general examination of the factors which led to the significant presence of Irish priests in the United States.[58] It considers how this group represents the progress of Irish American Catholics in society,

[57] Artists working at An Túr Gloine included Beatrice Elvery (1883 – 1968), Michael Healy (1973 – 1941), Catherine O'Brien (1881 – 1963) and Ethyl Rhind (1879 – 1952). David Caron, Nicola Gordon Bowe, Michael Wynne (eds.), *The Gazetteer of Irish Stained Glass* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2021), p. 16.
[58] Useful supporting sources are Jay P. Dolan, *In Search of an American Catholicism* (2002 and Chester Gillis, *Roman Catholicism in America* (1999), which chart the course of American Catholicism and the part Irish seminaries played in training priests for service in the United States in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.

and how the commissioning of Irish stained glass represented their success and ambitions. It also considers how factors such as a boom in Catholic church-building in Western States, and the dominance of Irish Americans in the Catholic Church hierarchy provided opportunities to assert a qualitative aspect of their Irish heritage within American society, while also demonstrating their nationalistic affiliations by supporting Irish industry.

The convergence of these two strands resulted in the commissioning and installation of hundreds of stained glass windows in locations across the United States in the mid-twentieth century, and specifically in the context of this research, for more than twenty locations in California. This approach will illuminate the agency the windows carried as Irish-made artworks and the extent to which Irishness is expressed in the objects.

1.2.3.*Research Sources*

Primary Sources

The main primary source for this research is the Clarke Studios Archive held in Trinity College Dublin Library. This source contains a significant amount of the business records of the company. Information includes inward and outward correspondence (from 1903 to 1970), customer orders (from 1893 to 1950) and sales books (from 1903 to 1953). This information reveals the details of commissions received by Clarke Studios, including information on individual windows (including dates, prices and subjects), text from the letter exchanges between the Clarke Studios manager and clients in the course of a project, and the sales efforts involved in generating new business. Also included in the archive are more than one thousand seven hundred original designs and photographs of the Clarke Studios work. The scale of this source presents challenges for the recording of information, making the use of an electronic database of records an essential tool for managing the data.[59]

Additional archive material which supports this research is held in the National Library of Ireland, the National Archives of Ireland, The National Gallery of Ireland and Dublin City Gallery, The Hugh Lane. This analysis is

[59] A MS Excel database has been used to manage the data generated by the archive research.

also informed by research at diocesan archives in California, and parish-level records and publications.[60]

In addition to information relating to commissions, the correspondence records from the Clarke Studios Archive also contains descriptions of the techniques the artists and craftspeople used in the design and manufacture of stained glass windows. On several occasions the Clarke Studios manager William Dowling wrote to prospective clients and other enquirers, outlining the process, technique and quality approach that was adopted in producing a window. Also, extensive personal correspondence records held in the National Library of Ireland contain details of Harry Clarke's own approach to stained glass-making, which was continued by Clarke Studios after his death.[61]

Members of the extended Clarke family have been very supportive of this research, providing personal accounts of the Clarke Studios operation and access to private material for consultation.[62] This information has proved invaluable in providing first-hand insight into the people and operation of Clarke Studios.

Secondary Sources

Secondary sources have been used to inform the author about the techniques of making stained glass and to examine the relevant cultural, social, economic and religious developments of the period, both in Ireland and the United States.[63] These sources fall into three categories: publications relating to the techniques involved in the making of stained glass and the history of the craft in Ireland, with particular focus on the Irish Arts and Crafts movement, stained glass and Harry Clarke and his studio; texts relating to the history of Catholicism in the United States, and in

[60] Research has been carried out at the Diocesan Archives in Los Angeles and San Francisco.
[61] NLI MS 39/202/A (xii).
[62] Family members consulted in the course of this research include Ms Mary Clarke (R.I.P.), Ms Sara Bourke, Ms Ann Bourke, Ms Sunniva Sheridan and Mr Terry Mahon. Documents shared include William Dowling, *Irish Stained Glass – the Harry Clarke Studios* (c. 1965, Private Collection), William Dowling, *Recollections of Harry Clarke R.H.A. 1928 – 1931* (c. 1973, Private Collection), John Clarke, *William Dowling, A Biographical Note* (c. 1980, Private Collection), William Dowling, *Some Notes on the Stained Glass of Loughrea Cathedral* (1979, Private Collection), and lists of windows created by William Dowling and Terence Clarke.
[63] The Bibliography lists the texts referred to in this section.

particular, the role Irish clergy played in its development; texts relating to the Irish American experience in the United States.

The Irish Arts and Crafts revival was the impetus behind the revival of stained glass making in Ireland. The important texts which inform this research includes Jeanne Sheehy, *The Rediscovery of Ireland's Past the Celtic Revival, 1830–1930* (1980), Paul Larmour, *The Arts and Crafts Movement in Ireland* (1992) and Vera Kreilcamp, *Making it Irish* (2016), as well as a number of journal articles. In relation to the history of Irish stained glass, section 1.1.1 (Literature Review) above describes the key texts which inform this research.

The techniques involved in making stained glass are described by Nicola Gordon Bowe both in *Harry Clarke: The Life and Work* (1989, 2012) and John Hearne (ed.) *Glassmaking in Ireland* (2011). A source which contains a clear technical introduction to the design and making of stained glass is written by the artist Robert Sowers *Stained Glass an Architectural Art* (1965). The most complete and well-illustrated source on how stained glass is produced which was consulted in the course of this research is Mary Clerkin-Higgins essay 'Origins, Materials and the Glaziers Art' in Virginia Chieffo Raguin's *The History of Stained Glass* (2003). This text combines photographs of artists at work on the various stages of production with actual stained glass windows to aid understanding of the various techniques involved. Finally, Lawrence Lee's *The Appreciation of Stained Glass* (1977) breaks down the various techniques involved in making stained glass, providing useful illustrations (juxtaposing images of medieval and contemporary glass) which illustrate all the considerations which go into making a successful window.[64]

A wide range of academic publications and articles describe Catholicism in the United States, particularly as it relates to the influence of Irish American clergy. Of most relevance to this research are general surveys of the subject such as John Tracey Ellis, *American Catholicism* (1969) and Chester Gillis, *Roman Catholicism in America* (1999), and publications specifically relating to experiences of Irish clergy, including William L. Smith, *Irish Priests in the*

[64] Considerations include architectural factors, scale, design, line, colour and painting.

United States: A Vanishing Subculture (2004) and numerous editions of the *All Hallows Annual* (1950 – 1966) published by and for priests who trained at All Hallows Missionary College in Dublin. Colin Barr's *Ireland's Empire* (2020) presents a view of the worldwide influence of Catholic Church, and the significant role Irish clergy played in formation of that influence in the English-speaking world. Sarah Roddy, *Population, Providence and Empire: The Churches and Emigration from Nineteenth-Century Ireland* (2014) provides a more focused study on the merging of Irish migration and religious history, and its impact on the social and cultural history of Ireland.

A large field of published research exists which deals with Irish immigration in the United States and the progress and experiences of Irish Americans in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.[65] Texts which are of particular relevance to this research are general histories such as J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey (eds) *Making the Irish American* (2006), Jay P. Dolan, *The Irish Americans: A History* (2010), and Kevin Kenny *The American Irish* (2014).

While there is limited research on displays of Irishness in Catholic churches outside of Ireland, there are sources which address such displays in other arenas, including some which relate to Irish ecclesiastical art.[66] The most relevant topic which relates to this are displays of Irishness at World's Fairs in the United States. Texts which are of particular relevance are Charles Fanning, 'Dueling Cultures: Ireland and Irish America at the Chicago World's Fairs of 1933 and 1934', *New Hibernia Review* (Vol. 15, no.3, 2011) and two PhD theses, Jeffrey M O'Leary, *Manufacturing Reality: The Display of the Irish at World's Fairs and Exhibitions 1893 to 1965* (2015) and Caroline R. Malloy, *Exhibiting Ireland: Irish Villages, Pavilions, Cottages, and Castles at International Exhibitions, 1853-193*9 (2013).

These sources are augmented by additional journal publications, newspaper articles, parish booklets and web sources which provide facts and insight

[65] Much of this research is published in relation to the discipline of 'Irish Studies'.
[66] One text which does explore the subject Irish stained glass in overseas churches is Fiona Bateman, 'Clarke Studios and the Foreign Missions: Windows with 'A Very Irish Look' in Africa' in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds) *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish State* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019).

into the histories relating to specific events and locations in the scope of this research.

1.2.4.*Methodological Approach*

The primary objective of this research is to establish the circumstances that led Clarke Studios to pursue the U.S. market and the motivations of patrons in the United States who commissioned Irish stained glass made by the company. The methodology used is to analyse, through the use of case studies, a representative sample of those commissions which provide insight into that motivation.

The approach taken to achieve this is firstly to establish the business and cultural contexts that the commissions took place in. This relates to both the operation of Clarke Studios as a business and also to the experience of Irish immigrants, particularly as it relates the experience of Irish priests working in the United States.

As described above in section 1.2.3 (Research Sources), a wide range of sources are available which reveal much about the social, cultural, professional, artistic and religious practice circumstances of Irish Americans living and working in the United States in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. This material provides the cultural context which led to hundreds of Irish priests working in parishes in the United States, a number of who commissioned Clarke Studios stained glass.[67]

As stated, the primary source of information is drawn from the Clarke Studios archive in Trinity College. The research for this thesis requires a deep investigation of the thousands of documents held therein to extract all relevant biographical, design-related and business-related information.[68] This is the first time such extensive research has been done on this resource. The information extracted from the archive forms the basis of an

[67] In addition to works which provide a historical survey of the Irish American experience such as Jay Dolan's *The Irish Americans: A History*(2010), texts such as William Smith's *Irish Priests in the United States: A Vanishing Subculture* (2004) provide a more focused study of the experiences of Irish Catholic priests in the United States.
[68] Of necessity this meant that much information not relevant to this research was set aside in order to make the scale of the investigation manageable.

inventory of all the stained glass made for North American clients.[69] This includes details of clients, locations, windows, costs, subject matter, timescales and, where known, the artists responsible for individual designs.

This is augmented by site visits to each location in California where Clarke Studios windows are installed. In addition to capturing images of each window, this aspect of the research provides local context to the churches and the windows, as well as the opportunity to learn about the history of their commissioning.[70]

The most revealing information discovered by this research is held in the correspondence records of Clarke Studios. The details of interactions between the Clarke Studios manager and clients, architects, government departments, newspapers and publications, staff and other people involved in the craft reveal the everyday concerns of all involved. Of most interest are the exchanges with individuals who were interested in or who had committed to commissioning the Clarke Studios work. This correspondence provides insight into aspects of the patron/artist relationship such as the motivation for ordering from Clarke Studios, the patron's input into the design process, the issues that occurred, the professional and social networks they were involved in, and their response to the finished work. It also reveals how Clarke Studios sold their products, the aesthetic intention behind designs, how they responded to patron's concerns and how they carried out their normal business operation. The retrieval of this information is the first time such extensive research has been carried out for on this resource.

The final step is to merge these elements of context and inventory and, by taking examples of a number of commissions, analyse the imagery, correspondence and other contemporaneous material associated with each project to respond to the research questions raised. Three case studies which are deemed to be representative of the majority of the Clarke Studios commissions are used to carry out this analysis in Chapter Four (*Meaning*).

[69] This information is held in a database created by the author.
[70] All windows that were made were photographed by the author with the exception of one location (St Brigid's, San Francisco) which is no longer a Catholic church and is not generally accessible.

This approach allows conclusions to be drawn about how Clarke Studios operated as a business to sell and deliver their work in the United States, the extent of stained glass they delivered to patrons in California, and the motivation behind why they were commissioned to do so.

1.3. Thesis Structure

This thesis is structured into three main research chapters *Clarke Studios*, *Patronage* and *Meaning*, with an introductory chapter and a conclusion. The *Introduction and Research Approach*, introduces the subject, describing the context of research, the research questions raised and the approach adopted answer those questions.

Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*) is concerned with the company as an art business. The chapter is broken into three parts. Part One examines Clarke Studios as a company. It traces the history of the business from its origin as the stained glass and church decorating firm of Joshua Clarke and Sons, through to the takeover of the stained glass business by Harry Clarke and its continued operations for forty years after his death. The chapter describes the distinctive aesthetic style of Clarke and how that became one of the pillars of the success of the company in winning new orders.

Part Two then investigates how Clarke Studios managed to exploit opportunities to sell a large proportion of its stained glass to patrons in the United States. The 'Harry Clarke' name was an important factor in the company's success in achieving this. As Clarke was the originator behind the style of stained glass that was produced, the extent to which the artists who worked there remained true to his aesthetic in the years after his death is investigated. An example of Harry Clarke's own original work is compared against later stained glass produced by Clarke Studios to establish the extent of any divergence and the reasons why.

The business operation of Clarke Studios is then examined, including identifying the main personnel, describing how the company advertised and promoted its work (including taking advantage of Irish State support for exporting businesses), how they dealt with competition, how the long

distance design process worked, and the process involved in executing commissions.

Part Three, the final section of the chapter, considers the principal factors which led to the loss of business in the United States, which was a significant contributing factor to the Clarke Studios closure in 1973.

Chapter Three (*Patronage*) investigates the factors which led to the demand for Irish stained glass in the United States, focusing in particular on the part played by Irish immigrants and Irish pastoral missionary priests in building parish communities. The chapter outlines the growth in Catholicism in the United States in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, and how this led to an increase in the number of Irish priests working in the country. This in turn led to Irish American clergy having a dominant position in the American Catholic Church. The chapter then considers the role of many of those priests in supervising church building and decoration projects in the mid-twentieth century, and how in a number of cases they turned to Ireland for the provision of stained glass for their churches. Concentrating on California, the area with the largest cluster of installed work, Clarke Studios won important commissions in Sacramento, Los Angeles and San Francisco in the 1930s and '40s, and these are described in detail as they laid the foundation for follow-on work in those cities. The chapter then describes the progression of commissions and the common threads between them which led to Clarke Studios winning many orders in the 1950s and '60s.

Chapter Four (*Meaning*) builds on the previous chapters, looking at how the stained glass commissions can be read as works of art, signifiers of identity, and as cultural agents. Taking a broad view of the Irish experience in the United States, it considers the nature of Irish immigration in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, and how Irish Americans sought to improve their standing in society through the mid-twentieth century. The chapter describes events where Ireland had opportunities to establish its image abroad as a progressive nation through participation at World's Fairs, and concentrates on one specific aspect which is the focus of this research – expressions of Irishness in stained glass purchased for new church buildings. It considers the meaning that can be ascribed to the commissioning of Irish

stained glass and the extent to which that meaning is expressed in the style and imagery present in individual windows. The chapter examines what these objects tell us about why they came to be commissioned and what agency they carry in terms of the construction of an immigrant Irish aesthetic. A number of case studies are presented which, drawing primarily on correspondence records, describe the motivation behind the purchases, and their installation and reception by the Clarke Studios' clients.

The Conclusion summarises the thesis and develops overall conclusions from its findings which answer the questions which frame this research. It highlights the contribution this research makes to the history of Irish stained glass and Irish American culture, and identifies opportunities for further study.

1.4. Note on the Clarke Studios Correspondence

The Clarke Studios archive is the most important primary source used to inform this research. Within that archive the most commonly used source is the inward and outward correspondence records of the company. The company clerical secretary for most of the period covered by this research was Miss Alice O'Sullivan (1881 – 1968).[71] Outgoing letters were typed by Miss O'Sullivan and carbon copies of all that correspondence were kept and bound in an annual 'letter book'. When these letter books were catalogued by TCD Library they were given a volume number, and each page has a folio number. For example, letters for the year 1960 have the volume number TCD MS 6028 and within that each page of correspondence has unique number. In this thesis a reference to a specific page includes the sender name, recipient name, the date the letter was sent and the TCD Manuscript reference, for example:

> Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Michael Lyons, 23rd April 1949. TCD MS 6017/216.

Inward correspondence is less structured, and less complete. In some cases it is organised by client location and in other cases it is stored sequentially

[71] Ms Doris Hansard took over the role when Miss O'Sullivan (as she was called) retired in 1964.

by year of receipt. The same format of referencing is used for inward correspondence, for example:

> Letter from Rev. Michael O'Callaghan to William Dowling, 25th February 1965. TCD MS 6117/2/5.

For example, Appendix 2 contains a copy of the initial correspondence exchanges relating to a new commission at Immaculate Conception Church, Sacramento.

The manager of Clarke Studios for most of the period considered in this thesis was William Dowling. One of the helpful aspects of Dowling's writing style was that in responding to inward correspondence he frequently repeated the content of the letter he received. Therefore, this gives a view of both sides of an exchange in a single source, which can be useful if the original inward correspondence item is not available.

2. Clarke Studios

2.1. Introduction

In the first two decades of the twentieth century the business of stained glass provision in Ireland evolved from being largely reliant on imported windows to the setting up of an indigenous capability which not only served the needs of patrons in Ireland but also clients around the world. This progression, which aligned with the Irish Arts and Crafts revival, saw the emergence of a group of artists who excelled in the craft of stained glass design and manufacture. In some cases, artists worked alone as independent commercial enterprises, and in other cases they worked for studios and co-operatives. Studios such as Joshua Clarke and Sons, which was subsequently renamed Harry Clarke Stained Glass Studios, (1886 – 1973), An Túr Gloine (1903 – 1944), The Craftworkers (1919 – c1960) and Earley & Company (1858 – 1975) made original-designed stained glass windows, mainly for churches and commercial buildings throughout Ireland.[1] Artists such as Harry Clarke, Michael Healy (1873 – 1941), Evie Hone (1894 – 1955) and Wilhelmina Geddes worked in Ireland and as their reputations, and the reputation of Irish and crafts in general, grew they also earned commissions in Britain and further afield in Australia, Belgium, Canada, New Zealand and the United States.[2] By the 1950s a number of new Irish companies had been set up, including Irish Stained Glass Limited (1957 – 2006) and Abbey Stained Glass Studio (1944 – present). Earley & Company and Harry Clarke Stained Glass Studios continued to make stained glass for Irish clients and for export. Analysis of the Clarke Studios business archive indicates that the largest overseas market for their products was the United States.[3]

The focus of this research is on the work of Harry Clarke Stained Glass Studios for the United States. Specifically, this chapter examines how Clarke

[1] Joshua Clarke and Sons was renamed Harry Clarke Stained Glass Limited in 1930. An Túr Gloine artists included Alfred Child (1875 – 1939), Michael Healy, Ethyl Rhind (1877 – 1952), Catherine O'Brien (1881 – 1963) and Beatrice Elvery (1883 – 1970). The principal artist working at The Craftworkers was William McBride (1880 – 1962).
[2] David Caron, Nicola Gordon Bowe, Michael Wynne (eds.), *The Gazetteer of Irish Stained Glass* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2021), p. 221. Geddes moved to work in London in 1925 and Clarke unsuccessfully attempted to set up a studio in London in 1927/28.
[3] The data for Clarke Studios has been derived from an analysis of the order books and correspondence of the company held in TCD Library. In 1966 the manager of the Clarke Studios wrote that 80% of their output was exported to overseas clients. Letter from William Dowling to Desmond Rush, *The Irish Independent*, 30th June 1966. TCD MS 6034/267.

Studios identified and created opportunities within the American market, and what the company did to maintain a significant amount of patronage for its work in this region into the 1950s and '60s. The chapter looks at the formation of the business in 1930 by Harry and Margaret Clarke (1884 – 1961), and how the company built on Harry Clarke's artistic legacy after his death in 1931. By retaining the late Harry Clarkes' name on the business, Clarke Studios ensured that the company could leverage to the fullest extent the reputation Clarke had developed for his own work. The extent to which this was a factor in securing commissions abroad will be considered.

The chapter investigates how the business obtained significant orders in the United States and outlines the logistics and the practicalities involved in the design, making and installation processes. Also examined are the textual and iconographic sources the artists used in the design process, particularly when working on United States-specific subjects which may have been unfamiliar. The chapter investigates the extent to which Studio artists were expected to conform to a collective style that was representative of the 'brand' of Clarke Studios, where individual expression was sublimated to fit that recognisable appearance. The company endeavoured to match the style and quality of Harry Clarke's stained glass, and promoted their work as such. The extent to which they achieved this is examined in an argued case study.

The impact of other factors that influenced the artist's designs for new commissions, including the patron's suggestions, architectural features of the buildings, funds available for the work, the influence of contemporary styles of art and architecture, previous work done in a location and the effect of the Irish connection in terms of the aesthetic strategy, will also be considered. Finally, the chapter reflects on the causes of the decline in the business which eventually led to its closure in 1973.

As was the case with Harry Clarke's stained glass work, the majority of the Clarke Studios output, including all the commissions for American clients, relates to the figurative representation of religious subject matter.[4] While

[4] The Clarke Studios did a small number of commissions which they considered as having non-figurative or 'abstract' elements, namely stained glass for the Sisters of the Perpetual

acknowledging that Clarke Studios also designed and made stained glass for domestic and business environments, much of it abstract or purely decorative, this thesis focuses on their ecclesiastical stained glass, which includes the iconography, allegorical figures and narratives that generally relate to the advocacy of the Christian faith, namely Roman Catholic.

While this chapter draws in part on previously published biographical and art-historical sources, the substance of the insight into the work of Clarke Studios has been gained from an examination of the business archives of the company. In particular, copies of the correspondence between the Clarke Studios manager and clients provide a rich sense of the concerns of all involved in the everyday workings of the business.

Rosary chapel in Lancaster Pennsylvania (1955), the Church of Our Lady's Nativity in New York (1965) and St Mary's Cathedral in Cork (1967).

2.2. Part One – Clarke Studios as a Business

2.2.1. *Background and Early Years*

A renaissance in stained glass making in Ireland occurred in the first quarter of the twentieth century. The passing of the Catholic Emancipation Act in 1829 and the disestablishment of the Church of Ireland in 1869 led to a surge of Roman Catholic church building throughout the nineteenth century.[5] This building programme, primarily in the Gothic revivalist style, in turn created a demand for ecclesiastical decoration.[6] In 1864 Thomas Earley together with Henry and Edward Powell set up their business Earley & Powell at 1, Camden Street, Dublin.[7] This business operated in competition with up to fifty smaller local workshops throughout Ireland.[8] Competition also came from the importation of windows from suppliers such as Mayer of Munich, Lobin of Tours and Heaton, Butler & Bayne of London, all producing work in a High Victorian-style pictorial idiom.[9] Often commissions were awarded to the lowest tender with little consideration of site, light or circumstances and, in the view of Gordon Bowe, generally portraying uninspired subject matter.[10]

It was into this environment that in 1877 Joshua Clarke (1858 – 1921) came to Dublin from Leeds, England, finding employment as a sales representative for an ecclesiastical supplier.[11] In 1886 he set up his own church decorating business at 33 North Frederick Street. In 1892 he added stained glass window provision as a service, acting as an agent for Mayer of Munich and bringing in a draughtsman and stained glass artist, James E.

---

[5] Barry O'Leary, 'Richard Pierce: Architect and Acolyte of the Gothic Revival', in Michael McCarthy and Karina O'Neill (eds.), *Studies in the Gothic Revival* (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2008), p. 160.

[6] Nicola Gordon Bowe, 'Harry Clarke, An Túr Gloine and the Early Twentieth-Century Irish Stained Glass Revival' in John M. Hearne, *Glassmaking in Ireland* (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 2010), p. 195.

[7] The company name changed to Earley and Co. in 1903. Nicola Gordon Bowe, 'Harry Clarke, An Túr Gloine and the Early Twentieth-Century Irish Stained Glass Revival' in John M. Hearne, *Glassmaking in Ireland* (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 2010), p. 201.

[8] David Caron, Nicola Gordon Bowe, Michael Wynne (eds.), *The Gazetteer of Irish Stained Glass* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2021), p. 11.

[9] Christine Casey, *Dublin: The City Within the Grand and Royal Canals and the Circular Road with the Phoenix Park* (New Haven, Conn.; London: Yale University Press, 2005), p. 63.

[10] Nicola Gordon Bowe, David Caron, Michael Wynne (eds.), *The Gazetteer of Irish Stained Glass* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2021), p. 9.

[11] Biographical note published online at http://www.dia.ie/architects/view/1054/CLARKE,+JOSHUA+* (accessed 25th January 2021).

Pope, from England.[12] Pope worked for the company for twelve years until he was replaced by William Nagle (1853 – 1923) a Dublin man, who had been an art student of the Royal Hibernian Academy Schools.[13] Thus the firm of Joshua Clarke and Sons became established as a stained glass and church furnishings provider, initially in Ireland and from 1896 also doing work in England.[14]

The revival of stained glass making in Ireland coincided with the Irish cultural revival at the beginning of the twentieth century and brought about an increase in demand for home-produced products. In order to meet the high demand for ecclesiastical decoration, the manufacturing processes which produced imported stained glass had become industrialised, a process that produced well-made windows of good quality design that looked pleasing but lacked the artistic qualities or creative innovations of earlier periods.[15] One of the leading figures of the Irish Literary Revival was Edward Martyn (1859 – 1923).[16] He recognised the potential for creating an indigenous Irish stained glass industry that would promote the development of new skills, create employment in Ireland and produce recognisably Irish products, in terms of themes and where possible materials, to compete with imported goods. In 1903 Martyn provided the impetus for two initiatives that would support this drive – the inauguration of stained glass classes at the Dublin Metropolitan School of Art and the founding of a new stained glass manufacturing business. An Túr Gloine, a cooperative workshop for stained glass, mosaics and other related crafts, was established by Martyn with the support of the celebrated Irish portrait painter Sarah Purser (1848 - 1943).[17] At Martyn's instigation A.E. Child (1875 - 1939) was appointed as the teacher of stained glass at the DMSA and he was also retained as chief artist at An Túr Gloine. Up to that time Child had been an assistant of the English

[12] Nicola Gordon Bowe, *Harry Clarke: The Life and Work* (Dublin: The History Press Ireland, 2012), p. 37.
[13] William Dowling, 'Harry Clarke: Stained Glass Artist', *Dublin Historical Record*, Vol. 17 (2), (1962), p. 55.
[14] Clarke Studios order book, TCD MS 6058, published online at http://digitalcollections.tcd.ie/ (accessed on 24th August 2020).
[15] Nicola Gordon Bowe, 'Introduction', in David Caron, Nicola Gordon Bowe, Michael Wynne (eds.), *The Gazetteer of Irish Stained Glass* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2021), p. 9.
[16] Martyn was a leading figure in the Irish Literary Revival and was also instrumental in the setting up of the Abbey Theatre and the Palestrina Choir in Dublin.
[17] Nicola Gordon Bowe, 'Two Early Twentieth-Century Irish Arts and Crafts Workshops in Context: An Túr Gloine and the Dun Emer Guild and Industries', *Journal of Design History*, Vol. 2, (2/3), (1989), p. 194. An Túr Gloine translates from Irish as The Tower of Glass.

artist Christopher Whall (1849 - 1924) who was described by Gordon Bowe as being the most progressive stained glass artist and teacher in the British Arts and Crafts movement.[18] Martyn's intention was that the workshop would act as a catalyst for the improvement of Irish church art. Purser had the same goal, and she also supported An Túr Gloine with her financial resources and her business acumen. Both Purser and Martyn believed that religious art was best supplied by individual artists and crafts people serving site-specific needs, working for a sympathetic architect or patron, rather than relying on industrially-manufactured products based on neo-medieval designs.[19]

The artistic vocabulary of An Túr Gloine and the students of DMSA drew from the richness of early Christian art in Ireland – its sculpture, metalwork and illumination. One aim of the revival of stained glass was to create a sense of national uniqueness modelled on artefacts from earlier times, such as the Cross of Cong, the Ardagh Chalice and the Books of Kells and Durrow.[20] In effect, the newly designed images were woven into a pattern of Irishness, promoting an Irish identity using the motifs and colours of Christian artefacts and illuminated manuscript decoration.[21] Thus, Purser and Martyn, with the help of Child, set new artistic, technical and stylistic standards in Irish stained glass design and manufacture. In the context of this research, this aspect of design would become important when Irish American clients wished to reference their Irish connections when commissioning stained glass. For example, for one design the Cross of Cong was used as a model for a cross included in a design for a window on the subject of St Patrick, made for St Ambrose Church, Los Angeles, (figure 3).

[18] Nicola Gordon Bowe, *Harry Clarke: The Life and Work* (Dublin: The History Press Ireland, 2012), p. 36.
[19] J. Turpin, 'Modernism, Tradition and Debates on Religious Art in Ireland 1920–1950', *Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review*, 91, 363 (2002), p. 253.
[20] This did not only apply to stained glass but also to other design work including jewellery making, shopfront design and tombstones.
[21] Jeanne Sheehy asserts that the distinctive work created by the artists who were involved in the Arts and Crafts movement was the only true expression of new Irish art at the start of the twentieth century. Jeanne Sheehy, *The Rediscovery of Ireland's Past the Celtic Revival, 1830–1930* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1980), p. 189.

2.2.2. *Harry Clarke's Influence and Style*

Early Years

Harry Clarke's first experience of stained glass was gained while working in his father's studio. At the time he started his employment in the family business the type of work produced by the company was conventional, drawing on the styles and forms of English and German stained glass companies which was in demand at the time (figure 4).

Ecclesiastical art procured in Ireland in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries tended to be conservative in style due to the standardisation of imagery deemed acceptable in Catholic churches.[22] Wilson (2011) describes the shift in the practice of Catholicism in Ireland during the second half of the nineteenth century from one based on pilgrimages, patterns and wakes towards the "fixed and emphatically figurative imagery of Tridentine Catholicism".[23] As described in section 3.2, a key figure in the introduction of this change was Archbishop Paul Cullen, whose promotion of an ultramontane (i.e. Pope-centred) canon saw a standardised approach to Catholic practice which included the scope and appearance of imagery that could be used in church decoration, both in Ireland and internationally.

Catholic art was expected to conform to the norms and regulations of approved religious imagery as defined in 1563 by the Council of Trent, which was reaffirmed with the publication of the 1917 Code of Canon law.[24] In this way the Catholic Church asserted "dogmatic and iconographical control" to combat 'modern' art which did not contain the specific values attributed to religious representations, whose deviation from traditional models could be deemed as being sacrilegious.[25]

This determined a consistency in the representation of a standardised range of religious figures and doctrines.[26] Standard representations of the form

[22] Ann Wilson, *Catholic Ireland: The Catholic Church and the construction of an Irish Catholic Identity, 1879-1923* (PhD Thesis, National College of Art and Design, 2011), p. 195.
[23] Ibid. p. 28.
[24] Dario Gamboni, *The Destruction of Art: Iconoclasm and Vandalism since the French Revolution* (London: Reaktion Books, 2007), p.240.
[25] Ibid. p. 241.
[26] In the early twentieth century these subjects typically included the Sacred Heart of Jesus, doctrines associated with the Virgin Mary and the Holy Family, Ann Wilson, *Catholic Ireland:*

and iconography associated with these subjects emerged, which clients deemed acceptable for their commissions of decorative objects including stained glass. This impacted the freedom artists had in producing work, i.e. they were expected to provide imagery which conformed to the 'norm' for each subject. Artists and craftsmen generally avoided experimentation and novelty of expression in order to conform with restrictions imposed by the Catholic Church in order to ensure that the "visual expression of heresies and unorthodoxies (witting or unwitting) was not officially endorsed".[27]

Harry Clarke learned the art of stained glass from William Nagle in the family's studio during the day and from A.E. Child as a part-time student in the School of Art at night.[28] In September 1910 he was awarded a scholarship by DATI which allowed him to take up his studies on a full-time basis.[29] In addition to studying the art of stained glass-making he continued to develop his skills as a graphic artist, winning awards for poster designs and book illustrations.[30]

In 1911 he submitted three cartoons and two sections in stained glass to the National Competition at the Royal College of Art in South Kensington, London, a competition open to practitioners across Britain and Ireland.[31] His entry won the overall Gold Medal for Ireland for that year and he went on to win the Gold Medal again in 1912 and 1913.[32] These works were also submitted to the annual Art Industries Exhibition at the Royal Dublin Society where they won awards and critical acclaim from the judges.[33] His unique style and technical mastery were recognised by the judges in entries such as

---

The Catholic Church and the construction of an Irish Catholic Identity, 1879-1923 (PhD Thesis, National College of Art and Design, 2011), p. 102.

[27] Ibid, p. 196. As will be discussed anon, this approach was challenged somewhat during the twentieth century by the work made during the Arts and Crafts Revival, developments in Modernism and the advance of abstract art.

[28] Nicola Gordon Bowe, *Harry Clarke: The Life and Work* (Dublin: The History Press Ireland, 2012), p. 38, 39.

[29] Ibid. p. 45.

[30] Ibid. pp. 52-56. Later in his career Clarke went on to win a number of important book illustration commissions including Andersen's *Fairy Tales of Hans Christian Andersen* (1916), Poe's *Tales of Mystery and Imagination* (1919: 2nd edition 1923) and Goethe's *Faust* (1925).

[31] See Appendix 3 for definitions of the terms cartoon and section.

[32] Clarke was not awarded an actual medal in 1912 and 1913 as an individual can only be presented with the medal once. William Dowling, 'Harry Clarke: Dublin Stained Glass Artist', *Dublin Historical Record*, 17, 2 (1962), p. 56.

[33] Nicola Gordon Bowe, *Harry Clarke: The Life and Work* (Dublin: The History Press Ireland, 2012), p. 52.

The Unhappy Judas in 1913 (figure 5).[34] This panel shows his command of colour, symbolism, draughtsmanship and it exploits the unique properties of glass windows. It depicts Judas, just before his death with a noose being placed around his neck by a flame-haired figure which represents Satan; at the top of the window is an image of Judas's body being carried by "wicked spirits".[35] Clarke's design is dominated by a yellow robe worn by Judas, a colour associated with deceit and cowardice. The robe is embedded with coins, each bearing the head of the Roman Emperor, symbolising his betrayal of Christ for thirty pieces of silver. His drawing of the face of Judas captures a sorrowful aspect of the character, perhaps indicating a degree of remorse for his actions, while the conceited image of Satan indicates a smug arrogance. The thick leading which holds many small pieces of decorative glass creates a crowded atmosphere in the upper part of the window, which heightens the intensity of the image.[36]

In November 1913 Clarke won a travel scholarship from DATI which enabled him to go to Europe to study further.[37] He visited Chartres Cathedral in France in January 1914 where he had the opportunity to examine at first hand the work of thirteenth-century stained glass masters. He saw techniques such as juxtaposing colours to create harmonies in the eye of the onlooker, the use of decorative borders around each panel, the need for clearly legible iconography and figures with powerful facial expressions.[38] His second trip to France in May of that year took him to Paris, Fécamp, Amiens and Rouen where he observed the expressive use of leadlines, the intricate juxtaposition of ruby and blue glass and the inclusion of humorous or symbolic narrative details, particularly around the principal figures – all of which he would later include in his own designs.[39]

Clarke saw that the beauty of medieval windows he had studied in France was born from the artists understanding of glass as a medium. For his own work he did not imitate the style of stained glass he saw in the cathedrals of

[34] Ibid. p. 53.
[35] Ibid. Gordon Bowe associates this image with the description of Judas's suicide in Voraigne's *Golden Legend*.
[36] The leading holds the individual pieces of glass together.
[37] Nicola Gordon Bowe, *Harry Clarke: The Life and Work* (Dublin: The History Press Ireland, 2012), p. 66.
[38] Ibid. p. 68.
[39] Ibid. p. 76.

Chartres and Rouen but created his own form of design which allowed for an inventive interpretation of the subject. He began creating his own original style which was distinguished by a richness of colour and his own imaginative forms, while remaining true to the great traditions of glass art. By revealing the jewel-like character of coloured glass and including elements of pertinent symbolism he gave his subjects a mystical feeling which was desirable in ecclesiastical art.[40]

Clarke's Approach to Design

For his ecclesiastical stained glass work, Clarke was not satisfied with reproducing conventional images of religious themes and saints but re-interpreted these subjects for each commission. His approach to every project was that the work was an original design for a specific client in a specific architectural setting for a specific price. His aim was to create distinctive works of art that avoided mediocre, sentimental or overly familiar representations of the subject. Clarke's choice of symbolism and iconography was designed to convey a deeper sense of the subject where the constraints and potential of glass as a medium, including its inconsistencies and imperfections, were accepted and exploited.

He was aware of developments in the world of art in Ireland and Europe, and from these he included elements that he found most attractive in his own work if it was appropriate to the subject matter. He spent time working in London where his cultural experiences included visits to the National Gallery and attending productions by the Ballets Russes, at which he took particular interest in the modernist costume designs of Léon Bakst.[41] He also looked for inspiration in various publications including the arts magazine *The Studio* and the German publication *The Firebird* which showcased Russian

[40] While Clarke did execute private commissions, the majority of his stained glass commissions were for religious patrons. Gordon Bowe (2012) provides a list of stained glass windows attributed to Harry Clarke in: Nicola Gordon Bowe, *Harry Clarke: The Life and Work* (Dublin: The History Press Ireland, 2012), pp. 312 - 320.

[41] Léon Bakst was a Russian artist whose work included costume and scenery designs for the ballet company Ballet Russes. Clarke was an avid admirer of Bakst's work and adapted some of his designs in his own illustration and stained glass work, including his designs for Hans Christian Andersen's *Fairy Tales* and figures in his *Eve of St Agnes* panel. Nicola Gordon Bowe, *Harry Clarke: The Life and Work* (Dublin: The History Press Ireland, 2012), p. 161. This aspect of Clarke's work is explored further in, Jessica O'Donnell, 'A Gorgeous Gallery of Poetic Pictures', in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds.) *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish state* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019), p. 65.

writing and illustration.[42] His exposure to this variety of aesthetic sources gave him ideas with which to experiment and to adapt for his own stained glass work, merging his ideas of style and symbolism with familiar religious iconography.

Where one of his religious commissions was for a window depicting a particular saint his interpretation of the subject was the result of detailed research into the life of that individual. Using texts such as Rev. John O'Hanlon's *Lives of the Irish Saints* (1877 – 1905), he developed an understanding of the hagiography associated with the saint.[43] This allowed him to create an original interpretation of the character and narrative, often choosing elements that would differentiate his work from commonplace renderings of the subject.[44] In his stained glass that depicts religious scenes, his imaginative approach to story-telling includes figures that relate to one another in a way which more resembles a theatrical scene made in glass than what was common in religious imagery of the time. An example of this can be seen in his stained glass window depicting *The Visitation* (figure 6) in the church of St Peter and St Paul, Balbriggan (1924). Details in the window such as the sinuous floral motifs, the lush green carpet under Mary's feet, the enigmatic female figure behind Mary who carries an urn depicting the Annunciation, and Elizabeth's husband Zachary whose peering gaze directly engages the viewer, all add to the narrative and the striking visual impact of Clarke's window. By engaging the viewer, Clarke extends the traditional focus of the scene beyond Mary and Elizabeth, inviting the viewer to act as a witness to the event. The scene appears as a theatrical performance using the exaggerated gestures and intense eye contact between the main figures to animate the event. The secondary figures act as supporting characters and the background townscape gives a sense of place. This window is an

[42] Clarke subscribed to the periodical *Firebird* (*Jar-Ptitza*), which was published in Berlin in the 1920s. It presented illustrations by Russian artists and literary works by a number of Russian writers. Letter from Harry Clarke to Anton Zwemmer, London bookseller, 22nd July 1924. TCD MS 5995/622.
[43] Rev. John O'Hanlon produced nine volumes entitled *Lives of the Irish Saints* between 1877 and 1905, the last of which was published posthumously. An example of Clarke's use of such texts is given below when describing some of Clarke's work at the Honan Hostel Chapel, Cork. Other sources included Margaret Stokes, *Early Christian Art in Ireland* (London: Chapman and Hall, 1894) and various texts at the National Library of Ireland, William Dowling, 'Recollections of Harry Clarke R.H.A. During the Years 1928 – 1931', (unpublished document, in the personal archive of Ms. Mary Clarke).
[44] Nicola Gordon Bowe, *The Life and Work of Harry Clarke*, (PhD Thesis, Trinity College Dublin, 1982), p. 791.

example of how Clarke uses dramatic elements to allow the viewer to connect the representation of the subject with reality. In this and other windows depicting religious scenes he instilled a presence in his subjects that animated them, filling them with character, as if they were protagonists participating in a drama for the viewer to witness.[45]

His delicately worked designs for the *Annunciation* (1922) and *The Blessed Virgin in Glory* (1923) stained glass windows in St Joseph's Church, Terenure, Dublin, are examples of how he drew from European influences to create works of sacred art that were recognised as being "a long way from the excessively sentimental style of religious art generally accepted at the time".[46] The latter window will be examined in detail in Case Study 1 which will be used as a point of reference to compare how Clarke Studios' later work for American clients in the 1950s and '60s matched Clarke's own work.

This approach to making stained glass windows was not merely to achieve a pictorial effect but to use the qualities inherent in the medium to realise a distinctive artistic impact only achievable through the manipulation of light through glass. Clarke made no attempt to imitate a subject as it would have been painted on canvas, but instead he used the intrinsic properties of the materials to give the effect of a mosaic of colour, which had a limited amount of painting in order to emphasise the beauty and colour of the glass, with the ultimate goal of realising the spiritual success of the work.[47] This led to work where, as described by William Dowling the garments of a figure "are not intended to represent a material like wool or velvet as in a canvas painting but rather that the figure should be clothed in a mystical radiance of brilliantly coloured light".[48]

Harry Clarke's technique in achieving the jewel-like effect of his windows was by the use of small pieces of light-coloured glass set in a darker

[45] Paul Donnelly, 'Legacy and Identity: Harry Clarke, William Dowling and the Harry Clarke Studios', in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds.) *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish state* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019), p. 305.
[46] William Dowling, 'Harry Clarke: Dublin Stained Glass Artist', *Dublin Historical Record*, 17, 2 (1962), p. 60. Dowling joined the staff of the company in 1928 and was manager of the business from 1940 to 1973.
[47] William Dowling, *Description of the Style and Method of Stained Glass by the Harry Clarke Studios Dublin* (1947).TCD MS 6126/1/1.
[48] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Michael Lyons, 23rd April 1949. TCD MS 6017/216.

surround, and the careful use of drawing and staining. In 1932 the manager of Clarke Studios Cecil B. Simmonds (1904 – 1983) described the approach when explaining how Clarke designed his windows for the Convent of Notre Dame, Ashdown Park, England, which had been installed in 1925:

> The jewel-like effect which is obtained is arrived at by the use of very many small pieces of glass throughout i.e. figures which would normally be cut into say 20 different shapes of glass are here treated in as many as 50 or 60 (these figures I only quote as an example). Together with this a careful use of pigment on the surface of the glass adds to the sparkling result. Every piece of glass is painted with a view to enhancing its original colour, quality and brilliance and the object, from the time the work passes into the painter's hands, was to arrive at the jewel-like effect already referred to.[49]

Another aspect of Clarke's approach was his striking use of colour, using the full spectrum and achieving a great range of tone. In particular he used deep blues and reds combined with complementary shades to produce a rich mix of colours which he enhanced by careful painting of details to achieve a striking effect. The windows generally have a highly ornamented border, very often with what appears to be eye-catching flora, marine creatures or geometric patterns.[50] Clarke also used the best available quality of antique glass, choosing the strongest and clearest colours in order to achieve the desired effect.[51]

Harry Clarke used the term 'gadgets' to describe the idiosyncratic features of his designs which would distinguish his work from other artists, both in his stained glass and graphic art.[52] His figurative style is characterised by subjects that are sumptuously portrayed, frequently with highly decorated robes, headwear and footwear. They are often pale or of grey pallor,

---

[49] Letter from C. B. Simmonds to Sister Bernard, 10th May 1932. TCD MS 6004/339.
[50] Thus Clarke is bringing the real world into the 'other' world of religious subjects and stories. Kelly Sullivan, 'Harry Clarke's Natural World', in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds.) *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish state* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019), p. 102.
[51] Antique glass is made using a traditional mouth blowing method. See Appendix 3 for more detail.
[52] Nicola Gordon Bowe, *The Life and Work of Harry Clarke*, (PhD Thesis, Trinity College Dublin, 1982), p. 86. The distinctive aspects of Clarkes approach will be discussed further when considering how the Clarke Studios referenced his style in later work.

generally having elongated fingers and neck and enlarged sanpaku eyes.[53] Some of the figures gaze directly at the viewer, engaging them in the scene. Some have an ethereal aspect, appearing to have the ability to float as in the *St Stephen* window (1922) in Christ Church, Gorey Co Wexford (figure 7).

Clarke knew the importance of controlling the light that passed through a window in its specific location. For example, too much light through a lightly painted or coloured glass could overexpose the figure, washing out the impact of the window. He used the technique of enlarging the subject's eyes to avoid them being reduced by poor light, thereby adding to his stylisation of the figures. Through their expressions and gestures Clarke's figures possess a vitality and presence. This is different to the many other windows that had been manufactured in preceding decades which, although competently executed, were of conventional figures which do not instil the same emotion in the viewer as Clarke's windows do.

Donnelly (2019) comments that in Clarke's designs, the arrangement of the figures, the attention to clothing and headwear and the organisation of the space in which they are set has the appearance of a mise en scène for a performance of the subject of the work. In this way he takes the storytelling skills he had developed through his illustration work and translates them to a grander scale in his stained glass. He imbues his subjects with a fitting sense of their role in the narrative whether it is serene, tragic, threatening, macabre or devout. These features combine to make a striking visual impact on the viewer.[54]

In addition to his design and technical virtuosity Clarke also drew on his Irishness to distinguish his work from his peers in Ireland and Britain. This is particularly evident in his first significant stained glass commission, eleven

[53] Sanpaku is a Japanese expression to describe where the whites of the eyes are shown above or below the iris. While the use of this technique can be associated with poor health Clarke's use adds an element of emotional expression to the eyes. Toshie Evans, *A Dictionary of Japanese Loanwords* (Westport: Greenwod Press, 1977), p. 150.

[54] Paul Donnelly, 'Legacy and Identity: Harry Clarke, William Dowling and the Harry Clarke Studios', in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds.) *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish state* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019), p. 310.

windows for the Honan Hostel Chapel in Cork.[55] As argued by Wilson (2019) stained glass installed in Irish churches in the nineteenth century predominantly portrayed standard subjects which obeyed a restrained approach to design – a conventional religious figure or scene with few and obvious attributes.[56] Individual figures had a generic saintly look with no additional narrative elements to distract from the central subject.[57] This adherence to convention, initially propagated by leading international stained-glass firms such as Mayer of Munich and Hardman of Birmingham, and followed by Irish firms including Earley and Company and Joshua Clarke and Sons, made the subjects easily recognisable throughout Ireland, and internationally (figure 8).[58] Harry Clarke developed his own style along less conventional lines as will be seen in his work for the Honan Chapel, where he received his first significant stained glass commission.

The Honan Hostel Chapel

As the commissioning of the decoration of the Honan Chapel was under the control of Sir John O'Connell (1868 – 1943), a strong supporter of the Arts and Crafts movement and indigenous Irish craft, Clarke could not have had a better opportunity to break away from existing conventions and make a bold artistic impression. The architecture of the chapel, its stained glass windows and its furnishing are designed to make a statement that this chapel was "truly and sincerely Irish" and that it "showed forth much that was most distinctive and suggestive in the best age of Irish ecclesiastical art."[59] O'Connell credits early Christian missionaries returning from Continental Europe in the eleventh century for creating a distinctive Hiberno-Romanesque style of architecture, which blended European and native influences to create a distinctive Irish style – explicitly emphasising that it was more influenced by what they had seen in Europe than in England.[60] This style commonly features single and three-light windows and

[55] Between 1915 and 1917 Clarke designed and made eight single-light windows and one three-light window for the chapel.
[56] Ann Wilson, 'Harry Clarke: The Honan Chapel Windows (1915-17)', in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds.) *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish state* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019), p. 29.
[57] Ibid.
[58] Ibid. p. 19.
[59] John O'Connell, *The Honan Hostel Chapel Cork – Some Notes on the Building and the Ideals Which Inspired It* (Cork: Guy & Co., 1916), p. 11.
[60] Ibid. p. 22.

O'Connell commissioned both Harry Clarke and An Túr Gloine to provide stained glass for all the window openings in the chapel.

As Kreilcamp (2016) asserts, Clarke, like a number of his contemporaries in the Arts and Crafts movement, had turned for inspiration to Ireland's pre-conquest period of monastic achievement to assert a new identifier of Irishness, using his imagination and skill to produce artworks which Thomas Bodkin described as producing an "effect of splendour which is overpowering".[61]

To inform his designs for Irish saints (nine of the eleven figures he depicted in the Honan Chapel were Irish), Clarke delved into sources which related the narratives and mythology surrounding their character, finding details which enabled him to use his imagination to give an unconventional perspective of the subject. In this way Clarke created a unique brand of Irishness which relied less on commonplace Celtic-style iconography such as zoomorphic figures and interlace patterns, and more on imagery which related to long-standing Irish narratives.

For example, when designing the St Brigid window, O'Connell states that Clarke had referenced medieval writing found in medieval manuscripts such as *An Leabhar Breach* and *The Book of Lismore*.[62] For the St Gobnait window he referenced stories of her affinity with beekeeping and for the St Colmcille window he includes the lesser-known detail of the saint's encounter with a horse near the end of his life (figure 9).

Clarke's inclusion of distinctly Irish details can be seen in the predella of the St Brendan window (figure 10). As stated by Bowe (2012), Clarke's personal diary indicates that he consulted Matthew Arnold's (1822 – 1888) 1860 poem *Saint Brandan* and the seminal text on Brendan's voyage from the tenth century *Navigatio Sancti Brendani Abbatis* to find inspiration for his

[61] Vera Kreilcamp, 'Introduction', *Making it Irish* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2016), p. 11. Thomas Bodkin in 'The Art of Mr Harry Clarke', The Studio, Vol. 79 (320), November 1919, p.46. Published online at http://catalogue.nli.ie/Record/vtls000510111 (accessed on 3rd September 2021).
[62] John O'Connell, *The Honan Hostel Chapel Cork – Some Notes on the Building and the Ideals Which Inspired It* (Cork: Guy & Co., 1916), p. 41. Both are compilations of Irish legends written in the fifteenth century. An Leabhar Breach is held in the Royal Irish Academy and the Book of Lismore is held in University College Cork.

design.[63] In practical terms however, Clarke is most likely to have referenced a textbook such as Rev. John O'Hanlon's *Lives of Irish Saints*, which drew writings from these texts and from many other Irish, English and European sources into a compendium of accounts of the acts of Irish Saints.[64]

In volume five of the series Rev. O'Hanlon describes Brendan's meeting with Judas:

> At last, they find a naked rock, and upon it a man seemed to be fixed. Some thought he was a bird. He had a cloth tied about his head, and holding a javelin in his hand, he seemed hanging between two iron forceps, and tossed about by the waves, like a vessel labouring in a storm. He cried bitterly for assistance. Brendan desired the crew to cease discussing the matter, but to direct their vessel towards that place. When reaching it, the waves formed a circle, as if they had been frozen. They found that man sitting on a rock, deformed and wretched, and when the tides flowed towards him, they reached to where he sat, when they receded, only the naked rock appeared. The cloth, which hung before when the winds blew, flapped against his eyes and forehead.
>
> Next, Brandan asks Judas the meaning of the cloth which is tied around his head. Judas replies, that although in a great measure an impediment to him, yet he receives great benefit from it, since it shelters his head and face from the cutting winds, and prevents the fish from biting them; and, this advantage he obtained, because once, when on earth, he gave a piece of cloth to a beggar, or to a leper.[65]

Clarke's depiction of the scene draws from this description of the event. Judas is shown as an emaciated figure with cloven hands and feet, his flesh

[63] Nicola Gordon Bowe, *Harry Clarke: The Life and Work* (Dublin: The History Press Ireland, 2012), p. 49.
[64] Up to the time of his death in 1905 Rev. O'Hanlon had produced nine volumes chronicling the lives of Irish saints. The final volume was published posthumously.
[65] Rev. John O'Hanlon, Lives of Irish Saints Volume 5 (Dublin: James Duffy & Sons, before 1875), p. 434. O'Hanlon predominantly drew on European sources which describe the Irish monk's travels, including L. Tachet De Barneval's *Histoire Legendaire De L'Irlande (1857),* Francisque-Michel's *Les Voyages Merveilleux De Saint Brandan À La Recherche Du Paradis Terrestre* (1878) and *Navigatio Sancti Brendani*, originally published in the tenth century.

marked by the torture and burning of hell. The white cloth covers his head and flames lick around his body. Standing on their boat in the background are St Brendan, gazing stoically as he does in the main panel of the window, and the terrified figures of three accompanying monks. Clarke's grotesque figure of Judas conveys the dramatic account in the text, not idealising or moderating the drama of the encounter. While the viewer's eye will always be drawn to the main image of St Brendan, Clarke's curious figure of Judas enclosed under what appears as an arch of 'Celtic' interlace-inscribed stone catches the eye of the observer. Using Rev. O'Hanlon's text Clarke has found a detail in the life of this sixth century Irish saint which connects him with the New Testament account of the story of Judas.

In his review of Clarke's Honan Chapel designs the designer and metalworker Percy Oswald Reeves (1870 - 1967) firmly places Clarke as the leading proponent of what he termed modern Irish 'Celtic' art, which he differentiates from what he describes as sentimental copies of ancient Celtic work.[66] Clarke's investigation of ancient Irish sources to discover atypical detail, and his incorporation of such detail in designs which both illustrate and complement a subject, contribute to his standing as a unique Irish artist.

International Recognition of Clarke's Work

The quality of Clarke's work not only appealed to his patrons but was also given international recognition by the noted academic Dom Eugène Roulin (1860 – 1939) in his commentary on modern European church architecture, *Nos Églises*, published in 1938. Roulin was a French-born Benedictine monk who spent most of his working life in England, serving the Roman Catholic parish of Filey, Yorkshire. In a twenty-five-year period, he collected material and wrote the text for his comprehensive volume on ecclesiastical art and architecture. In this work, which was translated into English for United States distribution in 1947, Roulin provides guidelines for clergy and religious sisters on how they should decide on matters of church design and decoration when dealing with architects and artists. Roulin considered that Ireland had "reached the first rank in the art of stained glass by virtue of the

[66] P. Oswald Reeves,' The Irish Arts and Crafts Society', in *The Studio* (London: 1918), Volume 72. Published online at https://digi.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/diglit/studio1918/0007 (accessed 3rd September 2021).

skill of one lone genius, Harry Clarke".[67] His entry on Irish stained glass focuses solely on Clarke's work, dedicating nine pages of the text, including a list of where Clarke windows can be seen in England and Scotland, and seven images of designs and cartoons (figure 11). Roulin commented on these examples, and Clarke's work in general, that:

> The success of such an enterprise is significant and shows that in countless places they want no more copies or imitations of an art that is inimitable; and there is no doubt about it, Clarke windows are copies of nothing whatever, not even of the greatest works of a past era. All is of the freshness of spring, works of freedom, of tasteful originality, of deep religious poetry.[68]

In 1965 Clarke's work received wider exposure when two of the images included in the English edition of Roulin's book were included on the cover of the April edition of the *Messenger of the Sacred Heart,* published in New York.[69] An editorial note describing the work of Clarke Studios was also included in the magazine.

In his book *Adventures in Light and Colour* (1937), Charles J. Connick (1875 – 1945), the Boston-based artist and owner of the large stained glass studio which bore his name, recognised Harry Clarke's work as being "windows of distinction".[70] At the time of his death in 1945, Connick was described by *The New York Times* as being the "world's greatest contemporary craftsman in stained glass".[71] He had visited Europe, including Dublin and Cork, in the 1920s where he saw Clarke's work, as well as stained glass by Wilhelmina Geddes, Michael Healey and other artists at An Túr Gloine.[72] Connick, through his friendship with the prominent Boston architects Ralph Adams Cram (1863-1942) and Charles Maginnis (1867-1955), was instrumental in the An Túr Gloine studio winning several orders in the United States in the

---

[67] Dom E. Roulin, *Modern Church Architecture* (St. Louis: Herder Press, 1947), p. 81
[68] Ibid p. 476.
[69] Images of *The Crucifixion* and *The Resurrection* were printed on the cover. Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Lincoln Walsh SJ (editor of *Messenger of the Sacred Heart*), 27th January 1965.TCD MS 6033/39.
[70] Charles J. Connick, *Adventures in Light and Colour* (New York: Random House, 1937), p. 335.
[71] Anon, 'C. J. Connick Dies: Glass Craftsman'', *The New York Times*, 29th December 1945, p. 13.
[72] David Caron, *An Tur Gloine and Michael Healy (1873-1941)* (PhD Thesis, Trinity College Dublin, 1991), p. 150.

late 1920s and '30s.[73] It was also on Connick's recommendation that Harry Clarke was awarded the commission for nine figurative chancel windows and twenty-eight ornamental clerestory windows for the Basilica of St Vincent de Paul, New Jersey in 1928.[74] That commission is included among a short list of superior stained glass craftworks in a 1937 edition of the American-published periodical dedicated to the arts of the Catholic Church, *Liturgical Arts*.[75]

These references, in particular the endorsement of Roulin, added to the standing of Harry Clarke's work internationally and were used by Clarke Studios in correspondence and in advertising to promote their work in the United States after his death (figure 12).

In summary, Clarke's stained glass work was recognised as being the work of a master craftsman. His designs displayed a rich imagination and the execution, either by him personally or by studio artists under his supervision, showed his virtuosity in the medium. He took a medieval art form and modernised it, mastering the art of modelling light as it passes through glass so that the glass glows with luminous effect, giving the window its beauty. The stained glass he produced became recognised as distinctly by the hand of Harry Clarke, and hence distinctly a work of Irish originality. In his commissions for religious clients Harry Clarke combined his skills as a graphic artist and colourist with his in-depth knowledge of the subject and his keen imagination to design each stained glass window in a unique way, achieving what Mary Clerkin Higgins describes as "clarity, sparkle and richness" in his work.[76]

The Clarke Studios clients in the United States expected and were promised work "in accordance with the Harry Clarke tradition".[77] While it is likely that Harry Clarke's own style would have changed over time, part of the

[73] Ibid. p. 151.
[74] Charles J. Connick, *Adventures in Light and Colour* (New York: Random House, 1937), p. 335.
[75] Theophilus, Jr, 'Where to See Windows of Representative Craftsmen in Stained Glass in the United States', *Liturgical Arts,* Vol. 6 (2), (1937), p. 78.
[76] Mary Clerkin Higgins, 'Preface', in Lucy Costigan & Michael Cullen eds., *Strangest Genius*: *The Stained Glass of Harry Clarke* (Dublin: The History Press, 2010), p.13. Mary Clerkin Higgins is a noted American stained glass artist and conservator.
[77] Letter from Rev. Thomas Millett, San Francisco to William Dowling 20th July 1953.TCD MS 6130/1769.

incentive in commissioning the Clarke Studios work was that it derived from the style of stained glass that Clarke had gained wide recognition for in Ireland, Britain and the United States. How the studio artists carried on Clarke's style is dealt with in the following case study.

2.2.3. *Case Study 1, Part 1 - Harry Clarke Vs Clarke Studios Style*

Introduction

When bidding for commissions in the United States Clarke Studios referenced the stained glass of their late founder, the internationally renowned Harry Clarke, as a continuous inspiration behind their work. Clarke had created his own distinctive style and Clarke Studios promoted the company's new stained glass as being based on the qualities found in his windows.[78] When writing to a prospective client in Pittsburgh in 1954, the studio manager William Dowling listed a number of examples of Harry Clarke's work and went on to state:

> These works set the standard by which the Studios became noted, and since Harry Clarke's death in 1931, the ideals and aspirations of its founder have been maintained.[79]

As will be described presently, this reference was an important factor in the choice of Clarke Studios as a provider of stained glass for American clients.

As Clarke Studios promoted Harry Clarke-style stained glass, the question arises as to the extent to which the studios' artists were true to Clarke's original design aesthetic. Did their work continue to match that of Harry Clarke or, alternatively, did they simply use elements of Clarke's style which they combined with their own artistic expression to produce Clarke-influenced work rather than close copies of Clarke's own work? That question is addressed by this case study. The first part of the study describes an example of Clarke's stained glass work in detail and sets the parameters for a comparison with the later work of Clarke Studios. In Part Two of this chapter, selected works by Clarke Studios for American clients

[78] In this context the term 'style' refers to the compositional elements, iconographic references and technical execution that made Clarke's work unique.
[79] Letter from William Dowling to Mrs R Mitchell, January 1954. TCD MS 6129/1170.

will be examined to determine how faithful they were to his original approach and aesthetic.

The Blessed Virgin in Glory, St Joseph's, Terenure

In 1922 Harry Clarke was commissioned by Rev. John Healy, the parish priest of St Joseph's Parish, Terenure, to make two lancet windows for the Lady Chapel in the church. Rev. Healy gave Clarke carte blanche over their design and the subjects chosen were *The Annunciation* and *The Blessed Virgin in Glory*.[80] The subjects for the windows refer specifically to the location of the works in the building (the Lady Chapel) and more generally to the designation of the Virgin Mary in the Catholic Church as "Mother of Christ, Mother of the Church".[81]

Following the death of his father Joshua Clarke in 1921, Harry Clarke took on increased responsibilities in running the family business, leaving him with less time to work on stained glass. The Terenure windows are among the last designed and executed by him without the aid of assistants.[82] As such they offer the opportunity to benchmark Clarke's work at a time when he was at the height of his capacity as a stained glass artist and craftsman.[83]

The first window completed was *The Annunciation* in 1922. Clarke entered it in the RDS Aonach Tailteann Art competition of that year, where it was awarded first place and the Silver Medal in the Stained Glass category.[84] While both windows are distinctly the work of Clarke, *The Blessed Virgin in Glory* window, described by Thomas Bodkin (1887 – 1961) at the time as having "a quality of hierarchic mysticism and grandeur", is of a more complex design, where he applied the full range of his stylistic and imaginative creativity in its execution.[85] The window is an example of the many aspects of Clarke's talent as a designer and maker, and as such offers

[80] Nicola Gordon Bowe, *Harry Clarke* (Dublin: Douglas Hyde Gallery, 1979), p. 112. Clarke had previously made a large three-light window, *The Crucifixion* (1920), for the church.
[81] As defined in *The Catechism of the Catholic Church*, Article 9, Paragraph 6 accessed online at https://www.vatican.va/archive/ccc_css/archive/catechism/p123a9p6.htm 22/3/2021.
[82] Based on the determinations made by Nicola Gordon Bowe in her biography *The Life and Work of Harry Clarke* (2012).
[83] The windows provide a practical point of reference when comparing his original work with the Clarke Studios later work in terms of iconography and style.
[84] Nicola Gordon Bowe, *Harry Clarke* (Dublin: Douglas Hyde Gallery, 1979), p. 206. Aonach Tailteann was a cultural and sports festival organised by the Irish Free State Government, first held in 1922.
[85] Thomas Bodkin, 'Mr Harry Clarke's New Windows', *The Irish Times*, 24th July 1923, p. 4.

the opportunity to examine his work in terms of composition, iconography and execution.

Composition:
The base of the *Blessed Virgin in Glory* window is situated two metres above ground level making close viewing possible. Because of its accessibility Clarke included detail in the design which would not be visible in windows positioned at a higher level in the building, as would have been the case for his large *Crucifixion* window in the sanctuary area of the same church, installed in 1920.

Clarke designed a window which is symmetrical both in layout and in colouring (figure 13). While the window is predominantly made up of shades of blue, Clarke has used the full spectrum of colour in its details. The Blessed Virgin is robed with a violet cloak over an ultramarine robe accentuated with an emerald green panel and gold-tassled girdle. Above her, formless except for the head and hands, God the Father is framed in red with a flaming nimbus and is encircled by four elongated angels in flowing pale pink robes.[86] Below him the figure of the Blessed Virgin is surrounded by characters from the Old Testament. She stands on a crescent moon and serpent, with images of Adam in Eve in the base. The window is framed with a blue border containing five vignettes depicting scenes associated with her life, which are described in more detail below.

There is flatness to the image with the main characters appearing as single-dimensional figures, similar to that seen in Byzantine art or, in a more contemporaneous comparison, the art of Gustav Klimt (1862 – 1918), where minimal, if any, tonal treatment which would suggest volume or perspective is worked into the overall design or into the form of the figures.[87] The form of the Virgin is implied using line and patterned areas of glass.

[86] Although they are without distinguishing attributes, these figures possibly represent Archangels.
[87] Nicola Gordon Bowe highlights the similarities between Clarke's work and that of Klimt where both artists favour an elaborate, richly patterned scene in which faces and hands the only human attributes to indicate a figure. Nicola Gordon Bowe *Harry Clarke* (Dublin: Douglas Hyde Gallery, 1979), p. 48.

Harry Clarke has included the full range of his 'gadgets' as discussed above to put his own stylistic imprint on the design – the enlarged eyes, the elongated hands with split fingers, the serene gaze of Mary and her pursed lips with a pronounced cupid's bow. The treatment of the clothing, including the long cloak, the robe with ruched neck and delicate pointed footwear all combine to make this distinctly the work of Clarke.[88] So also does the ornamentation present in all parts of the window, which includes decorative motifs derived from many varieties of flora and other natural elements Clarke observed in nature, particularly in his travels to the Aran Islands on the western Irish seaboard, or from reproductions of microscopic studies in scientific journals.[89]

Iconography:

The standard elements of iconography associated with the Blessed Virgin include the dominant blue colouring of her robes, a scroll with the Latin words "Benedicta tu in mulieribus et benedictus fructus ventris tui" and the crescent moon and serpent under her feet.[90] A less common aspect of the window is the blending of imagery associated with a number of other Catholic Church dogmas associated with the Virgin. She wears a crown, barely visible within her glowing nimbus, and holds a golden orb and sceptre which are associated with her enthronement as Mother of God, and are also symbolic of her sovereignty as Queen of Heaven. She stands on a crescent moon which indicates chastity and she crushes a serpent underfoot to signify her attribution as the 'second Eve' who defeats Satan and vanquishes sin – all of which is associated with the Marian dogma of the Immaculate Conception.[91] Adam and Eve are included at the base of the window alluding further to the power of the Virgin to both transcend and redeem 'original

[88] These features of Clarke's styling first appeared in some of his earliest work, such at *St Gobnait* (1916) in the Honan Hostel Chapel in Cork.
[89] Kelly Sullivan, 'Harry Clarke's Natural World', in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds.) *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish state* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019), p. 102.
[90] A salutation to the Virgin which translates as "Blessed art thou among women and blessed is the fruit of thy womb." Luke 1:42, *Douay-Rheims Bible*, published online at https://www.drbo.org/index.htm (accessed 5th December 2022).
[91] The Catholic dogma of the Immaculate Conception of Mary was defined by Pope Pius IX in his 1854 Papal Encyclical *Ineffabilis Deus* after centuries of debate about the subject. The Immaculate Conception was a popular subject in art, particularly in Spain, from the seventeenth century. James Hall, Dictionary of Subjects and Symbols in Art (London: John Murray, 1996), p. 326.

sin'.[92] She appears to ascend towards God the Father, as seen in representations of her Assumption into Heaven and her headwear appears as if it is a flaming crown, indicating her Coronation as Queen of Heaven.

The vignettes in the window's border recall five episodes from the life of the Virgin – the Annunciation, the Visitation, the Presentation of Jesus and meeting with Simeon and Anna, the Nativity and the Assumption and Coronation of Mary. Their inclusion combines the human and divine aspects of her life story.

While the stylistic elements make the window distinctively the work of Harry Clarke on first viewing, what makes it a unique masterwork are the detailed iconographic references which, by their arrangement and drawing, give the window a depth of quality unmatched by other stained glass makers at the time. Clarke has taken the main narrative for the window and has chosen a range of additional subjects to support his interpretation of the theme. In addition to texts from the New Testament, Clarke is likely to have also consulted reference books such as Adolphe Didron's (1806 – 1867) *Christian Iconography* to derive appropriate imagery for his designs.[93] The main subject of the window is *The Blessed Virgin in Glory*, which recognises Mary as the Mother of the Church. In this window Clarke has used the elements of the conventional iconography associated with the subject and, in contrast to common renditions of the subject, he has woven in additional symbolic elements which create a work of great detail and variety which is his unique interpretation of that subject.

The selection of ancillary subjects, which merge into the background when focusing on the main figure, is what gives Clarke licence to bring forward his chosen secondary theme for the window – the virtuous nature of the Virgin Mary. For this divergence from the main theme, Clarke selected six heroic female figures from the Old Testament who were paragons of virtue, positioning the Virgin as the dominant figure among a group who exemplify

[92] Ibid. p. 5.
[93] Didron's *Christian Iconography* was originally published in French in 1843. In 1851 the text was translated into English and republished with new references and appendices which had been added by the Irish-born scholar and illustrator Margaret Stokes (1832 – 1900). William Dowling later listed the book as one of the Clarke Studios reference books for iconography. Clarke also owned a copy of Stokes' *Early Christian Art in Ireland* (1886) NLI MS 48,419/1/5.

the high moral standards expected of followers of the Catholic faith. Didron's *Christian Iconography* included a section listing 'Holy women of the Old Testament' which includes the six figures which feature in Clarke's design.[94] The inclusion of these figures is not merely to embellish the window, but also to convey meaning and context to the Virgin's role as an ideal of purity and sanctity.[95]

The first two figures in green to the left and right, located above the Virgin's head, are Ruth and Deborah (figure 14). Ruth is depicted holding a sheaf of wheat, the "alien corn" from the fields where she worked to support her mother-in-law - a reference to her virtues of humility and kindness.[96] Deborah was a judge and prophet known for her wisdom, and hence Clarke depicts her holding an owl.[97] The next two figures, Rachael and Rebecca, are in shades of purple and are placed each side of the Virgin's head. Rachel, who carries a lamb, is associated with the virtue of patience.[98] Because of a deception by her father she had to wait twelve years before she could marry her husband Jacob. Rebecca, the wife of Isaac and father of Jacob, is depicted carrying a water jar. Rebecca's generosity in sharing the water with strangers became an example of the virtue of kindness.[99]

Finally, two heroic women, Esther and Judith, are depicted each side of the Virgin, both of whom are credited with saving the lives of their people. The Jewish woman Esther, who was the second wife of King Ahasuerus of Persia,

---

[94] Adolphe Didron, Margaret Stokes, *Christian Iconography* (London: Bell and Sons, 1907), Vol. (2), p. 291.
[95] It is worth noting that at the time the window was being made the Irish Free State had just come into existence. Women were asserting themselves in many aspects of Irish society. They had achieved equal voting rights with men, were key figures in the republican movement and were prominent in many aspects of the development of the State. These included women active in the Irish politics such as Countess Constance Markievicz, Dr. Kathleen Lynn, Jennie Wyse Power and Hanna Sheehy Skeffington. See Padraig Yeats, *A City in Turmoil: Dublin 1919 – 21* (Dublin: Gill & Macmillan, 2012), p. 32 and p. 72. This may have been in Clarke's consciousness when designing the window.
[96] The story of the Old Testament figure of Ruth is told in Ruth 2, *Douai-Rheims Bible*, published online at https://www.drbo.org/index.htm (accessed 5th December 2022). Here Clarke may be referencing John Keat's poem *Ode to a Nightingale* - "Through the sad heart of Ruth, when, sick for home, / She stood in tears amid the alien corn" (lines 66-67)" published online at https://www.poetryfoundation.org/poems/44479/ode-to-a-nightingale (accessed 17th September 2021).
[97] Judges 4, *Douai-Rheims Bible*, published online at https://www.drbo.org/chapter/07004.htm (accessed 5th December 2022).
[98] Genesis 29, *Douay-Rheims Bible*, published online at https://www.drbo.org/chapter/01029.htm (accessed 5th December 2022).
[99] Genesis 24, *Douai-Rheims Bible*, published online at https://www.drbo.org/chapter/01024.htm (accessed 5th December 2022).

interceded with her husband after he had been deceived into ordering the deaths of all Jewish people in his kingdom.[100] Her shrewdness and courage are seen as having parallel with the Virgin's role as intercessor with God. Two scenes from the account of her life are included. The upper image depicts her coronation as queen by Ahasuerus. The lower image depicts her kneeling before the King petitioning for her people, in which she was ultimately successful. In the background Clarke depicts a gallows on which her betrayer Haman would later be executed.[101]

On the right side of the window the story of Judith saving her people in Bethulia from massacre by the Assyrian army is illustrated in two parts.[102] The top scene depicts a wistful Judith with a sword in one hand and the head of the Assyrian general Holofernes in the other. His decapitated body is strewn on a couch, blood dripping from the neck of his headless corpse. Below the scene, separated by a view of the gloomy Gothic-style ramparts of Bethulia, Judith's maidservant carries Holofernes's head away in a bag, with a look that could be described as satisfied disgust on her face (figure 15).

Clarke's inclusion of these female figures in the window place the Virgin among the strongest in character and most virtuous of women in the Bible, thus signifying her own strength of character.

In the lower section of the window Clarke includes an image of Adam and Eve as a stylised couple recoiling from the serpent, realising their error in falling to temptation by Satan (figure 16). Clarke includes the barely discernible form of the Tree of Knowledge of Good and Evil, but it is the symbolic inclusion of clusters of apples that provide the key to the narrative. A frond covers Adam and Eve's genitalia while also providing a serpent-like threatening, thorny feature. The sun is sinking in the background and the frail Adam and Eve are entering darkness. The Catechism of the Catholic Church pronounces that Adam and Eve succumbing to this temptation is the

[100] Esther 7, *Douai-Rheims Bible*, published online at https://www.drbo.org/chapter/19007.htm (accessed 5th December 2022).
[101] Ibid.
[102] Judith 13, *Douai-Rheims Bible*, published online at https://www.drbo.org/chapter/18013.htm (accessed 5th December 2022).

cause of original sin, by which all mankind becomes sinful.[103] The exception to this is the Virgin Mary who, as expressed by the Catholic dogma of the Immaculate Conception, was born without sin, in this way demonstrating her purity. It is this aspect of her existence that Clarke has illustrated in dramatic fashion through her powerful domination of the serpent - the cause of Adam and Eve's grief.[104]

Technical Execution:
Clarke chose a balanced range of rich colours which give a striking overall impression of the stained glass. Aciding and staining is used throughout the window to achieve a wide spectrum of colour shading.[105] Many secondary figures are drawn in minute detail, comparable to the detailed drawing style present in Clarke's graphic art. However, he has succeeded in making this level of detail appropriate for the medium of stained glass. No part of the window is left undecorated. Floral ornamentation is included where there are plain areas of glass, giving the window a glowing jewel-like effect when lit by sunshine, without over-darkening the window. As with all his windows, Clarke used the finest antique glass available. Paint and staining were used to add definition to features and garments, and to control the light. As the window is in an unobstructed south-west facing wall the availability of full light is integral to the work, and these techniques utilise the inherent properties of the glass to give the effect of the work.

The combined aspects of Clarke's treatment of the subject – the composition, iconography and execution – merge to create a sense of wonder in the viewer, which is appropriate for the mystical nature of the subject.

[103] Chapter 1/75, published online at https://www.vatican.va/archive/compendium_ccc/documents/archive_2005_compendium-ccc_en.html (accessed 27th March 2022).
[104] A standard iconography associated with the Immaculate Conception was established in the 16th century by the Spanish painter and writer Francisco Pacheco, with the approval of the Catholic Church. James Hall, *Dictionary of Subjects and Symbols in Art* (London: John Murray, 1996), p. 327. Pacheco's specification became the accepted image of the dogma in Spain, spreading to the rest of Europe in the seventeenth century.
[105] See Appendix 3 for an explanation of these terms.

Comparing Harry Clarke and the Clarke Studios' Work

Given the Clarke Studios claims of correlation with Harry Clarke's work, the Terenure window is an appropriate subject for comparison with the work of Clarke Studios after Clarke's death in terms of composition, iconography and execution. In relation to composition, the general approach in the arrangement of the figures and other elements, the dimensionality of the image, and colour range and intensity can be found in the Clarke Studios later work. Also, the extent of the continued use of the hallmarks of Harry Clarke's work, his 'gadgets', can also be considered.

For the iconographical and illustrative elements in the work, as can be seen in *The Virgin in Glory*, Harry Clarke did not rely on conventional representation of a subject but often included additional narrative detail which he associates with that subject, in this case a number of related biblical figures. Through detailed research of the narratives surrounding the Virgin Mary he brought together other sources which enhanced the overall design. This included the use of symbolism or indirect expressions of meaning as distinctive components of the work. He combined these with familiar iconography so that the subject was recognisable, but which also included unusual elements not commonly seen in depictions of the same subject in other churches. The extent to which Clarke Studios followed this approach will be examined in Part 2 of this case study.

In relation to technical execution, examples of Clarke Studios work in the 1950s and '60s will be compared with Harry Clarke's to determine the extent to which detailed working of the glass was typically done, and how successful the completed windows are in achieving the jewel-like effect synonymous with much of Clarke's own stained glass.[106]

2.2.4. *Walter and Harry Clarke's Directorship of the Business*

Following the death their father in 1921, Harry Clarke and his brother Walter (1887 – 1930) took over the running of the business of Joshua Clarke & Sons. At the time the company was thriving, making stained glass windows and providing church decoration services throughout Ireland.[107] Harry Clarke

[106] Described in more detail in Case Study 1, Part 2.
[107] Information gathered from the Company order books TCD MSS 6059 – 6060.

had by then established himself as the leading Irish stained glass artist, and his reputation grew both at home and abroad through the 1920s.[108] In that period, the company won many orders for stained glass from patrons in Ireland and, to a lesser extent, Great Britain, New Zealand, Australia and the United States.[109]

Through the 1920s, with the increasing number of both stained glass and book illustration commissions, coupled with his own health problems due to tuberculosis, Harry Clarke progressively delegated full or partial execution of commissioned windows to Clarke Studios staff while he retained more of a design and supervisory role.[110] In order to cope with the number of stained glass commissions being received in the 1920s he was aided by assistant artists Philip Deegan (1895 - unknown), William Nagle (1853 – 1923), Kathleen Quigley (1888 – 1981), Leo Cartwright (1899 – 1967), Millicent Girling (1900 – 1993), Leonard Potter (1903 – 1962) and Isobel Goudie (1903 – 1977). George S. Walsh (1911 - 1988) joined as an apprentice in 1925, and in 1928 Clarke employed two new trainee artists, Richard King and William Dowling. He trained his assistants in his approach to design and expected them to produce work which would match his own in terms of quality. Clarke visited the artist's studio and workshop every morning to examine the work being done and was critical if it did not reach his standards. In a recollection of Harry Clarke, William Dowling recalls:

> Early every morning he went the rounds of the Studios to examine the work of the assistant artists. He did not waste words and we all immediately knew whether he liked what we were doing or not by the expression on his face or his stance. He was quick to show appreciation of work well done and a glance from him was sufficient to tell us that poor work had better be rubbed out and done again.[111]

[108] Nicola Gordon Bowe asserts that Clarke was at the peak of his career in 1924 with many orders on hand and refusing work if he could not meet proposed deadlines. Nicola Gordon Bowe, *Harry Clarke: The Life and Work* (Dublin: The History Press Ireland, 2012), p. 226.
[109] Information gathered from the Company order books TCD MSS 6059 – 6060.
[110] In 1926 he had a serious, almost fatal, bicycle accident from which he recovered but was left with a legacy of severe headaches. He suffered from neuralgia and was subsequently diagnosed with tuberculosis. Nicola Gordon Bowe, *Harry Clarke: The Life and Work* (Dublin: The History Press Ireland, 2012), p. 259.
[111] William Dowling, 'Recollections of Harry Clarke R.H.A. During the Years 1928 – 1931', (unpublished document, in the personal archive of Ms. Mary Clarke).

Thus, these artists learned to work in the Clarke style under his direct supervision:

> If you were trying hard, he did his best to guide you along the right artistic path without any fuss. I found him to be fair and just, but severe at times and very impatient of careless work.[112]

Harry Clarke spent most of 1929 and the early part of 1930 in Davos, Switzerland receiving treatment for tuberculosis.[113] The time spent in Switzerland was having a severe impact on the business as he was unable to meet clients and he was also restricted in the design work he could do as he was confined to bed for long periods. Furthermore, he had the expense of the treatment to pay for while still contributing to the upkeep of his family. With his wife Margaret and his close friend Lennox Robinson (1886 – 1958) he devised a scheme to save the business and in March 1930 the business of Joshua Clarke & Sons, which provided both church decoration and stained glass services, was divided to form two new companies.[114] Walter Clarke formally took over the church decoration business, keeping the original name of Joshua Clarke and Sons, and Harry established the stained glass business Harry Clarke Stained Glass Limited, sometimes known as Harry Clarke Stained Glass Studios but more generally referred to as Clarke Studios.[115] In July 1930 Walter died from pneumonia, and the church decoration business also ended with his death.[116]

Establishing Clarke Studios served a number of purposes. Firstly, it divested Harry Clarke of the responsibility of the church decoration side of the company, allowing him to concentrate solely on the stained glass business. Secondly, it created a company associated with what was to become its most important asset – the name 'Harry Clarke' in the title. Clarke had recognised the value in exploiting his now widespread reputation. From that

---

[112] Ibid.
[113] He left Dublin for Davos on 18th March 1929, not returning until May 1930.
[114] Correspondence between Lennox Robinson and Harry Clarke on various dates between January and March in 1930. NLI MS 48/422. Robinson was a playwright, theatre produce and cultural activist. For a further description of Robinson's association with Clarke see Paul Donnelly, 'Legacy and Identity: Harry Clarke, William Dowling and the Harry Clarke Studios', in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds.) *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish state* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019), p. 307. Clarke had granted Power of Attorney to Robinson in January 1930, NLI MS 48/422/20.
[115] In this thesis the business is normally referred to as 'Clarke Studios'.
[116] Nicola Gordon Bowe, *Harry Clarke: The Life and Work* (Dublin: The History Press Ireland, 2012), p. 287.

point on, every commission had the words *Harry Clarke Stained Glass* written on one or more of the windows, whether he had any involvement in designing the work or not. This became the case even after his death. Nicola Gordon Bowe recalls a conversation she had with Harry Clarke's sister, Florence (Dolly) Clarke (1892 - 1983), who said that they had to do that because it was very much in their interest to use his name as that was what clients wanted:

> It wasn't to deliberately fool people but to give the idea that they were adhering to the spirit of Harry Clarke and if people wanted to imagine he was still alive that was well and good.[117]

While Harry Clarke was receiving treatment for his tuberculosis in Switzerland Florence Clarke took charge of the business matters of the company until a manager was engaged to run the company on a day-to-day basis. With the assistance of the English stained glass artist Karl Parsons (1884 – 1934), Clarke appointed a business manager to act as chief designer and to look after the day-to-day affairs of the business.[118] Parsons had written to Harry Clarke's wife Margaret recommending the young English artist Cecil B. Simmonds for the position based on samples of some of his work:

> My own opinion is that they [Simmonds sample drawings] show very considerable capability and that as S. can catch the spirit of medieval work so well – as in some of these – he should be able to do the same with Harry's…S. is your man I fully believe.[119]

Simmonds had trained at the Royal College of Art, South Kensington, London where he had been awarded the Diploma Associateship of the

---

[117] Nicola Gordon Bowe in conversation with the author, 15th July 2014.
[118] Karl Parsons was an English stained glass artist whom Harry Clarke had befriended in 1914. Nicola Gordon Bowe, *Harry Clarke: The Life and Work* (Dublin: The History Press Ireland, 2012), p. 68. Parsons had trained under and collaborated with the leading exponent of stained glass making of the period, Christopher Whall. He took over from Whall as principal teacher in stained glass at the Royal College of Art in London and developed a significant business for his work in Britain, South Africa and Australia. Peter Cormack, *Karl Parsons 1884–1934*, Exhibition Catalogue, William Morris Gallery, *c*. 1987, p. 3.
[119] Letter from Karl Parsons to Margaret Clarke, 8th March 1930, National Library of Ireland, MS48 425/1. Although Parsons did not know the twenty-six-year-old Simmonds as a student, he had been recommended by William Rothenstein, then principal at the Royal College of Art in London. In some texts C. B. Simmonds' first name is given as Charles. However, in income tax returns made by the company, for example TCD MS 6007/123, he is named as Cecil, and this forename will be used in this thesis.

College. He then worked in an ecclesiastical decoration studio in London.[120] Simmonds took up the position as Manager of Clarke Studios in April 1930.

Clarke left Davos in February 1930 and by 16th May 1930 he was back at work in the company, interviewing and corresponding with clients.[121] He spent the summer of 1930 working as much as he could to maintain and further build the business of the company. He was very unwell and some days could only spend an hour in the studios interviewing clients, however, as he had been absent for a year, this commitment was necessary for the sustainability of the business.[122] The time also allowed Simmonds to establish himself as the manager of the company while Clarke was present. This period therefore was essential in establishing Clarke Studios as a business, with the direct personal involvement of Clarke and allowing him to introduce Simmonds to clients.

Clarke worked at the studios until October 1930 and then returned to Switzerland for further medical treatment, expecting to be there for at least a year. However, he did not survive the winter and died in Coire, Switzerland on 6th January 1931 aged 41. He had left his company in a healthy condition with a significant number of orders on the books, a good manager in charge, an excellent reputation for the work produced by Clarke Studios in his idiosyncratic style and, very importantly, his name on the business.[123]

2.2.5. *Managing the Business after Clarke's Death*

Clarke Studios Structure

When Clarke Studios was established Harry Clarke became the largest shareholder in the business with his sisters Kathleen (Lally) Clarke (1885 – 1965) and Florence Clarke holding the balance of the allocated shares in the company.[124] The shareholders formed the Board of the company. After Harry

[120] Letter from C.B. Simmonds to J. O'Sheehan, Irish Hospitals Trust, 10th February 1933. TCD MS 6005/281.
[121] Nicola Gordon Bowe, *Harry Clarke: The Life and Work* (Dublin: The History Press Ireland, 2012), p. 287.
[122] Ibid.
[123] This was all the more important as the company now had to support his widow Margaret and their three children, and his brother Walter's widow Minnie and her five children.
[124] Companies Registration Office records, National Archives of Ireland, CRO 2013/80/172.

Clarke's death in 1931 his shares passed to his wife Margaret. One of the conditions of Clarke's will was that his shares were to be divided among those of his children who worked in the company. In later years his daughter Ann Bourke (1917 – 2002) and his son David Clarke (1920 – 2005) worked as artists at the company and became shareholders.[125] Florence Clarke, in her role as a director and as company secretary, took an active part in managing the finances of the business.

Day-to-day management of Clarke Studios was the responsibility of the manager – initially Cecil Simmonds, then Richard King, and finally William Dowling. On all significant business-related matters, the manager answered to the Board of the company. In addition to managing the staff and the daily work of the business the main responsibility of the manager was dealing with clients – responding to enquiries, making sales and managing ongoing projects. The manager produced estimates for new stained glass windows based on the client's needs, meeting them in person if possible or by correspondence if the client was outside Ireland. A review of the Clarke Studios correspondence indicates the range of other tasks the manager carried out which included sourcing and procuring glass and other materials, dealing with government departments concerned with exports, recruiting staff, arranging advertising and exhibitions, responding to queries about the art of stained glass and inspecting work before it was sent to clients for installation.

As with many businesses, the numbers of staff employed expanded and contracted with the demand for their products. Twenty people worked in the company in the mid-1930s. This number reduced considerably in the 1940s due to the impact of World War II, falling to just ten in 1950. As business for North American clients increased in the early 1950s so did the number of workers. Staff numbers reached a peak in 1961 when there were twenty-

---

The company was established with 2,000 ordinary shares of which 800 were allocated to Harry Clarke and 400 to each of his sisters.

[125] In addition, in 1931 the company solicitor George Meares and accountant Alexander Fraser became minor shareholders with ten shares each. In 1955 the Clarke Studios' manager William Dowling received fifty shares in the business. Companies Registration Office records, National Archives of Ireland, CRO 2013/80/172.

nine employees, but this reduced as the 1960s progressed and by 1970 only ten workers remained.[126]

Development of the Overseas Business

Harry Clarke's ambition was to create a business that would see his Irish-made artwork installed in locations both at home and outside Ireland, thereby cementing his standing as an Irish artist with an international reputation.[127] Initially he saw England as a lucrative market for commissions:

> My view is now, and has been for some considerable time, that the public for really high class stained glass is in England, the "Firms" there simply turn the work out badly, fix it and get paid. There is no reason why stained glass should be treated as if it were a second rate applied art. Why should there not be reviews and notices of windows the same as of ones' pictures or books for the public, who would eventually come to take an interest in stained glass, and so open the immense field of possibilities in domestic glass.[128]

He also saw that opportunities existed to secure orders further afield. Correspondence with Rev. Joseph Dolan at St Vincent de Paul Church in Bayonne, New Jersey, shows that Clarke was very keen to win a contract in the United States which would act as a showcase for his work in America:

> I would like very much to do these windows for you, it would give us the opportunity of letting the people see the type of work we do.[129]

Clarke was successful in winning the order and at the time of his death Clarke Studios was working on commissions for North American patrons in

---

[126] Source: Various items correspondence from Clarke Studios to income tax and social welfare departments of the Irish Government. For example letter from William Dowling to Employment Exchange 4th January 1961. TCD MS 6029/9.
[127] Paul Donnelly, 'Legacy and Identity: Harry Clarke, William Dowling and the Harry Clarke Studios', in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds.) *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish state* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019), p. 305.
[128] Letter from Harry Clarke to E. M. O'Rourke Dickey, 12th November 1924. TCD MS 5995/953. In 1920 Edward Montgomery O'Rourke Dickey exhibited with the Dublin Painters Society, of which Harry Clarke was also a member. He was a Belfast-born wood engraver who worked in England for much of his career. Theo Snoddy, *Dictionary of Irish artists: 20th century* (Dublin: Wolfhound Press, 1996), p. 100.
[129] Letter from Clarke to Rev. Dolan, 16th December 1927. TCD MS 5999/757. Clarke won the valuable commission for nine clerestory windows for the church in 1928.

Bayonne and the Church of the Sacred Heart, Sacramento, California.[130] Although Harry Clarke was directly involved in the design for nine windows depicting 'Angels Bearing Symbols of the Mass' for Bayonne, studio artists, principally Richard King, were responsible for the Sacramento work. Later, these commissions acted as references for other potential clients in the United States, both in answering direct inquiries from prospective patrons and when promoting the work of Clarke Studios at trade exhibitions in the U.S. and Britain.[131]

Following Clarke's death Simmonds continued as Principal Artist and manager "dealing firmly with the workmen as well as interviewing clients".[132] In his time as manager new business continued to be won by the company. Overseas orders included an additional nine windows (three in the baptistery and six in the transept) for Bayonne, and several commissions in England and Wales.[133] Irish orders included several windows for St. Mel's Cathedral, Longford, a seven-light window for St. Augustine's, Drogheda and the Kevin Barry Memorial window for University College Dublin.[134]

By the mid-1930s, although Clarke Studios were winning orders, staff wages exceeded income from sales, leading to the business making a loss of £560 in the six months to March 1935.[135] As a result, Cecil Simmonds was dismissed by the board of the company and was replaced as manager by Richard King, who managed the company until 1940.[136] In that period Clarke Studios continued to attract orders from Ireland and from further afield.

---

[130] By January 1931 the Clarke Studios had received orders for nine chancel windows, one rose window and fourteen plain clerestory windows for Bayonne. They were also on the cusp of receiving orders for four chancel windows, one figurative clerestory window and a baptistery window for Sacramento. TCD MS 6060.

[131] An example of a reference is a letter from the Clarke Studios to Archbishop John Cantwell, Los Angeles, seeking to be considered for new stained glass at a new Diocesan Seminary. Letter from Richard King to Rev. John Cantwell, 23rd August 1938. TCD MS 6010/440. This is illustrated in more detail in Chapter Three (*Patronage*).

[132] Nicola Gordon Bowe, *Harry Clarke: The Life and Work* (Dublin: The History Press Ireland, 2012), p. 285.

[133] Listed in Clarke Studios order book. TCD MS 6060.

[134] One of the more unusual commissions was for the design and painting of panels for the National Sweepstake Draws. These draws were run by Irish Hospitals Trust to raise funds for the development of hospital services in Ireland. Tickets were sold world-wide for draws which which took place quarterly between 1930 and 1986. For more detail on the Clarke Studios work for the Irish Sweepstake see Paul Donnelly, *The Rise and Fall of Harry Clarke Stained Glass Limited* (MPhil Thesis, Trinity College Dublin, 2014).

[135] Letter from Florence Clarke to C.B. Simmonds, 30th May 1935. TCD MS 6007/957.

[136] Simmonds later took up the position of Art Director at the Royal Worcester Porcelain Company in England.

Examples in Ireland include six large windows, seven small windows and several door panels for the church of SS Peter and Paul, Athlone in 1935, and fifteen windows for the Dominican Convent chapel, Wicklow in 1938.[137] The commission for Bayonne, for which Harry Clarke had created the initial designs, continued to be delivered up to 1940. Other overseas work began to grow with new orders coming from Sacramento, Melbourne and Palmerston North in New Zealand.[138]

King left Clarke Studios in 1940 to join the staff of the religious publication the *Capuchin Annual*, where he worked as an illustrator and artist until September 1953.[139] He then continued making stained glass and working as a freelance artist until his death in 1974.[140] William Dowling succeeded King as manager of Clarke Studios, a position he held until the business closed in 1973. For those thirty-three years, Dowling continued to design windows, sharing much of that work with Harry Clarke's nephew Terence Clarke (1917 – 1968).

At the time Dowling took over as manager a slowdown in business was occurring due to the impact of World War II. This downturn was not unique to the stained glass industry. According to Haughton, between 1938 and 1943 the volume of Irish exports fell by half, with industrial output falling by 27% due to the scarcity of raw materials and a shortage of shipping capacity.[141] In the six years leading up to the World War Clarke Studios had won orders to the value of £34,000 (£31,000 of that for clients in Ireland). In the following six years to the end of 1945 the value of new orders reduced to £28,000 (£21,000 in Ireland with orders from England and Port of Spain, Trinidad and Tobago, making up the majority of the remainder).

[137] The costs of these windows were £995 and £1,125 respectively. TCD MS 6060.
[138] Two windows for St Vincent de Paul Church Bayonne; Nine windows for Sacred Heart Church, Sacramento; Eleven windows for three locations in Australia; A three-light window for St Patricks Cathedral, Palmerston North. TCD MS 6060.
[139] Ruth Sheehy, *The Life and Work of Richard King* (Oxford: Peter Lang Ltd., 2020), p. 207.
[140] King continued to provide illustrations for the Capuchin Annual throughout his career. Ibid.
[141] Johnathon Haughton, 'Historical Background', in John O'Hagan and Carol Newman, eds., *The Economy of Ireland: National and Sectoral Policy Issues* (Dublin: Gill & Macmillan, 2008), p. 19.

As a consequence of the decrease in business a number of staff members were let go in the early 1940s.[142] Procuring glass from their normal sources in England became impossible as the manufacturers were required to focus on producing materials for the war effort and English suppliers had reduced production towards the end of the war. The company attempted to buy glass from Connick's Studios in the United States, which was unsuccessful.[143] Dowling eventually sourced good quality glass from the Société Anonyme Des Verreries de Saint-Just-Sur-Loire in France.[144] Other materials like hydrofluoric acid, lead, tin and iron bars were also difficult to procure.

It was not until after the World War II that overseas business picked up again. The value of orders in the four years from 1946 to 1949 amounted to £28,000 (£20,000 from Ireland, £2,000 from the U.S. and most of the balance from England, Australia and New Zealand). In that period Dowling was also actively looking for new commissions in the California, particularly San Francisco and Sacramento. In August 1944 William Dowling wrote to their existing client in Sacramento describing how they were preparing to carry on business when World War II ended:

> We are writing to let you know that as we anticipate a large number of commissions for stained glass from abroad at the close of the War. We are at present making plans to deal with post-War conditions, and the most important of these plans is the reservation of pre-war Antique glass of the best quality for commissions in hands to be completed after the war. The manufacture of this Antique Glass ceased last year owing to war conditions, and it is extremely likely that it will be some time after the war before good Antique Glass will be manufactured again. In view of these circumstances and because of the fact that you are one of our most important patrons, we would like to reserve for you a quantity of this good glass in anticipation of any stained glass windows you have in mind to erect. [145]

[142] The policy was that single men were let go before married men. I am grateful to Alan Tomlin, son of the artist Stanley Tomlin who was one of the men made redundant, for this information during a conversation on 6th June 2014.
[143] Letter from William Dowling to Charles Connick, 4th June 1946. TCD MS 6014/538 and, acknowledged response in TCD MS 6014/621.
[144] Letter from William Dowling to Societé Anonyme Des Verreries de Saint-Just-Sur-Loire, 12th May 1949. TCD MS 6017/261.
[145] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Michael Lyons, 24th August 1944. TCD MS 6013/522.

The first half of the 1950s saw work for North American clients increase substantially with total orders amounting to £62,000, of which £34,000 was for clients in the U.S. and £20,000 was for Irish clients. An analysis of the company's order book for 1950 shows that two-thirds of the value of all orders went to the United States, and all of that to California.[146] Business increased further in the second half of the decade where total orders amounted to £89,000 of which £54,000 was for clients in the U.S. and £18,000 for Irish clients.[147]

As will be discussed in Chapter Three (*Patronage*), this significant increase in business with the United States which occurred in the 1950s was helped by a boom in church-building in the western States. It was when this source of business was exhausted in the late 1960's that Clarke Studios became less viable as a business and was finally closed in 1973.[148] However, through the 1950s and '60s the company won many orders in the United States and other countries, keeping it sustained as a business and contributing to Ireland's export trade.

2.2.6. *Studios Organisation and Personnel*

In a 1963 newspaper article about Clarke Studios, William Dowling described the people who worked in the company as being more a community than a business undertaking.[149] As Dowling later described it, this "community effort of artists and glaziers, not excluding the kiln operator" relied on each person having the required skills to carry out their part of the process effectively.[150] This section, which primarily draws from the company's correspondence records, outlines the roles played by the different workers at Clarke Studios when executing commissions.

Management

William Dowling was a key figure involved in the history of Clarke Studios, having a central role in terms of dealing with the complexities of the

[146] In 1950, thirty-three orders were received with a total value of£17,000. TCD MS 6060.
[147] While figures are available for the United States for the 1960s, they are not complete for other countries and therefore comparison with earlier years is not possible.
[148] The closure of the Clarke Studios will be discussed further later in Part Three of this chapter.
[149] Anon, 'Craftsmen in Glass', *The Irish Times,* 19th November 1963, p. 4.
[150] Letter from William Dowling to Ian Montague, 28th December 1967. TCD MS 6035/613. Montague was researching Irish graphic artists and crafts people.

business. He was employed as an assistant artist by Harry Clarke in 1928 and took over as manager in 1940, a position he held until 1973. In addition to his role as chief designer he also dealt with staff, clients, the company board, suppliers and associates in the stained glass trade in Ireland. His responsibilities with staff included recruitment, personnel and prioritising and scheduling work. With clients he was chief salesperson and the point of contact for all commissions, he designed windows and dealt with the vicissitudes of each project (he shared design responsibilities mostly with Terence Clarke, Harry Clarke's nephew).

Dowling's name appears on almost all the outgoing correspondence relevant to this research and therefore it is his expression and voice that comes through in communications with clients. What is apparent from his writing is his ability to forge good relationships with clients, showing his professionalism as an artist, his understanding of Roman Catholic doctrines and how this could be best represented in ecclesiastical art, and his shrewdness as a salesperson, while still being able to strongly defend the output of the Clarke Studios in response to criticism of their work. He had a pivotal role in generating the success the company enjoyed.[151]

Artists

The artists at Clarke Studios were responsible for the production of designs and cartoons, and painting the glass. While the artists were all trained in the various aspects of the craft of stained glass making, for practical reasons it had evolved that some artists concentrated on designing and others on painting. An important aspect of the Clarke Studios design approach was that its output was not the product of an individual, but that of Harry Clarke Studios as a 'brand'. From the time of Harry Clarke's death, it was clear that the artists' design work would follow a 'Clarke Studios' in-house style, with the personal artistic interests of the studio artists subjugated to the brand aesthetic. In 1938 Richard King reluctantly agreed to identify himself as the designer of a rose window at Mount Sion, Waterford, stating "we here in the Studios prefer that each work be accepted as a product of the Studios

[151] For a more in depth account of Dowling's life and career see Paul Donnelly, 'Legacy and Identity: Harry Clarke, William Dowling and the Harry Clarke Studios', in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds.) *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish state* (2019).

solely".[152] In 1960 William Dowling, when offering a position to a new artist, outlined how they were expected to fit with this approach:

> In a studio such as ours a blending of artistic efforts is desirable and that in general a special style of design is expected of us. The majority of our clients are conservative in matters of contemporary art and consequently it is essential that we fulfil what is expected of us in the execution of the work.[153]

While the artists' designs followed the in-house style and forms Harry Clarke had established, they did not merely produce copies or pastiches of his work but modified their own ideas to include distinctive aspects of Clarke's style. The way in which the Studio's artists adapted Harry Clarke's style is dealt with in Case Study 1.

This blending of artistic efforts makes the attribution of work to an individual artist without supporting documentation challenging. Some work that was destined for the United States is identifiable to its designer as it was a requirement for the import of stained glass that the artists who designed and those who painted the windows were named in order for them to qualify for duty relief. For example, when three of the windows for St Ambrose Church, Hollywood were being dispatched the consignment included a sworn statement from the Clarke Studios solicitor George Meares:

> The *Presentation* window is designed by Terence Clarke, painted by Ann Bourke. The *Finding* window is designed by William Dowling, painted by Reuben Matthews. The *Coronation* window is designed by Terence Clarke, painted by James McNamara.[154]

While some correspondence such as this can provide evidence regarding the authorship of designs, other than that, based on a survey of the holdings in TCD Library, the majority of extant designs are not signed.[155] Harry Clarke's

---

[152] Letter from Richard King to Rev. Flannery, Mount Sion, Waterford, 6th August 1938. TCD MS 6010/414.
[153] Letter from William Dowling to Noel Millar, Derry, 28th December 1960. TCD MS 6028/683. Millar did not take up the offer of a position at the company.
[154] Sworn statement included in letter from William Dowling to Rev. Thomas O'Toole, 26th August 1952. TCD MS 6020/382.
[155] The survey, conducted by the author throughout the course of this PhD research, reviewed the library catalogue, physical designs and digitised items available at TCD MS 11182, accessed online at http://digitalcollections.tcd.ie/ on many dates. Another useful aid

daughter Ann Bourke, one of the artists who worked at Clarke Studios was asked why they did not sign their work, to which she replied "No, it's Studio's, we don't put our names on it, it's the brand, we're not individuals."[156]

The Studio's artists, although each capable of designing and painting, tended to specialise in one or the other. William Dowling and Terence Clarke were responsible for the majority of the design work, with some done by David Clarke.[157] The company also experimented with engaging artists to provide designs on an ad-hoc basis. In November 1965 William Dowling commissioned two Welsh artists, John Edwards (b. 1940s) and Colwyn Morris (1920 – 2011) to produce designs for work on hand for St Edward's Church, Seattle. Dowling provided specifications for each design, including an outline of the style of work Clarke Studios produced and which they were expected to follow. Dowling instructed the artists to "avoid too much realism, perspective and too many figures".[158] Edwards, who also worked at Celtic Studios in Swansea, produced a design for *The Holy Women at the Tomb* and Morris, then working on stained glass at Powell & Co in London, provided a design for *The Miracle at Cana* window which was also made and installed in the Seattle church (figure 17).[159] These episodes were the only two occasions where Clarke Studios used freelance artists to provide designs for client orders. Skilled artists who were capable of producing work in the Clarke Studios' style were difficult to find and it appears from correspondence that the effort of specifying the studios' needs demanded more effort than producing the work themselves.

The responsibility of the glass painter was to produce the finished artwork by painting, staining and etching the individual pieces of glass in accordance with the design and colour scheme. They were also responsible for adding

---

are the attributions made by David Clarke when designs were being catalogued for acquisition into TCD Library.

[156] The author in conversation with the artist Ann Bourke's daughter, Sara Bourke, on 31st May 2016.

[157] David Clarke designed windows for Immaculate Conception parish, Monrovia, St Augustine parish, Culver City, as well as painting windows. Ann Bourke also did design work but this is not recorded in the Clarke Studios' correspondence and no extant designs in the Clarke Studios Archive in TCD bear her name.

[158] Letter from William Dowling to John Edwards, 30th September 1965. TCD MS 6033/451.

[159] Biography published online at http://stainedglass.llgc.org.uk/person/441 (accessed 2nd April 2021).

inscriptions if required. Glass painting was mostly the responsibility of Albert Altendorf (who worked at Clarke Studios for 37 years), Ann Bourke (32 years), Reuben Matthews (46 years) and James McNamara (46 years), with other artists joining the staff for shorter periods.

In this way the production of a stained glass window at Clarke Studios can be seen as the creative work of the designer, materialised through the painting skills of the glass painter. The designer was responsible for the overall layout of the design, the choice of glass and colouring, the expressiveness of the characters and the details of iconography and symbolism in the work. The glass painter took the design and translated it into a stained glass artwork by adding appropriate detail to the coloured glass in terms of the flesh, hair and facial features of the subjects, and the decorative effects in garments, surrounding areas and borders.

Glazing

At Clarke Studios, the role of the glazier included selecting the glass to match the colour design produced by the artist and cutting the individual pieces of glass to match the cutline.[160] The window was then temporarily assembled with the individual pieces held together with beeswax and the glass painter rendered the detail on the window using enamel paint which was permanently fixed to the glass at high temperature in a kiln. Once the painting process was complete the glazier assembled the glass according to the artist's design using lead strips (cames) which were fixed together by soldering the joints, the placement of which were determined by the designer (figure 18). The window was then weatherproofed with mastic.

For jobs in Ireland, and occasionally in England, the glaziers also fitted the windows in place, travelling to whatever location they were ordered for and staying until the job was complete. When the windows were commissioned for other overseas locations, the client engaged a local glazier to erect the windows. If this was a new building then the contractor would appoint the glazier. For installation as replacement windows the pastor would find a

[160] The cutline is a guide for cutting the individual pieces of glass. See Appendix 3.

glazing firm, sometimes going on the recommendation of Clarke Studios if they had other work in the same area.[161]

The longest serving glazier at Clarke Studios was Bill Malone who worked there for twenty-five years before leaving to set up his own glazing company in 1956. Richard Nagle worked at Clarke Studios for seventeen years before leaving in 1968 aged seventy. Paddy McGowran was employed for fifteen years before moving to another firm and Anthony Nolan worked there for at least fifteen years, until the early 1970's.

At times of peak work, Clarke Studios would have employed more staff if they had been available. Glaziers in particular were in high demand in the building industry in the 1960s and skilled workers became more attracted to the better wages offered in construction jobs than what they could earn at stained glass work.[162] In one case, towards the end of life of the company when just one significant project was on hand (twenty-nine windows for the church of Our Lady of Guadalupe, La Habra, Los Angeles) it became necessary to recruit past employees to do glazing work in the evenings after they had done their normal days' work for their main employer.[163]

Kiln Operation

The other important aspect of the process was the fixing of the black metallic oxide pigment on to the glass which took place at high temperature in a kiln. This was a highly skilled procedure as any errors can result in the cracking of glass, which would add to the time and the cost of production. For more than forty-three years the kiln was operated by Dan O'Brien, with the help of assistants. O'Brien is another example of a staff member whose entire working life was spent at Clarke Studios.[164]

---

[161] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. George Gallagher, Holy Trinity San Pedro, 30th November, 1959. Dowling recommended B & H Glass Limited, who were contracted to install the Clarke Studios windows at Mary Star of the Sea Parish, San Pedro, for the Holy Trinity work. Rev. Gallagher engaged B & H Glass for the installation job.
[162] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Thomas Killeen, Newport County Mayo, 10th April 1970. TCD MS 6038/112.
[163] Two former employees, Paddy McGowran and William Doyle, agreed to do glazing work for the Clarke Studios commission at La Habra California in the evenings. Letters from William Dowling to Paddy McGowran and William Doyle, 20th August, 1970. TCD MS 6038/267-269.
[164] The others were William Dowling and the glass painters Reuben Matthews and James McNamara.

The final employee to be considered is the clerical worker, Alice O'Sullivan. Miss O'Sullivan, as she was known, retired in 1964 aged eighty-three after more than thirty-six years with the company. She was responsible for all administrative matters for the company – maintaining accounts, typing and sending correspondence, wages and general administration. It must be acknowledged that it was her scrupulous attention to record-keeping which made much of this research possible.

2.3. Part Two – The Clarke Studios Work in the United States

This section outlines the approach Clarke Studios took which enabled the company to win a significant number of orders in the United States in the 1950s and '60s, identifying the factors which had the greatest influence on their success. An analysis of the Clarke Studios' correspondence of the period indicates that in addition to relying on the patronage of a number of Irish American priests who sought their work, considered in detail in Chapter Three (*Patronage*), they also utilised a number of commercial strategies which helped the company to win business. The approaches used included promoting the 'Harry Clarke' factor, advertising in religious publications, participation in exhibitions of religious goods, availing of state supports for increasing exports and direct contact with priests who they had discovered were embarking on new church-building projects.

2.3.1. *The Harry Clarke Factor*

Harry Clarke's distinctive style and the recognised quality of his finished work contributed to him being recognised as Ireland's leading stained glass artist. In promotional material produced by the company, Richard King described Clarke's stained glass as "akin to the products of Ireland's Golden Age in its beauty of conception and richness of effect".[165] As described earlier, Clarke had won numerous awards for his stained glass and had received important commissions in Ireland, Great Britain and the United States. These achievements were made known to many potential clients and it was the same style of work that they wanted Clarke Studios to reproduce for their own churches. Clarke had personally trained his assistants, including Richard King and William Dowling, who went on to become the principal artists at Clarke Studios. He taught them his approach to design and how to produce work that he himself was satisfied with as a product of his studio, including the importance of detailed research into a subject to find unique perspectives, and the use of his characteristic 'gadgets'.[166]

In correspondence with clients, Richard King or William Dowling would refer back to the ideals of Harry Clarke, suggesting that these ideals continued to

[165] From promotional material produced by the Clarke Studios, 6th April 1939. TCD MS 6010/839.
[166] The design approach is outlined in detail in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*), Case Study 1.

drive the approach of Clarke Studios long after his death. In 1949, when coming to the end of long association with Rev. Michael Lyons in Sacramento Dowling wrote:

> Harry Clarke knew that the beauty of the medieval windows was due to perfect sympathy with the character of the medium, but rather than imitate he chose to create a form of design which gave the fullest scope for the imaginative interpretation of religious subjects. The jewel-like character of coloured glass in the medieval was embodied in the new form of design and all the beauty of symbolism was used to give the subjects that supernatural feeling so desirable in Christian Art. Thus he created a School of Irish Stained Glass which was distinctly national in feeling and universal in its obedience to the canons of Art. The ideals and style have been maintained since the death of Harry Clarke without any loss of vitality because no attempt has been made to repeat any previous design or to allow new design to be unduly influenced by mannerisms.[167]

These are the aspects of the Harry Clarke style that the artists who worked at Clarke Studios learned to emulate and they assured their clients that was also their way of working.

As described earlier, Dom Eugène Roulin's endorsement of Harry Clarke's work also became an important reference for the company when advertising for business in the United States. The company produced promotional leaflets which listed both ongoing and recently completed commissions. These leaflets were either included as inserts in religious publications or were sent directly to prospective clients. One correspondent, Monsignor Patrick J. Dignan, pastor to the parish of St Cecilia in Los Angeles, California, was particularly impressed with Roulin's opinion on Clarke's stained glass (figure 12) and wrote to Dowling, "For the fifteen rosary windows I have studied pictures of your work in Dom Roulin's book *Our Churches* and believe they would be splendid."[168]

[167] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Michael Lyons, 23rd April 1949. TCD MS 6017/216.
[168] Letter from Rev. J. Dignan, St Cecelia's Church, San Francisco, to William Dowling, 30th January 1954. TCD MS 6129/913.

2.3.2. *The Clarke Studios Style*

Although the Harry Clarke style was one of their unique promotional statements, the Clarke Studios' artists did not merely copy his work for new designs. When William Dowling was interviewed about the work of Clarke Studios in 1963, he commented that:

> Harry Clarke created a style but at the same time we have done our best to develop it and produce work with a definitely creative character of its own. If we did not it would be sterile.[169]

Harry Clarke's style and designs were not directly reproduced, but became the basis of the 'Clarke Studios' style. Although the windows made by Clarke Studios maintained a similarity to Clarke's work, their designs changed over time, primarily to suit developments in art and architecture and to take into consideration the needs of the clients and their architects. Adapting to the needs of the client was particularly true for commissions from the United States where design decisions were also driven by factors such as speed of delivery and the patron's budget for stained glass. Another development that the studios' artists had to adapt to was changes in church architecture which encouraged a move from detailed representational figure work to either an abstract style or to a plain, more lightsome window.

To meet those needs, in the 1950s and '60s the style of stained glass produced by Clarke Studios developed in two ways – towards what could be termed 'modern traditional' in terms of a blend of traditional imagery adapted for modern church interiors, and towards the modern in terms of abstraction. Both include elements of the idiosyncratic style of Harry Clarke, modified to the needs of patrons and the creative skill of the Clarke Studios' artists.

In 1960 Dowling summarised the range of styles Clarke Studios could produce when writing to a prospective client in Palmerston North, New Zealand:

> After the death of Harry Clarke in 1931 we continued to make our windows in the style of design which he created and made famous and more especially still we have endeavoured to preserve, as far as

[169] Anon, 'Craftsmen in Glass', *The Irish Times,* 19th November 1963, p. 4.

> possible, the example of his discrimination in Sacred Art and his avoidance of the mediocre and sentimental. This approach has been most evident in our desire to visualise the sacred personages and scenes in a manner which would emphasise their glory and most significant aspects. In other words, to avoid the mundane and commonplace. That was the ideal of Harry Clarke and one which we have done our very best to follow. In recent times we have made some windows for modern churches which demanded a less elaborate approach in design and much more light from the windows. In working on these we preserve the fundamental ideals I have mentioned. Many of our clients, especially in the USA are keen on the Irish jewel-like window which is synonymous with the name of Clarke and you will be interested to know that we have a considerable number of orders for windows of this kind from clients in the USA.[170]

Modern Traditional Style

The modern traditional style adopted by Clarke Studios is characterised by designs which include traditional elements such as a figurative representation of the subject with associated iconography, which is rendered in a way which takes into account modern architectural requirements including minimal representation and, for certain subjects, the incorporation of everyday objects and people.

As many of the Clarke Studios' American clients purchased full schemes that filled all window openings in their church with stained glass, it was important from a building design perspective to ensure that interiors remained lightsome. The detailed work made for St Ambrose church in Los Angeles and St Brigid's Church in San Francisco, where every window contained stained glass, darkened those churches in a way which became unacceptable for newer commissions. Some prospective clients saw these windows and specifically stated that they did not want their windows to darken their own churches to the same extent.[171] The result was that many

[170] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. James McManus, Cathedral of the Holy Spirit, Palmerston North, 8th September 1960. TCD MS 6028/457.
[171] See, for example, letter from Rev. Arthur Cantwell to William Dowling, 23rd September 1957. TCD MS 6112/5/3/1. Rev. Cantwell comments that "The windows of St Brigid [San Francisco] are beautiful in design but are too dark for the modern world."

newer designs tended to use larger pieces of lighter stained glass and less ornamentation in borders, the effect of which was to allow more light through, but at the sacrifice of the brilliant, sparkling effect of detailed stained glass work.

Also, in many cases a broader, less detailed style was favoured by clients as this was less costly in terms of the amount of the artist's time that was required both to develop detailed designs and to paint details on the glass. From a glazing perspective, such windows were also quicker to make, all of which would shorten the delivery times for the windows. When David Clarke was visiting clients in the United Sates in 1954, William Dowling sought his advice:

> We are doing all we can to get the work out to America but we can't neglect our Irish clients, and besides we are understaffed for the work at hands. I can well imagine the amount of work there is waiting for us in California alone, and I know that the Americans want to spend. Do you get the impression that the Americans want a detailed style from us? If they would take a broad style the work would certainly go out quicker.[172]

This is an indication that, for the North American market at least, Clarke Studios were prepared to amend the style of detailed work they had built their reputation on if the result was that they could fulfil commissions more quickly, which would in turn allow them to commit to a greater number of orders.

Another difference in the later style of Clarke Studios stained glass was that in some cases the windows became more pictorial, losing the mystical impact of earlier work, and relying on the representational quality rather than the innate properties of glass and colour to achieve impact. This can be seen in windows such as *The Eucharist*, made in 1962 for St Elizabeth's, San Francisco, (figure 19). In this window it is clear that the intention of the artist is to portray as true a representation as possible of an everyday religious event in the 1960s. This realistic-style window disregards one of

[172] Letter from William Dowling to David Clarke, 19th January 1954. TCD MS 6022/30. David Clarke, who worked at that time with the theatre group The Dublin Players was touring America with the company and visiting the company's clients where possible.

the original principles advocated by Harry Clarke, and Clarke Studios, which aims to use the properties of the glass to evoke mysticism and spiritual emotion. The window is a painting on glass of a contemporary sacramental scene. The designer is looking to achieve a degree of realism in the work, in particular through the use of contemporary clothing which includes details such as the seam on the back of one of the women's stockings and a subtle rendering of a stained glass window in the background. The effect is an image which captures a snapshot of a religious service in the 1960s, which is well executed in terms of composition but which lacks expression in terms of the prosaic appearance of the figures.

The design is indicative of a trend in that period to include real figures in the composition which makes the humanistic aspect of the subject more apparent. This development towards inclusivity is indicative of liturgical changes that were formally emerging from the Second Vatican Council, as will be discussed in Part Three of this chapter. Although Harry Clarke had included everyday human figures in his religious stained glass, they were there to provide an element of mystery, of humour, as part of a story, and had, on occasion, a grotesque aspect aimed at eliciting an emotion in the viewer. However, in Clarke's work those subjects were never the central figure. Therefore, these pictorial windows indicate that what patrons wanted had developed from solely traditional religious imagery, with more inclusive aspects of religious practice becoming evident in the stained glass. An example of this development in Ireland in the late 1950s and early 1960s is the Clarke Studios commission from the Archbishop of Cork and Ross, Rev. Cornelius Lucey, for a series of stained glass windows for All Saints Church, Drimoleague. This scheme of windows included depictions of scenes of everyday life in the parish, including *Family Prayer*, *Choosing a Way of Life* and *Work and Play* (figure 20).

Towards Abstraction

For a small number of commissions, the artists did adapt their work to fit with new developments in church architecture. When writing about the company in the early 1960s Dowling commented on the Clarke Studios ability to adapt to these newer styles:

> The changes occurring in modern church architecture have not gone unnoticed by the Clarke Studios, and if a mode of design is required to suit a church of modern design, such a problem is not outside the capabilities of its craftsmen. Windows made for the new chapel of the Dominican Convent in Lancaster, Penn., and the chapel of the Immaculate Heart of Mary Convent in Los Angeles are examples of work in this style.[173]

The Lancaster commission was to make stained glass windows for a new chapel under construction for the Dominican Sisters of the Perpetual Rosary. This chapel which has a plainly decorated interior, minimal statuary and few windows, was built in 1955 as a place for prayer, liturgy and as a meeting place. William Dowling designed five stained glass windows, including three which depict the Fifteen Mysteries of the Rosary.[174] The limitation of space made it inevitable that a new way of depicting these subjects was required which would suit the style of the building. To do so, Dowling adapted the normal Clarke Studios style, treating the subjects in a more abstract manner, as is seen in the window depicting the *Joyful Mysteries* (figure 21). The centre panel contains a traditional representation of *The Annunciation*. There is very little painting or modelling of the figure and as large pieces of glass are used there is no attempt at achieving a jewelled effect or a highly decorated image as would be common with other work by Clarke Studios. Dowling then used religious symbolism in the smaller panels of the window to represent each 'Mystery', abstracting a motif from standard iconography to illustrate the subjects.[175] For example, in the *Presentation in the Temple* panel, typical representations of the event depict the Holy Family meeting Simeon at the entrance to the Temple, as can be seen in Dowling's 1938 design for the same subject for the Dominican Convent in Wicklow (figure 22). For the Lancaster window, just the idea of the Presentation is suggested in the top-centre panel, with the pair of doves St Joseph brings as a sacrifice being the only element of this event that is portrayed.

---

[173] William Dowling, 'Irish Stained Glass – The Harry Clarke Studios' (unpublished document (1961), in the personal archive of Ms. Mary Clarke), p. 1.
[174] The subject for the remaining windows were St Dominic Receiving the Rosary and the Blessed Virgin Mary. TCD MS 6022.
[175] In this case the smaller panels depict the text of the Magnificat prayer (the *Visitation*), a nativity scene (the *Nativity of Jesus*), a pair of doves (the *Presentation*) and holy scrolls (*Finding in the Temple*).

The Lancaster chapel is an example of how Clarke Studios were able to successfully adopt a more contemporary style if required to fit within a modern church architectural design. In an interview with *The Irish Times* newspaper in 1966 Dowling summarised how the change in stained glass design reflected the change in church architecture, and that Clarke Studios could adapt to this change:

> A functional simplicity has triumphed over the ornate, so less ornamentation is called for in stained glass design. Yet Mr. Dowling insisted that this development was in the true spirit of Harry Clarke's own work.[176]

However, this style of design was not in great demand from the Clarke Studios' clients in the United States, with modern traditional being the favoured type of stained glass commissions. This was the case through to the time the Clarke Studios closed, as can be seen with Dowling's 1969 design for a figure of *The Child of Prague* at Mary Star of the Sea, San Pedro (figure 23), or his *Crucifixion* in1970 for Our Lady of Guadalupe, La Habra, (figure 24) showing that while they could adapt to the modern style, the Clarke Studios would also return to the more detailed, ornate style if required.

2.3.3. *Case Study 1, Part 2 - Harry Clarke Vs Clarke Studios Style*

Part 2 of this case study considers examples of the Clarke Studios work in the 1950s and '60s, and compares them with the work of Harry Clarke. Two examples of Marian subjects by Clarke Studios from the period have been selected for comparison with Harry Clarke's original stained glass work in Terenure as described in Part 1 of this case study. The stained glass windows, one located in San Francisco and the other in Sacramento, have been chosen based on the similarity of the subject matter and size. Also taken into consideration are the dates of commission of the windows (one from the 1950s and one from the 1960s) and the artists who created the designs (one designed by William Dowling and one by Terence Clarke).

[176] R. M. Fox, 'Pioneer in Irish Stained Glass', The Irish Press, 10th August 1966, p. 7.

Immaculate Conception, St Brigid's Church, San Francisco (1955)

The Immaculate Conception window for St Brigid's in San Francisco was ordered by Rev. James Cantwell (1885 – 1956), in March 1955 and was installed in September of that year.[177] This was one of forty-three windows made by Clarke Studios for the church, with the design responsibilities shared between William Dowling and Terence Clarke, nephew of Harry Clarke. The pastor was concerned that the stained glass would over-darken the church and this was one of the factors that was taken into consideration when designs were created. William Dowling, who had previously designed windows on this subject for the Holy Ghost Fathers Church in Kimmage in 1940 (figure 25) and the Dominican Convent chapel Dun Laoghaire in 1947, designed the window.

Composition:

Dowling's design for the window is a full length symmetrical representation of the subject (figure 26). The figure of the Blessed Virgin occupies the central space of the window, the halo surrounding her head balanced by a crescent moon at her feet (figure 27). The base of the window includes space for an inscription of the name of the donor, common with all windows in that part of the church. The figure, robed in shades of blue, stands out from the background of predominantly red and yellow decorative patterns, giving full clarity to the central subject of the window.

The viewer is drawn to the features of the Blessed Virgin, the focal point of the window. Her head is slightly bowed indicating her humility with minimal modelling of the facial features. The full length two-dimensional image is robed in ultramarine, covered by a cobalt blue mantle with purple lining. In the upper section of the window the red nimbus is surrounded with rays of 'immaculate' light emanating in all directions. In the lower section the Virgin stands on a crescent moon, crushing a serpent over a green earth. The only other detail is a Celtic-style ribbon interlace pattern in the base which encloses the window's inscription. The figure is static, with no sense movement or depth in the image, and there are no additional narratives to add to or distract from the main subject.

[177] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. James Cantwell, 18th August 1955. TCD MS 6023/377.

In his design for the St Brigid's window Dowling has chosen a typical representation of the Immaculate Conception.[178] The layout and colouring are similar to earlier Harry Clarke and Clarke Studios renditions of the subject. This includes the characteristics which distinguish Clarke's work from others – the modelling of the facial features, the split fingers and toes, the dominant blue colouring, the sparkling effect achieved by juxta-positioning of smaller light pieces of glass with larger, darker pieces. Overall, Dowling has designed an uncomplicated, idealised rendition of the subject which is well balanced in terms of colour and layout.

Iconography:
The design includes iconography associated with the Immaculate Conception – the blue robes, the crescent moon, the serpent and the globe. The Virgin's hands are crossed on her breast, stars surround her head and a starburst of light emanates from her red halo. This is a simple, single-subject window with no extra figurative elements included in the design. Common representations of this subject often include angels attending the Virgin, but due to the size constraints of the window (the opening is four feet wide) and the position of the window at the upper level of the church such detail would overcrowd the design which would not be easily visible from ground level. The inclusion of what was recognised as Celtic-style interlace pattern at the base alludes to the Irish origins of both the Saint the church is dedicated to (St Brigid) and the ethnic origin of its pastor Rev. James Cantwell.[179] Several other windows in the church include this patterning (figure 28) as well as other symbols associated with Ireland such as the St Brigid's Cross. The inclusion of obvious Celtic-style ornament in the base of the window is not something that was common in Harry Clarke's own work, particularly where its inclusion appears to be making a statement about the Irishness of the parish and its pastor, rather than a detail relevant to the subject matter (as in the Judas window in the Honan Chapel, described above). As outlined in section 2.2.2, Harry Clarke did not rely on Celtic-style iconography such as zoomorphic figures and interlace patterns to reference ideas of Irishness,

[178] The Immaculate Conception was a popular subject for stained glass in Catholic churches. Dowling could use texts and cartoons of previously-made windows depicting the subject to influence his design.
[179] Rev. James Cantwell was born in Fethard, County Tipperary in 1885 and died in San Francisco in 1956.

but relied more on imagery which related to long-standing Irish narratives to do so. The iconography used at St Brigid's therefore is a case where Clarke Studios used recognised Irish motifs to make an explicit statement about the Irish influence in the parish.

Technical Execution:
Dowling has introduced a rich effect in the glass surrounding the Virgin, which creates a glowing background for the distinctive central figure. The modelling of the robes is principally done through the use of smaller pieces of glass of varying blue tones rather than by painting or staining. The textured appearance of the garments is produced by the selection of streaky glass and acid-etching to achieve a range of hues.[180] Also, the juxtaposition of light and dark glass in the top part of the window, particularly around the Virgin's head, adds to the shimmering effect the upper section of the window produces in direct sunlight.

The figure is surrounded with heavily leaded red and yellow glass in a random pattern which resembles falling flower petals, which makes the window somewhat opaque without strong sunlight. With bright sunlight however this contrast between the lighter yellow glass and the deeper red, as well as the light blue-shaded glass in the halo and border, would produce a jewel-like sparkling effect for the viewer.

While the leadlines do not unduly interfere with the appearance of the window, the four heavy horizontal support bars tend to distract from the overall effect of the stained glass. These supports occur in all the windows in the nave and clerestory of the church and are necessary for their structural integrity.

Dowling has designed a straightforward representation of the *Immaculate Conception*. Although it is not a bold artistic statement as Harry Clarke's Terenure window was, it is a balanced design which incorporates the key iconographical elements associated with the subject. The design also includes features that are derived from the work of Harry Clarke such as the predominantly blue colouring, the decoration surrounding the Virgin and the

[180] See Appendix 3 for terms, streaky, acid-etching, staining.

two-dimensional figure with distinctive facial features and hands. However, Dowling's design is not a direct copy of Clarke's style but conforms to what had become a 'Clarke Studios' style where there is less detail in the finished work, which results in less visual impact when compared to Harry Clarke's own work.

Immaculate Conception, Immaculate Conception Church, Sacramento (1965)

In September 1963 Rev. Thomas Kirby (1905 – 1991) ordered a series of stained glass windows when he was overseeing the remodelling of the Church of the Immaculate Conception, Sacramento.[181] As described in Chapter Three (*Patronage*), Rev. Kirby was a senior official in the Sacramento Diocese and on a previous occasion (in 1950-52) had commissioned ten stained glass windows from Clarke Studios for St Mary's Mausoleum and Cemetery, Sacramento. Soon after Rev. Kirby placed the new order he was replaced as pastor by Rev. Michael Fitzgerald (1902 – 1968) who finalised the selection of the theme for the stained glass. Six windows were ordered for the church with subjects relating to the life of the Blessed Virgin. The resulting windows, installed in 1965 and each costing £290, are typical of the Clarke Studios work for American clients in the mid-1960s.[182]

The windows were designed by Terence Clarke who noted that they were positioned seven feet above ground and received poor light due to the proximity of other buildings.[183] This low position is similar to that of Harry Clarke's *Virgin in Glory* window in St Joseph's Church, Terenure and therefore offers the opportunity to draw direct comparisons between the Clarke Studios work from the mid-1960s with Clarke's own work executed forty years earlier. The *Immaculate Conception* window (figure 29) is chosen from this church for comparison as its subject relates most closely to the *Virgin in Glory* window in St Joseph's, Terenure. As this window is designed by Terence Clarke there is also the opportunity to compare it with William

[181] See Appendix Two for the opening correspondence relating to this commission.
[182] Clarke's Virgin in Glory Terenure cost £120 in 1923.
[183] The light conditions are recorded on the design drawing for the window depicting *The Coronation of Our Lady*, TCD MS 11182/1036v

Dowling's design for the same subject, as described above. This gives an indication of the existence or absence of an in-house style at Clarke Studios.

Composition:
In terms of the overall design, the window contains the single figure of the Virgin which is clearly distinguishable in a flat, symmetrical layout. At the top, the large radiant halo around the Virgin's head is balanced at the base by a host of cherubs surrounding her feet. The two-dimensional figure appears to float on a sea of air and other than the image of the suppressed snake under the Virgin's feet there is little animation in the scene. As is typical in windows relating to the Virgin, the dominant colour in the window is blue, with the Virgin robed in a purple-lined, cobalt blue cloak over an ultramarine robe, similar to the colours used by William Dowling and Harry Clarke in their designs for the *Immaculate Conception*.

The figure is surrounded by relatively large pieces of lightly-shaded red, blue and green streaked glass, cut and assembled in a wavy pattern. The use of larger pieces of glass means that less leading is needed which adds to the overall transparency of the window. This was a requirement as the church was shaded by trees and another building.[184]

Aspects of the design that associate it with Harry Clarke are the depth of shading of the blue robes and the inclusion of his characteristic gadgets such as the split fingers, the large eyes, the gaze of the Virgin and the child-like features of the cherubs. In terms of the modelling of the Virgin's face, Terence Clarke's design gives the figure rounded features, different to the faces of Harry Clarke's female figures, which usually appeared oblong with an oval or pointed chin. There is no additional detail in the design, with no other attributes of the Virgin included, and no secondary enigmatic or symbolic elements that would add additional layers of meaning to the window. Such features are found in many Harry Clarke designs, and are abundant in the Terenure *Virgin in Glory* window. The requirement that the windows remain lightsome would be a factor in omitting such detail.

[184] Letter from Rev. Thomas Kirby to William Dowling, 10th June 1963. TCD MS 6112/2/4.

Iconography:

The stained glass design follows familiar iconography associated with the Catholic Church's dogma of the Immaculate Conception. The Virgin is robed in blue and crushes a serpent underfoot, indicating her victory over sin. She stands on a crescent moon over a globe which is supported by seven cherubs. Stars surround her head and light radiates from her halo in all directions. Her hands are clasped across her breast and her young face holds a serene gaze. There are no secondary elements or additional narrative panels in the window – it is a typical representation of the Immaculate Conception, in a Clarke Studios style.

Technical Execution:

The window is executed in a broad style, with little detailed drawing.[185] Most of the finer drawing detail is in the features of the Virgin and the cherubs. There is some etching of the glass which gives texture to areas of the window, including the Virgin's robe, the cherubim's wings and the serpent. In other areas such as the border of the Virgin's cloak, the stars surrounding the Virgin's head and the globe, a sparkling effect is achieved either with the use of smaller pieces of lightly coloured glass, or by using a dark stain around clear glass.

Overall, while it is a straightforward rendition of the subject, the stained glass window closely matches the general appearance the other stained glass provided for the same church and was very satisfactory to the pastor and his parishioners who reported that "parishioners appreciate them as they are very beautiful".[186] The layout is clear and is balanced from a colouring perspective. Some of the details, in particular the appearance of the cherubs, attract the viewers' attention. However, although it has some similarities, it is quite different from what would be expected from a 'Harry Clarke' window. The design strictly adheres to the familiar narrative of the subject and does not have the theatrical qualities of Harry Clarke designs.

[185] The term "broad" is used by Dowling in correspondence to describe stained glass designs which do not have an extensive amount of detailed drawing in the figures or robes. For example in TCD MS 6021/163 Dowling writes ""The windows of St Ambrose were conceived in a rather broad style to suit the height, and for the windows in your church we propose to obtain a more detailed effect because they will be closer to the eye."

[186] Letter from Rev. Michael Fitzgerald to William Dowling, 2nd March 1965. TCD MS 6132/9/5.

While it is well executed, the garments of the Virgin are not as elaborate as Clarke would make them. There is no extra detail in the borders, and no secondary meaning relating to the subject is included, either explicit or through symbolism. There are no odd or out-of-place figures or facial expressions, and no fantastical elements – all of which were hallmarks of Harry Clarke's imaginative interpretations of a subject.

Comparing this window with the *Immaculate Conception* designed by William Dowling for St Brigid's (described above) there are clear similarities in the design of both commissions. The composition, iconography and treatment of the figure of the Virgin are almost identical in the windows. One difference is the background which is much lighter in the Sacramento window to make allowance for poor external lighting conditions. Also, there is no Celtic-style ornament in the Sacramento window, indicating that its inclusion in the St Brigid's designs was at the request of the patron rather than a common feature of windows made for clients in the United States.[187] Although a small sample, these windows indicate that the designs produced by principal designers at Clarke Studios did conform to an in-house style which distinguished their work from other studios operating at the time.

Conclusion

Many of the creative elements that made Harry Clarke's windows unique are less evident in the Clarke Studios designs from the 1950s and '60s. William Dowling and Terence Clarke do not attempt to repeat the imaginative digressions that feature in Clarke's work and their designs adhere to the narrative of each subject as recognised by their clients. In the two cases presented in this study, the completed windows, as with others made for the same churches at that time, succeed very well in terms of their handling of the subject, their visual appeal and how they blend with the other work in each location. However, the theatricality which gives vitality and mystery to Clarke's work is not as apparent in later designs executed by Clarke Studios. Elements such as the arrangement of the subjects and the decorative background are present, but the less detailed working of the figures and the absence of extra narrative and symbolic details show how this later work by

[187] A survey by the author of other windows in the United States made by Clarke Studios shows that this Celtic-style decoration was rarely included in designs.

Clarke Studios does not match the artistic quality of Harry Clarke's work. The studios' artists had developed a contemporary 'Clarke Studios' style which was derived from but did not slavishly copy Harry Clarke's style, and their patrons were satisfied with that. The Clarke Studios style was a product of that of its founder and the artistic efforts of its principal design artists William Dowling and Terence Clarke which, although lacking the quality and narrative strength of Harry Clarke's work, was nonetheless appealing to clients in the United States.

2.3.4. *Company Name*

The shrewd decision of including 'Harry Clarke' in the name of the company when the new business was being set up in 1930 ensured that all documents such as correspondence and designs had Harry Clarke's name included somewhere in the paperwork. This kept the Harry Clarke brand central to all dealings and led to a degree of vagueness about who clients were dealing with – the person or the company, and Clarke Studios were content to let this ambiguity continue as long as it helped win orders.

Some of the Clarke Studios correspondence indicates that clients were satisfied to overlook the detail that Harry Clarke was not directly involved in their work. Rev. James Cantwell showed the newly installed stained glass in St Brigid's, San Francisco to visiting priests who described the windows as "some of Harry Clarke's best".[188] By 1956, when the work was complete St Brigid's went on to be known as "Harry Clarke's Church".[189] In 1960, when commenting on the windows at St Ambrose Church in Los Angeles, Rev. George Scott described the stained glass as darkening the church too much but that "like all Harry Clarke windows, they are very beautiful".[190] Although the windows in the Sacred Heart Church in Sacramento were designed by Richard King and William Dowling in the 1930s and '40s, the parish still identifies their stained glass as being the work of Harry Clarke.[191] The use of

[188] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 3rd May 1955. TCD MS 6127/423.
[189] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 6th February 1956. TCD MS 6128/467.
[190] Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling, 6th July 1960. TCD MS 6113/3/40. Rev. Scott, a client of the Clarke Studios, was pastor at Mary Star of the Sea parish, San Pedro, California.
[191] Anon, 'Sacred Heart Parish History', published online at https://sacredheart.church/parish-history (accessed 29th January 2021).

the Clarke name therefore has proven to be a benefit to both Clarke Studios and their clients.

2.3.5. *Advertising, Promotion and State Support*

Advertising

Following enquiries from a number of Irish American priests in the late 1940s it became apparent to Clarke Studios' management that there were opportunities to sell more of their stained glass work in the United States. In addition to advertising in Irish publications such as *The Capuchin Annual* which was distributed world-wide (figure 30), Clarke Studios began to promote the company in Catholic publications in the United States, hoping to catch the attention of more Irish American priests. In May 1948 William Dowling made enquiries about advertising in the *Official Catholic Directory*, an annual publication which listed details of bishops, clergy, religious orders, parishes and diocesan offices within each diocese across the United States.[192] Due to foreign currency spending constraints post-World War II, Clarke Studios had to seek permission from the Department of Finance to be able to pay advertising costs in dollar currency.[193] In a letter to the Department of Finance William Dowling wrote:

> We wish to increase our trade with the United States so propose to advertise in the *American Catholic Directory* and other Catholic magazines. The only United States funds we could call upon for payment would be dollars owed to us for windows supplied to America. We are not sure if your department would agree to this. We shall be glad to have your advice in this matter as we believe that much good would come from our advertising in the United States both from the cultural and national economic standpoints.[194]

[192] Letter from William Dowling to Department of Finance, 6th November 1948. TCD MS 6016/395.
[193] From 1922 Ireland held large sterling balances in British banks which it used to pay foreign debt, including imports from the United States. In 1947British currency policy changed which led to measures to improve Ireland's balance-of-payments with the U.S., including managing levels of imports and encouraging increased exports. Frank Barry & Clare O'Mahony, 'Regime Change in 1950s Ireland: The New Export-Oriented Foreign Investment Strategy', *Irish Economic and Social History*, Vol. 44 (1), (2017), p. 50.
[194] Letter from William Dowling to Department of Finance, 6th November 1948. TCD MS 6016/395.

Dowling then wrote to the Irish Consul General in New York to get the titles of other important Catholic magazines published in the United States.[195] This change of focus towards the U.S. resulted in Clarke Studios cancelling some of their advertising in Ireland, such as a long-standing advertisement in *The Collegian* published by St Malachy's College in Belfast.[196]

Through the 1950s, Clarke Studios relied strongly on word-of-mouth from existing clients rather than advertising to generate new orders. However, when new business appeared to be dwindling in 1963 it was decided to invest in advertising in diocesan directories across three Californian Dioceses. Advertising subscriptions were taken in the official annual directories in the Catholic dioceses of San Francisco (published by *The San Francisco Monitor*), Sacramento (published by *The Catholic Herald*) and Los Angeles (published by *The Tidings*).[197] These directories acted as a reference for all official Catholic resources in each diocese and they attracted advertising from a range of ecclesiastical goods suppliers. The subscriptions, and an additional one for Fresno Diocese in 1966, continued until 1968 when it became clear to Studios' management that the market for stained glass in the United States had changed.[198]

Other forms of promotion included contributions to parish booklets which commemorated churches where the Clarke Studios had installed work, and occasional mentions in newspaper articles when pastors were interviewed about new church buildings.[199] One such promotion was a donation by Clarke Studios of $125 towards the cost of producing a souvenir booklet for the opening of St Ambrose Church, Los Angeles.[200] In addition to the advertising text, Clarke Studios provided a sketch of the St Ambrose window for the

[195] Letter from William Dowling to the Irish Consul General, New York, 8th April 1949. TCD MS 6017/181.
[196] Letter from William Dowling to Colm McCompton, St Malachy's College Belfast, 13th May 1950. TCD MS 6018/211.
[197] Details of the Directories where advertisements were placed are contained in numerous items of correspondence in TCD MSS 6031 – 6035. A copy of one advertisement published in the Los Angeles Catholic Directory is held in TCD MS 6131/1/157.
[198] The change in the market will be discussed later in this chapter.
[199] An example of a newspaper reference can be found in the San Francisco Diocesan newspaper *The Monitor*. Anon, 'St. Brigid's Celebrates Centennial*', The Monitor*, 17th May 1963, p. 7.
[200] Although William Dowling sought permission from the Department of Finance to pay the $125 the cost was offset against the St Ambrose account. Letter from William Dowling to Department of Finance, 17th May 1951. TCD MS 6019/281.

booklet, which was also used on the cover of a booklet describing the church's stained glass (figure 31).

One newspaper article which was complimentary to the Clarke Studios - but which they were ultimately dissatisfied with - was a piece written by the *Irish News Agency*, a Government-sponsored press agency set up to channel Irish news worldwide.[201] The article was printed in newspapers throughout the United States in July and August 1954.[202] A customer of Clarke Studios, Rev. Patrick Hannon from Reedley, CA sent William Dowling a copy of the article which had been printed in the *Sacramento Bee* on 25th July 1954:

> American Catholics are turning more and more to Ireland for stained glass windows for their churches and cathedrals. In hundreds of churches, not only in the United States, but all over the world, the light that streams through the tall windows is touched to magic colours by the artistry of a small group of workers in a Dublin studio. These workers, under bespectacled, beaming William Dowling, are reviving a craft that is as old as Ireland itself. Over the past three years, their exports of stained glass windows to American churches have been netting them a yearly $100,000, not bad for just 13 craftsmen unhurriedly plying their skilled trade.[203]

While initially happy with the article, although disputing the claim of $100,000 worth of business per year, a letter to the company from a stained glass firm in New Jersey changed their view. George L. Payne, the company who had installed Harry Clarke's windows in Bayonne New Jersey, wrote to Dowling in a "friendly spirit" warning them that such publicity could lead to import tariff increases, which would not be good for the Clarke Studios' business in the U.S.[204] Payne advised them that the article could have the effect of making the Stained Glass Association of America, the

---

[201] Michael MacDonagh 'Ireland's Attitude to External Affairs', *Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review*, Vol. 48 (189), (1959), p. 81.
[202] Newspaper articles available at www.newspapers.com (accessed April 2020). Publications included *The Marion Star*, Ohio, 28/7/1954. *Kannapolis Daily Independent*, North Carolina, 5/8/1954. The Times San Mateo, California, 21/7/1954. *The Battle Creek Enquirer*, Michigan, 28/7/1954. The article was also published in newspapers in New York, Illinois, New Mexico, Oregon and Cincinnati.
[203] Newspaper cutting enclosed in letter from Rev. Patrick Hannon to William Dowling, 1st August 1954. TCD MS 6129/1212.
[204] Letter from William Dowling to George L. Payne, 25th August 1954. TCD MS 6022/449. This letter acknowledges Payne's advice.

representative body for stained glass artists, seek an increase in the tariff duty payable on stained glass imports. Dowling, who is likely to have been interviewed for the piece initially, contacted the *Irish News Agency* outlining his concerns:

> If this [increase in tariffs] were to happen we would be at a disadvantage with our American clients and the demand for Irish stained glass might cease.[205]

As a result, the company limited their advertising to religious periodicals, and shied away from widespread publicity, fearing a backlash from American stained glass makers. No further articles on the extent of Irish stained glass imports to the U.S. appeared in the general press and the majority of specific newspaper references to Clarke Studios were articles or advertisements in religious publications.[206]

While the article may have drawn negative attention from the SGAA, the bulk of its content would have found interest with many Irish Americans, particularly those interested in Irish nationalism:

> The present pedigree of Irish stained glass goes back no more than 50 years. With the suppression of religion in Ireland during Tudor times and the desolation wrought by Cromwell's soldiers almost a century later, not a piece of medieval Irish stained-glass was left unsmashed. After Catholic Emancipation in 1829 churches in Ireland again went in for the luxury of stained glass windows imported from England and the continent. The work was based on unlovely German models. Until Irish stained glass began to go to America some four years ago, the fashion in the United States was for something conceived in terms of realism—almost like the reproduction of pictures in glass. lf it wasn't ingeniously realistic it was a slavish copy of the worst England and German models of 70 or 80 years ago—sloppy and sentimental. [207]

---

[205] Letter from William Dowling to Director, Irish News Agency 25th August 1954. TCD MS 6022/447.
[206] This information determined from searches of online newspaper archive www.newspapers.com (accessed March 2020).
[207] Newspaper cutting enclosed in letter from Rev. Patrick Hannon to William Dowling, 1st August 1954. TCD MS 6129/1212.

Records of the company's correspondence indicate that few enquiries came as a result of advertising in American publications, with only one recorded enquiry which cites the Los Angeles Diocesan Directory as a source of information about the company.[208] While it could be argued it had limited success, the benefit of advertising therefore was to make the Clarke Studios name known, and to keep it familiar with Irish American priests who may have been already aware of their work, and that of Harry Clarke, either in Ireland or the United States.

The greatest advertising for Clarke Studios in the United States was the stained glass that was already installed in churches. Positive word of mouth from existing clients was a significant factor in how the company won more orders. Seeing the Clarke Studios work installed in churches and the testimony of satisfied customers won new clients and convinced architects of the suitability of the company's stained glass for their buildings. Hence, getting a foothold in a city was important as it made the Clarke Studios work more accessible to interested pastors who had church-building projects. As Dowling commented when seeking funding for a trade visit to the United States from the Irish Export Board:

> Most of our new work comes from clergy and architects who have been impressed by important windows of ours already installed in churches where, naturally, the work is seen to best advantage and a better assessment made of it.[209]

A number of potential clients requested brochures of the Clarke Studios work in order to see the style of stained glass they produced and to compare their work with that of their competitors. When such requests were received, William Dowling responded that it was not the company's policy to produce a catalogue as an original design was created for each new window.[210] In his replies to these enquiries Dowling included leaflets which listed current and recent commissions in the United States, and photographs of recent work (figure 32). This approach was consistent with the standards of the Clarke

[208] Letter from William Dowling to Sr Francis Gilbert, Tujunga, Los Angeles, 13th August 1964. TCD MS 6032/345. This enquiry did not generate an order.
[209] Letter from William Dowling to M. Flanagan, Irish Export Board, 21st February 1967. TCD MS 6035/98. The role of the Irish Export Board is discussed later in this chapter.
[210] An example of such a response is the letter from William Dowling to Rev. Thomas Connolly, Archbishop of Seattle, 24th July 1951. TCD MS 6019/420.

Studios that each window they produced was a distinct artwork, uniquely designed and made for a specific client.

Sales Agents

Although the company was courted by local Californian companies on several occasions in the 1950s and '60s, they did not use local agents to promote and sell their work.[211] Some of their clients advised them to do so, believing that an agent working on their behalf would bring more business to the company. They were also encouraged to do so by Larry Gunning (1917 – 2009), co-owner of Gunning and Co., another Dublin-based church furnishing supplier which specialised in church metalwork (including decorative chalices, monstrances and candle holders) who was very active in the United States in the 1950s and '60s.[212]

The board of the company considered each approach by an agent seeking to form an alliance, and the offer was refused every time for a number of reasons. Firstly, the company management found it difficult to find a partner they were sure they could do business with at such a distance. Coming to a satisfactory arrangement without travelling to the U.S. to meet and build a good relationship with an agent would have been difficult, and the company was not prepared to spend the time and expense doing that. Also, agent's fees would also have to be added to the price of a commission, possibly making the cost prohibitive.[213]

More importantly however, it was the Clarke Studios long-established policy to always deal directly with clients. Through experience they knew that this

[211] William Dowling corresponded with a number of companies who could act as agents for the company - C.F. Horan (Los Angeles), Robert D Donovan (Los Angeles), Philip et Cie (Los Angeles) and William Schwalm (Los Angeles). The Clarke Studios also had enquiries from agents in other parts of North America including, Joseph Poli (Pitsburgh), Toronto Glass (Toronto), AM Duffy (Newfoundland), Liturgical Imports (New York), Gaspari Studios (New York), Karl Hackert (Chicago), and J. Chartrand (Boston). This information gathered from multiple items of correspondence in TCD MSS 6010 – 6035.

[212] During the 1940s, 1950s and 1960s Gunning and Co. were the largest ecclesiastical silversmiths operating in Dublin, exporting their products worldwide. Jill Gilmer, 'The Gunning Family Tree', published online at http://jillgilmerfamilytree.blogspot.com/2015/04/ancestor-profile-gunning-family-part-one.html (accessed 11th December 2020). Larry Gunning encouraged American ecclesiastical goods suppliers such as Philip et Cie to approach the Clarke Studios to offer agency services. Letter from Joe Elway, Philip et Cie, to William Dowling 12th February 1959. TCD MS 6130b/2187.

[213] This point made in a letter from William Dowling to Rev. George Gallagher, San Pedro, 13th January 1964. TCD MS 6032/23.

led to a better understanding of the client's needs, and allowed them to interact as required on design decisions and any other practical matters. In this way a commission was considered more an artistic endeavour, which was true to the original aims of Clarke Studios, and not merely the factory provision of a 'stock' stained glass window. Each commission was unique and hence this personal interaction was needed and the Clarke Studios management believed that an agent could have no role in this. Responding to Rev. Thomas O'Toole's (1882-1960), encouragement to use a sales agent in California William Dowling stated:

> We have never had an agent abroad for two reasons. One being the difficulty of procuring a suitable person or firm and the other being a desire on our part to avoid at all costs a too commercialised outlook on religious art which an agent might create in the minds of prospective clients.[214]

One agent with whom they explored the possibility of going into business with, the church furnishings agent William Schwalm, saw this level of direct interaction between maker and client as being unworkable if a sales agent was involved. Schwalm as a salesperson could sell a scheme of windows but due to the long lead times needed for the Clarke Studios to work, the final product would only be delivered on a staggered basis. As a result, they, as agents, would have no control over the timeline for delivery.[215] The staggered delivery would also increase the cost of the commission as freight charges and insurance would have to be paid for each consignment. Therefore, Clarke Studios, because of their methods and rate of production, would not have been an attractive proposition to them as partners.

A final reason for not having an agent was the possibility that the company may get more orders than they would be able to deliver in a reasonable time.[216] During their busiest years finding and retaining a sufficient number of artists and glaziers to work at the company was difficult, leading to long lead times for delivery and frustration on the part of their clients. Having to wait a year or more for a stained glass window to be made and delivered was unacceptable for some potential clients, and an increase in business

[214] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Thomas O'Toole, 14th June 1950. TCD MS 6018/265.
[215] Letter from William Schwalm to William Dowling, 2nd April 1964. TCD MS 6133/11/2.
[216] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Alford Abraham, 1st May 1957. TCD MS 6025/190.

without having the staff to deliver the work would have had a negative impact on existing business.[217]

On one occasion a client, Rev. Alford Abraham who was the Anglican minister at St Andrews Memorial Church, London, Ontario, offered to act as a representative for the company in Canada. The Clarke Studios management declined, concerned that having a clergyman acting as an official representative may introduce complications and misunderstandings with clergymen clients of other denominations.[218]

Other Irish ecclesiastical suppliers such as Gunning and Co. did use sales agents and did have product catalogues. However, their products were smaller scale items than stained glass and, where a design would be repeated, the products were mostly sold from a catalogue. Larry Gunning, who co-managed the business, travelled extensively in the United States, winning business for his company, and recommending Irish stained glass studios to his clients when he had the opportunity.[219] The association between Gunning and Clarke Studios was of benefit to both companies as they shared information with each other about their respective clients.

A past employee of the company, John Hogan, who had established his own stained glass business in the U.S. also offered to act as an agent for the Clarke Studios work.[220] The Clarke Studios management ignored his request as Hogan, who had previously been using the Clarke Studios name to sell his own glass, was not trusted.[221] William Dowling went as far as writing to twenty-three clients and all their advertising outlets in the U.S. to advise them about Hogan's false claim.

---

[217] The company did engage freelance artists to do a limited number of designs. This will be discussed later in this chapter.
[218] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Alford Abraham, 1st May 1957. TCD MS 6025/190.
[219] During the 1950's and 1960's Larry Gunning made sixty-seven trips across the Atlantic on assignments for the U.S Catholic Church. Jill Gilmer, 'The Gunning Family Tree', published online at http://jillgilmerfamilytree.blogspot.com/2015/04/ancestor-profile-gunning-family-part-one.html (accessed 11th December 2020).
[220] John Hogan had trained in the company as a glazier for 7 years to 1939. He was not employed as an artist. He set up his own studio in Dublin in 1945 and emigrated to the United States in 1958 where he set up a new stained glass business, John Hogan Studios Ltd.. Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Arthur Cantwell, 2nd October 1959. TCD MS 6027/377.
[221] Letter from Rev. Arthur Cantwell to William Dowling, 2nd October 1962. TCD MS 6112/5/70.

In summary, Clarke Studios avoided the use of local sales agents to promote their work in the United States, preferring direct contact with clients. Although Larry Gunning acted as a quasi-agent, putting William Dowling in contact with some of his clients who were considering stained glass, there is no evidence to suggest that this amounted to an increase in orders in the U.S.

Trade Exhibitions and State Support

Following Harry Clarke's death in 1931 Clarke Studios saw opportunities for selling ecclesiastical stained glass to overseas clients through international trade exhibitions, and they participated by displaying the best available examples of their work. Before World War II, Irish involvement in overseas trade fairs was facilitated by the Department of Industry and Commerce. As discussed in Chapter Four (*Meaning*), participating in events such as the Chicago World's Fair (1933/34) and the New York World's Fair (1939) had both nationalistic and commercial advantages for the new Irish state.[222] Clarke Studios exhibited at both, with particular success in New York where the Richard King-designed panel *Ireland's Homage* was bought by the Archbishop of Los Angeles Rev. John Cantwell.[223] Other pre-World War II international expositions that Clarke Studios participated in were the Empire Exhibition in Glasgow (1938) and the New Zealand Centennial Exhibition 1939/40. For the Glasgow exhibition the Department initially wanted to only display work by Harry Clarke, including specific panels extracted from his *Geneva Window,* which, ironically, had been rejected by the State some years previously.[224] While agreeing that some original work of Clarke's should be included, the manager Richard King argued that examples of their current work should also be shown as it represented the contemporary work of Ireland's leading stained glass studio.[225] The outcome was that, with the

[222] The name of the Irish state was 'Irish Free State' up to 1938, thereafter 'Ireland'. For an analysis of how the Irish Free State harnessed visual art for political purposes between 1922 and 1934 see William Shortall, *Art and the Irish Free State - visualizing nationhood (1922-1934*), (PhD Thesis, TCD, 2020.
[223] This covered in greater detail in Chapter Four (*Meaning*).
[224] Letter from Richard King to Frederick Boland, Department of Industry and Commerce, 9th April 1938. TCD MS 6010/195. The controversy surrounding the commissioning and subsequent rejection of the Geneva Window by the Irish Free State Government is explored fully in, Róisín Kennedy, 'The *Geneva Window*: A Precious Gift Never Given', in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds.) *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish state* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019), pp. 73-99.
[225] Letter from Richard King to Frederick Boland, Department of Industry and Commerce, 9th April 1938. TCD MS 6010/195.

agreement of the pastor Rev. Michael Lyons, Clarke Studios sent two windows which had just been completed for Sacred Heart Church, Sacramento, *St John* and *Our Lady of Sorrows* (figure 33), both designed by Richard King.[226] The windows were displayed in the Catholic Pavilion at the Empire Exhibition, and were dispatched to Sacramento following their return to Dublin.[227]

For the New Zealand exhibition four panels on the subject of *Our Lady Queen of Heaven* were made for the Archbishop of Wellington. They were subsequently installed in the Cathedral of the Holy Spirit, Palmerston North.[228]

In response to post-World War II economic difficulties, the Irish Export Board was established by the Irish Government in October 1950, and was incorporated as CTT in 1951.[229] One of CTT's goals was to increase the amount of dollars earned by Irish exports in order to be able to pay for imported American goods, thus improving Ireland's balance of payments.[230] In the United States CTT acted as a promotional agency charged with providing opportunities for Irish exporters to sell their products in the American market. The Board organised trade shows and gathered information on possible sales prospects which it fed back to suppliers. CTT operated across a range of industries including bloodstock, whiskey, meat, fashion, textiles and, in the context of this research, it organised several exhibitions of Irish-made ecclesiastical goods.

The first post-World War II exhibition Clarke Studios participated in was an Exhibition of Religious Goods in New York, 1955, for which it made a panel depicting the Sacred Heart of Jesus.[231] In 1959 Clarke Studios sent a panel

[226] Letter from Richard King to Rev. Michael Lyons, 22nd April 1938. TCD MS 6010/224.
[227] Letter from Richard King to Rev. John Cantwell, Archbishop of Los Angeles, 23rd August 1938. TCD MS 6010/440. Having the windows displayed in the Catholic Pavilion, and not the Irish Free State Pavilion, would give them good exposure to their target audience – religious patrons.
[228] Letter from Richard King to Rev. A. J. McRae, Chancellor Wellington Diocese, New Zealand, 13th July 1939. TCD MS 6011/20.
[229] The Irish Export Board had been established on the recommendation of the Dollar Export Advisory Committee in 1950. Frank Barry & Clare O'Mahony, 'Regime Change in 1950s Ireland: The New Export-Oriented Foreign Investment Strategy', *Irish Economic and Social History*, Vol. 44 (1), (2017), p. 51.
[230] Ibid.
[231] Letter from William Dowling to CTT, 11th February 1955. TCD MS 6023/68.

entitled *The Visitation* for an exhibition of Irish ecclesiastical art, first in London and then in New York in August of that year. The panel, designed by Terence Clarke, was a replica of a section of the *Annunciation* window made for St Thomas the Apostle Seminary in Seattle. William Dowling had asked the client, Rev. Thomas Connolly, Archbishop of Seattle, if he would allow the original panel to be included in the exhibition. He declined, as it would have delayed the erection of the window which he wanted in place for the dedication of the chapel in April 1959. Clarke Studios made the replica panel was included in both exhibitions along with photographs of William Dowling's *Ascension of Christ* window made for Christ Church Priory in Eltham, London and Dowling's *St Gabriel* window made for St Gabriel's Church, Clontarf, Dublin (figure 34).[232] Also included in the London and New York exhibitions were works by Evie Hone, Oisin Kelly, Patrick Pye, Patrick Pollen, Ian and Imogen Stuart, John Haugh, Brigid Rynne and Phyllis Burke.[233]

While these exhibitions allowed the Clarke Studios work to be seen with other ecclesiastical good suppliers, there is no evidence in the company order book or correspondence that they generated new business. In the late 1960s, despite encouragement from CTT, the company became reluctant to engage with trade exhibitions as they considered them of little benefit to the business at that time.[234]

U.S. Import Tariffs

In the mid-1950s the Clarke Studios management became very concerned about the impact of import tariffs imposed on stained glass by U.S. authorities. In the 1920s a duty of thirty percent was levied on stained glass imported into the USA which cost less than $15 per square foot. This limited the type of work Clarke Studios could do to higher value figure work. The Clarke Studios orders from American clients ranged in cost between $20 and

[232] The exhibition moved from London to New York 6027/124. Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Alford Abraham, 7th April 1959. TCD MS 6027/124.
[233] Anon, 'Irish Church Art Exhibit Opens at Ireland House', *The Tablet (Brooklyn, New York)*, 20th June 1959, p. 7.
[234] Clarke Studios participated in a trade exhibition in London organised by CTT which ran for two weeks in November 1967, which was not a success as it was not focused on Catholic churches. Letter from William Dowling to Hugh Graham, CTT, 5th January 1968. TCD MS 6035/394. The Clarke Studios also participated in an exhibition of Irish Ecclesiastical Furnishings in Liverpool from 26-29 September 1968, sending one completed window, eleven designs, ten B/W photos and one cartoon. Letter from William Dowling to CTT, 24th August 1968. TCD MS 6036/34. There is no evidence of new orders coming from either of these exhibitions.

$30 per square foot depending on complexity of design.[235] Each window was also deemed to be an original artwork, a one-off design which was painted by professional artists. Therefore, because of the cost per square foot and the artistic value of the stained glass, Clarke Studios work fell outside the range of goods on which duty had to be paid. If a client wanted plain or leaded glass, or if their budget was limited then it was not feasible for Clarke Studios to do the work, and they advised the client to purchase locally.

In April 1949, before embarking on a sales drive for Irish stained glass in post-World War II United States, Clarke Studios verified that this tariff arrangement was still in place. Writing to the Minister for Industry and Commerce William Dowling outlined the export-potential of stained glass which would benefit Ireland both economically and culturally:

> You will be aware that previous to the late war a prices commission investigated the matter of imported stained glass windows, and established a price per foot under which no stained glass could be imported. This prevented the importation of cheap, commercially produced and unartistic windows from the continent and preserved the level of excellence which this country has attained in the art. Has the price been changed in line with post war costs of production? (If so) grave harm could be done to craft. We believe Ireland has an opportunity now to develop a tradition of her own in sacred art which would be contemporary in spirit and of ultimate value to the country both culturally and economically[236]

From this it is clear that Dowling is not only enquiring on behalf of his company, but is petitioning for the Irish stained glass industry as a whole.[237]

In the mid-1950s the SGAA, concerned with the increasing amount of stained glass being imported into the U.S., began lobbying for an increase in

[235] Letter from William Dowling to Messrs Donley and Bundey Architects, 4th June 1968. TCD MS 6036/281.
[236] Letter from William Dowling to Department of Industry and Commerce, 8th April 1949. TCD MS 6017/182.
[237] While the Clarke studios were members of the industry group the Master Glaziers Association, there is no evidence that there was industry-wide lobbying of the Irish government to support exports.

the threshold under which duty was to be levied to $45.[238] In November 1958 Clarke Studios were contacted by Max Ingrand (1908 – 1969), a competitor stained glass artist based in France, indicating that the proposed increase was becoming a reality and that it would be in their mutual interest to attempt to prevent it happening.[239] William Dowling contacted the Minister for Industry and Commerce, Seán Lemass (1899 – 1971), requesting that he use his influence to lobby the U.S. authorities on their behalf.[240] The Minister asked CTT to investigate the matter and their representatives in the New York office made enquiries with the American Customs authorities. The outcome was that no increase occurred.[241]

Sales Visits to the U.S.

The advent of more accessible air travel between Ireland and the United States in the late 1950s made it easier for Irish businesses to visit North America to market and sell their products.[242] In October 1960, Frank Ryan of Abbey Stained Glass Studios in Dublin, and Larry Gunning of Gunning and Co., Dublin visited forty cities across the U.S. on a sales tour.[243] They found a good market existed for Irish ecclesiastical products, winning commissions and getting a large number of enquiries for their businesses. In their report from the visit, they also observed that Irish stained glass needed to be of high quality in order to find a niche in the American market – Irish producers could only compete with products that were high in artistic and craft value.[244] Both Ryan and Gunning were acquaintances of William Dowling so it can be assumed that they shared some of the findings from their trip with him.[245]

[238] Newspaper clipping from *The Wall St Journal* sent by Rev. William O'Shea, Los Angeles to William Dowling, 17th July 1959. TCD MS 6135/5/58.
[239] Ingrand also provided the address for the French Trade Counsellor in New York. Letter from William Dowling to Max Ingrand 19th November 1958. TCD MS 6026/668.
[240] Letter from William Dowling to Minister for Industry and Commerce, 19th November 1958. TCD MS 6026/678.
[241] Ibid. Handwritten notes dated February 1959 state "no increase contemplated by US Customs and Excise at this time".
[242] Aer Lingus began scheduled transatlantic flights in April 1958.
[243] Anon, 'U.S. Market for Irish Stained Glass', *The Irish Times*, 24th December 1960, p. 11.
[244] Ibid.
[245] The Clarke Studios correspondence indicates that Gunning frequently provided the Clarke Studios with leads for new business in the United States. TCD MS 6021 – 6032.

William Dowling also travelled to the U.S. to "stimulate orders" in 1965 and again in 1968.[246] The first trip in March 1965 was part-funded by one of the company's clients, Rev. Francis Donnelly at the Church of Mary's Nativity, Flushing, New York. Donnelly had invited Dowling to attend the dedication of his new church, and paid for his airfare, found accommodation for him with a parishioner while staying in Flushing and provided him with $300 for other expenses.[247] In the course of his two-week visit Dowling spent time in Flushing where he met the architect for the church, and potential donors for new windows. He also visited another Studios client at the Society of African Missions American headquarters in Tenafly, New Jersey.[248] He spent one week in New York where, in addition to visiting churches and galleries, he spent time with Harry and Margaret Clarke's son Michael Laurence Clarke (1919 – 1988).[249] The Irish Consul in New York John O'Brien set up two meetings for Dowling, one with the Bishop of Brooklyn Rev. Dr Bryan McEntegart, and one with Rev. Michael McGuire who was building a new church in the Bronx district. Although Clarke Studios provided Rev. McGuire with estimates for the stained glass work he required they did not win an order.[250] On his first visit to the United States Dowling learned about how church architecture was developing in the United States, in particular the East Coast, but did not gain any new business for the company.

Dowling's second visit to the U.S. in 1968 will be covered in Part Three of this chapter in the context of the Clarke Studios' closure.

2.3.6. *Winning Orders*

Clarke Studios received enquiries about possible commissions in the United States in a variety of ways. In some cases, pastors either wrote to or visited the company's premises in Dublin to enquire about stained glass and to discuss their building plans. In other cases, William Dowling wrote to

[246] For the 1965 trip the company sought financial support from CTT. Letter from David Clarke to F Keogh, CTT, 4th March 1965. TCD MS 6033/95.
[247] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Francis Donnelly, 16th February 1965. TCD MS 6033/84. Correspondence indicates that Clarke Studios made twenty-nine stained glass windows for re Donnelly in 1964-1967 for a total cost of £13,230 (equivalent to €275K in 2021).
[248] In 1964 the Clarke Studios supplied a 5-light window with subjects St Jude, St Therese of Lisieux, Flight to Egypt, SS Patrick & Benignus and St Anthony of Padua.
[249] Michael Laurence (Clarke) had no day-to-day role in the running of Clarke Studios.
[250] Rev. McGuire preferred a single contractor who would make and install the stained glass.

prospective clients who they had discovered were building new churches.[251] Enquirers were sent information about the Clarke Studios including the history of the company, the type of work they produced, where their windows could be seen, a typical cost per square foot of window and practicalities about shipping, insurance and fitting. As previously outlined, leaflets which described both completed and ongoing work were included in the correspondence. In some cases, the correspondence would specifically refer back to the achievements of Harry Clarke and the standing of his stained glass work.[252]

Dowling also typically outlined the quality of their stained glass:

> The following are the chief characteristics of our stained glass. 1. The preservation of the true characteristics of the stained glass medium by using the lead as an integral part of the design and by using glass as an element of coloured light to be controlled and worked so that its luminosity is not impaired. 2. To relate the above artistic ideal to the interpretation of religious subjects in stained glass without too much distortion of the natural appearance of things (although we realise at the same time that an abstract or primitive form of design can be quite effective and appealing in stained glass because it is a decorative medium). 3. To preserve the brilliance of glass and not to obscure it by tones and colours more consistent with an oil painting or mural. In other words to recognise the beauty and limitations of the stained glass medium and not to make it imitate the appearance of a canvas painting. 4. To preserve the rhythmic flow in the drawing of the design so that the decorative element is sustained. 5. To harmonize and contrast colours not so much for a third dimensional effect but rather to give variety of tone in colour to the whole design, suitable in feeling to the subject to be portrayed. The academic canvas painter uses light and shade to obtain this effect, and the stained glass artist who imitates him inevitably produces a window lacking in luminosity of glass. 6. To retain that which is good of the traditional and combine it with modern so that vitality is maintained.

[251] Some of the ways the Clarke Studios learned about possible new work was from existing clients, from trade contacts or from CTT.
[252] As was previously discussed in section 2.3.1, 'The Harry Clarke Factor '.

7. We do not believe in using outworn conventional ornament in a window because it invariably produces a dull and lifeless effect.[253]

On occasion Dowling would stress the Clarke Studios Catholic background and the artists' understanding of Christian teaching, speaking the language of the clergy in order to win their confidence. Some examples which illustrate the approach can be found in the following items of correspondence.

Richard King's 1938 letter to the Archbishop of Los Angeles, Rev. John Cantwell (1884 – 1947) states:

> We need hardly state that we are a Catholic firm working to Catholic principles and desirous of enshrining in our windows everything that would make for a truly catholic artistic quality.[254]

When Clarke Studios received the order for large rose windows for St Brigid's, San Francisco, William Dowling included the following in his response:

> I feel Ireland can be an anchor of Faith to the drifting ship of European civilisation and if the Irish in America imbue those around them with some of their strength of Faith, who knows but they might be instrumental with us in giving new vitality to the ancient traditions of Christian culture and civilisation.[255]

Also, when responding to a request for sample designs from the Director of Catholic Cemeteries in Chicago, William Dowling wrote:

> Our ideal in Stained Glass is to interpret the story of our faith with dignity and reverence and to help this further by the use of radiant jewel-like colour symbolical of the supernatural and symbolical also of the greatest traditions of our craft.[256]

[253] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Alford Abraham, 1st January 1958. TCD MS 6026/1.
[254] Letter from Richard King to Rev. John Cantwell, 23rd August 1938. TCD MS 6010/440.
[255] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. James Cantwell, 23rd February 1950. TCD MS 6018/63.
[256] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Francis McElligott 30th January 1954. TCD MS 6022/72.

In other correspondence William Dowling's own religious understanding often came through when suggesting a theme for a group of stained glass windows for a new church:

> In general, we feel the theme should honour the American martyrs by showing how by their sacrifice for the Faith that they carried into the new world of America the example set by the Ancient martyrs of the church. Martyrs are continually mentioned in the sacrifice of the mass.[257]

Dowling's language emphasised the artist's understanding of the religious context of its work. This, coupled with highlighting stained glass as a unique medium, and that their work was not factory-made but the product of an artistic studio, helped win the confidence of clients that their windows would not only be fine examples of the craft but would also portray religious subjects appropriately.[258] He was not merely promoting stained glass as a mass-produced commodity but as the product of a faithful, Catholic craftsman.

Making a Proposal

In order to ensure that they were providing an accurate price quote for a commission, William Dowling would request detailed architectural plans for the window openings and any suggestions for preferred subject matter. In some cases, clients had specific ideas for the subjects, and in other cases they were open to advice from Clarke Studios as to a theme suited to the location. From this information, Dowling would produce a proposal with an estimate of costs and timeframe for delivery. An initial watercolour design for the first window would also be created for the client (figure 17).

Any negotiation and discussion about the proposal would then take place. The company did not offer financial discount on any of their work. Because, in many cases, pastors were dependent on donors coming forward to pay for the stained glass, the only concession the company offered was to provide

[257] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Edmund O'Donnell, American Martyrs Church, Los Angeles, 24th August 1956. TCD MS 6024/444.
[258] Letter from William Dowling Harold Clar, architect for St Ambrose, Los Angeles, 26th June 1951. TCD MS 6019/365.

long-term credit.[259] If a proposal was deemed too expensive Dowling would propose a simpler design which would require less work and hence would cost less. In some cases, if a client was not willing to pay for the quality of window Clarke Studios recommended, Dowling would advise looking for an alternative provider rather than compromise the reputation their stained glass work had achieved. If the pastor was concerned about the darkening effect of stained glass, then Dowling would provide alternative quotations for less elaborate windows.

David Clarke visited many of the Clarke Studios clients in the United States when he worked with The Dublin Players, a touring theatre group which visited many cities across the country. He was able to report that the company's prices were "more than competitive" despite the added cost of freight and insurance.[260]

Chapter Three (*Patronage*) describes the process that proposals were required to go through before a decision and approval to proceed was made. If Clarke Studios was successful in getting a commission Dowling would then look for more detail about the site, for example, the direction light would come from, if trees or buildings would obstruct the light, the overall architectural style of the building, and whether all or only some of the windows would contain stained glass. These details and general comments about the light requirements on the building, as well as the suggestions by the clients, were taken into consideration by the artists when producing detailed designs.

2.3.7. *The Competition for Commissions*

As outlined in Chapter Four (*Meaning*), pastors had a choice of potential suppliers for their stained glass and Clarke Studios had to compete with Irish, international and American firms to win orders. When communicating with prospective clients Clarke Studios sought to distinguish itself as an artist-led business, emphasising the quality of their design and execution, the distinctive style of their designs and their Irishness to win new business.

[259] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. William O'Shea, 1st November 1955. TCD MS 6023/474.
[260] Letter from William Dowling to David Clarke (in the U.S.), 19th January 1954. TCD MS 6022/30.

They contrasted their work with what they described as more commercially-driven uninspired work done by large European companies (discussed further below). The company also competed with other Irish studios for overseas commissions. These included Earley & Co. of Dublin, J Watson & Company of Youghal and Clokey Stained Glass Studio of Belfast, all of which were capable of producing a high standard of stained glass work.[261]

Each studio employed similar production methods – an artist creates the design for the chosen subjects, which were then made into the final artworks by glaziers and glass painters. Earley & Co. was a larger scale business than Clarke Studios, also offering marble work, altar rails and church decoration services. On occasion, the style of Earley's stained glass work was very similar to that of Clarke Studios. An example of their work (figure 35) from the 1960s shows such similarity, where the colouring, dominated by deep blues and reds, and the treatment of the figures are almost identical to the style of work made by Clarkes. While Clarkes would claim that they were the originators of this style, it is clear that Earley & Co. were capable of producing work of the same quality, which they did for both for Irish clients and for export (figure 36).[262]

Watson & Co., based in Youghal, Co. Cork was another family-run stained glass business.[263] In the 1950s, although the company produced some ecclesiastical stained glass for export, the majority of their work was for

[261] In addition to individual artists such as Evie Hone and Patrick Pollen, other significant stained glass companies operating from Dublin in the mid-twentieth century were Abbey Stained Glass Ltd., Dublin Glass and Paint Co. Ltd, Murphy Devitt Studios, A. W. Lyons & Co. and Myles Kearney and Sons. Abbey Stained Glass was based in Dublin and although being rivals of the Clarke Studios the managers of both companies Frank Ryan and William Dowling were friends. Letter from William Dowling to Rev. O'Callaghan, New York, 19th April 1965. TCD MS 6033/191. On occasion Ryan loaned staff to Clarke Studios to assist with large workloads. Letter from William Dowling to Abbey Stained Glass, 1st June 1967. TCD MS 6035/256.

[262] For example, in a letter to a client in relation to a commission for a set of Stations of the Cross, Dowling comments on a similar work done by Earley's "We did not install the Stations of the Cross in the Franciscan Church Cork. They were done by Earley of Dublin, but in a style created by us". Letter from William Dowling to A. B. O'Shea, Blackrock, Co. Cork, 1st June 1964. TCD MS 6022/304.

[263] Established in the mid-1880s by James Watson, the company was taken over by his son Clement in 1920. His descendants made stained glass windows there until 2012. For more information on the company and its work see Ryan, Vera. 'Divine Light: A Century of Stained-Glass', *Irish Arts Review*, Vol. 32 (2), (2015), pp. 272–75.

Irish clients, both from the Catholic and Protestant traditions.[264] The company designed and made stained glass which was more conservative in style than Clarkes or Earley's, not changing significantly from the pre-Raphaelite-influenced imagery which the company had established its reputation on (figure 37).[265] Their designs often incorporated Irish Cultural Revivalist motifs such as interlace patterns and zoomorphic imagery (figure 38). No evidence has emerged from the Clarke Studios correspondence to date of direct competition between the two companies for stained glass commissions. However, in 1960 Watsons were recommended by William Dowling to carry out repairs on stained glass at Mount Melleray, County Waterford following a survey of the windows carried out by Clarke Studios.[266]

Clokey Stained Glass Studios was established in Belfast in 1904 and continued to operate until the early 1970s. Similar to Watson & Co. the company found work all over Ireland, with a small number of commissions in England, Scotland and other overseas clients.[267] The scope of their work included domestic glass designs, symbolic and decorative glass, narrative and figurative glass, and heraldic and memorial windows. The principal design artists in the mid-twentieth century were Olive Henry (from the mid-1920s -1972) and George S. Walsh (from 1948 – 1957).[268] Their designs of the mid-century varied from traditional imagery (figure 39) to quite detailed memorial windows (figure 40). George S. Walsh brought a modern aspect to some of the work, as seen in his six-light *Christ as Young Man and Christ as Adult* (figure 41), which includes several figures celebrating the virtues of work, all separated by complex interlace patterns.

[264] Watson's made stained glass for clients in the United States, Australia, New Zealand, south Africa and Barbados, R. O'D., 'The Craft and the Designer', *The Cork Examiner*, 30th August 1960, p. 7.
[265] Ibid.
[266] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Bursar, Mount Melleray, 2nd December 1960. TCD MS 6028/651.
[267] The extant Clokey collection of stained glass designs and photographs is held in the Architectural Drawings Collection of the Historic Environment Record of Northern Ireland (HERoNI).
[268] George Walsh had previously been employed at Clarke Studios. https://www.rascal.ac.uk/institutions/northern-ireland-environment-agency-built-heritage/clokey-collection-stained-glass (accessed 20th November 2022).

While a full evaluation of the quality of work produced by other Irish stained glass companies is beyond the scope of this research, this small sample indicates that, as with Clarke Studios, new stained work produced by the larger studios in Ireland was generally of good quality, with all companies striving to maintain high standards.

International competition came from artist-led studios such as those of the French designers Max Ingrand and Gabriel Loire (1904 – 1996), and from large companies such as Mayer of Munich. Ingrand won commissions for his expressionist style stained glass in many locations around the world including France, Belgium, Israel and the United States.[269] Gabriel Loire established his stained glass workshop near Chartres, France in 1946.[270] Although he also worked with antique glass he is principally known for his development of the 'dalle de verre' technique which uses 25mm thick glass, cut with a diamond-edged saw, and set in an epoxy matrix or grout. Often the edges of the pieces are chipped with a hammer, a process known as faceting, to refract sunlight, producing a dazzling effect. In addition to his work in the United States, Loire had great international success, winning orders in many countries including Chile, Morocco, Egypt, Great Britain and Ireland (figure 42).[271] On at least two occasions in 1965 Clarke Studios were in direct competition with Loire for commissions. The Irish firm was not successful in winning the first, an order for the St Thomas More Church, Alhambra, Los Angeles, probably due to the influence of the French-born architect who favoured Loire.[272] However, Clarke Studios did win the second commission, a large order for St Edward's Church, Seattle, as it was feared by the pastor that the Loire designs would darken the church too much.[273]

While William Dowling was seldom critical of other artist's work when writing to prospective clients, he did comment unfavourably on the type of work

[269] See Chapter Three (*Patronage*) for an example of Ingrand's work.
[270] Virginia Chieffo Raguin, *The History of Stained Glass* (London: Thames & Hudson, 2003), p. 264.
[271] All locations where Loire's work is installed is published online at https://www.ateliers-loire.fr/en/references-stainded-glasses.php?reset=1 (accessed 1st May 2021).
[272] St Thomas More Church, Alhambra project folder. TCD MS 6109/5.
[273] Letter from Rev. Michael O'Callaghan to William Dowling, 25th February 1965. TCD MS 6117/2/5.

done by Mayer of Munich.[274] He voiced his opinion about the company's work in a letter written to Rev. James Cantwell at St Brigid's in San Francisco, commenting that:

> The Munich Style of stained glass has not got a very good reputation in Ireland, unless they have improved since the war. Those of Munich to be seen in Ireland are of a commercially uninspired type which can be speedily produced.[275]

Although Dowling was not directly criticising the quality of Mayer's work, he was addressing the advantage the company had that due to the large size of their studios and production methods they used, they were able to deliver stained glass faster to clients than Clarke Studios could. As will be described in more detail in the next section, Dowling stressed that as Clarke Studios production method was to design and make each window individually, which would in turn lengthen the time required to deliver each order.

Of the businesses based in the United States, Connick Studios of Boston (1913 – 1986) had a reputation as being the best stained glass firm in the country.[276] In California, local firms such as the Los Angeles-based Judson Studios (founded in 1897) won many orders in Southern California.[277] Other artists who competed directly with Clarke Studios were Irish-born Joseph Tierney (1889 – 1965) and the former Studios employee John Hogan. Dublin-born Tierney trained at the DMSA. He was active in the Arts and Crafts movement as a calligrapher, receiving a commission in 1916 to provide altar cards for the Honan Hostel Chapel, Cork. He emigrated to the United States in 1924 where he established a studio working mainly in the field of ecclesiastical stained glass. [278] Tierney won the commission to provide the stained glass for the main chapel at the Los Angeles Diocesan Seminary in Camarillo (figure 43), the same location where the Clarke

[274] Although Dowling did consider Ingrand as an excellent artist he described work as being "too spikey and grotesque" for his own taste. Letter from William Dowling to John Butler (New York), 8th October 1964. TCD MS 6032/434.
[275] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. James Cantwell, 1st June 1954. TCD MS 6022/311.
[276] Letter from William Dowling to David Clarke, 19th January 1954. History of Connick Studios published online at https://www.cjconnick.org/studio-history (accessed 13th September 2021). In its lifetime Connick Studios executed more than five thousand commissions across the country.
[277] The history of Judson Studios published at https://judsonstudios.com/ (accessed 14th September 2021.
[278] Biographical information published at http://www.nival.ie/collections/artists-database/view/artist/name/tierney-joseph/ (accessed 13th September 2021).

Studios panel *Ireland's Homage* was installed in the oratory. Clarke Studios had expressed interest in providing all the stained glass for the chapel but were unsuccessful in their bid.

This limited sample of rivals gives an idea of the competitive environment the company was operating in. A more detailed analysis of how they were successful in some of their bids is addressed in Chapter Three (*Patronage*).

2.3.8. *Executing Commissions for the United States*

Section 2.2.6 describes the organisation of Clarke Studios in terms of the roles involved in the business and the main people who worked there. This section focuses on how Clarke Studios approached the fulfilling of orders for clients based in the United States, describing the practicalities of the process and the work done by different members of the studios' staff. An understanding of some of the extra challenges Clarke Studios had to overcome for American commissions provides insight into the importance of that market to the company, and the importance placed on having Irish stained glass to American patrons.

Design

As previously described, while all artists were trained in the various aspects of the craft of stained glass making, for practical reasons it had evolved that some artists concentrated on producing designs and others on painting of the glass. The design process started with the artist producing a pencil design and colour scheme for a window based on the brief for the commission in terms of subject, size and position. This design was usually on a scale of one to twelve, that is, one inch (25mm) on the page represented one foot (300mm) in the finished window (figure 44). The subject matter chosen for each scheme in a church generally followed common themes in traditional church artwork – the Mysteries of the Rosary, hagiographical characterisations of Saints and Holy People from Christian scripture, episodes from the Life of Christ and Symbols of the Church including representations of priesthood, the Evangelists, the Sacraments and the Passion of Christ.

As well as previous work they or Harry Clarke had done of the same subject, the artists used a variety of textual sources to inform a design, including books, pamphlets, images from magazines and prayer leaflets.[279] In addition to *The Holy Bible* (Douay edition) the studios' artists used publications such as *A Catholic Commentary on Holy Scripture* (Dom Bernard Orchard and Edmund F. Sutcliffe, 1953), *Symbols of the Church* (Carl van Treeck and Aloysius Croft, 1936) and *Christian Iconography* (Adolphe Didron, 1907) for insight and inspiration.[280]

For example, William Dowling described the approach he used when designing the *St. Ambrose* window for the parish of St. Ambrose, Hollywood, California to a newspaper journalist (figure 45):

> …seeing the saint lived in the fourth century, we went to mosaics in Ravenna to see just how early Christian missionaries were clothed. To background the appropriately clad St. Ambrose, we read up all we could about his life. He was interested in church music. Hence the design of organ pipes in glowing glass behind him.[281]

In some cases, clients recommended reference books that the artists should consider when developing a new scheme. On one occasion Rev. Francis Donnelly, Church of Mary's Nativity, Flushing, suggested that William Dowling should consult *The Mass: A Liturgical Commentary* (Auguste Croegaert, 1958) in order to appropriately convey in glass the "remembrance Prayer of the Canon of the Mass".[282] For another window, Rev. Donnelly, who took a strong interest in the details of designs, also recommended that Dowling clarify the details of the headdress of St Cyril of Alexandria, which he did by consulting with Rev. Dermot Ryan (1924 – 1985) at University College Dublin, who in turn clarified the details with the art historian Françoise Henry (1902 - 1982).[283]

---

[279] A number of these source images are retained in TCD MS 11182/1400/3.
[280] Listed in latter from William Dowling to Rev. Thomas Connolly, Seattle, 18th May 1963. TCD MS 6031/217.
[281] Mac Alla, 'Irish Stained Glass for Hollywood Church', *The Irish Press*, 15th June 1951, p. 4.
[282] Quoted from *Church of Mary's Nativity Dedication Booklet* (April 1965) p. 11. William Dowling borrowed a copy from Maynooth College Library and consulted it while developing the theme for the Blessed Sacrament chapel in the church. Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Francis Donnelly, 29th November 1965. TCD MS 6033/554.
[283] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Dermot Ryan, 25th September 1964. TCD MS 6032/415.

Where a subject was not well known in Ireland, clients sent images of saints to be used in designs. This was required for common American subjects such as St Junipero Sera (a Spanish born saint who set up Catholic missions in Mexico), Our Lady of Guadalupe (celebrating a series of Marian apparitions in Mexico), Mother Ann Seton (an American-born Catholic saint) and St Emydius (a saint associated with protection against earthquakes).[284] Clarke Studios also designed windows based on Italian saints not commonly seen in Ireland but important to Italian immigrants in the United States, including St Frances Xavier Cabrini, St Alphonsus Liguori, St Maria Goretti, and St Vibiana.

On occasion, previously-made designs were adapted with some modification for new commissions, such as the *Our Lady of Knock* window for St Elizabeth's Church, San Francisco (figure 46). This window was designed by Terence Clarke and is similar to another depiction of the same subject made for the parish church in Knock, Co. Mayo which was designed by William Dowling in 1956 (figure 47).[285] While the St. Elizabeth's window was intended to inspire devotion to the Blessed Virgin, it was also designed to appeal to the Irish American community, as can be seen by the inclusion of a representation of the actual church building at Knock, and a number of thatched cottages which are typical of a West of Ireland landscape.

Another aid that was used extensively were the original cartoons made by Harry Clarke for his own stained glass commissions. A number of these full-size designs were fixed permanently on the walls of the studio and workshop, where they were available for reference and to be adapted where necessary for new commissions.[286] They ensured that the details of the Clarke style – the symbolism, decoration, dress, form of the figures including eyes and fingers, were prominent. The cartoons also stood as reminders of the Clarke Studios artistic origins for visitors to the building. However, the studios' artists never directly copied a previous design. As William Dowling commented in a letter to a client:

> Every design we make is an original conception created to suit the size and shape of a window and we do not copy a previous picture but

[284] TCD MS 6113/3 holds a number of prayer cards with images associated with these saints.
[285] TCD MS 11182/1400/240.
[286] Nicola Gordon Bowe in conversation with the author, 15th July 2014.

> it is very complimentary to learn that you put these designs in the category of Masterpiece. We do a lot of research to get everything correct as regards the interpretation of the gospel narrative and we regularly check over designs we have made previously in an effort to seek more perfection.[287]

This claim is confirmed by an informal review by the author of a majority of the extant design drawings in the Clarke Studios archive in TCD Library and images of installed windows in numerous churches in Ireland and the United States.[288]

The amount of input that clients had into a design varied depending on the commission. Some patrons such as Rev. Thomas O'Toole at St Ambrose parish, Hollywood were clear about what they wanted:

> We are favourably impressed with your windows in the Church of the Sacred Heart (Sacramento) but suggest that the figures and symbols for our windows have more contemporary lines. We do not desire extreme or grotesque pictures as used in modern art, but rather simplification of the purely traditional figures while retaining true facial expressions.[289]

Other clients were satisfied to leave it to Clarke Studios to propose stained glass suitable for their needs. Draft designs were sent to the pastor and/or the architect for comment and approval, and in some cases the local diocesan office was also involved in the authorisation process.[290] Any comments the pastor had would be considered by Clarke Studios, and if amendment of a design was required, it would be done by the artist.

When reviewing sketches for his stained glass, Rev. Arthur Cantwell at St Elizabeth's, San Francisco, made comments such as "we like Our Lady of Knock, but do not like Our Lady of Guadalupe", or "Thomas Aquinas looks

---

[287] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Michael Callaghan, St Edwards, Seattle, 2nd February 1966. TCD MS 6034/33.
[288] TCD MS 11182 contains original pencil drawings, colour schemes and photographs of many Clarke Studios designs.
[289] Letter from Rev. Thomas O'Toole to William Dowling, 13th March 1950. TCD MS 6130a/2140.
[290] The process of awarding commissions id described in more detail in Chapter Three (*Patronage*).

too high or too crowded, could they be in profile" or "we didn't like the design for St. Dismas so we are eliminating it altogether". [291] These comments indicate how active he was in refining the details of each design. Rev. George Scott at Mary Star of the Sea, San Pedro, commented that the "likeness of St Pius X was very accurate as was that of St Paul as a Jew", but that "The face of St Patrick is quite different from anything I have ever seen of him. Maybe we should be happy it is different, but he seems to look a little Jewish too!"[292] To which William Dowling replied:

> We are glad to know that the St. Paul sketch was liked by all who have seen it, and that we may retain our Jewish Portrayal of him. However as regards St Patrick we are glad that you mentioned that he looked a little Jewish too, and we think we ought to remedy that. We want to portray him somewhat different from the usual representation as a very old man with a long beard, because we feel that he should be shown as a virile and strong character in his prime. Unfortunately, no picture of him has come down to us through the centuries and the usual representation is an invention of the last century.[293]

This is an example of a case where the patron took great interest in the finer details of a commission, and the studios' artists were open to comments and criticism relating to details in an image. However, they did not take instruction from clients on the detail of a design and never used a third–party design for a window they were making.[294] While on occasion it took several iterations to finalise approval of a design, Clarke Studios retained artistic control of the work.

In several other cases the patron had little comment to make, leaving it to the artist to decide the detail, trusting their experience and skill.

---

[291] Letters from Rev. A. Cantwell to William Dowling on 29th March 1962 and 24th April 1963. TCD MS 6112/5.
[292] Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling, 6th February 1959. TCD MS 6113/3/22.
[293] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. George Scott, 2nd March 1959. TCD MS 6027/75.
[294] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Reidy, St Johns, Tralee, 13th September 1946. TCD MS 6014/727. While this is generally true, there was one exception where the Clarke Studios made a window based on a design by the artist Carlo Pietzner for Stormont Presbyterian church in 1959.

In addition to the creative elements to a design, other more practical factors influenced the work. These included the position of the window in the church (those in the sanctuary area received more attention), its height above floor level, its size, the shape of the opening, whether it was single or multiple light, what other stained glass was in the building, the normal light conditions in the building, colour preferences, the preferred degree of lightsomeness after installation and typical weather at the location (principally sunshine levels in the United States). Clarke Studios sought all this information from the patron and the architect before finalising the details of a scheme.

In some cases a client was disappointed with the sketch of a window as it could not get across the effect of the finished window and convey the effect glass would bring to the work. Watercolour sketches do not capture the luminosity a finished window would have, and this in turn made it difficult for some clients to visualise the work in-situ. Commenting on a sketch design for one of his windows Rev. Bernard Dolan at St Anthony's Long Beach wrote:

> I saw St Ambrose and I liked them very much, but they did not have the diamond effect I saw at St Brigid's. The colours in garments for (our windows) look more subdued than St Ambrose's, especially like those in St Ambrose that have a lacy effect.[295]

To which William Dowling replied:

> The windows of St Ambrose were conceived in a rather broad style to suit the height, and for the windows in your church we propose to obtain a more detailed effect because they will be closer to the eye. (Your windows) will glow with all the brilliance of antique glass.[296]

In this case, and others, Dowling stressed that the design was not the finished product and advised against getting too occupied with the detail of a watercolour sketch on paper as the completed window would be much more striking.

[295] Letter from Rev. Bernard Dolan to William Dowling, 20th March 1953. TCD MS 6129/948.
[296] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Bernard Dolan, 25th March 1953. TCD MS 6021/163.

What made this part of the process more difficult and time-consuming was that the business was done by post. Designs, blueprints, window templates and correspondence would all have to travel by mail between the client and Clarke Studios. The usual method was surface mail which could take between three and four weeks, but if speed of response was required then more expensive air-mail could cut that time to one week. If absolute urgency was required then telegrams were used to communicate short messages. There is no evidence that telephone calls were used to communicate between clients in the United States and Dublin, as was often the case when communicating with Irish clients. Thus, the method of communication was certainly a factor in lengthening the delivery process for orders.

Another important consideration was the amount of money the client was prepared to pay. In many cases pastors relied on donations from parishioners, either individually or through fundraising, to finance their purchases. If funds were limited then a broader style of work which required less design time and less glazing work, and hence a lower cost for the finished product, was the preferred option. Windows with simpler designs were also quicker to make. Therefore, if speed of delivery was important to a client, then the process could be accelerated by opting for a more modest design. This would also have suited Clarke Studios as it would allow them to deliver more orders.[297] However, Clarke Studios had to be careful not to make their windows too plain, and hence too cheap, as this could bring them under the import duty-free threshold of $15 per square foot, as noted above.

Making

When a design was agreed the window went into production.[298] The next stage was to produce a cartoon (full size drawing) of the window, copied from the design sketch. A tracing from the cartoon was used to produce a guide for cutting the individual pieces of glass (the cutline). The glass was then selected based on the colour design, and cut accordingly. As briefly described earlier, the cut glass is laid out on a clear plate of glass according

[297] Letter from William Dowling to David Clarke, 19th January 1954. TCD MS 6022/30.
[298] For an explanation of terms associated with stained glass see Appendix 3.

to the cutline, with each piece held in place with beeswax. The glass painter then sets to work adding details such as facial features, flesh and garment details with an opaque black enamel pigment (figure 48). All of the colour is in the glass itself with no other pigment painted in except for a silver-nitrate stain used occasionally to give an amber hue. On some occasions the surface of the coloured glass was etched with acid to achieve a lighter shade of that colour, usually where it is not possible to 'lead in' small pieces of different tinted glass.

The pieces which have been painted with the black pigment are then 'fired' in the kiln at high temperature to permanently fix the pigment on the glass, and then allowed to cool.[299] With the cutline as a guide the window is assembled using lead cames to join the individual pieces. Where the cames meet, they are attached to each other by soldering the joints. Finally, putty or mastic is then applied between the cames and the glass in order to weatherproof the windows. The window is now ready for packing, dispatch and installation.

For Irish customers it was possible for the client to visit the company premises in Dublin to inspect the window before dispatch, but this was not possible for American clients unless they were visiting Ireland at a suitable time. In some cases, they appointed a local acquaintance or family member to view the window before dispatch.[300] When, for example, Clarke Studios were making windows for the Convent of Our Lady of Mercy Auburn, Sacramento, Sister nuns from the same order who were based in Dublin, inspected the designs and windows on behalf of their American Sisters.[301]

Dispatch and Installation

When the windows were packed in crates, they were dispatched by the company's shipping agents Arbuckle Smith and Co. to their destination. The majority of windows were transported by sea from Dublin to the west coast

[299] Repainting and re-firing may be required if some of the black enamel pigment does not fix to the glass adequately on the first occasion.
[300] For example, Rev. Michael O'Callaghan at St Edwards, Seattle appointed his sisters and nieces to inspect the work. Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Michael O'Callaghan, 12th August 1965. TCD MS 6033/379.
[301] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Mother Barbara, 21st September 1951. TCD MS 6019/504.

of the United States (San Francisco or Los Angeles) via Liverpool or Glasgow and the Panama Canal. This journey typically took between six and eight weeks to complete, if there were no delays. On occasion, dock worker strikes at the ports caused delays, sometimes for up to a month. This risk added to the unpredictability of delivery from Ireland. The other risk was a delay at U.S. customs, which at times held up the release of consignments. One of the issues with customs at Los Angeles in the early 1960s was delay caused by the increased volume of freight coming into the port. This particularly affected deliveries for Rev. George Scott and Rev. George Gallagher in San Pedro. Fortunately, one of Rev. Gallagher's parishioners worked at a freight brokerage company (Guy Barham and Company) and he took over dealings with the customs authorities which helped resolving any difficulties.[302] However, delays such as this did cause frustration for clients, especially when it came to organising church dedication ceremonies which usually involved the attendance of the local Archbishop. As projects progressed into the late 1950s, air freight became more common. Air transport, although being more expensive, was a more reliable route, in particular when a fast delivery was required.

When the windows arrived at their destination it occasionally happened that some of the glass pieces had cracked in transit. Depending on what part of the windows was broken William Dowling either advised having it repaired locally (if not in a prominent position) or to send specific details for the cracked glass so that they could make a new piece and send it to the client. In all cases such breakages were covered by insurance, which was claimed if the repairs were going to be costly. The Clarke Studios clients engaged a local glazing company to fit the windows and if repairs were necessary, they would do that also.

The majority of the Clarke Studios windows were fitted without difficulty. However, due to errors in sizing, some had to be adjusted to fit correctly as they were slightly too big. This was also done by the local glazing company who would trim the edges all around.[303]

[302] Letter from Rev. George Gallagher to William Dowling, 25th April 1961. TCD MS 6113/2/37.
[303] For example, when the first windows for Mary Star of the Sea in San Pedro were found to be slightly too large the glazier, Mr St John, wrote to the Clarke Studios recommending they

Reception of the Stained Glass

In general, the stained glass was well received by pastors, architects, parishioners and other visiting priests. Rev. O'Callaghan in St Edwards, Seattle reported that "all the (visiting) clergy were in ecstasies, especially the Irish among us" when they saw the newly installed windows.[304] Rev. Scott in San Pedro could have "sold his windows (to parishioners) three times over they are so well liked".[305] Rev. David Coleman (1908 – 1991) was "the happiest man in La Habra", when his windows were installed.[306] Almost all reports were that parishioners were pleased with the stained glass.

On rare occasions however, clients were not always fully satisfied with the Clarke Studios work. In two instances commissions ended with strained relationships between the company and their North American clients. Clarke Studios were commissioned to make twenty-nine stained glass windows for St Andrews Memorial Anglican Church in London, Ontario. A further nine windows were ordered but this order was cancelled when the rector, Rev. Alford Abraham, severely criticised the window *Solomon Dedicates the Temple* (figure 49). The criticism, which was prompted by a local stained glass firm, related to the rendering of the facial features of the two cherubim above the Ark which Rev. Abraham wanted changed. William Dowling wrote a long and robust letter defending the design:

> We resent the local firm drawing your attention to what they considered to be a fault in our work, especially as they cannot possibly know the principle underlying our form of design in glass. In representing the cherubim above the Ark it was essential that the faces should not appear as if alive and that the effect of an image made in gold should be retained. Otherwise the contrast with the living faces above was destroyed.
>
> We did not show a primitive style for the faces but essentially an effect that would be in keeping with a symbolic form of face made in gold. It would not have been correct, in our opinion, to draw the faces

make the lip around the window smaller. Letter from Mr St John (B.H. Glass) to William Dowling, 2nd November 1959. TCD MS 6113/3/27.

[304] Letter from Rev. Michael O'Callaghan to William Dowling, 11th May 1966. TCD MS 6118/1/29.

[305] Letter from George Scott to William Dowling, 29th August 1969. TCD MS 6113/3/52.

[306] Letter from William Dowling to Reno Eppink, architect, 1st May 1970. TCD MS 6038/143.

> in a manner similar to the faces of the Angels in the lower part of the chancel windows. One feels that a Studios of our international reputation merits more confidence in the design and execution of its work.[307]

This response shows how willing the company was to defend its reputation as a creator of high quality artworks, its artistic independence and its confidence in the integrity of the artists design decisions. The letter concludes:

> We regret that you appear to have placed more reliance on the opinion of the local stained glass firm than upon our own in this instance, and this has resulted in a loss of artistic enthusiasm here for the continuance of the project.[308]

That was the end of the relationship with Rev. Abraham, resulting in the cancellation of the order for remaining stained glass windows.

A similar situation arose with Rev. Bernard Dolan at St Anthony's parish in Long Beach. Between 1954 and 1956 Clarke Studios made ten windows on the subject of *The Mysteries of the Rosary* for the church, all designed by Terence Clarke. Rev. Dolan was very satisfied with nine of the windows but was critical of the *Resurrection* (figure 50) window, which he did not believe was of the same quality as the others. A comparison of this window with another in the same scheme (figure 51) does not indicate any divergence in style or quality between the windows and an examination of the costing analysis for the window indicates that as much time and effort went into making that window as did for the others.[309]

Rev. Dolan also complained that Clarke Studios were misrepresenting their work as stained glass as he believed most of the colour came from painting the glass. As with Rev. Abraham's criticism, William Dowling suspected that it was a local glazing firm that had influenced Rev. Dolan to make these comments. Dowling outlined the process for making stained glass in detail, pointing out that some painting is always required to draw the faces and

[307] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Alford Abraham, 15th March 1960. TCD MS 6028/132.
[308] Ibid.
[309] Clarke Studios Costing Book, TCD MS 6075.

other items of shading and decoration, and that this was an accepted technique of the craft as traditionally practiced.[310] He assumed however that the local firm produced work in a more contemporary 'abstract' manner, which would typically require less drawing.

Another aspect of the commission which may have disappointed Rev. Dolan was that the stained glass darkened the church significantly. In designing the windows Terence Clarke assumed that the bright Californian sunlight which Rev. Dolan had indicated would shine on one side all day would mean that a deeper, richer glass would give the greatest effect from the window. William Dowling, after visiting the church in 1968, admitted that although the windows were very beautiful in situ, that they darkened the church more than he would have thought when the design was produced.[311]

Although Rev. Dolan required more stained glass for his church, he decided to give the order to a local firm, partly for the reasons outlined but primarily because of the length of time it took Clarke Studios to make the other windows. From the time of the first order, it took three years to complete the ten windows. Not all the delays were the fault of Clarke Studios (Rev. Dolan was ill for a number of months), but by the time they were complete Rev. Dolan did not have the patience to wait a long period for the remaining windows and awarded the contract to the local firm.

Overall however, clients were generally very satisfied with their investments which, considering the risks they were taking by importing stained glass from such a distance, was a good outcome. The greatest source of disappointment for clients was the time taken to deliver an order. Despite the company taking on more staff to cope with the increase in American work, in the 1950s William Dowling invariably had to apologise to clients for delays in delivering orders.[312]

---

[310] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Bernard Dolan, 23rd March 1956. TCD MS 6024/180.
[311] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Bernard Dolan, 5th June 1968. TCD MS 6036/286.
[312] For example Dowling expressed "sincere regrets" for the delay in supplying the stained glass for St Ambrose, Hollywood. Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Thomas O'Toole, 13th December 1951. TCD MS 6019/590. Dowling frequently cited colds and flu's among the staff as a reason for delays. In Feb 1963 Dowling reported that they had increased staff to cope with American work. Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Thomas O'Toole, 6th February 1953. TCD MS 6021/74.

2.4. Part Three – Demand Drops – The Final Years

Clarke Studios closed for business in July 1973. Using information discovered in the correspondence records of the company, this section examines the factors which contributed to the decline in the demand for the company's work in its largest market, the United States, in the years leading up to the closure.

2.4.1. *Sales Visit to United States 1968*

Itinerary

In April and May 1968 William Dowling travelled to the United States to evaluate the market for Irish stained glass and to seek new business for Clarke Studios. His three-week trip was supported financially by CTT who paid his travel expenses. In addition to meeting existing clients and seeing the Clarke Studios' stained glass work in situ, Dowling's visit had three main objectives – to seek new business from existing clients and to follow any other leads they may provide, to meet senior church officials to introduce or reinforce the capabilities of Clarke Studios, and to meet with architects engaged in ecclesiastical building to learn about contemporary design trends and to introduce the work of Clarke Studios.

Dowling's itinerary took him to New York, Waco, Los Angeles, San Francisco, Sacramento, Seattle, Minnesota and back to New York. He made arrangements to meet existing clients of Clarke Studios in each location and CTT also set up contacts with a number of architectural firms who were engaged in church building. The number of locations visited demonstrates the extensive range of clients and contacts cultivated by the firm in the previous decades.

In New York he met with a number of church architects and the editor of *Liturgical Arts*, a periodical specialising in religious arts and crafts.[313] He also revisited Flushing to see the installation of a large stained glass order at the Church of Mary's Nativity (completed in January 1968). He then travelled on to Waco, Texas where visited the parish of St Louis. The pastor, Rev. Mark Deering (1921 - 2016) had built a new church in 1967/68 and had awarded

[313] A summary of his meetings with this group is outlined below.

the contract for all the stained glass to Clarke Studios.[314] In all, seventy-one windows were made for St Louis, with a total value of £18,434 ($44,380). Dowling also met with some of Deering's parishioners, a number of whom had previously visited the company's premises in Dublin while visiting Ireland.

In Los Angeles Dowling was hosted by Rev. George Scott at Mary Star of the Sea parish in San Pedro.[315] Rev. Scott, a major customer of Clarke Studios, acted as a guide for Dowling during his stay, arranging appointments with existing clients and with senior diocesan clergy. He drove Dowling to visit a number of locations where Studios' stained glass was installed, including Immaculate Conception Church Monrovia, St Anthony's Church Long Beach and Holy Trinity Church San Pedro.[316] He also visited Rev. John Ward (1920 – 2011), Auxiliary Bishop of Los Angeles and pastor at St Timothy's where he was invited to provide estimates for additional stained glass. However, the only additional orders that Dowling was able to successfully acquire were from Rev. Scott himself who ordered twenty-two small stained glass windows for his church. On the day Dowling was leaving Los Angeles Rev. Scott presented him to the Archbishop of the Diocese, Cardinal James McIntyre (1886 – 1979).

Dowling travelled on to San Francisco where he first met the incumbent pastors of St Brigid's and St Agnes.[317] At St Brigid's he commented at how the stained glass had darkened the church. While likening the effect to that experienced at Chartres Cathedral in France, he did acknowledge that the modern preference was for "brightsome" interiors.[318] He then visited Rev. Arthur Cantwell at St Elizabeth's, where he observed that the stained glass windows, made in 1962/63 were a good balance of colour and lightsomeness. This same approach to design was one they had adopted for

[314] Rev. Mark Deering was born in Co Carlow in June 1921. He was ordained a priest at St Kieran's College Kilkenny in 1953 and then moved to Waco, Texas where he served for more than fifty years.
[315] The stained glass for Mary Star had been completed in 1960.
[316] The Clarke Studios had completed commissions for these three locations in 1957, 1955 and 1962 respectively.
[317] The commissions for St Brigid's and St Agnes were completed in 1956 and 1953 respectively.
[318] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. James O'Connor, 5th June 1968. TCS MS 6036/290.

later work in Seattle. He also met with the Archbishop of San Francisco, Rev. Joseph McGuckan (1902 – 1983).

While staying in San Francisco, Dowling made a day trip to Sacramento where he met Bishop Alden Bell and visited St Mary's Mausoleum where Clarke Studios had provided ten windows in 1966, including two large octagonal ceiling windows (figure 52).

Dowling's next destination was Seattle where he met with Archbishop Thomas Connolly. Clarke Studios had provided forty-five stained glass windows for St Thomas the Apostle diocesan seminary in the early 1960s. He also visited St Edward's where the company was in the process of providing all fifty-seven windows in the church. This was the last meeting he had on the trip with the company's customers.

Trends in Church Architecture

His final destination before returning to Ireland was St Paul, Minnesota. In order to find out how the market for stained glass was developing in the United States Dowling had sought the opinion of recognised figures in the area of church architecture and liturgical art. Fintan Keogh at the New York office of CTT arranged introductions for Dowling with the influential architect Edward Sövik (1918 – 2014), church architect George Rafferty (1917 – 2018), liturgical consultant Frank Kacmarcik (1920 – 2004) and Maurice Lavanoux (1894 – 1974), a founding member of the Liturgical Arts Society and managing editor of its quarterly publication *Liturgical Arts.* It was these discussions with those involved in contemporary church building design and decoration which were the most informative in terms of the future of religious stained glass requirements in the United States.

Edward Sövik was an American architect who published extensively on his theories underpinning church design in the second half of the twentieth century.[319] He led the architectural firm he had established in 1948 (Sövik,

[319] Through his career Sövik earned many awards, including Fellow of the American Institute of Architects (AIA), Fellow of the Society for the Arts, and Honorary Doctor of Fine Arts at Concordia College. In 1981 he received the Edward S. Frey Award from the Interfaith Forum on Religion, and in 1982 he was awarded the AIA's Gold Medal. Published online at https://wp.stolaf.edu/news/retired-art-professor-campus-architect-edward-sovik-dies (accessed 31st January 2021)

Mathre & Madson) in the design and renovation of several hundred churches and other building projects across the United States. He also held various leadership positions with national bodies concerned with art and architecture in the United States.[320] Sövik was part of a movement of religious consultants and architects who moved away from designing traditional basilican style churches and cathedrals and began to rethink the house of worship as a sacred space which emphasised the assembled community, with the central altar as the key feature.[321] For Sövik this would develop further as an even more radical adaptation of church architecture – the "non-church". This concept allowed for flexibility of use of church buildings beyond the purely sacramental. Buildings would be designed with furnishings that are portable and can be moved with relative ease. They would be multi-purpose, having the capability of hosting liturgical and non-liturgical activities, and would exhibit a 'modern' architectural design idiom.[322]

Dowling did not meet with Sövik in person, but had a conversation with Robert Warn, an associate at his architectural practice, who outlined Sövik's views and sent Dowling a number of texts that he had published. This information strongly influenced Dowling's opinion on how church architecture in the United States was developing, and the consequences that those developments may have on demand for church craftwork, in particular stained glass. On his return to Dublin, Dowling wrote to Warn, requesting further texts by Sövik which related to church art in particular:

> They [the articles Warn had given to Dowling] contain fundamental ideas close to the heart of things so important for us to understand in the realm of church architecture today. I am interested to hear his views on functions of artist and craftsman in church architecture, perhaps he has written on this? His observations would be of great value, I am sure, to all of us engaged in the applied arts. The

[320] These included the National Council of Churches, the Liturgical Conference and the Federation of Diocesan Liturgical Commissions.
[321] Basilican in terms of a longitudinally arranged worship space consisting of a long, narrow nave for the laity with seating arranged in two rows, separated by a central aisle, and facing the chancel where the clergy perform the actions of the liturgy. Jay M. Price, *Temples for a Modern God* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018), p. 17.
[322] Mark Torgerson, 'An Architect's Response to Liturgical Reform: Edward A. Sövik and his "Non-Church" Design', *Worship*, Vol. 71 (1), (1997), p. 19. Published online at https://digital.journalworship.org/Home/Index (accessed 31st January 2021).

> simplicity which is the keynote of church architecture now is demanding more restraint in design in the crafts and it is perhaps as well that this should be so in order that more cohesion and all-over harmony of skills may conform to the intentions of the architect in his conception of a building as a complete and unified idea.[323]

Dowling also discussed developments in church design with the liturgical consultant Frank Kacmarcik. His collaboration with the Bauhaus architect, Hungarian-born Marcel Breuer (1902 – 1981) established Kacmarcik's reputation as a leading liturgical and architectural consultant in the United States at that time.[324] In the late fifties and early sixties he worked on several notable projects with other well-known architects across the United States.[325] Kacmarcik had a significant influence on the development of religious architecture and art within the United States in the second half of the twentieth century. He was recognised as a "creator for new models for Roman Catholic space and furnishings", leaving his distinctive mark on every aspect of church design, furnishings, ritual space and liturgical art.[326] In addition to learning about trends in church architecture Dowling was also keen to ensure that Kacmarcik was aware of what Clarke Studios could offer:

> It is essential to have a unity of mind between the architect and the artist craftsman for the success of a project. We realise that this for us engaged in glass work demands a close attention to the conditions of light and colour planned by an architect. We would like to show you what we can do, we are conversant with new techniques, and are prepared to cooperate with architects desiring them. [327]

The Liturgical Arts society was established in the United States in 1928 to "devise ways and means of improving the standards of taste, craftsmanship

---

[323] Letter from William Dowling to Robert Warn, 5th June 1968. TCD MS 6036/301. Warn replied, sending Dowling two further articles written by Sövik.
[324] R. Kevin Seasaltz, 'From the Bauhaus to the House of God's People', *U.S. Catholic Historian*, Vol. 15 (1), (1997), p. 111. In later years Kacmarcik won awards from Liturgical Arts, National Council of Churches, American Institute of Architects Regional Honor Award, and American Institute of Architects National Award.
[325] Ibid. Examples include new developments at Saint John's Abbey in Collegeville, Minnesota (1955, 1961), Saint Patrick's Church in Oklahoma City (1962) and Church of Saint John the Evangelist in Hopkins, Minnesota (1965).
[326] Charlotte Zalot, *Revisioning liturgical space and furnishings in American Roman Catholic churches, 1947—2002* (PhD. Thesis, Drew University, Madison New Jersey, 2004), p. 3.
[327] Letter from William Dowling to Frank Kacmarcik, 5th June 1968. TCD MS 6036/296.

and liturgical correctness of ecclesiastical art".[328] One of the society's undertakings was to run a 'craftsman's service' which connected ecclesiastical customers with quality craftsmen. The society's most effective channel for communication was *Liturgical Arts* which was first published in 1931 and edited by Lavanoux from 1937 until its closure in 1972. Lavanoux travelled the world collecting material on religious art which was included as editorial content for the periodical. Stemming from his experience in this role, he acted as a consultant to the Subcommission on Sacred Art of the Pontifical Commission on the Sacred Liturgy in the preparatory stages for the Second Vatican Council.[329] Lavanoux, through *the Liturgical Arts*, provided an influential venue for architects, artists, and other interested Catholics which played a crucial role in introducing new thought to seminarians, clergy, religious and lay intelligentsia.[330] As a well-respected editor, lecturer and liturgical art consultant Lavanoux was well placed to give Dowling a view of developments in church architecture and decoration in the United States when they met.[331]

From these meetings Dowling learned of the shift that was occurring in the architectural style of new and renovated church buildings. Elaborate, finely decorated buildings were outdated, and the trend was towards minimalist ecclesiastical decoration. This change would directly affect a traditional-style stained glass maker who would have to adapt their offerings to fit the new building forms. He commented to Robert Warn that "the simplicity which is the keynote of church architecture now is demanding more restraint in design in the crafts".[332]

Dowling also recognised that a change in the power balance between architect and pastor during the design process meant that the company was

[328] Susan J White, *Art, Architecture, and Liturgical Reform: The Liturgical Arts Society (1928-1972)* (New York: Pueblo Publishing Company, 1990), p. viii.
[329] Susan J White, *Art, Architecture, and Liturgical Reform: The Liturgical Arts Society (1928-1972)* (New York: Pueblo Publishing Company, 1990), p. 175. The Second Vatican Council, also known as Vatican II, was established by Pope John XXIII to consider the relationship between the Catholic Church and the modern world of the twentieth century. It was conducted between 1962 and 1965.
[330] Catherine R. Osborne, *American Catholics and the Church of Tomorrow: Building Churches for the Future, 1925-1975* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2018), p. 11.
[331] Lavanoux had been honoured by the Holy See, by five universities, and by the architectural profession as "a dynamic force in the American field of religious arts and crafts." Susan J White, *Art, Architecture, and Liturgical Reform: The Liturgical Arts Society (1928-1972)* (New York: Pueblo Publishing Company, 1990), p. 60.
[332] Letter from William Dowling to Robert Warn, 5th June 1968. TCD MS 6036/301.

losing its greatest ally in winning commissions – the Irish American priest. From his conversations with clergy and architects Dowling learned that the new generation of architects were leading the design process, including interior design, and the pastor was no longer in control of these decisions. He reported that:

> The architects I met aim to have more control of stained glass in the future, especially as regards design, colour and light for purposes of all over architectural success in the modern styles of building.[333]

In the history of its work with North American clients Clarke Studios prided itself on the relationships it built with the clergy, and often depended on the pastors convincing architects that they were capable of meeting the standards required in new buildings. With the increasing power of the architect this relationship with its religious patrons was now becoming less influential in terms of the company winning new business in the United States.

Outcome of the Trip

It became apparent to Dowling that the church furnishing business in the United States had become seriously affected by trends towards the construction of all-purpose parish buildings with less expenditure on ecclesiastical decoration. He found that these new trends had created a general atmosphere of uncertainty regarding the future of Church building and decoration, and consequently on the need for stained glass. As a result, in order to gain time to examine these trends, potential clients were reluctant to make decisions on decorating new churches. The implication of this for Clarke Studios was that the business could not continue to rely on American patronage – its most valuable source of income of the preceding twenty years.

Furthermore, in locations where stained glass was being installed, changes in aesthetic preferences were taking patrons away from the figurative work Clarke Studios had established its reputation on, towards a preference for more abstract designs. Although the studios' artists could do such work, as

[333] William Dowling produced a comprehensive report of his visit for CTT. Letter from William Dowling to William O'Brien, CTT, 5th July 1968. TCD MS 6036/354.

previously described in the commission for Lancaster Pennsylvania, they did not have a strong reputation for making stained glass in that style. A significant factor which influenced this trend was the shift from church buildings being used purely for sacramental purposes to having a multi-functional capability within the communities in which they were built. Stained glass could still be included but now in abstract patterns.[334] Furthermore, new ecclesiastical buildings were making bold architectural statements, such as the new Cathedral of St Mary of the Assumption in San Francisco, where dalles de verre was the preferred stained glass medium (figure 53).[335] Dowling summarised his findings in his report to CTT:

> In general, very few pictorial windows will be required now and in the foreseeable future. Abstract design is mostly favoured for new churches, especially as carried out in the new technique of slab glass in epoxy or concrete. The size of the market in Stained Glass will be radically affected by new trends in Parish architecture.
>
> Catholic Church building may be suspended and all-purpose parochial building erected instead. This is a trend coming into favour for economical and modern liturgical reasons. This particular trend is in the experimental stages and it is not certain if Stained Glass will be used in the proposed all-purpose buildings but some Stained Glass may be used in the section of the building reserved for the Blessed Sacrament.
>
> Young priests, Architects and lay people are in favour of the new trend. The older ones may feel compelled to follow suit in order to satisfy the popular demands and thereby induce greater participation in church activities by the younger generation. There will be some who will insist on the traditional Church with all its customary embellishments of Stained Glass and other artistic furnishings, but

[334] Jay M. Price, *Temples for a Modern God* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018), p. 144.
[335] The Clarke Studios had requested to be included in the list of vendors who were competing for the provision of stained glass for the Cathedral, referencing a previous visit of the Archbishop Rev. Thomas McGuckan to the Clarke Studios premises in Dublin. Letter from William Dowling to György Kepes (architect), 24th January 1968. TCD MS 6036/72. However, the Clarke Studios were not included in the list of bidders.

> due to the high cost of this style they will become fewer than heretofore and perhaps confined to very wealthy parishes.[336]

Dowling concluded that the traditional style that Clarke Studios was known for was no longer favoured by architects and the only way to proceed was to have "more intensive consideration of new forms of stained glass design to be made to harmonise with changing trends in Church building."[337]

Dowling's visit had limited success in terms of generating new business for the company. While a small number of potential orders were identified, only Rev. Scott at Mary Star of the Sea committed to new work. Dowling was successful at meeting senior clergy, commenting at one stage "I have never before met so many dignitaries of the Church in such a short time", but these meetings did not translate into new orders for stained glass.[338] From this perspective the visit could be seen as a failure. However, the trip was successful in developing a better understanding of trends in church architecture in terms of aesthetic changes and the shifting roles of pastor and architect in the design process – both of which would have an impact on the Clarke Studios business.

2.4.2. *Stained Glass Demand in Ireland*

Similar trends in terms of the changing style of new church buildings and the role of the architect were also occurring in Ireland in the 1950s and '60s, accelerated by changes brought about by the Second Vatican Council. As stated by Brown (2004), in that period large numbers of people relocated to the urban centres of Ireland. Many people moved to Dublin where housing construction in the Crumlin, Whitehall, Cabra, Inchicore, Raheny and Artane areas of the city in 1930s to the 1950s facilitated this migration.[339] For many, Catholic belief and practice still dominated daily life, maintaining a

---

[336] William Dowling produced a report of his visit for CTT. Letter from William Dowling to William O'Brien, CTT, 5th July 1968. TCD MS 6036/354.
[337] Ibid.
[338] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Patrick O'Donoghue, Tenafly New Jersey. TCD MS 6036/266. Dowling wrote letters of thanks to all the places he had contacted when planning his visit. Although he did not visit Tenafly he described his other visits, listing the high-ranking clergy he had met including Cardinal McIntyre (Los Angeles), Archbishop Joseph McGuckan (San Francisco), Archbishop Thomas Connolly (Seattle), Bishop John Ward (Los Angeles) and Bishop Alden Bell (Sacramento).
[339] Terence Brown, *Ireland: A Social and Cultural History 1922 – 2002* (London: Harper Perennial, 2004), p. 207.

continuity with the rural past of many of those who settled in the city.[340] The Diocese of Dublin set up a major church-building programme and between 1940 and 1965 thirty-four churches were built and twenty-six new parishes formed.[341] One impact of this urban development was that financial resources of church bodies were put under strain often with the result, as Hurley (2001) observes, of less than satisfactory church buildings and furnishings, including stained glass.[342]

The Second Vatican Council initiated changes in the practice of Catholic liturgies and rituals. The changes were intended to move from a celebrant-centred liturgy towards a more congregation-inclusive liturgy where attendees participate more directly in religious services. The reforms that were introduced included new language (mass prayers would now be said in the vernacular and not Latin), new and more inclusive prayers, greater lay engagement with music and singing, and greater movement within the church space during ceremonies.[343] The new liturgical reforms called for adaptation of church buildings in terms of space usage so as to maximise the levels of participation by those gathered, both priests and laity, and to emphasise the role of the assembly in the liturgical actions.[344]Aspects of the change which affected church buildings included the removal or dispensing with the use of pulpits, the removal of altar rails that divided the sanctuary from the rest of the church, the altar table was moved forward from the reredos with the celebrant then facing the congregation during the mass.[345] These changes had an impact on church architecture in terms of the design of new churches and the re-ordering of existing buildings. Grand church design was to be abandoned in favour of restraint, and architects now worked towards designing church spaces that considered greater congregational participation.[346]

---

[340] Ibid. p. 208.
[341] Ibid. p. 209.
[342] Richard Hurley, *Irish Church Architecture in the Era of Vatican II* (Dublin: Dominican Publications, 2001), p. vii.
[343] Gary Carville, 'Scrupulous and Timid Conformism: Ireland and the Reception of the Liturgical Changes of Vatican II' *Religions* 12, (7: 545), p. 10. Published online at https://doi.org/10.3390/rel12070545 (accessed 6th September 2021).
[344] Ibid. p. 15.
[345] Ibid.
[346] Ellen Rowley, 'Catholic Churches and Cathedrals in the Twentieth Century', in Andrew Carpenter (ed.), *Art and Architecture of Ireland Volume IV* (Dublin: Yale University Press, 2014), p. 298.

A number of new churches were built in Ireland during and following the Second Vatican Council to designs which reflected the aspirations of inclusive celebration of sacraments. As Hurley (2001) states, this presented opportunities for artists to give "new meaning to age-old truths and mysteries".[347] However despite the exceptions noted below, Hurley goes on to state that, in most cases the church authorities did not choose to patronise such work, with the amount of commercially produced art being purchased greatly outnumbering the volume of original art commissions, causing a decline in the church furnishing business and consequently the number of artists working in the area.[348]

Some exceptions occurred where, for example, artists were commissioned by distinguished architects such as Liam McCormack (1916 – 1996) and Andrew Devane (1917 – 2000) to provide original artworks for their new churches.[349] As Caron (2021) states, for these architects stained glass was an integral part of their vision for a church building.[350] In many cases they favoured working with individual artists rather than the larger Irish studios such as Clarke Studios or Earley & Co. Examples of this trend include McCormick's commissioning of Helen Moloney (1926 – 2011) to provide eight stained glass windows for his new church at Desertegney Donegal in 1964 (figure 54), and Devane's commissioning of Sheila Corcoran (b. c. 1942) to provide Stations of the Cross in stained glass for Our Lady Queen of Heaven church at Dublin Airport in 1964 (figure 55).[351]

In other cases newly built churches in large city suburbs such as the Church of the Annunciation in Finglas (figure 56), completed in 1967, the Church of the Holy Spirit in Greenhills (figure 57), completed in 1970, included vast areas of stained glass which occupied large wall spaces, filled with colour but predominantly of abstract design. Again, it was individual artists, George S.

[347] Richard Hurley, *Irish Church Architecture in the Era of Vatican II* (Dublin: Dominican Publications, 2001), p. 103.
[348] Ibid. p. 108.
[349] David Caron, Nicola Gordon Bowe, Michael Wynne (eds.), *The Gazetteer of Irish Stained Glass* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2021), p. 37.
[350] Ibid. p. 35.
[351] Stained glass for Desertegney was also commissioned from Margaret Becker and George Campbell. David Caron, Nicola Gordon Bowe, Michael Wynne (eds.), *The Gazetteer of Irish Stained Glass* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2021), p. 93.

Walsh and Richard King respectively, who were commissioned to provide these monumental stained glass windows.

William Dowling recognised the changes that were happening in his business and saw the need to change the type of stained glass the company offered. In 1967 he wrote to a prospective client in Ireland:

> We would like to mention that although our work has been in what might be described nowadays as modern traditional, we are nevertheless aware of the changing aspects in church architecture which demand a simple and more abstract approach to stained glass design with less emphasis on figure work. Firstly, because traditional style is costly and secondly because the simpler abstract work, when properly designed, suits the modern style of church or chapel and is less costly. We mention the above because most of the modern churches and chapels being built today contains great areas of glass from floor to ceiling which would, of course, be costly and actually out of place if done in the traditional style. We do a simpler style as with St Mary's Cathedral in Cork City.[352]

In 1966 Clarke Studios had been successful in winning a commission to provide large abstract windows for the Cathedral of St Mary and St Anne in Cork. The church was being enlarged and reordered following Vatican II and Clarke Studios were commissioned to provide three windows in the sanctuary area and one in the west gable wall (figure 58). While the central window of the sanctuary contains an image of the Crucifixion, the predominant appearance of the three windows is that of a wall of colour. The large west gable window is of similar design (figure 59). However, based on a review of the Clarke Studios correspondence held in TCD Library, this order was the only commission received by the company for this large-scale type of work.

Clarke Studios did attempt to adapt their style to include modern techniques in stained glass-making such as dalles de verre.[353] In 1967 William Dowling

[352] Letter from William Dowling to P. Keenan, 20th January 1967. TCD MS 6035/42.
[353] See Appendix 3 for an explanation of the term.

wrote an introduction to Clarke Studios in the catalogue for an exhibition of Irish Ecclesiastical goods in London:

> The Clarke Studios have mainly concentrated on leaded stained glass but are now prepared to accept commissions for Dalle de Verre or Slab Glass in Concrete or a combination of concrete and epoxy-resin techniques. Other techniques than the above are in course of testing by the artists and craftsmen in the Clarke Studios because it is their desire to be up to date with the new forms of architectural design.[354]

However, the exhibition did not prove to be a success as there is no indication in the company records that any orders came as a result of the Clarke Studios involvement.[355]

In the late 1960s and early 1970s churches continued to be built but generally at minimum cost. The new buildings were functional but as artist Patrick Pye (1929 - 2018) describes it in a newspaper interview "most architects seem to have a utilitarian indifference to something as intangible as atmosphere".[356] In the same article another stained glass artist Patrick Pollen (1928 – 2010) cites rising costs of materials and expenses as a factor in making quality stained glass windows unaffordable.[357] William Dowling also lamented these changes in church architecture which, as a consequence of the introduction of more glass into the building structure, for cost reasons leads to large areas of plain, undecorated glass.[358]

Dowling would have observed therefore that the developments in Church architecture which affected the stained glass business in the United States were being mirrored in Ireland in the late 1960s. The demand for the style of stained glass the company produced had flourished up to that time, but that demand was unsustainable as modern trends emerged which favoured less figurative and more abstract forms.

---

[354] Letter from William Dowling to Hugh Graham, CTT, 5th January 1968. TCD MS 6035/394.
[355] Letter from William Dowling to CTT, 24th August 1968. TCD MS 6036/34.
[356] Kerry McCarthy, 'The Church is Like Everyone Else Hit by Inflation', *Irish Independent*, 13th May 1974.
[357] Ibid.
[358] William Dowling, 'Future of Stained Glass Industry', *The Irish Independent*, 5th June 1974, p. 12.

2.4.3. *Studios Closure*

Following William Dowling's visit to the United States in May 1968 Clarke Studios won just one additional large order in America.[359] In September 1968 Rev. David Coleman (1908 – 1991), pastor at Our Lady of Guadalupe parish, La Habra, Los Angeles visited the Clarke Studios premises in Dublin. Rev. Coleman was building a new parish church and he chose Clarke Studios to provide a complete set of stained glass windows for the building. Starting in April 1969 the company made twenty-nine windows, including three large three-light windows.[360] The subject matter included Christian Saints and scenes from the life of Christ, and all were executed in the traditional manner of Clarke Studios (figure 60). Other than orders for four large windows in a hospital chapel in Ballarat, Australia, the La Habra commission was the last significant order received by the company. The negative outlook of Dowling's trip to the United States translated into reality.

In November 1968 two members of staff, Richard Nagle and J.B. Oman, were let go because of "slackness of work".[361] In addition, Terence Clarke had died in February of that year and his position as artist was not filled. This brought the number of staff working at the company down to twelve from a peak of twenty-nine in 1961. Producing figurative stained glass was the Clarke Studios' strength and in the early 1970s, as the style of work demanded by patrons continued to move away from this, the amount of business the company could attract declined further.

In 1972, the year before the business closed, William Dowling was interviewed by *The Irish Times* about the training available for stained glass artists and trends in church decoration. [362] As he had discovered on his visit to the United States in 1968, he observed that churches were being built as all-purpose buildings, some with no stained glass at all. Clarke Studios were attempting to keep up with new trends but other factors such as a recession

[359] A large order for St Louis Church in Waco Texas which had started in 1966 was also in progress at the time.
[360] The total value of the orders exceeded £21,000, estimated at €520,000 in 2021 value. Calculated at https://www.cso.ie/en/interactivezone/visualisationtools/cpiinflationcalculator/ (accessed 18th August 2021).
[361] Letter from William Dowling to Department of Social Welfare, 28th November 1968. TCD MS 6036/526.
[362] William Dowling, 'Antiquated Training for Artists', *The Irish Times*, 27th January 1972, p. 15.

in the U.S. and uncertainty over tariff rates when exporting from the Common Market to Australia and New Zealand were having an impact on the business.[363]

In an interview in February 1973 David Clarke, then a director of the company, stated that the reason for the closure was due to "modern ecclesiastical architecture" which he believed was making churches less devout as a consequence.[364] He added that "unlike other stained glass makers it is devoted to stained glass only and has nothing else on which to fall back".[365] After eighty-seven years the company founded by Joshua Clarke and re-invented by Harry Clarke went out of business in July 1973.

2.5. Chapter Conclusion

Harry Clarke took a medieval craft and applied his rich imagination and technical virtuosity in the medium to create visually striking modernist stained glass windows. As can be seen, for example, in his commission for the Honan Hostel Chapel Cork, Clarke's creativity in terms of interpretation, narrative, composition, detailed drawing, colour and pattern, symbolism (including a reimagining of national themes) and his technical mastery of the medium resulted in unique stained glass windows which gained wide critical appeal in Ireland and beyond. In addition to the actual stained glass windows that he made, his legacy to the history of Irish stained glass was a unique style which was carried on by the business he established in the year before his death.

When he founded the Clarke Stained Glass Studios in 1930 his ambition was to create a business which would produce work of the highest artistic merit, be internationally recognised and commercially successful. As the demand for stained glass in Ireland was limited, the key to sustaining a business the size of Clarke Studios lay in winning overseas orders. This was something the company was able to achieve, particularly in United States which, in the 1950s and '60s, became its largest market.

---

[363] Ibid.
[364] David Clarke, 'New Trend Forces Art Studio Out Of Business', *Irish Independent*, 21st February 1973.
[365] Ibid.

The continuation of the distinctive style of Harry Clarke's work was one significant factor in the success of the company. While Clarke Studios maintained consistency with Clarke's approach, the style of stained glass they made in the forty years of the company's existence did not remain static, varying in accordance with the skills of the artists, trends in church design and the commercial realities of producing work at a competitive cost. Case Study 1 concludes that the style of work Clarke Studios produced was derived from but did not slavishly copy Harry Clarke's style. By the 1960s it became a contemporary 'Clarke Studios' style – broader and less detailed than the original Clarke work.

The Clarke Studios' commissions in California and New Jersey in the 1930s opened up opportunities for further work and the company worked hard to develop their business in those locations. The company actively pursued American business through a number of channels – advertising in religious periodicals, direct contact with prospective clients who had building projects, participation in trade shows and direct contacts with influential diocesan personnel and architects. The company was assisted in its export efforts by CTT, which supported the company by providing business leads and promoting exhibitions of ecclesiastic products.

However, as will be addressed further in Chapter Three (*Patronage*), an important factor in the Clarke Studios success in finding new work was through connections with a core group of loyal patrons who promoted their work. Very often it was word-of-mouth recommendations among the network of these priests and their architects which led to new orders being won. The best advertisement for Clarke Studios was their stained glass on location, where prospective clients could see for themselves its quality and style.

The company had a number of obstacles to overcome when doing business in the United States, including local competition, the protectionist lobbying of the Stained Glass Association of America, staff shortages, and material shortages in the wake of World War II. Added to this were the complications of doing business over long distances when communication was mostly by

post, where details such as accurate measurements may be misunderstood and where shipping by sea can be prone to uncertain delivery timescales.

To build trust, Clarke Studios ensured that their clients saw them not only as craftspeople but also as artists who had a theological understanding of the subjects they were portraying in glass. This distinguished Clarke Studios from commercial companies who could not have developed the same degree of empathy with clients. With the assistance of their clients the artists supplemented their knowledge of subjects such as St Junipero Serra or St Emydius, which were commonly represented in Catholic churches in the United States but were unfamiliar to them. This was another factor which gave the patrons and sponsors of the windows assurance about the quality their investment –where Clarke Studios worked with the client to ensure the stained glass was accurate in terms of content and was also aesthetically satisfactory.

Critical comments about the Clarke Studios work, evident in the company's correspondence, indicates that at times they were too slow in delivering orders, that some of the work darkened the churches too much and that the stained glass was expensive. While these criticisms influenced some prospective clients to choose an alternative supplier, others were willing to work around them as the prospect of having what they considered to be the best of Irish quality stained glass outweighed the negative aspects of the arrangement.

A number of factors contributed to the decline in the company's business in the United States. Firstly, changes in Catholic Church architecture in the 1960s and the subsequent change in the style of stained glass that was preferred for new buildings, contributed significantly to the fall-off in commissions for the business. The trend shifted away from figurative compositions towards abstraction and towards new forms of stained glass such as dalles de verre. Modern churches that were being built required either modern stained glass or none at all. While this shift was accelerated by the Second Vatican Council, as demonstrated by work done by Clarke Studios in Lancaster PA, it had already been a trend through the 1950s.

Although the Clarke Studios' artists were aware of developments in the approach to stained glass-making in the period, and had executed a small number of orders in a contemporary style, the company was associated with a specific style of modern traditional design, and when that style went out of favour in the late 1960s the market for their work in the United States all but disappeared. Another factor Clarke Studios could not overcome was the loss of their greatest ally in winning commissions – the Irish American priest. Up to the mid-1960s these priests were the key decision makers when it came to church fitting. As architecture styles changed and stained glass became a greater part of the fabric of a building rather than its decoration, the role of the architect became stronger and decisions on how it would be included were no longer in the power of the pastor.

It was not one single factor, but a combination of these which contributed to Clarke Studios closure. The boom decade for the company was the 1950s and it was a viable business up to end of 1960s. Despite the obstacles associated with operating over long distances, the company won more orders in the United States in that period than they could comfortably manage. While still making stained glass for patrons in Ireland, Great Britain, Australia and New Zealand, the company had a successful twenty years work in the United States, evidenced by more than six hundred windows installed across the country, four hundred of them in California.

It was Harry Clarke's ambition to be successful outside of Ireland and his family worked to achieve that after his death. Based on his artistic legacy, the skills of its craftspeople and the loyalty of its patrons, Clarke Studios was a successful business for more than forty years. However, when the demand for the type of work the company produced came to an end, the business had to close.

3. Patronage – The Demand for Irish Stained Glass in the U.S.A.

3.1. Introduction

An examination of the Clarke Studios order books held in Trinity College Dublin Library has shown that while the company was moderately successful in Ireland and Great Britain during the 1930s and 1940s, it was primarily overseas orders that kept the company in business between 1950 and 1970.[1] In that period an estimated sixty percent of the commissions (by value) received for stained glass came from the United States, mainly from patrons in California where a boom in church building led to orders for over four hundred stained glass windows. In the same period twenty percent of the company's commissions came from other overseas locations such as Australia, New Zealand, Africa and Great Britain, with the remaining twenty percent being Irish business.[2]

Further examination of the company's correspondence from the period indicates that many American patrons were Irish or of Irish descent. This chapter investigates the factors that led to this demand for Irish stained glass in the United States in the 1950s and '60s, focusing in particular on the part played by Irish immigrants and Irish pastoral missionary priests in building parish communities and structures. The chapter outlines the growth in Catholicism in the United States in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, and how this led to an increase in the number of Irish priests working in North America. It considers the role of Irish priests working in North American Catholic parishes in supervising church building and decoration, and the reasons why a number of those priests selected Clarke Studios to supply stained glass for their churches. Focusing on California, the state where the majority of Clarke Studios stained glass in the United States was installed, this chapter describes the initial commissions which were won by the company and how they acted as a catalyst for the Clarke Studios' expansion in the U.S. market. It then considers how the

[1] Information relating to orders is collected from the Harry Clarke Studios Order Book, TCD MS 6060, and various items of correspondence sent by the Studios, held in TCD MSS 6001 – 6038.
[2] These statistics on commissions extracted from TCD Library documents relate to costing and sales information in - MS 6074, MS 6075, MS 6076, MS 6079 and multiple correspondence records from the period 1950 to 1970.

commissions evolved over time in the 1950's and '60s, focusing on the common threads which led to Clarke Studios winning new patronage for its work in that period.

3.2. Catholicism in the United States

Barr (2020) asserts that through the nineteenth century the Catholic Church became a binding force in creating an Irish Catholic identity in English-speaking locations worldwide.[3] He contends that this was largely planned and executed by Irish-born Cardinal Paul Cullen (1803 – 1878).[4] Barr argues that Cullen, in his capacities as Rector of the Irish College in Rome, Archbishop of Armagh, Archbishop of Dublin and Ireland's first Cardinal, influenced the systematic appointment of Irish bishops in dioceses throughout the world.[5] With the support of Rome, he installed allies across the English-speaking world, promulgating an ultramontane version of Catholicism which was rooted in the dogma of papal infallibility.[6]

Barr considers Cullen's work as forming an 'Irish Empire' one of the results of which was a conflation (in the English speaking world where Irish immigrants existed) of being Irish and being Catholic.[7] He argues that Irish immigrants still considered themselves as part of the Irish nation, but now part of what he terms an essentially Catholic "Greater Ireland".[8] Across Greater Ireland, Irish bishops, priests, and nuns mediated loyalty to both the papacy and to Ireland, encouraging the presence of Irish symbolism and Roman devotions to Catholic populations.[9] The result, concludes Barr, was a

[3] Colin Barr, *Ireland's Empire: The Roman Catholic Church in the English-Speaking World, 1829-1914* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2020), p. 6.
[4] Rev. Cullen was ordained in Rome in 1829. He taught there from 1829-1832 before becoming Rector of the Irish College, Rome from 1832-1849. In January 1850 he was promoted as Archbishop of Armagh and remained there until appointed to the See of Dublin in 1852. He became Cardinal in 1866. https://dublindiocese.ie/paul-cullen-1852-1878/ (accessed 12th November 2022).
[5] Colin Barr, 'Imperium in Imperio': Irish Episcopal Imperialism in the Nineteenth Century, *The English Historical Review*, Vol. 123 (502), (June, 2008), p. 613.
[6] Ibid. p. 611.
[7] The concept of an 'Irish Empire' is considered further by Sarah Roddy in 'Spiritual imperialism and the mission of the Irish race: the Catholic Church and emigration from nineteenth-century Ireland', *Irish Historical Studies*, Vol. 38 (152), (November 2013), pp. 600-619.
[8] Colin Barr, *Ireland's Empire: The Roman Catholic Church in the English-Speaking World, 1829-1914* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2020), p. 3.
[9] Ibid. p. 18.

form of Catholicism which was an amalgam that was neither wholly Irish nor wholly Roman but rather, what he terms, "Hiberno Roman".[10]

In the United States the Irish influence was made apparent by the degree of control the Irish held in the American Catholic Church, which was most obvious at episcopal level but was also true at every layer of the institution.[11] This, asserts Barr, was the result of a conscious plan to establish Irish authority throughout all levels in the Church – in the convent, the parish and the diocese – a plan which was underpinned by a steady supply of trained personnel from Ireland, whether from convents, All Hallows or other Irish seminaries.[12] The outcome was that the American Catholic Church became a binding force which encompassed a significant Irish Catholic identity, loyal to Rome and loyal to Ireland. Within that, Irish American Catholics were part of a larger ethnic mix, where they were successful at preserving elements of their own identity while absorbing that of others in their new adopted homes.[13]

3.2.1. *Catholicism in Nineteenth Century America*

A significant characteristic of the Catholic Church in America is its ethnic diversity, which it derives from a history of immigration. William L. Smith (2004) describes the history of Catholicism in the United States as being that of an immigrant church, one built on ethnic diversity and religious pluralism.[14] In the nineteenth century many Europeans emigrated to the United States with the expectation of establishing new and better lives for themselves and their families.[15] In particular, the Great Famine which devastated much of rural Ireland in the late 1840s drove hundreds of thousands of Irish Catholics to the United States, radically changing the face

[10] Ibid.
[11] Ibid. p. 74.
[12] Ibid.
[13] Ibid. p. 75. For a more focused study on the merging of Irish migration and religious history, and its impact on the social and cultural history of Ireland see Sarah Roddy, *Population, Providence and Empire: The Churches and Emigration from Nineteenth-Century Ireland* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2014), in particular Chapter 5.l
[14] William L. Smith, *Irish Priests in the United States: A Vanishing Subculture* (Lanham: University Press of America, 2004), p. 2.
[15] The first large groups came from Germany and Ireland. These were later followed by Polish and Italian immigrants, to name the largest groups.

of American Catholicism.[16] While some immigrants arrived in America with urban, educated backgrounds, many left a rural, peasant existence behind them. They brought with them their own ways of life and, as Ellis (1969) observes, this first wave of peoples created enclaves where their respective languages, social customs and original cultures were cultivated to the greatest extent possible in a foreign land.[17] This included their customs of religious practice.

While these people had brought their own traditions and culture, they found that they also had to live in a society of many differing cultures. Although many immigrants coming from different countries shared the same religion, they did not always share the same ways of practising their beliefs. Furthermore, while they found that it was the practice of religion that bound many communities together, there was for some a conflict between keeping their own traditional practices and merging into an existing society, one they had chosen and had been accepted into.[18]

The American Catholic Church of the period facilitated the emergence of 'national parishes' which enabled Catholics from the same ethnic background to adhere to their native practices while still operating under its administration.[19] Different nationalities set up their own schools where their own language was spoken, organised social events for their own national entertainment, produced newspapers in their own language and in their churches their religious practice was carried on in their own language with their own rituals, music and other traditions.[20] This allowed these first groups of immigrants to express themselves by practicing their religious

[16] Kerby A. Miller, *Emigrants and Exiles* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985), p. 291. Miller states that between 1845 and 1855 almost 1.5 million Irish migrated to North America.
[17] John Tracey Ellis, *American Catholicism* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1969), p. 167.
[18] Chester Gillis, *Roman Catholicism in America* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), p. 59.
[19] The governing law of the Catholic Church (Canon Law) defines a parish as community of the Christian faithful constituted in a particular church, whose pastoral care is entrusted to a pastor under the authority of the diocesan bishop. As a general rule a parish is territorial but, when expedient, parishes can be established determined by reason of the rite, language, or nationality of the Christian faithful of some territory. Code of Canon Law of the Catholic Church, published online at https://www.vatican.va/archive/cod-iuris-canonici/eng/documents/cic_lib2-cann460-572_en.html#CHAPTER_VI. (accessed 28th October 2021)
[20] Jay P. Dolan, *In Search of an American Catholicism* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2002), p. 91.

faith with their own familiar customs while establishing their lives in their adopted country. The national parish assured them of religious identity, helped them to preserve their language and traditions, and eased them into American society.[21] As a result, the beliefs and practices of American Catholics in the late nineteenth-century could be regarded as much an expression of cultural identity as an expression of religious beliefs. This aligns with Warner's (1993) assertion that rather than religion being the property of a whole society it is a "vital expression of groups" within that society.[22] These Catholics adapted to American society while still looking to their church for cohesion, spiritual reinforcement, and moral guidance.[23]

In many cases, the following generations of children born to these immigrants were less content to hold to the native traditions of preceding generations and chose to enter more fully into mainstream American life with the result that over time these immigrant groups merged into existing and newly formed territorial parishes.[24] In the early part of the twentieth century many American parishes developed as multi-ethnic groups of people that practised their religion under the same roof. As described by Julie Byrne, in the space of fifty years, the Catholic population in the United States suddenly transformed from a tight-knit group of landowning, educated aristocrats into an incredibly diverse mass of urban and rural immigrants, who came from many different countries, spoke different languages, held different social statuses, and emphasised different parts of their religious heritage.[25] For many of its members the Church not only served as an instrument of moral authority and guidance but it also facilitated an important element of the person's social life, all the time operating within the values and norms of the wider American society in which they lived and worked.

---

[21] Chester Gillis, *Roman Catholicism in America* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), p. 61.
[22] R. Stephen Warner, 'Work in Progress Toward a New Paradigm for the Sociological Study of Religion in the United States', *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol 98 (5), 1993, p. 1047.
[23] Chester Gillis, *Roman Catholicism in America* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), p. 71.
[24] John Tracey Ellis, *American Catholicism* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1969), p. 167.
[25] Julie Byrne, *Roman Catholics and Immigration in Nineteenth-Century America*, published online at http://nationalhumanitiescenter.org/tserve/nineteen/nkeyinfo/nromcath.htm (accessed on 13th December 2018)

3.2.2. *Growth in American Catholicism in the Twentieth Century*

The nineteenth-century generation of European migrants were followed by more people from Ireland, Germany, Italy, Poland, Austria-Hungary and other European countries, many fleeing oppression in their native country or seeking prosperity and better living circumstances in the United States. Significant numbers of people also emigrated to the United States from Mexico and Central America, the majority of those immigrants settling in the Southern and Western States of the US.[26]

Through the first half of the twentieth century the population of the United States doubled from seventy-six million to one hundred and fifty-one million.[27] In that period the population of California, the focus of this research, grew from one and a half million to ten million people, and in the following decade grew to sixteen million with Los Angeles alone accounting for more than three million of this number.[28] The economic boom which started in California in the 1940s was a significant factor in this population growth. During the Second World War California, and in particular the Los Angeles area, became a major centre for manufacturing both for munitions and other engineering industries.[29] The demand for workers led to a large increase in the population of the region. In addition, farm work attracted hundreds of thousands of people from Mexico to work in Western States during and after the war.[30] In the same period, aided by a post-World War II 'baby boom', there was a corresponding increase in the Catholic population of the United States which more than doubled from 22 million to 45 million.[31] As a consequence there was a significant growth in the number of schools and churches needed to serve this population increase.

---

[26] John Tracey Ellis, *American Catholicism* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1969), p. 128.
[27] Data from https://www2.census.gov/ accessed 12/2/2019. As well as the additional children of existing immigrants and US-born citizens, this increase includes twenty million new immigrants in that period.
[28] These figures include Los Angeles City and County. California Government Department of Finance statistics published at http://www.laalmanac.com/population/po02.php (accessed on 5th February 2020).
[29] Gerald D. Nash, *The Federal Landscape: An Economic History of the Twentieth-century West* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1999), p. 45.
[30] The Mexican population was predominantly Catholic. Gerald D. Nash, *The Federal Landscape: An Economic History of the Twentieth-century West* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1999), p. 48.
[31] Chester Gillis, *Roman Catholicism in America* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), p. 76.

This population growth largely occurred in the urban centres, and as the population moved to the suburbs, the Catholic Church and other religious organisations expanded their land holdings, drawing on the finances of their members to pay for this expansion.[32] The post-war economic boom helped their fund-raising efforts as the standard of living of many workers increased. Furthermore, as many Catholics had enlisted to serve in World War II, they gained from higher education opportunities which were made available to veterans on exiting military service.[33] Thus, from the 1950s, many Catholics achieved higher levels of education and were more successful in business, subsequently becoming wealthier and more able to contribute to the development of their parishes.

Initially, in order to cater for the pastoral needs of these people, many temporary churches were built, and these were replaced by permanent structures through the 1950s and '60s.[34] One indicator of this expansion is the statistic that in the fifteen years after his installation as Bishop of Los Angeles in 1948, Cardinal James McIntyre (1886 – 1979) opened a new church every sixty-six days and a new school every twenty-six days.[35] As Wills comments, at that time success in the Catholic Church was largely measured by opening schools (and churches) – Cardinal Spellman (1889 – 1967) of New York was champion on the east coast, Cardinal McIntyre on the west coast.[36]

3.2.3. *The Demand for Priests and Religious*

With the significant growth of the Catholic population in the first half of the twentieth century, there was a corresponding rise in demand for priests and other religious to service the spiritual, health, education and moral guidance needs of newly established and expanding parishes.[37] Whereas the eastern states were able to fulfil this demand with native-born priests, the Southern

[32] Ibid.
[33] Irish American progress in society is discussed further in Chapter Four (*Meaning*).
[34] Letter from Rev. Thomas O'Toole, Los Angeles to William Dowling, 5th June 1950. TCD MS 6130a/2146.
[35] Rev. McIntyre was born in New York to an Irish mother (born in Kiltormer Co. Galway) and American father. Thomas J. Shelley, 'Twentieth-Century American Catholicism and Irish Americans' in J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey (eds) *Making the Irish American* (New York: New York University 2006), p. 598.
[36] Barry Wills 'Memories of a Catholic Boyhood', *Esquire*, (February 1991) p. 24.
[37] While the United States ceased being regarded a missionary territory by the Vatican in 1908, it continued to get help from European missionary societies up to the 1920s.

and Western states continued, as they had in the nineteenth century, to depend on foreign-born priests, particularly from Ireland, well into the twentieth century.[38]

American bishops, many of Irish descent, actively recruited from overseas seminaries, in particular those in Ireland. From the early nineteenth century Irish priests had travelled to the United States as pastoral missionaries whose primary aim was, as Hogan (1990) states, to sustain the faith of Irish immigrants in North America.[39] This was made possible due to an excess of priests who had trained for the religious service in Ireland.

In the third quarter of the nineteenth century the Catholic Archbishop of Dublin Rev. Paul Cullen is credited with bringing about a reformation of the Irish Catholic Church. This was accompanied by what Larkin (1972) describes as a 'devotional revolution' which saw a large increase in the number of Irish people becoming practising Catholics.[40] Several Irish Catholic dioceses established seminaries where candidates received training for the priesthood.[41] Some dioceses also operated second-level junior seminaries which acted as a preparatory college for students who wanted to proceed to major seminaries either at home or abroad.[42] The main diocesan seminaries were St John's College Waterford, St Kieran's College Kilkenny, St Patrick's College Carlow, St Patrick's College Thurles, St Peter's College Wexford and, to a lesser extent in terms of missionary work, St Patrick's College Maynooth.[43] In addition, while Diocesan seminaries trained priests to serve both in Ireland and overseas, All Hallows College Dublin was established in 1842 with the primary purpose of educating priests for service abroad.[44]

---

[38] William L. Smith, *Irish Priests in the United States: A Vanishing Subculture* (Lanham: University Press of America, 2004), p. 11.
[39] Hogan differentiates between 'pastoral missionaries' whose mission was to care for the spiritual needs of already-baptised Catholics and 'evangelical missionaries' whose mission was to convert non-Christians to Catholicism. Edmund Hogan, *The Irish Missionary Movement: A Historical Survey, 1890 – 1980* (Dublin: Gill and Macmillan, 1990), p. 2.
[40] Emmet Larkin, 'The Devotional Revolution in Ireland, 1850-75', *The American Historical Review*, 77(3), (June, 1972), p. 625.
[41] William L. Smith, *Irish Priests in the United States: A Vanishing Subculture* (Lanham: University Press of America, 2004), p. 22.
[42] Ibid.
[43] Ibid.
[44] William L. Smith, '"Euntes Docete Omnes Gentes": Emigrant Irish Secular Priests in America', *History Ireland*, Vol. 8 (3), 2000, p. 41.

As observed by McConville (2011), these seminaries allowed young Catholic men from more modest backgrounds to aspire to the priesthood.[45] One outcome of this was a significant increase in the numbers entering these seminaries to take up religious life, creating a surplus of priests for service in Ireland, thus providing priests who could move abroad to serve the increasing numbers of Irish people who were emigrating in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.[46]

This phenomenon was known to American Catholic Church leaders and as more Irish priests were appointed to senior positions in the North American church they sought to recruit newly ordained priests from Ireland to serve in their dioceses. Students were courted by senior American clergy who in some cases sponsored students with the understanding that they would serve in their diocese in the United States when ordained.[47] This is illustrated by a letter in 1951 from the Auxiliary Bishop of Los Angeles Timothy Manning to the then President of All Hallows College Dublin which described the growth occurring in Los Angeles at that time and requested that he:

> might be able to recommend to us some students whom we could hope to assign to this Mission on the completion of their course. There are many alumni of All Hallows College doing splendid work here these several years, and it would be a joy to all of us to continue this tradition.[48]

In many cases seminarians received their primary education for the priesthood at one of the diocesan seminaries previously listed. On completion of their studies some of those destined for overseas appointments also trained at All Hallows College in Dublin where they learned specifically about mission work before departing for their assigned

[45] Kieran McConville, 'A Biographical Directory of 19th Century Catholic Clergy from the Parish of Lower Creggan, County Armagh', *Seanchas Ardmhacha: Journal of the Armagh Diocesan Historical Society*, Vol. 23 (2), (2011), p. 80.
[46] Ibid.
[47] William L. Smith, *Irish Priests in the United States: A Vanishing Subculture* (Lanham: University Press of America, 2004), p. 22.
[48] Letter from Rev. Timothy Manning to Rev. William Purcell, quoted in William L. Smith, *Irish Priests in the United States: A Vanishing Subculture* (Lanham: University Press of America, 2004), p. 15.

posting.[49] The training they received at All Hallows was designed to prepare them theologically and pastorally to work away from Ireland, whether in England, the United States, Africa, Australia, New Zealand or Asia.[50] They then left Ireland to serve where needed, acting as examples of the missionary spirit present in Irish Catholicism in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.[51]

The majority of graduates from these seminaries who were posted away from Ireland went to the United States. William L. Smith (2004) estimates that Irish seminaries sent more than four thousand alumni to work in the United States in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.[52] Many went to the western states to serve the needs of the expanding population where Smith's research indicates, for example, that during the 1940s and '50s, eighty percent of the priests in the Archdiocese of Los Angeles were Irish-born.[53]

These missionary priests going to the United States crossed the Atlantic by ship and onward by rail to their assigned destination to set up their new lives in new locations with new people and a new mission. Although they had settled a long way from their homeland, they did not isolate themselves from Ireland. Many kept in contact with friends and family in Ireland by letter and by occasional visits home. One important source of information about the work the graduates from All Hallows College Dublin were doing while on mission is the *All Hallows Annual*. This publication included reports of events at All Hallows, articles relating to different aspects of mission work, reports about gatherings and meetings of Irish priests abroad, requests for more priests to be sent to help in existing locations, updates on jubilee anniversaries, reports on the health and deaths of colleagues, news

[49] In the late nineteenth century thirty-one percent of entrants to All Hallows came from diocesan seminaries. Kevin Condon, *The Missionary College of All Hallows 1842-1891,* (Dublin: All Hallows College, 1986), p. 144.
[50] The principal areas of study on the All Hallows curriculum up to the mid-twentieth century were philosophy and theology. Kevin Condon, *The Missionary College of All Hallows 1842-1891* (Dublin: All Hallows College, 1986), p. 147.
[51] Edmund Hogan, 'The Motivation of the Modern Irish Missionary Movement 1912-1939', *Journal of Religion in Africa*, Vol. 10 (3), (1979), p. 168.
[52] More than 1,400 went from All Hallows Dublin, 1,043 from St Patricks Carlow, 550 from St Kieran's Kilkenny, 511 from St Patrick's Thurles, 244 from St John's Waterford, 163 from St Peters Wexford and 88 from St Patrick's Maynooth. William L. Smith, *Irish Priests in the United States: A Vanishing Subculture* (Lanham: University Press of America, 2004), p. 25.
[53] Ibid. p. 14.

items of interest from personnel in different parts of the world and, importantly, letters from alumni about the work they were doing and their lives where they were then serving.[54]

A review of the correspondence published in various editions of the *All Hallows Annual* indicates they formed networks with other Irish priests.[55] Those in the same geographical areas shared activities on free days, paid visits to one another's parishes and participated in annual seminary reunions held in the United States. As Smith (2004) observes, they shared many characteristics – they were Catholic, from Ireland, received seminary education in Ireland, they were priests, and they were immigrants who had left their homeland to serve as missionaries in the United States.[56] Each of these traits was embedded with distinct beliefs, values and norms learned during their education in Ireland. This helped to reinforce a concept of Irishness with which they identified. According to Smith these individuals who identified themselves with this sense of an Irish identity can be regarded as a subculture within the United States religious system.[57]

Thomas T. McAvoy (1970) asserts that one of the greatest assets that Irish priest's possessed was their command of the English language.[58] Smith (2004) suggests that this ability to speak fluent English allowed them to assimilate more easily into American culture than priests of other nationalities who often spoke heavily accented English which made them more difficult to understand.[59] However, adapting to American culture was not an easy task for some. When addressing seminarians at all Hallows College in October 1923 the Archbishop of Los Angeles Rev. John Cantwell advised those bound for mission work that:

---

[54] The Missionary College of All Hallows produced its 'Annual' at intervals of one to four years from 1848 until 2004.
[55] The Annuals are published at https://allhallows.ie/missionary-college/publications/ (last accessed on 29th October 2021).
[56] William L. Smith, *Irish Priests in the United States: A Vanishing Subculture* (Lanham: University Press of America, 2004), p. 3.
[57] Ibid.
[58] Thomas T. McAvoy C.S.C., 'The Irish Clergyman' in Patrick J. Corish (ed.), *A History of Irish Catholicism* (Dublin: Gill and Macmillan, 1970), p. 36.
[59] William L. Smith, *Irish Priests in the United States: A Vanishing Subculture* (Lanham: University Press of America, 2004), p. 12.

> It is essential to know the place to which you are going before you get there; by deficiency in this kind of knowledge a priest will lose two or three of the most precious years of his life.[60]

Smith (2004) reports that while the majority believed they were well prepared intellectually for their work in the United States, they were significantly less well prepared for the culture change they were to experience, even those who had received some education in American history and culture.[61]

Those posted in West Coast parishes, and in particular Southern California, lived and worked in multi-ethnic parishes.[62] The immigrants who had settled in these parishes, including those from Ireland, carried their devotional practices from their home countries with them and continued to exercise those practices in their new communities.[63] The Irish immigrants brought religious customs which included devotion to the rosary, praying of novenas, benediction services, participation in retreats and veneration of Irish saints. Both the Irish-born priests who moved to the United States and native-born priests of Irish descent reinforced these practices.[64] While the very different cultural environment and apparent liberalism of the western United States appeared to challenge their heritage system of beliefs and values, the imported religious system provided what appeared to be a stable, traditional and familiar transition from home.

3.2.4. *Parish Building*

When newly appointed priests arrived in America from Ireland they were assigned to a specific parish. In 1966 Rev. Francis J. Weber, archivist for Los Angeles diocese, described the advent of Irish priests to the United States in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries:

---

[60] All Hallows Annual 1922-30, p.39, accessed online at http://allhallows.ie/cms/wp-content/uploads/2016/11/1922-1930-Annuals.pdf (accessed 25/03/2019).
[61] William L. Smith, *Irish Priests in the United States: A Vanishing Subculture* (Lanham: University Press of America, 2004), p. 78.
[62] For example, Rev. Thomas Neary writing from Selma, California in 1948 describes the make-up of his parish as being Mexican, Native American, Irish, Portuguese, Chinese and many other nationals. All Hallows Annual 1950-51, p.124, published online at https://allhallows.ie/download/1950-1951-annuals/ (accessed 22/2/2022). Other correspondents include Italians, Maltese, Syrians and English immigrants as parishioners.
[63] William L. Smith, *Irish Priests in the United States: A Vanishing Subculture* (Lanham: University Press of America, 2004), p. 48.
[64] Ibid.

> From the Apostolic colleges of Ireland, they came: from St. Kieran's in Kilkenny, from St. Patrick's in Carlow, from St. John's in Waterford, from St. Patrick's in Thurles, and from All Hallows in Dublin. Nor were these messengers of peace all silver-haired divines who had borne the heat and burden of the day, but bright young clerics, just fresh from the anointing of the Bishop, fortified with the continence of the Virgin, the burning zeal of the Apostle, and the spirit and welfare of their fellow men till death would meet them at the end of the trail.[65]

Some took up the leadership role of pastor, and some became curates, assisting the pastor in their assigned parish. As Coriden (1997) describes, the parish is the "primary, normal and original form of the local Christian community because of the principle of locality; a union of neighbours who live in the same place".[66] Within each parish the church and schools were seen as the central places of this community engagement. For Catholicism, the church was where the faithful met to practice their religion and where the community's spiritual needs were understood to be met. The parish schools were where the young were educated, with the Catholic ethos being a fundamental element underpinning their teaching.[67]

With the growth in the Catholic population and expansion into suburban areas many pastors took on the task of building new churches, schools and community facilities. Michael Gibson (2009) describes the process for constructing a new church building in Los Angeles from the late 1930s, which became a model for other dioceses:

> If the pastor of a parish believed that his congregation needed – and could afford to pay for – a new building, he contacted the Archbishop's central administrative office, commonly known as 'the Chancery'. If an initial administrative review determined that the request had merit, it was placed on the agenda of the Archbishop's Board of Consultors – an advisory board consisting of assistant bishops and priests selected by the Archbishop. If the Archbishop and

[65] All Hallows Annual 1967-70, p.30, accessed online at http://allhallows.ie/cms/wp-content/uploads/2016/11/1967-1970-Annuals-vol-40.pdf (accessed 25/03/2019).
[66] James A. Coriden, *The Parish in Catholic Tradition: History, Theology, and Canon Law* (New York: Paulist Press, 1997), p. 44.
[67] John Tracey Ellis, *American Catholicism* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1969), p. 104.

> his Consultors decided to approve the request, they also considered and confirmed the pastor's choice of an architect, and established a preliminary budget for the project.
> Following the Archbishop's and Consultors' approval, the pastor was authorized to engage the architect. Once preliminary plans were drawn, they were submitted to an Archdiocesan Building Committee whose membership consisted of pastors appointed by the Archbishop, and usually one of his assistant bishops. The Building Committee reviewed the preliminary plans, offered direction and suggestions, reviewed and commented upon any subsequent revisions to the plans, and then eventually approved some final version of the plans. The Building Committee's action was referred for review to the Archbishop and Consultors, who resolved any disputed issues, gave final approval to the plans, and confirmed a construction budget. At that point, the project went out to bid. The Archbishop could choose to intervene at any point in the process, and all decisions ultimately belonged to him.[68]

Significant building programmes were undertaken and in many cases the pastor sought to reflect the diversity of their parish in the style, decoration and embellishment of their churches. They included aspects of their own cultural identity with that of the people of their parish, reflecting to some extent the diverse backgrounds of the parish membership. They dealt with the practicalities of working with a range of people including architects, builders, diocesan committees, parishioners, donors, local government and fellow priests to get these building programmes completed, while at the same time looking after the pastoral needs of their parishioners.

A typical example of how the pastor's role was seen is that of an All Hallows graduate Rev. Tom Garrigan, the pastor of St. David's parish in San Francisco, a parish he had founded in 1952, who was reported as being "busy providing all the necessary buildings and organizing the flock into a

[68] Michael Joseph Gibson, *Creating Sacred Spaces in the Suburbs: Roman Catholic Church Architecture in Postwar Southern California* (Master's Thesis, University of Southern California, 2009), p. 27.

well-knit Catholic community".[69] Another news item in the *All Hallows Annual 1938-39* which announced the retirement of Rev. Patrick Grealy from Willows parish, Sacramento, sums up the pastoral characteristics of what was regarded as typical of an Irish priest:

> In all the years since his ordination he has maintained the high traditions of piety, culture, scholarship and zeal which have characterised the Irish priesthood for centuries, and which have laid the diocese of Sacramento under a heavy debt to 'Ireland, Mother of Priests'.[70]

When faced with a building project one of the key aspects of the design was how the building would incorporate elements which would enhance the spiritual experience of the congregation. Although the basic requirement to be able to carry out rituals and rites of the Catholic Church would be met by having the church building itself, there is also a desire to create the sense of a spiritual experience for participants in ceremonies by adapting some of the physical characteristics of the building to assist this. In addition to the 'bricks and mortar' aspect of building, the design of the interior and the quality of its decoration were significant factors to be considered by the pastor and their architect.

In consultation with diocesan oversight committees, the pastor had a degree of freedom to choose architectural features and decorative elements which he believed would enrich the spiritual environment in the church. These include items such as imagery portraying the Stations of the Cross, shrines, statuary, altar materials, vestments, candle stands, devotional images and stained glass.

The decisions made in terms of providing these items were influenced by several factors including the regulations governing church decoration, the taste of the decision makers, availability of funding and the theme or concept for the overall scheme. Enhancing the window openings with stained glass improves the visual features of the building, which can increase the quality of the experience of being in the church either at prayer or

[69] All Hallows Annual 1955-56, p.162, accessed online at http://allhallows.ie/cms/wp-content/uploads/2016/11/1955-1956-Annuals-vol-35.pdf (accessed 25/03/2019).
[70] All Hallows Annual 1938-39, p.180, accessed online at http://allhallows.ie/cms/wp-content/uploads/2016/11/1938-1939-Annuals.pdf (accessed 21/02/2019).

participating in religious ceremonies. The pastor had choices in terms of sourcing all the decorative features and in the context of this research there were a number of options for procuring stained glass.[71]

The first choice to be made was whether or not to install any stained glass, or merely use plain glazing in the windows. Plain, leaded glass could be the preferred option where funding was not available for stained glass at that time, or where it was considered that stained glass could darken the interior of the church. However, for many religious traditions the spiritual experience of a person being present in a sacred space can be made more tangible by the use of objects and artworks, including stained glass and other decorative elements. Morgan (2005) asserts that the physical manifestation of a belief-based religion is the material culture associated with those beliefs.[72] Morgan argues that the contemplation of images, be it stained glass, statuary or a painting, exerts the power to arrest the mind and deliver it from the anxieties that fragment consciousness, stabilising the mind by displacing distractions with a single object of attention.[73] This concept is manifested in different ways in different religions. In Hinduism, for example, darshan is the ritual act of seeing and being seen by the deity, an encounter that occurs within the gaze of a statue or image in the temple or at a shrine.[74] Some forms of Buddhism make important use of mandalas, intricately designed diagrams that model the construction of vast universes of mental vision which allow the practitioner to 'see' the Buddha.[75]

As Gillis (1999) describes, the celebration of the rituals of the Catholic Church in the early and mid-twentieth century was a vivid experience. Roman Catholicism was a religion that adopted an array of tactile and visual means to communicate with a congregation, using objects such as crucifixes, paintings, statues and stained glass.[76] These elements were combined to create the aura of a sacred place in a Catholic church so that

[71] For example, when deciding on stained glass for the church of St Timothy, Los Angeles the pastor, Rev. William O'Shea, indicated that he had forty proposed designs on his desk. Letter from Rev. William O'Shea to William Dowling, 1st July 1952. TCD MS 6135/5/5.
[72] David Morgan, *The Sacred Gaze* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005), p. 8.
[73] Ibid. p. 2.
[74] Ibid. p. 48.
[75] Ibid. p. 50.
[76] Chester Gillis, *Roman Catholicism in America* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), p. 152.

the person entering to exercise their religious obligations knows that this is not an ordinary meeting place. Stained glass is often seen as essential to the creation of that sacred space, the visitor knows that they are not just in another building but one of religious importance. In addition to its didactic properties, stained glass can also be regarded as having a spiritual significance. In Christian teaching St. John the Evangelist describes Christ as the light of the world:

> Then Jesus again spoke to them, saying, "I am the Light of the world; he who follows Me will not walk in the darkness, but will have the Light of life."[77]

Therefore the light that streams through a stained glass window is considered to have special religious significance where God's light penetrating the window can be interpreted as giving life to the figures and scenes portrayed on the glass.[78]

If the pastor decided to introduce stained glass into the church, then the next decision was where to source it. The options available were to obtain it locally or elsewhere in the United States, or to go to the other main source of stained glass at the time which was a range of European suppliers. Because of the Great Depression in the 1930s and World War II in the 1940s the number of companies making stained glass in the United States reduced from almost nine hundred in 1929 to approximately two hundred in 1950.[79] With the boom in church building during the 1950s, stained glass imported from Europe accounted for sixty percent of all new purchases.[80] Despite import tariffs and the cost of shipping, lower wages in Europe made stained glass manufactured there an affordable option.

Coupled with the decision on sourcing the glass is the question of the style of stained glass to be purchased, the principal options being a factory-produced style such as that made by German companies, for example F.X.

---

[77] John 8:12, *The Holy Bible: New International Version*, accessed online at https://www.biblegateway.com/ (accessed on 14th July 2021).
[78] For a further discussion on the spiritual significance of light and stained glass see Paul Donnelly, *The Rise and Fall of Harry Clarke Stained Glass Limited* (MPhil Thesis, Trinity College Dublin, 2014).
[79] See Stained Glass Association of America at http://stainedglass.org/history-of-the-sgaa/ (accessed 26th January, 2019).
[80] Ibid.

Zettler or Mayer of Munich, or, unique artist-designed images produced by an individual artist or studio, such as that produced by Connick Studios of Boston or Harry Clarke Studios.[81] As Kieckhefer (2004) comments, the aesthetic character of a church is central to its purpose of inducing "awe, mystery, wonder, reverence, thanksgiving and praise", and this is a function of the beauty or expressive power of the environment.[82] One consideration in the choice of style of stained glass for a church would be that a more artistic use of light and colour creates a greater aura of mystery.[83] Arguably, the viewer could then have a greater sense of being in a holy place which would lead to a greater sense of connectedness to the Church and its teaching. Pastors, working with their architect, requested proposals from a number of suppliers, in order to have the option of choosing the one that best fitted their wishes. If they preferred an overseas supplier which may have been more expensive and involved more implementation risk, then they would have to justify their choice to the architect, the Bishop and the parishioners who were paying for the work.[84]

3.2.5. *Choosing Irish craft*

In the period from 1945 to 1970, records in the Clarke Studios Archive show that the company communicated with more than one hundred potential clients in the United States seeking commissions for stained glass.[85] In that time they were successful at winning commissions at thirty-three locations in California, Texas, Arizona, Pennsylvania, New Jersey, New York and Washington State (figure 1).[86] The bulk of the orders, twenty-three in all, were for locations on the west coast and research for this thesis reveals that in the majority of cases the principal decision maker for the award of the contract was a cleric, either Irish-born or of Irish descent.[87]

---

[81] For more detail on Clarke Studios competitors see Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*).
[82] Richard Kieckhefer, *Theology in Stone* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2004), p. 98. In addition to the stained glass, pastors imported other features such as marble mass altars and mosaic work directly from other countries including Italy.
[83] Ibid. p. 107.
[84] For example, Rev. George Scott admitted that he should have been submitting proposals to the Bishop and Building Committee for approval, but he didn't as it would slow up progress significantly. Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling, 3rd October 1959. TCD MS 6135/4/27.
[85] Source: Various items of correspondence in TCD MSS 6011-6038.
[86] The Studios also won commissions in Newfoundland and Ontario, Canada. TCD MS 6060 and various items of correspondence in TCD MSS 6011-6038.
[87] Ibid.

Clarke Studios were at a disadvantage on a number of fronts when it came to competing with other suppliers. One difficulty was that they did not produce a catalogue describing their products which potential clients could consult to see the range of work they offered, or from which they could select a specific type of design that a client would like to commission. As described in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*), not having a catalogue was a deliberate business choice of the company and re-enforced their ethos that they were an artist-led business that produced unique designs for each commission. When corresponding with prospective clients Clarke Studios did however include a selection of advertising inserts which contained a small number of images of recently completed orders and a list of recent commissions (figure 32). This would have given clients an impression of the style of their work at the time.

Another disadvantage was that they did not have a representative agent working for them in the United States selling their products. Evidence suggests that Clarke Studios preferred to deal directly with their clients with no intermediary involved. As described in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*), on several occasions in the 1950s Clarke Studios had offers from American and Canadian companies to act as their agents. The company policy however, was to preserve a direct relationship with its clients and therefore it declined these offers.[88] Another difficulty was that they could not promise exact delivery times to clients. This was primarily because they were a relatively small studio working on several projects simultaneously and were dealing with uncertain delivery times due to the long distances and the transport methods involved.[89] Finally, Clarke Studios, and any supplier importing to the U.S., had to overcome hurdles relating to import restrictions. These issues are addressed further in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*) which deals with the company's business operations.

The question of why a number of patrons chose Clarke Studios ahead of other suppliers is addressed in detail in Chapter Four (*Meaning*). In

[88] One such offer came from a religious goods supplier in California, C. F. Horan, which was turned down by the Clarke Studios board. Letter from William Dowling to C. F. Horan 1st September 1947. TCD MS 6015/299.
[89] The Studios also only bought the more expensive glass as-required for each commission, which could introduce delays in the process.

summary, it is apparent from their correspondence with Clarke Studios that in many cases, by commissioning an Irish supplier, pastors wanted to highlight their own Irish heritage and that of their congregation. The presence of Irish craft reminded Irish and Irish American families of their ancestral homeland even though their lives, both secular and religious, were now rooted in the United States. They desired something that they would value as worthy of Ireland and also of themselves as Irish people. They were very aware that the churches being built or renovated would stand as a legacy to their abilities as parish-builders and would act as reminders of the Irish heritage in their parishes. In addition, some pastors also wanted to promote Irish industry by showcasing good quality contemporary Irish craft, potentially creating more business for home industries.[90]

When confirming an order with Clarke Studios in June 1950 the pastor at St Ambrose Church, Hollywood, Los Angeles wrote:

> I am informing you that I was born in Ireland not far from Dublin, and it was my desire to get something worthy of Ireland in my new Church. I had a very difficult time convincing my Architect that a firm in Ireland was capable of producing Stained Glass comparable to native product, but I insisted that he write to you. I might go further and say that the Archbishop of the Diocese, with his board of Consultors, quote "Questioned whether or not the windows were worthy of the Church", and this too after seeing your sketches. Personally, I have no worries about the quality of your product, but it might be well for you to know that Los Angeles represents the greatest field in the world for a manufacturer of Stained Glass who wishes to push his product. Temporary churches are springing up like mushrooms. The population in this city has increased in the past twenty-five years from about half a million to nearly two million. I know for I have lived here for thirty-eight years. In the next ten years or less many of our parishes, which have been using temporary churches, will be erecting permanent structures.[91]

[90] These themes are explored in more detail in Chapter Four (*Meaning*).
[91] Letter from Rev. Thomas O'Toole to William Dowling, 5th June 1950. TCD MS 6130a/2146.

The pastor, Rev. Thomas O'Toole, was born in Carnew, County Wicklow and was keen to act as an advocate for the Clarke Studios' work in California. He recommended Clarke Studios to other pastors in the Los Angeles area, including Msgr. Bernard Dolan who was re-building the church at St Anthony's parish, Long Beach. Msgr. Dolan, born in County Roscommon, subsequently ordered ten windows for his church, on the collective theme of the Mysteries of the Rosary.

As has been previously outlined (in section3.2.3), the long-standing practice of recruiting Irish priests for the American Catholic Church put them into influential positions both at parish and at diocesan levels. In the mid-twentieth century this led to Irish American priests being responsible for the development of increasingly multi-ethnic parishes, caring for their parishioner's spiritual needs and having a significant role in the Americanisation of Catholic immigrants. As described above (section 3.2.1), in the earlier decades of the century the 'national parish' was the key institutional means of satisfying the specific needs of different ethnic communities. In California, as the century progressed, the policies of Archbishop John Cantwell and later Archbishop James McIntyre, aimed to develop an Americanised Church, which served the growing range of ethnicities in territorial parishes.[92] The largest number of Catholic immigrants to that region in the middle decades of the twentieth century were Mexican and, to a lesser extent, Filipino.[93] Pastors encouraged immigrants to attach to the parish they lived in, but maintain their ethnic identity by forming their own societies within the parish, and including the diverse practices and devotions from their native lands in religious ceremonies.

While little evidence of conflict occurring between different ethnic groups within the parishes studied has been found in parish histories, newspaper searches and textbooks, it can be assumed that such existed. For example,

[92] The diocesan approach to the treatment of immigrant Catholics in Los Angeles is described by the archivist and historian Rev. Francis J. Weber in the biographies of Archbishops John Cantwell and James McIntyre in *John Joseph Cantwell: His Excellency of Los Angeles* (1971) and *His Eminence of Los Angeles: James Francis Cardinal McIntyre* (1997).

[93] Jay Dolan (2002) describes the issues faced by immigrants attempting to maintain their national identity, concluding that efforts at assimilation into Americanism ultimately failed, particularly as the century progressed and their numbers increased. Jay P. Dolan, *In Search of an American Catholicism* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2002), pp. 136 – 146.

in San Pedro, the location of Mary Star of the Sea parish, the prosperous fishing and canning industries attracted immigrants from many countries, including Italians, Mexicans, Japanese and Croatians.[94] The conflict between groups is reported to have, on occasion, turned malicious, with fishing nets being vandalised to prevent competitors going to sea and therefore it is possible that such tensions affected relationships in the parish community.[95] Under the pastorship of Rev. George Scott, the parish promoted ethnic and devotional mixing while still recognising the diversity present in its membership. In an effort to dispel tensions and encourage unity, or at least a degree of mutual respect, Rev. Scott encouraged parishioners of all backgrounds to work together, albeit on occasion competitively, to support the parish both by organising religious and social gatherings, and also in fundraising endeavours.[96]

Mary Star of the Sea parish is typical of other parishes surveyed in the course of this research, where the many ethnic backgrounds of the parishioners are reflected in the stained glass, statuary and other artworks which make up the ecclesiastical decoration of the church.[97] Through the choices made in the sourcing of these objects, the pastor acted as a mediator of ethnic tensions. None of the correspondence between Clarke studios and its clients in the United States gives any indication of ethnic divisions, particularly as it relates to the Irish dominance of parish structures. What does emerge is more a sense of cohesion between different groups in each parish, fostered by the Irish American pastor.[98] It has been identified however that as the century progressed racial tensions did emerge within parishes and across the broader American Catholic Church.[99]

---

[94] Mary Star of the Sea Parish commissioned a large number of stained glass windows from Clarke Studios.
[95] Mary Clark Moschella, *Living Devotions: Reflections on Immigration, Identity, and Religious Imagination* (Eugene: Pickwick Publications, 2008), p.78.
[96] In particular, through events like the Annual Fiesta described in 3.4.3. For an examination of the ethnic tensions in Mary Star of the Sea parish in the 1950s see Mary Clark Moschella, *Mary Star of the Sea: The Interplay of Immigration and Religion in Italian Catholic Devotional Practices in the Port of Los Angeles* (PhD Thesis, Claremont School of Theology, 2001).
[97] See, for example, the description of St Timothy's, Los Angeles in section 4.4.
[98] Although no such evidence has been found in exchanges with Clarke Studios, this may also indicate that the pastor did not wish to reveal any such conflicts in correspondence with a third party.
[99] The 1960s did see tensions rise as a result of the changing dynamics in parish life due to the increase in Hispanic and Filipino immigrants in California, particularly in relation to the saying of mass in Spanish, see Jay P. Dolan, Gilberto Hinojosa (eds) *Mexican Americans and the Catholic Church, 1900-1965* (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1994) and

In addition to emphasising the quality of their craft, Clarke Studios also stressed that they had a good understanding of church teaching and that their work would be faithful to the standard presentation of chosen subject matter. In August 1938, Richard King (1907 – 1974), the manager of Clarke Studios, wrote to the Irish-born Archbishop of Los Angeles, Rev. John Cantwell with the hope of being considered to supply the stained glass for a new seminary chapel being built for the diocese. King knew that Rev. Cantwell had seen the Clarke Studios' work in Ireland. He outlined how Clarke Studios operated and described recent commissions executed for the new Seminary erected by Rev. Dr. Mulhern, Bishop of Dromore at Newry, and windows executed for the Venerable Archdeacon Crowe, P.P. Athlone. King concluded by writing:

> We should be only too pleased to have your Grace's suggestions and incorporate them in designs which we would submit for your approval, and would like to assure Your Grace that in the event of being commissioned to execute windows the finest glasses and craftsmanship would be incorporated in them. We need hardly state that we are a Catholic firm working to Catholic principles and desirous of enshrining in our windows everything that would make for a truly catholic artistic quality.
>
> P.S. We have already executed work for Bayonne New Jersey, also for Sacred Heart Church, Sacramento, and are at present executing windows for the latter as repeat orders, some of the glass for the latter is at present on view in the Catholic Pavilion, Empire Exhibition, Glasgow.[100]

King was appealing to Archbishop Cantwell's Irish background and was also ensuring that he was aware that Clarke Studios were well versed in the *Irish* interpretation of Catholic teaching and its representation in art. He was not only outlining how well their work was accepted in Ireland, but also that they had successfully completed commissions for other clients in the United

---

Kathleen Garces-Foley 'From the Melting Pot to the Multicultural Table: Filipino Catholics in Los Angeles', *American Catholic Studies* , Spring 2009, Vol. 120 (1), (Spring 2009), pp. 27-53. Smith (2004) describes tensions arising between Irish born and American-born Irish priests and their differing approach to pastoral care.

[100] Letter from Richard King to Rev. John Cantwell, 23rd August 1938. TCD MS 6010/440.

States who had Irish connections, and that their work was being showcased as new Irish ecclesiastical art at a significant international exhibition.[101]

Clarke Studios corresponded with several bishops and senior diocesan officials in the United States, many of whom were Irish or who had connections to Ireland.[102] As with the letter to Archbishop Cantwell, they assured them of their ability to deliver quality Irish craftwork at a reasonable cost, citing examples of work already done. This connection was important for a number of reasons. Firstly, the bishops, or their assistants, were directly involved in every building programme in their respective dioceses. By making them aware of the work of Clarke Studios they need not be concerned about engaging with an unfamiliar supplier. Secondly, if Clarke Studios was successful at getting its work into a diocesan seminary building it would be seen by the hundreds of priests who visited the seminaries either for training or on short term retreats, thus making them familiar with the Clarke Studios' style. Finally, if the bishop was amenable to having some Irish character in some of their parish churches, they felt confident that Clarke Studios were capable of delivering good examples of Irish craft.

Irish-born priests took personal satisfaction and pride in the buildings they were responsible for erecting. Various testimonies and obituaries in the *All Hallows Annual* which list the building accomplishments of college alumni invariably often describe the buildings as 'beautiful churches'. For example, a report from dioceses in the West Coast of the United States in the *All Hallows Annual 1957-58* names fifteen priests who between them were responsible for building twelve churches, thirteen schools, three rectories and two convents.[103] The reports in the *Annual* regularly included photographs of recently completed churches built by these graduates of All

[101] The 1938 Empire Exhibition held in Glasgow included a showcase of Irish industry, art and craft. The exhibition included an Irish Pavilion and a separate Catholic Pavilion. The event attracted more than thirteen million visitors between May and October 1938. Clarke Studios exhibited in the Catholic Pavilion.
[102] These included Rev. George Leech Archbishop of Harrisburg, Rev. Thomas Connolly Archbishop of Seattle, Rev. James McIntyre assistant bishop of Los Angeles, Rev. Timothy Manning Archbishop of Los Angeles, Rev. Thomas Kirby Vice-Chancellor Sacramento, Rev. Joseph McGuckan Archbishop of Sacramento. (note: some of these appointments changed over time).
[103] Editor, *All Hallows Annual 1957-58* (Dublin: Browne & Nolan Limited, 1958), pp. 160 – 163.

Hallows College. The *Annual* was circulated to alumni across the world and as such acted as a testament to the achievements of many individual priests.

Managing the Risks of Buying Irish

The early clients who commissioned work from Clarke Studios in the 1930s were undoubtedly taking a risk. The Clarke Studios' work was not low-cost, and donors who were unfamiliar with the company's work in Ireland would only have black and white photographs of previous commissions to give an idea of their product. Also, there was a significant risk with the delivery of the fragile glass over long distances. The pastor would have had to convince the patrons that such an undertaking would be successful and that the outcome would be as splendid as was promised. The donors too were invested in this venture, not just financially but also reputationally. Gillis (1999) argues that despite these concerns, these donors expressed their pride in being Catholic and were willing to project an association with their church through their contributions.[104] As stained glass was a permanent fixture, their names would be associated with the work for as long as the windows would be in place. Therefore it was important for both pastor and donor that they were not seen to be spending significant amounts of money and getting a poor product in return.

To overcome these issues the Clarke Studios' patrons introduced a number of safeguards. Before committing to a large scheme, the pastor would initially order a small number of windows. If these were seen as being successful then further orders would be considered. For example, for the renovation of St Brigid's Church in San Francisco the pastor, Rev. James Cantwell, gave an initial order for just two windows before committing to any further commissions. These were significant windows as they were to occupy a very important position in the transept on each side of the sanctuary, and therefore to have any prospect of follow-on orders Clarke Studios had to provide good quality work. Only when these windows were installed were any further commissions given. In this case Clarke Studios did

[104] Chester Gillis, *Roman Catholicism in America* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), p. 73.

a very satisfactory job with the initial windows and they went on to make all the stained glass windows for the church.[105]

Also, before the order was given for a new window Clarke Studios would provide sketches and colour schemes for approval. These sketches, produced by the studio artists, were of such a high standard of finish that they could themselves be considered artworks, and thus were persuasive in terms of showing potential patrons and donors the quality of the Clarke Studios' work.

A typical example of such a sketch is the one made for Rev. Thomas Kirby when Clarke Studios were requested to provide a cost estimate for a new stained glass window at St Mary's Mausoleum and Cemetery, Sacramento. While the cost of the window was acceptable, Rev. Kirby asked for a sketch of the first window before placing the order.[106] William Dowling provided a sketch design for the Resurrection of Christ window, and outlined the concept behind the design:

> In designing the *Resurrection* our idea was to give the greatest possible significance to the subject by introducing various scenes taken from the Gospel narratives concerning the resurrection. By this approach we wished to interpret the subject in an appropriately idealistic manner.[107]

Both Rev. Kirby and the architect for the new building Harry Devine (1894 – 1963) approved the design and returned it to Dowling to make the window.[108]

When deciding that Clarke Studios were the preferred supplier of stained glass for his new church in San Pedro, Rev. George Scott (1903 – 1986) commented on the designs William Dowling had provided:

---

[105] These statistics on commissions, extracted from TCD Library documents, relate to order information in MS 6060, costing and sales information in MS 6074, MS 6075, MS 6076 and multiple correspondence records from the period 1950 to 1956.
[106] Letter from Rev. Thomas Kirby to William Dowling, 9th November 1949. TCD MS 6130/1446.
[107] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Thomas Kirby, 15th December 1949. TCD MS 6017/618.
[108] Letter from Rev. Thomas Kirby to William Dowling, 21st December 1949. TCD MS 6130/1447.

> There is nothing like seeing something like what you are going to receive in stained glass. The four designs of Our Lady of Guadalupe, St Joseph, St Francis and St Augustine are beautiful. We will probably take all of them when we place a formal order in the very near future.[109]

The sketches also gave the patron an opportunity to provide feedback on the design, allowing a degree of input in how the finished product would appear. Only if the finalised sketches were acceptable to the pastor and the donor would the project be allowed to progress.[110]

Finally, in addition to the pastor and architect reviewing proposals, the local Bishop's building committee did in some cases have a role in approving designs as the work progressed. The degree of diocesan involvement depended on the scale of the overall stained glass project and whether or not the funds were coming from private or diocesan resources. One of the largest commissions that Clarke Studios received in the United States was for St Timothy's Church, Los Angeles. Before the initial order was given the pastor, Rev. William O'Shea (1902 – 1963), outlined that he did not have the final decision regarding the choice of supplier, writing:

> In near future am hoping to present proposals to Archbishop McIntyre for the windows, from certain artists in this country and Belgium. Personally, I would like very much to have one of your sketches among them as I like your work, and would feel very pleased if we could place the order in Ireland. However, there will be a comparison, and the decision won't be mine.[111]

Not all Irish missionary priests who were building new churches chose Irish craft for their buildings. The reasons could be related to the style of church being built, the preferences of the architect, funds available for church decoration, what priority the inclusion of stained glass had, the strength of the Irish connection in the parish, their enthusiasm for Irish craft, the support of their local bishop or their willingness to take on the delivery and

[109] Letter from Rev. George Scott, Mary Star of the Sea Church, to William Dowling, 20th January 1958. TCD MS 6112/3/11.
[110] Source: Multiple items of correspondence in TCD MSS 6001 - 6038.
[111] Letter from Rev. William O'Shea to William Dowling, 18th January 1951. TCD MS 6135/5/3.

installation risks. When Rev. Patrick Coleman was procuring stained glass for St Thomas More Church, Alhambra, California although his preference was for the Clarke Studios' work, his architect Mr J. Earl Trudeau preferred the work of the renowned French artist Gabriel Loire (1904 – 1996). Rev. Coleman wanted "windows with figures with beautiful faces" but the architect preferred the dalle de verre style of Loire.[112] The outcome was that in this case the architect's choice prevailed.[113] Another reason for not choosing the Clarke Studios' work was to avoid possible mismatches between making and fitting, and therefore a number of other potential clients preferred to have the same company make and fit the windows. For example, Irish-born Rev. John Lucey, when deciding in 1966 on stained glass for his new church at Brimfield, Massachusetts, chose a local supplier, informing Clarke Studios that:

> I must decide on having the windows made here. Craftsmanship and materials compare favourably. Price is lower. There is the advantage that the firm here will install the windows and we can inspect the windows in process of manufacture.[114]

The other reason given by potential clients was that the Clarke Studios' work was too expensive for the finance available, and it was more economical to purchase the stained glass locally. This was certainly the case where plainer windows were required, as the work Clarke Studios did was more elaborate artist-designed work. As outlined in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*), only stained glass which cost above a set cost threshold was exempt from import duty, and therefore purchasing lower value work from Ireland did not make economic sense.

3.3. Initial Clarke Studios Commissions

In 1929 Harry Clarke won an order for nine chancel windows for the Church of St Vincent de Paul in Bayonne, New Jersey. This was the company's first commission in the United States and their only client on the east coast of the United States until the mid-1950s. While Clarke Studios responded to

[112] Letter from Rev. Patrick Coleman to William Dowling, 14th January 1965. TCD MS 6109/5.
[113] J Earl Trudeau also designed the church of St Augustine in Culver City, Los Angeles. The Clarke Studios provided a series of stained glass windows for that church.
[114] Letter from Rev. John Lucey to William Dowling, 16th November 1966. TCD MS 6132/15/6.

requests for information about its services from a number of locations across the United States, their initial business success was in the three major urban centres of Sacramento, San Francisco and Los Angeles in California.[115] At each of these locations Clarke Studios won significant commissions in the 1930s and late 1940s which acted as reference points for follow-on work in each city and across the west coast region. In addition to work for churches, a stained glass panel produced by Clarke Studios for exhibition at the 1939 New York World's Fair was brought to Los Angeles by Archbishop John Cantwell and installed in the diocesan seminary at Camarillo. These commissions were important for Clarke Studios as they allowed the company to establish its reputation as a stained glass supplier in California, ensuring that their style of design and the quality of their work was available to be seen by potential clients.

3.3.1. *Sacred Heart, Sacramento*

In November 1930 Clarke Studios were invited to submit proposals for the provision of six windows for Sacred Heart Church in East Sacramento.[116] The pastor charged with the building project, Rev. Michael Lyons, was a native of Dunmore, County Galway who in 1915 had been ordained to serve in Sacramento. Rev. Lyons called on the services of the architect Harry Devine, a Sacred Heart parishioner, to design the building. Rev. Lyons and Devine decided on a Romanesque style of church which would accommodate 750 people. Excavation work began in December 1930 and the completed church was dedicated in September 1931.[117]

The building of a new church presents the opportunity to consider a unified scheme of stained glass from the same supplier, and that was Rev. Lyons' preference for Sacred Heart. He asked Clarke Studios to suggest a plan for the complete set of windows and the manager, Cecil B. Simmonds, responded that they were "exceedingly interested" in the commission and would propose a full scheme including a choice and arrangement of subjects

[115] The Studios had unsuccessfully bid for work in Detroit Michigan and Seattle Washington in 1929. TCD MS 6001/33, 47.
[116] This new church was initially dedicated to St Stephen at the request of a wealthy parishioner who was providing significant funds for the building, but subsequently changed to Sacred Heart at the request of many parishioners and the first pastor, Fr. Philip Brady.
[117] Sacred Heart Parish History, published online at https://sacredheart.church/parish-history (accessed 28/3/2022).

when they had a layout for the building.[118] Despite having little experience in exporting stained glass beyond England, Clarke Studios did not baulk at the idea of fulfilling commissions for clients at such a distance.

Unable to provide any local references for Clarke Studios work, Simmonds made Rev. Lyons aware of the only other work the company were carrying out for clients in the United States, the chancel windows for the Church of St Vincent de Paul in Bayonne. Simmonds also sent photographs of the windows erected at St Joseph's Church in Terenure, Dublin which had also been designed by Harry Clarke. The initial order for four chancel windows on subjects relating to the dogma of the Sacred Heart of Jesus, a rose window of abstract design located over the entrance at the rear of the church and a small window to depict the *Baptism of Our Lord* was placed in January 1931. In July 1931 the order was increased to include a window depicting Saint Patrick for a clerestory window. The total value of this commission, including shipping, was £578, which was the second largest commission that Clarke Studios received that year.[119]

The choice of subjects for the chancel windows, *Sacred Heart of Jesus, Immaculate Heart of Mary, St Margaret Mary Alacocque* and *St Francis de Sales,* reflected the dedication of the church to the Sacred Heart of Jesus. The first three of these windows were suggested by Rev. Lyons and are common subjects associated with the Sacred Heart. The *St Francis de Sales* window was suggested by Clarke Studios and is a less well known subject depicted in stained glass.[120] Rev. Lyons requested a short delivery timeframe for the completed windows but Simmonds, the Studio's manager, only committed to delivery of the four large sanctuary windows and the small window for the baptistery in time for the dedication of the church, initially planned for June 1931. This was a busy time for Clarke Studios with work on

[118] Letter from C. B. Simmonds to Rev. Michael Lyons, 10th November 1930. TCD MS 6002/484.
[119] This amount is approximately equivalent to €36,588 in July 2021 terms. https://www.cso.ie/en/interactivezone/visualisationtools/cpiinflationcalculator/ accessed 7th July 2021. The largest commission in 1931 was for a five-light and tracery stained glass window for St Nicholas's Church, Solohead, Co. Tipperary which cost £645.
[120] In his writings St Francis de Sales contends that the starting point for spiritual growth is the Sacred Heart of Jesus. This commission appears to be the only occasion this saint was depicted by the Studios. The Studios artists must have done some additional research to select a subject which wouldn't be commonly known but which added to the balance of the proposed scheme.

hand for a number of clients in Ireland and England.[121] It was also a time of great loss with the untimely death of Harry Clarke in January 1931, at the age of 41. However the Clarke Studios, led by his widow, Margaret Clarke, saw the opportunities that would arise from a successful commission in the United States and promptly proceeded with the work.

As the construction of the church was proceeding Rev. Lyons led the drive to raise finances for the building and decoration of the church. Funds were raised through pledges, card parties, dinners and festivals.[122] Confident that Clarke Studios could craft and deliver the quality and style of stained glass he wanted, he successfully encouraged a number of parishioners to provide individual sponsorship for the windows.

Rev. Lyons would not commit to any further orders until the first batch was delivered, which was done in 1932. However, he did ensure that the St Patrick window, donated by the society of the Ancient Order of Hibernians, was made even if it was decided not to award the full scheme to Clarke Studios (figure 61).[123] The choice of St Patrick for the first nave window is important in terms of the overall scheme. While the four chancel windows are not easily visible to the congregation they are, however, located above the sanctuary in the most sacred space of the church. This would lend more prestige to the donors of these windows. The rose window, paid for from parish funds and not a specific donor, is at the rear and is north facing, and is therefore the least-lit and least-visible window in the church. The baptistery window is one of the smallest stained glass windows, and in an area only occasionally used by a small number of people. The St Patrick window however is prominently placed in the nave and was one of the most easily viewed figurative stained glass windows in the church (figure 62). As such it is a clear statement of the strong Irish influence in the parish due to both its subject matter and its origin as an example of authentic Irish craft.

[121] Large orders in hand included four windows for St Cuthbert's Durham, England, a 5-light window for Solohead Co. Tipperary, a 3-light window for St Joseph's Abbey Co. Tipperary and many windows for the parish church at Scariff Co. Clare.
[122] Described in parish booklet Rita Spillane, *A Brief History and Architectural Overview of Sacred Heart Church Sacramento, California (2001).*
[123] The Ancient Order of Hibernians (AOH) is a worldwide Catholic fraternal organisation which supports Irish immigrants socially and economically. Its largest membership is in the United States.

In February 1932 the first batch of windows was shipped to Sacramento from Dublin, travelling via Liverpool, the Panama Canal and San Francisco to be installed the following April. There was however a serious issue with fixing the windows as they did not fit the openings. Simmonds pointed out that they were made in strict accordance with the architect's blueprints and insisted that there must have been a change in the size of the window opening while under construction. He strongly advised against changing the window which he said would be "ruinous".[124] The solution decided upon was that the builder had new frames made for the openings and therefore no alteration to the windows was needed. As a gesture of goodwill the Clarke Studios' board of directors agreed to pay half the cost of the new frames, signalling how keen they were to maintain a good relationship with Rev. Lyons and the architect. Rev. Lyons was very pleased with the result and the windows were deemed a success.

The relationship between Clarke Studios and Rev. Lyons was further tested in April 1933 when financial difficulties forced Rev. Lyons to defer full payment for the first order.[125] Simmonds, still keen to maintain a good relationship with the pastor, allowed Lyons to postpone the payment, writing:

> In the meantime please do not trouble yourself about the £169 sterling at present outstanding; we fully realise that payment in respect of this will be made as soon as you are in a position to do so, and accordingly we shall be glad to await your convenience.[126]

The balance was, however, fully paid in March 1934.

Rev. Lyons was clearly satisfied to continue working with Clarke Studios and commissioned a further nine windows, the last of which were installed in April 1940. The project was delayed when World War II intervened and no further windows were ordered until 1947, when Clarke Studios renewed its relationship with Fr. Lyons. In 1938 the then manager Richard King had sent

[124] Letter from C. B. Simmonds to Rev. Michael Lyons, 13th May 1932. TCD MS 6004/347.
[125] This was the time of the Great Depression in the United States and many large contributors, including the churches main sponsor Ms Elizabeth Bowden, were severely impacted by the downturn.
[126] Letter from C. B. Simmonds to Rev. Michael Lyons, 21st April 1933. TCD MS 6005/527.

suggested designs for two large wheel windows, and Rev. Lyons decided to proceed with them in June 1948. He also commissioned stained glass for the remaining three windows. By March 1950 all twenty-one windows in the church were of stained glass made by Clarke Studios.

The stained glass windows in Sacred Heart Church served as a reference location for Clarke Studios, not only in Sacramento but also when looking for business in the neighbouring dioceses of San Francisco and Los Angeles. The final correspondence between Clarke Studios and Rev. Lyons summarises this successful engagement and advises Rev. Lyons that he can expect visitors who are considering Clarke Studios for their stained glass projects:

> We feel it is a great compliment to realise that those who know good glass and have seen our windows in your church consider them to be without comparison in your part of the country. Now the windows are complete and we have had the honour of making them all we have opposing emotions, pleasure (we can imagine the richness in Californian light) and regret our pleasant associations have come to an end. We are doing more so expect visits by Rev. Thomas O'Toole, Rev. Thomas Kirby, Harry Devine.[127]

3.3.2. *St Brigid's, San Francisco*

The next important commission received by Clarke Studios in the United States came after World War II. Rev. James Cantwell, the pastor at St Brigid's parish, San Francisco, had started working in St Brigid's in 1926 and is credited with leading the development of a new school, a new convent and enlarging the church in the early 1930s. In 1947 he undertook the major task of renovating and further enlarging the Romanesque-revival style church, increasing its seating capacity from 750 to 1050. As described in detail in Chapter Four (*Meaning*), for this project Rev. Cantwell took the opportunity to make St Brigid's a showcase for contemporary Irish liturgical arts. The Irish sculptor Seamus Murphy (1907-1975) was commissioned to make an eight foot tall sculpture of St Brigid to be placed above the exterior of the church entrance, Dun Emer Guild provided altar cloths and a large carpet for the sanctuary, and Clarke Studios were invited to provide stained

[127] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Michael Lyons, 3rd March 1950. TCD MS 6018/87.

glass.[128] Rev. Cantwell initially requested designs and an estimate for windows depicting St Brigid and St Mel specifying that he would like to have the same 'Irish type' in the windows as in Murphy's statue.[129] As with the first commissions for Sacred Heart in Sacramento, the first windows were to occupy the most important place of honour of the church above the sanctuary.

Rev. Cantwell visited Ireland in the summer of 1948 and met with Seamus Murphy to discuss the sculptures, and it is likely that he visited the Clarke Studios premises while in the country. The St Brigid and St Mel windows were deemed great success, with Rev. Cantwell describing them as a "monument to your Irish artistry".[130] In the following eight years a total of forty-three windows were made for St Brigid's. Clarke Studios work was installed in every window of the church, establishing it as a model of Irish stained glass art.[131]

3.3.3. *St Ambrose, Los Angeles*

The first commission received in the Los Angeles area was for the church of St Ambrose, West Hollywood. In January 1950, at the request of the Pastor, Rev. Thomas O'Toole, Clarke Studios were requested by the consulting engineer for the project Harold Clar (b. 1897) to provide an estimate for the provision of a scheme of stained glass windows for the Spanish Revival style church. O'Toole had been ordained in 1912 and after working in several parishes in Los Angeles and serving as an army chaplain in World War I, he was assigned to St Ambrose in 1922 where he served until he died in 1960. In his time at St Ambrose, he oversaw the construction of a school, rectory, a convent and, beginning in 1950, a new church. Rev. O'Toole wanted "something worthy of Ireland" in his new church but had a number of obstacles to overcome before he could make that happen.[132]

[128] Dun Emer guild was an Irish Arts and Crafts textile making firm. St Brigid's church history records indicate the carpet was made by Dun Emer Guild in Donegal.
[129] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 17th October 1947. TCD MS 6127/369.
[130] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 15th October 1948. TCD MS 6127/389.
[131] The work for St Brigid's is described in more detail in Chapter Four (*Meaning*).
[132] Letter from Rev. Thomas O'Toole to William Dowling, 5th June 1950. TCD MS 6130a/2146.

As he had difficulty convincing the architect that a firm in Ireland was capable of producing stained glass comparable to that available in the United States, he asked Clar to contact Clarke Studios directly to satisfy himself about the company's capabilities. Hence all the initial correspondence for this project was between William Dowling and Clar. Rev. O'Toole also had to convince the Archbishop of Los Angeles Rev. James McIntyre and his board of consultors about the quality of the Clarke Studios' windows as they "questioned whether or not the windows were worthy of the church".[133]

Dowling sent an initial batch of proposed designs and recommended that Clar visit Sacred Heart Church in Sacramento to see their work in situ for himself. Clar was evidently satisfied with the quality of the Clarke Studios' work he witnessed at Sacramento. He requested that the St Ambrose windows be of the same quality but specified that the figures and symbols for the St Ambrose windows should have a more contemporary style than those at Sacred Heart, suggesting a simplification of the purely traditional figures and stating "We do not desire extreme or grotesque pictures as used in modern art, but rather simplification of the purely traditional figures while retaining true facial expressions".[134] As described in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*), this indicates that the appeal of the Clarke Studios was that their work was in a 'modern traditional' style, rather than the modernist style of other contemporary stained glass designers such as, for example, the work of Gabriel Loire who, as described earlier, competed with Clarke Studios for work in the U.S.[135]

Despite having seen the sketches, Archbishop McIntyre remained to be convinced that the commission should be given to Clarke Studios. Both Clar and Rev. O'Toole provided strong testimonials as to quality of the company's work, and that proved enough to satisfy the Bishop and his office, with the proviso that they would approve all design decisions as the project progressed. Subsequently, all sketches were presented to Archbishop McIntyre for comment and approval, and as the project progressed he made suggestions in relation to the overall scheme – principally that each window

[133] Ibid. Bishop John McIntyre was appointed Bishop of Los Angeles in 1948.
[134] Letter from Harold Clar to William Dowling, 13th March 1950. TCD MS 6130a/2140.
[135] See Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*), for further description of Gabriel Loire's work.

be of a predominant colour, rather than the multicolour design used in the sketch of the *Annunciation* window.[136] The designs were also reviewed and commented on by Rev. McIntyre's Vicar General, Rev. Joseph McGuckan and the Chancellor of the Archdiocese Rev. Timothy Manning (1909 – 1989).[137] Following these reviews a number of the designs had quite detailed comments, indicating how committed they were to getting it right from their perspective. For example, on the proposed overall scheme Rev. McGuckan commented:

> The colour scheme indicated by the sketch is too divergent - too much of a rainbow. The windows near the sanctuary might appear somewhat "washed out" in comparison to the windows in the rear of the church. Perhaps the problem might be solved by keeping shades of blue in the background of all the windows, and having the warmer overtones - the reds, the greens and the oranges in the windows nearer the Sanctuary. Blue in each would give better unity to the whole scheme.[138]

While this may appear like excessive intervention in the design process, Clarke Studios were happy to accommodate the suggestions, perhaps realising that they knew less about the actual light conditions in the church while also recognising the importance of developing a good relationship with the Archbishop. All detailed design was done by the Clarke Studios' artists, taking these suggestions into consideration.

The subjects decided on for the stained glass comprised of The Mysteries of the Rosary, the Seven Sacraments, a series of Old Testament saints, door panels and two small panels for the 'baby room' (figure 63). A window depicting St Patrick was also included in the order. One of Rev. O'Toole's main concerns was light in the church after the windows were installed. Although the church is located in normally sunny California, the pastor was clear that he did not want the building to be darkened too much, a risk if too deep a shade of glass dominates a window.

---

[136] Letter from Harold Clar to William Dowling, 14th June 1950. TCD MS 6130a/2147.
[137] Rev. Joseph McGuckan was later appointed Bishop of Sacramento and then Archbishop of San Francisco. His mother was from Castleisland, Co Kerry. Rev. Timothy Manning, born in County Cork, was appointed Archbishop of Los Angeles in 1970 when Rev. McIntyre retired.
[138] Letter from Harold Clar to William Dowling, 18th August 1950. TCD MS 6130a/2148.

Rev. Manning and Rev. O'Toole visited the Clarke Studios' premises in Dublin in the summer of 1952. Rev. O'Toole found the visit very useful as he learned about the complexities of making stained glass of the quality he was buying, and why it took so long to manufacture.[139] By the end of the project Clarke Studios had provided every stained glass window at St Ambrose, thirty-six windows in all.[140] The last shipment was installed in July 1953 and Rev. O'Toole was "pleased beyond words" with the result.[141] So much so that he preferred them to the ones installed in Sacramento and he felt they would be an excellent advertisement for Clarke Studios and for Ireland.[142]

When fulfilling these orders there was a strong incentive on the company to produce excellent work as at the time a lot of churches were being built around Los Angeles, presenting good sales opportunities. Rev. O'Toole acted as an advocate for Clarke Studios, encouraging several of his peers who were building churches in other parishes to contact the company for proposals. Some of these contacts resulted in orders for the company.[143] For example, Rev. O'Toole recommended Clarke Studios to another Irish-born priest Rev. Thomas O'Regan (1872 – 1957) at St Philip the Apostle Church in Pasadena.[144] This resulted in an order for thirteen stained glass windows for Rev. O'Regan's church.[145]

Rev. O'Toole's final act of patronage with Clarke Studios was to donate a stained glass window to his home parish church in Carnew, County Wicklow. In 1952 he commissioned a window with the subject *The Resurrection*, for the mortuary chapel (figure 64).

---

[139] Letter from Rev. Thomas O'Toole to William Dowling, 16th December 1952. TCD MS 6130a/2177.
[140] The windows were all paid for from diocesan funds, not individual donors.
[141] Letter from Rev. Thomas O'Toole to William Dowling, 12th May 1953. TCD MS 6130a/2117.
[142] Letter from Rev. Thomas O'Toole to William Dowling, 16th December 1952. TCD MS 6130a/2177.
[143] Letter from Rev. Thomas O'Toole to William Dowling, 23rd February 1951. TCD MS 6130a/2157.
[144] Rev. O'Regan was born in Limerick and went to Los Angeles to work as a priest in 1908.
[145] Another Irish American priest Rev. William O'Shea at St Timothy's parish, was also involved in promoting Clarke Studios with Rev. O'Regan.

3.3.4. *St John's Seminary, Camarillo*

An important early example of Clarke Studios' work that found its way to California was a panel made by them for the New York World's Fair in 1939. This panel, entitled *Ireland's Homage*, was exhibited at the Fair alongside a selection of work by two other Irish stained glass studios.[146] It was subsequently bought by the Archbishop of Los Angeles Rev. John Cantwell who had it installed at St John's Diocesan Seminary, Camarillo, Los Angeles.[147] While the seminary was primarily used for education and training of new priests, it was also used as a place for ongoing formation of existing priests and for hosting spiritual retreats. Archbishop Cantwell had it placed prominently in a side chapel adjacent to the main chapel (figure 65). The panel was, therefore, very accessible to be viewed by the many priests who visited the seminary. One pastor, who subsequently bought stained glass from Clarke Studios, referred to this panel as being:

> outstanding among stained glass at St John's seminary. We felt a little honest Irish pride when we saw your masterpiece. Our architect said he had never seen better. Your price is high but not excessive. However if you give us windows equal with that same refinement and beauty of detail, with that same jewel like quality we will be extremely satisfied. It will give an extra thrill to our exile hearts.[148]

When Rev. William O'Shea at St Timothy's parish, Los Angeles was committing to ordering stained glass for his new church in Hollywood he stated "I am staking a great deal on your doing good work, and I have in mind the kind of window that you sent to the New York World's Fair".[149] Rev. O'Shea indicated that he had forty proposals on his desk, but that he wanted Clarke Studios to do the work, and theirs was the only sketch he had submitted to the Archbishop and his council for approval.

It is clear therefore that it was important to these pastors that the artwork they were ordering represented the best of Irish, and they were willing to

[146] Stained glass panels by Earley Studios and Irish Craftworkers Guild were also included in the exhibition. The Studios exhibit at the World's Fair is examined in detail in Chapter Four (*Meaning*).
[147] The Archbishop, although specifically interested in the Clarke Studios panel, bought the three panels and brought them to Los Angeles.
[148] Letter from Rev. Ignatius O'Donnell ODC to William Dowling, 1st February 1951. TCD MS 6129/1305.
[149] Letter from Rev. William O'Shea to William Dowling, 1st July 1952. TCD MS 6135/5/5.

take the risk and stake their reputation on Clarke Studios delivering the best for them. These first commissions became the reference point for the many subsequent contracts the company would be awarded in California through the 1950s and '60s.

3.4. Progression of Commissions

Following these initial commissions Clarke Studios won orders for more than three hundred windows in California in the 1950s and '60s. This section outlines the progress of these commissions, identifying the main factors which influenced this level of patronage.

3.4.1. *Sacramento Diocese*

After the work done for Fr. Lyons at Sacred Heart parish, in addition to orders to provide single windows for two convent chapels in the city, Clarke Studios were successful in winning three further noteworthy commissions in the Sacramento diocese.[150] From a business perspective this does not represent good progress, and possibly reflects that the company had turned its attention to a larger market in Los Angeles. Of the three new Sacramento commissions, Rev. Thomas Kirby was directly responsible for two and was closely associated with the third.

St Mary's Mausoleum and Cemetery

The first commission after Sacred Heart was for St Mary's Mausoleum and Cemetery in 1949. Rev. Kirby, who was born in County Kerry, was secretary to the Archbishop of Sacramento, Rev. Robert Armstrong (1884 – 1957) and held the position of Chancellor, which included responsibility for cemeteries. Rev. Kirby was a frequent visitor to Ireland for business purposes. He was successful in recruiting Irish seminarians from Wexford, Waterford, Kilkenny, Thurles, All Hallows, and Maynooth to commit to Sacramento, which led to a steady stream of Irish priests arriving in the diocese until the early 1970s.[151] He would have become familiar with the work of Clarke

[150] The Studios also won commissions to provide single windows for two convent chapels in Sacramento.
[151] Rev. John E. Boll, *Sacramento Establishes its own Minor Seminary*, Sacramento Diocesan Archive, accessed at https://www.scd.org/archives (accessed on 5th July 2021).

Studios in Ireland during those visits. He had also been mentored by Rev. Lyons when he first arrived in Sacramento and therefore it can be assumed that when new stained glass was to be ordered for an extension to the mausoleum at St Mary's, Clarke Studios was a prime candidate to receive the commission. The architect for the new building at the cemetery was the principal architect for the Diocese, Harry Devine, who had also designed Sacred Heart Church and had worked successfully with Clarke Studios on that project.

The first order, placed in December 1949, was for a window on the subject of the *Resurrection of Christ*. There were some delays in making the window, mainly put down to the Clarke Studios difficulty procuring specific ruby and blue glass from France which was deemed as being "essential to the success of the window".[152] The window was dispatched in August 1950 along with a second window for the Bishops Crypt Chapel depicting symbols representing the office of the diocesan Bishops. The Bishops window depicts the coat-of-arms of the diocese as a central feature surmounted by the Holy Spirit (represented as a dove) which has on each side the Greek abbreviations for the words Jesus Christ (figure 66). From the Holy Spirit twelve tongues of fire are distributed down the window, symbolising apostolic succession.[153] The doves beneath the tongues of fire are intended to represent the Faithful who receive the blessing of the Holy Spirit by the power of the Bishop. The lower section of the window represents the sacramental nature of the priesthood – the chalice and host represent the Eucharist, the book is a sign of teaching power and the stole over it symbolises pastoral power. The Rev. Kirby was very satisfied with the window when installed, commenting that both windows were "admired by all and no complaints".[154]

These initial orders were followed by seven more at St Mary's including a copy of a window depicting the Madonna window in Chartres cathedral (figure 67). Rev. Kirby wanted to have a copy of this window in case the

[152] Letter from Ann Clarke to Rev. Thomas Kirby, 14th May 1950. TCD MS 6108/222.
[153] As described in a letter from William Dowling to Rev. Thomas Kirby, 15th December 1949. TCD MS 6017/618.
[154] Letter from Rev. Thomas Kirby to William Dowling, 11th December 1950. TCD MS 6130/1457.

original might be lost, citing post-World War II concerns in the United States about the advance of communism:

> The Russians are liable to cause trouble in Europe. They are liable to invade Western Europe and naturally, they would not spare these beautiful European windows. If such a calamity should occur, wouldn't it be nice to have some copies of these famous windows preserved?[155]

A more uncommon commission, and one which was more technically challenging, were two large windows which were to be placed as skylights in the building. Each octagonal window was 5.5 metres (eighteen feet) across and weighed approximately 650 kg. The subjects for the windows were *New Jerusalem* and *Lamb of God* (figure 52). These windows, because of their weight, required extra support frames to ensure they could not fall on visitors. Again, Rev. Kirby was very happy with the windows, which attracted much favourable comment from viewers.[156]

In total the spending for the stained glass at St Mary's Mausoleum was £4,400, which includes a number of smaller medallion windows made in the mid-1960s. During the process Harry Devine was awarded the honour of Knight Commander of the order of St Gregory the Great by Pope Pius XII for his service to the church and for his participation in civic activities.

Rev. Kirby was very satisfied with the work of Clarke Studios, and recommended the company to other cemetery committees in the region, some of whom travelled to view them. As a result, Rev. Victor Bucher at St Francis Mausoleum Cemetery in Phoenix, Arizona commissioned a large Resurrection window and 14 small panels depicting the Stations of the Cross.[157]

Sisters of Mercy Convent, Auburn

While the St Mary's Mausoleum commission was being worked on, Clarke Studios received another commission for stained glass for a new chapel at

[155] Letter from Rev. Thomas Kirby to William Dowling, 20th February 1951. TCD MS 6130/1459.
[156] Letter from Rev. Thomas Kirby to William Dowling, 5th November 1953. TCD MS 6130/1501.
[157] Various items of correspondence in TCD MS 6023.

the motherhouse being built by the Sisters of Mercy at Auburn, fifty kilometres from Sacramento. Again Harry Devine was the architect and it may not be a coincidence that one of Msgr. Kirby's sisters, Sister Mary Vincent Kirby, was a member of the community at the Auburn centre. A total of ten windows were made for the convent chapel, to a total value of £2,840 (figures 68, 69).

Immaculate Conception Parish

The final large commission in the Sacramento diocese came when Rev. Kirby was appointed as pastor at Immaculate Conception parish, East Sacramento. When he arrived at the parish he began a remodelling project which included new Stations of the Cross, a new entrance designed by Harry Devine and new stained glass for all the windows in the church. In June 1963 Rev. Kirby ordered six new stained glass windows but while in the process of agreeing the subjects he was transferred to another parish.[158] Rev. Michael Fitzgerald, who was appointed as his successor, agreed a set of subjects relating to the Blessed Virgin and the Mysteries of the Rosary. The windows, costing £1,740, were installed in December 1965.[159]

When the Diocese was building a new Seminary in 1959 Clarke Studios were considered as the potential supplier of a large stained glass window measuring eight metres by eleven metres. However, due to an apparent oversight by the architect, Harry Devine, Clarke Studios were not invited to submit proposals and missed the opportunity to bid for the window. The successful bidder was the French artist Max Ingrand (1908 – 1969) who made a window on the subject of Christ sending out disciples into the California missions to spread the Gospel message (figure 70).

In terms of patronage, it is clear that the work Clarke Studios did for locations in Sacramento was down to the patronage of two individuals, Rev. Lyons and Rev. Kirby, with the support of the Dioceses' principal architect, Harry Devine. Rev. Lyons was responsible for the first commission and Rev. Kirby thereafter. Both men were influential in the Sacramento diocese and

[158] See appendix 2 for a copy on the initial correspondence relating to this commission.
[159] For an example of one of the windows see figure 29, *Immaculate Conception*.

hence were able to indulge their desire to act as patrons for Irish stained glass.

3.4.2. *San Francisco Diocese*

Despite the success of the St Brigid's commission (1949 – 1956) Clarke Studios were only successful in winning two other orders in San Francisco. One factor which may have influenced this outcome was the lack of native Irish priests serving in the diocese. The Archbishop of San Francisco from 1935 to 1961 was New York-born Rev. John J Mitty (1884 – 1961). During his episcopate the number of Catholics in the Archdiocese almost tripled from four hundred thousand in 1935 to more than one million in 1961, and the number of parishes increased by a half with eighty-five new parishes established.[160] In total, Archbishop Mitty sponsored more than 560 major building projects for schools, hospitals and church buildings.[161] One of his policies was to end the reliance on Irish-born priests to staff his parishes, instead recruiting native-born priests and educating them with advanced degrees in education, social work, and various academic subjects.[162] The success of this policy is evident in the listing of alumni from All Hallows active in San Francisco in the 1950s. Taking 1955-56 for example, the number of alumni in San Francisco that year was twelve, compared to forty-seven in Sacramento and forty-six in Los Angeles, with the most recent graduate having been ordained in 1928.[163]

St Agnes, Masonic Avenue

In 1953, while the work for St Brigid's was proceeding, Clarke Studios received an order for three windows at St Agnes Church, Masonic Avenue. The church was undergoing alterations designed by the architects Smith & Winton, with the addition of a new façade in the Spanish Revival style. The Irish-born pastor Rev. Thomas Millett (1893 – 1964) had visited the Clarke

[160] Jeffrey M. Burns, 'Transitions in Catholicism in San Francisco, 1950 – 1970', *Records of the American Catholic Historical Society of Philadelphia*, Vol. 109 (1, 2), 1998, p.20.
[161] Ibid.
[162] Steven M. Avella, 'Catholicism on the Pacific'*, U.S. Catholic Historian*, Vol. 31 (2), 2013, p. 13.
[163] Editor, *All Hallows Annual 1955-56* (Dublin: Browne & Nolan Limited, 1958), pp. 280 – 282. As not all Irish priests in the United States graduated from All Hallows these statistics can be taken as indicative of the trend.

Studios premises in the summer of 1952 when on a trip to Ireland.[164] The subjects were St Patrick and St Francis (co-patrons of the diocese) and a rose window depicting symbols of the passion of Christ (figure 71), which were placed over the entrance to the church. Rev. Millett was very satisfied with the windows, in particular the rose window which he described as being "truly magnificent, as I expected it would be - which, of course, is in accordance with the Harry Clarke tradition".[165] Rev. Millett promised to commission four more windows, but no further orders were placed with Clarke Studios. However, two tondo windows made by Earley Studios of Dublin are installed above side altars (figure 72).

St Elizabeth's, Somerset Street

The final commission in San Francisco was for the newly built St Elizabeth's Church. The pastor, Rev. Arthur Cantwell (1894 – 1976), was a brother of the former Archbishop of Los Angeles Rev. John Cantwell and also of the pastor at St Brigid's in San Francisco Rev. James Cantwell – both of whom were, as previously described, pivotal figures in the procurement of Clarke Studios stained glass in California.[166] Another brother Rev. William Cantwell was pastor of St Monica's parish in San Francisco, who also procured a scheme of stained glass windows for his church in the early 1950s, opting to buy from Mayer's of Munich in order to harmonise with existing stained glass in the church.[167]

St Elizabeth's was a new church building designed in a "modified Gothic' style by the architect George J. Steuer (1915 – 1969).[168] Clarke Studios were first made aware of the project by Rev. James Cantwell in 1954 when he informed William Dowling that "my brother is building a new church a year from now, you will hear later about his windows".[169] This would indicate that Clarke Studios were a favoured candidate to supply the stained glass if

[164] Rev. Millett was born in Carlow and was ordained in in 1918 having studied at St Patrick's, Maynooth.
[165] Letter from Rev. Thomas Millett to William Dowling, 20th July 1953. TCD MS 6130/1769.
[166] Rev. Arthur Cantwell was born in Tipperary and trained for the priesthood in Rochester, New York.
[167] Saint Monica's Parish History, accessed online at http://smstaparishsf.org/about/history/ (accessed on 7th July 2021).
[168] Anon, 'St Elizabeth Church to be Dedicated', *The Monitor*, Vol. 103 (45), 9th February 1963, p. 3.
[169] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 21st January 1954. TCD MS 6127/403.

their proposals were satisfactory. It was not until 1957 that further progress on the building project was made and Rev. Cantwell invited Dowling to submit a proposal for the stained glass contract:

> My brothers, Archbishop John P Cantwell of Los Angeles and Msgr. James P Cantwell procured your windows and were very pleased with the work. Because of sentimental reasons and your workmanship I hope to have your windows. They will go to the lowest bidder of good craftsmanship. The windows of St Brigid are beautiful in design but are too dark for the modern world. People in our day in the USA are afraid to go into dark churches as matter of fact there is good reason for it. People have been attacked in our churches in the past. I'm sure you can permit more light to enter without taking away from the mastership of design. If you do this you will get much more work for our Irish windows. See what you can do and sharpen your pencil to give us the lowest bid.[170]

This letter reveals Rev. Cantwell's motivation for engaging Clarke Studios – quality and sentimentality, and he felt that he could work with and direct them to suit his own needs. It is unlikely that he would have chosen Clarke Studios if his brothers had not done so before him.

Clarke Studios won the order and the work was their largest commission in California – to provide sixty separate windows for the church in a three year period. Due to further delays in the building project the first windows (a three-light St Elizabeth, and two lights depicting St Francis and St Jude) were not installed until October 1961(figure 73). A very pleased Rev. Cantwell wrote to William Dowling:

> The first three windows have been installed and they are of such beauty of colour and design and workmanship that we are at a loss of words to express our great appreciation of them. Thank you is the most inadequate word to express so much but it is sincerely heartfelt.[171]

[170] Letter from Rev. A Cantwell to William Dowling 23rd September 1957. TCD MS 6112/5/3/1.
[171] Letter from Rev. A Cantwell to William Dowling 17th October 1961. TCD MS 6112/5/38.

All of the stained glass windows were donated by parishioners. The names inscribed on the windows reveal the multi-ethnic background of the donors – O'Dea, Cahill and Barrett indicating Irish names and Daneri, Zaragoza, Gheilmetti and Gysels indicating names of German, Hispanic and Italian origin. The project was largely completed by the end of 1963, with every window opening the church fitted with Clarke Studios stained glass (figure 74).[172] While not a source of many more orders in San Francisco, the commissions, particularly St Brigid's, became a reference location for other clients in Los Angeles and in Seattle.

3.4.3. *Los Angeles Diocese*

It was in Los Angeles Diocese where Clarke Studios was most successful in finding patronage.[173] In addition to the previously described orders for thirty-six windows at St Ambrose church Clarke Studios went on to design and make two hundred and fifty stained glass windows for eleven locations in the greater Los Angeles urban area (figure 2). Evidence from Clarke Studios correspondence reveals the connections and recurring trends that led to this extent of patronage. One key factor was the involvement of a small number of individuals who, through their actions were able to influence and win more work for Clarke Studios. These individuals included Bishops James McIntyre and Timothy Manning, pastors Rev. William O'Shea and Thomas O'Toole and the architect George Adams (1889 – 1959).[174]

As previously described Archbishop McIntyre directed the extensive building programme in the diocese. He had oversight of many of the stained glass designs in his new churches. In 1954 when Archbishop McIntyre was making a ten-day visit to Irish seminaries and the Shrine of Our Lady at Knock County Mayo, he personally funded the commissioning of Clarke Studios to make the *Our Lady of Angels* window in the church at Knock in honour of his

[172] For a full description see Paul Donnelly, *The Rise and Fall of Harry Clarke Stained Glass Limited* (MPhil Thesis, Trinity College Dublin, 2014) pp. 51 – 55.
[173] In addition to the city and county of Los Angeles Los Angeles Diocese also includes the cities of Lon Beach, San Pedro, Pasadena and Monrovia.
[174] For a description of the architectural style of many of the newly-built churches in Los Angeles during the period see, Michael Joseph Gibson, *Creating Sacred Spaces in the Suburbs: Roman Catholic Church Architecture in Postwar Southern California* (Master's Thesis, University of Southern California, 2009).

mother who was born in Kiltormer, Co. Galway.[175] Rev. Manning, as Chancellor of the Archdiocese, chaired the building committee and in that capacity had a role in approving new church-building developments. In 1959 he donated two windows made by Clarke Studios to the parish church in his native Ballingeary Co Cork on the subjects of *St Michael Archangel* and *John the Baptist*.

In addition to his own church St Timothy's, Rev. O'Shea was also influential in the decision to choose Clarke Studios for St Anthony's Church, Long Beach and Mary Star of the Sea church in San Pedro. His role as a supporter and promoter of Irish craft is developed further in Chapter Four (*Meaning*). The pastor at St Ambrose church Rev. Thomas O'Toole was also an important client. In addition to his own large purchase he was instrumental in Clarke Studios winning large orders for St Philip's Church, Pasadena and Holy Trinity Church, San Pedro. George Adams, who was a regular architect for Los Angeles archdiocese, was the principal designer for the building developments which included Clarke Studios stained glass at Immaculate Conception Church in Monrovia and Mary Star of the Sea and Holy Trinity churches, San Pedro. While there were other smaller commissions, these locations represent ninety-four percent (by value) of the work done by Clarke Studios in the Los Angeles area in the 1950s and '60s.[176]

St Timothy's, Hollywood

The second major commission in Los Angeles was for the new St Timothy's Church, Hollywood, designed by Harold Gimeno (1896 – 1980) in the Spanish Colonial Revival style.[177] In similar fashion to the St Ambrose commission the first contact occurred when the pastor, Rev. William O'Shea visited the Clarke Studios premises in Dublin in August 1950.[178] As with St Ambrose, Rev. O'Shea indicated that the Diocesan Building committee, led by Rev. Manning had a specific interest in the scheme, reviewing the design sketches for each window.[179] In all, Clarke Studios designed and made sixty

[175] Francis J. Weber, *His Eminence of Los Angeles: James Francis Cardinal McIntyre* (Los Angeles: St. Francis Historical Society, 1997), p. 98.
[176] The value of each order is taken from the Clarke Studios Order Book TCD MS 6060 and from various items of correspondence.
[177] The details of this commission are covered in more detail in Chapter Four (*Meaning*).
[178] TCD MS 6084 (Visitor Book).
[179] Letter from Rev. William O'Shea to William Dowling 1st July 1952. TCD MS 6135/5/5.

windows for twenty-eight separate openings in the church (figure 75). The large nave windows are made up with three separate designs – a main subject at the centre with a decorative symbol at the top and two figures at the base (figure 76). Rev. O'Shea did not have specific subjects in mind and sought suggestions from William Dowling.[180]

The subject for the first window to be made was the *Annunciation*, and this was the catalyst for further sponsors to come forward. The stained glass and other features of the church were sponsored by people who lived in the parish, some of whom were non-Catholic, but had business interests in the locality. For example, statues of the Virgin and St Joseph which had been used on film sets, were obtained from Twentieth Century-Fox Movie Studios, the tabernacle was designed and made by craftsmen in the special effects department of MGM Studios, the pews were made by carpenters working at Twentieth Century-Fox, and the mosaic Stations of the Cross were donated to the parish by a Jewish film director in gratitude to Rev. O'Shea for his technical advice in connection with films having Catholic scenes.[181]

From October 1953 to May 1954 there was no correspondence from Rev. O'Shea, which caused Clarke Studios some anxiety, enough for Dowling to write to Rev. O'Shea's sister in Ireland to check that everything was in order. O'Shea did eventually write, apologising and enclosing a cheque for one thousand dollars citing 'a complicated story' as being the reason for not being in touch.[182] It could be assumed that as his first correspondence for some time included a payment that he had been experiencing financial difficulties, which were now resolved. In 1955 when a lull occurred in the project Clarke Studios offered Rev. O'Shea long term credit while donors for the remaining windows were being sought.

The total value of the commission was £11,400. This was a major commission for Clarke Studios which led directly to further work for Rev.

[180] Letter from Rev. William O'Shea to William Dowling, 18th January 1951. TCD MS 6135/5/3.
[181] St Timothy's Parish History accessed at https://sttimothyla.org/history-artwork (accessed 7th July 2021).
[182] Letter from Rev. William O'Shea to William Dowling 27th May 1954. TCD MS 6135/5/24.

Thomas O'Regan at St Philip the Apostle church in Pasadena, and indirectly to other commissions.

St Anthony's, Long Beach

The next significant commission was from Msgr. Bernard Dolan (1890-1968) for St Anthony's Church, Long Beach.[183] The church was built in a modified Gothic style in 1934, and in 1952 the architects Barker & Ott were engaged to enlarge and redecorate the church, and to create a new façade.[184] Msgr. Dolan wanted to make his church a "real shrine" by erecting good quality stained glass windows.[185] He was also purchasing a set of 'Stations of the Cross' from a company in Rome, spending an estimated $250,000 in total on the renovation of the church.[186] He had seen the Clarke Studios' work in St Brigid's San Francisco which he liked very much, and his admiration for them was a deciding factor in his selection of Clarke Studios. In August 1952 the Pastor at St Brigid's wrote to William Dowling:

> Last Friday Msgr. Bernard Dolan from St Anthony's Long Beach was here. He admired the windows and said we had solved his difficulty in regard to windows. Long Beach is a seaport town half an hour from Los Angeles. There are eleven parishes in the city which St Anthony's is the most important.[187]

He also liked the windows at St Ambrose, although he thought them somewhat dark and lacked the "diamond effect" he saw at St Brigid's.[188] Rev. Dolan commissioned ten windows for the nave of the church on the subjects of the Joyful Mysteries and the Sorrowful Mysteries. The work went slower than expected due partly to the ill health of Rev. Dolan. The first window *The Annunciation*, was dispatched in February 1954 and installed in April, to the great satisfaction of Rev. Dolan.[189] Further delays, put down by Dowling to dock workers strikes and colds and flu's among the Clarke

[183] Born in County Roscommon, Rev. Dolan's family emigrated to Massachusetts in 1909.
[184] Michael Joseph Gibson, *Creating Sacred Spaces in the Suburbs: Roman Catholic Church Architecture in Postwar Southern California* (Master's Thesis, University of Southern California, 2009), p. 322.
[185] Letter from Rev. Bernard Dolan to William Dowling 18th October 1952. TCD MS 6129/945.
[186] Letter from Rev. Bernard Dolan to William Dowling 18th October 1952. TCD MS 6129/947 and letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling 20th November 1954. TCD MS 6127/417.
[187] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling 31st August 1952. TCD MS 6127/321.
[188] Letter from Rev. Bernard Dolan to William Dowling 20th March 1953. TCD MS 6129/948.
[189] Letter from Rev. Bernard Dolan to William Dowling 4th June 1954. TCD MS 6129/959.

Studios' workers, meant that it was October 1955 before the final windows were installed.

Many visitors admired the work, including Rev. O'Toole from St Ambrose. However, Rev. Dolan became unhappy with one of the windows, *The Resurrection*, which he thought was of lesser quality than the others, and the relationship with Clarke Studios deteriorated (figure 77). The correspondence from Rev. Dolan indicates that he had been told that the windows were painted glass, rather than stained glass.[190] William Dowling comprehensibly rebutted this assertion in a reply, assuming that a local supplier had criticised the Clarke Studios work:

> All our colours are in the glass itself and are absolutely fadeless. The black enamel which we use gives form and decoration to the coloured glass. We are inclined to suspect that someone who favours the modern manner may have mentioned to you that too much of our work is paint. This would be a technical way of referring to the use of black enamel, and a matter of opinion in regards to the use of it.[191]

While the commission was progressing Rev. Dolan had sought estimates for additional windows at the side altars in the church. However after his comments about the *Resurrection* window, he changed his mind, deciding instead to commission the remaining windows locally.[192] Another factor in his decision was that he was not prepared to wait the long time it would take Clarke Studios to provide them. Overall, Rev. Dolan spent £4,000 in the three year period. Although he was very happy with nine of the ten windows, it is evident from his criticism and the tone of his correspondence towards end of contract that he had become somewhat dissatisfied with the company's performance.[193]

Immaculate Conception, Monrovia

In July 1954 Rev. Maurice Dee (1899-1972) visited the Clarke Studios premises in Dublin to enquire about stained glass for his church, Immaculate

[190] Letter from Rev. Bernard Dolan to William Dowling 12th March 1956. TCD MS 6129/978.
[191] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Bernard Dolan 23rd March 1956. TCD MS 6024/180.
[192] Letter from Rev. Bernard Dolan to William Dowling 12th March 1956. TCD MS 6129/978.
[193] He did not include any pleasantries in his final letters to William Dowling, which was not characteristic of his earlier correspondence.

Conception, in Monrovia, Los Angeles.[194] Rev. Dee was extending the existing Gothic Revival style church by adding new transepts either side of the nave, thereby tripling the seating capacity of the building. His initial order was for a large window above the entrance, to be followed by windows in the new transepts. This first window was donated by a relative of Rev. Dee in Chicago, who donated $2,000 for its installation.[195] After some discussion the subject agreed for the large window was the Immaculate Conception. Rev. Dee would have preferred a stained glass window similar in composition to Antonio da Correggio's (1489 – 1534) painting *The Holy Night* (1529) but William Dowling dissuaded him as he didn't believe the composition would translate well to stained glass:

> We felt that to arrange this successfully we would be obliged to compose it as a Nativity subject with St Joseph, Angels and shepherds included to give balance to the design. When working a rough sketch, the thought occurred to me that a full length figure of Our Lady as the Immaculate Conception in Glory surrounded by Angels would possibly harmonize best with the shape of the window and the tall arch enclosing it.[196]

The scale of the *Immaculate Conception* (figure 78) window (approximately eleven square metres) allowed the artist Terence Clarke to produce a richly coloured, well-ordered design which uses the supporting muntins to frame the different sections of the layout. The Virgin, clothed in predominantly blue garments, stands on an orb crushing a serpent. She is surrounded by beams of golden yellow light which come from the dove above her. On each side she is attended by angels in a range of coloured garments – predominantly reds, greens and yellows. At the request of Rev. Dee his sister Kathleen Quirke viewed the window at the Clarke Studios premises before it was dispatched to Monrovia. The stained glass was installed in the church in April 1956 and although he thought it a little too dark, Rev. Dee was satisfied with the window.[197]

---

[194] Rev. Dee was born in Tipperary and was ordained a Catholic priest from St. John's Seminary in Waterford in 1923.
[195] The window is dedicated to the parents of Mr and Mrs Packee J. Dee, Chicago.
[196] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Maurice Dee 27th January 1955. TCD MS 6023/41. The cost of the window was £1,000.
[197] Letter from Rev. Maurice Dee to William Dowling 1st May 1956. TCD MS 6128/831.

The next windows for the transept walls, *The Annunciation* and *The Nativity*, were both designed by William Dowling. The subjects for the remaining windows in the nave were the Twelve Apostles. These windows were designed by Harry Clarke's son David Clarke who worked as an artist at Clarke Studios from the mid-1950s. The latter windows are in a broader style with less detailed drawing and large areas of clear glass which ensured the interior of the church was not darkened significantly (figure 79).

Rev. Dee visited Clarke Studios on a number of occasions and also had acquaintances visit to view progress on the stained glass. The final consignment of windows was installed in May 1957. Overall Rev. Dee was very satisfied with windows commenting that they were "beautiful", but he would have liked the window depicting *The Nativity* to be more like Corregio's *The Holy Night*.[198] However, as William Dowling replied, matching that composition would have upset the balance of the new design in the shape of the window which was divided by a separating muntin.[199] The overall cost of the windows was £5,400 ($25,000).[200]

This was the first project Clarke Studios executed with George Adams and they went on to work together on two other large commissions in Los Angeles at Mary Star of the Sea and Holy Trinity churches in San Pedro.

As a further sign of his satisfaction with the Clarke Studios work, in 1963 Rev. Dee commissioned Clarke Studios to make stained glass windows in memory of his parents for his home parish church in Solohead, Co. Tipperary. The subjects chosen for the two-light window were the *Baptism of Our Lord* and *Our Lady of Perpetual Succour*, both of which were designed by William Dowling.[201]

St Philip the Apostle, Pasadena

While the commissions for St Timothy's Church in Hollywood and Immaculate Conception Church in Monrovia were in progress, Clarke Studios

[198] Letter from Rev. Maurice Dee to William Dowling 1st June 1957. TCD MS 6128/829.
[199] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Maurice Dee 20th June 1957. TCD MS 6025/265.
[200] Various items of correspondence and Parish Church Bulletin TCD MS 6128/830.
[201] The designer is identified from the design drawings in Trinity College Library, TCD MS 11182/1091.

also began carrying out work for Rev. Thomas O'Regan at St Philip the Apostle church in Pasadena. Rev. O'Regan was a member of the Diocesan Building Commission and, in the opinion of Rev. O'Shea, was regarded as being "the most beloved and influential priest in this Archdiocese".[202] Rev. O'Regan first became aware of Clarke Studios stained glass in California when saw the work done for Rev. Thomas O'Toole at St Ambrose in 1951.[203] As described in more detail in Chapter Four (*Meaning*), having seen the Clarke Studios stained glass there and in other churches, Rev. O'Regan decided to replace some of the windows in his own Spanish Revival style church. In November 1955 he commissioned the first three of thirteen windows from Clarke Studios. The scheme chosen for the windows, located at clerestory level thirteen metres from the ground, was the Mysteries of the Rosary. He particularly liked the windows being made for Rev. O'Shea at St Timothy's and wanted the same quality for his own windows.[204]

Rev. O'Regan, an elderly priest at the time, was helped by Rev. O'Shea in his dealings. As the windows were being installed Rev. O'Regan was very pleased and proud of the Clarke Studios work that was admired by all visitors.[205] Unfortunately however, he passed away shortly before the last windows were installed.

The St Philip the Apostle commission is one that came as a result of the network of Irish American priests in California. Rev. O 'Regan's close association with Rev. O'Shea and Rev. O'Toole directly influenced his decision to purchase Clarke Studios stained glass for his church.

St Augustine's Culver City, Los Angeles

In 1956 Rev. James McLaughlin commissioned a twenty-seven-light and tracery stained glass window for his church in Culver City, Hollywood. The church was built in the Gothic Revival style and while Rev. McLaughlin suggested a Crucifixion scene, William Dowling dissuaded him from the idea

[202] Letter from Rev. William O'Shea to William Dowling 15th September 1954. TCD MS 6135/5/29.
[203] Letter from Rev. Thomas O'Toole to William Dowling 23rd February 1951. TCD MS 6130a/2157.
[204] Letter from Rev. William O'Shea to William Dowling 3rd September 1954. TCD MS 6135/5/26.
[205] Letter from Rev. Thomas O'Regan to William Dowling 8th October 1956. TCD MS 6130a/2057.

as it would be difficult to make it a dominant subject in the window without the central figure of Christ becoming spoiled or fragmented by the masonry mullions.[206] In response to Dowling's suggestions for a theme for the windows the pastor responded "I am very pleased with suggestions, I will accept the second one (depictions of single figures) as I feel the people will understand more easily and consequently will mean more to them."[207] The entire window, designed by David Clarke, extended to eighteen square metres of glass (figures 80, 81).[208] The work consists of twenty-one panels in the main part of the window, each containing a single figure - Christ as the central figure and around him the Blessed Virgin, the archangels, the major prophets, the apostles and the doctors of the church with St Augustine occupying a prominent position amongst them. Above the main part of the window are symbols of the Evangelists and the Eucharist, the arch of the window contains predominantly blue decorative tracery.

Mary Star of the Sea, San Pedro

The parish of Mary Star of the Sea was established in San Pedro in 1899. By the 1940's San Pedro had become the largest commercial sea-fishing port in the United States and many of the parishioners depended on the fishing industry for their livelihood whether as fishermen, as workers in fish processing or as boat builders and fishing equipment suppliers.[209] Rev. George Scott was assigned as pastor to the parish in 1946.[210] He came to a parish of people mainly with Italian or Croatian ethnic backgrounds, but also including immigrants from Japan, Scandinavia, Slovenia, Portugal, Ireland and Central America.[211] In his twenty-nine years as Pastor he built a new convent, an elementary school and high school, an auditorium and a new church.

---

[206] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. James McLaughlin, 28th May 1956. TCD MS 6024/291.
[207] Letter from Rev. James McLoughlin to William Dowling, 27th June 1956. TCD MS 6130/1704.
[208] The value of the St Augustine commission was £1,800. TCD MS 6075 (Costing Book).
[209] Mary Clark Moschella, *Living Devotions: Reflections on Immigration, Identity, and Religious Imagination* (Eugene: Pickwick Publications, 2008), p.75.
[210] Rev. Scott was born in Los Angeles to an English-born father and an American-born mother. His father Joseph Scott, whose mother was Irish, was an attorney, a civic and a lay religious leader who was a strong advocate of Irish nationalist causes. M. Anita Weyer, 'Joseph Scott: A Life of Service', *Southern California Quarterly*, Vol. 48 (3), 1966, p. 251.
[211] Mary Clark Moschella, *Living Devotions: Reflections on Immigration, Identity, and Religious Imagination* (Eugene: Pickwick Publications, 2008), p.77.

While his initial priorities were the building of the new school, in 1957 he turned his attention to replacing the existing church which was unable to cater for the demands of the large parish. Working with the Los Angeles Diocesan Building Committee, he engaged George Adams as architect and set about planning a church which would reflect the multi-ethnicity of its people, the close association of the parish with the sea and the devotion of the parishioners to their Catholic Faith. The building would also reflect the relative prosperity San Pedro was experiencing in the mid-twentieth century. The church, designed in a 'restrained contemporary' style by Adams, was built in 1958.[212]

Rev. Scott visited the Clarke Studios premises in October 1957, outlining his plans for the new church building and how it would be fitted out. Although local stained glass suppliers were making proposals for the work Scott was fixed on the company providing all the stained glass he had planned. He had seen their work at St Ambrose in Los Angeles and while he liked the design of each window he thought the church was too dark overall.[213] He had also seen the Clarke Studio's work at Immaculate Conception, Monrovia, where George Adams had also designed the building. Therefore he was clear about how he wanted the stained glass for his church to fit with the overall design, and specifically with the elaborate altar and baldachin he was planning for the sanctuary.[214]

Rev. Scott was confident of finding donors for the windows. His building programme was funded both by successful business people in San Pedro and also by many smaller donations by devout fishing families.[215] Funding also came from the San Pedro Fisherman's Fiesta. This annual event, which had started in 1946, was a blend of social festivities, Catholic rituals and small commercial activities. The Fiesta provided opportunities for people from each ethnic background to display something about their cultural heritage,

[212] Michael Joseph Gibson, *Creating Sacred Spaces in the Suburbs: Roman Catholic Church Architecture in Postwar Southern California* (Master's Thesis, University of Southern California, 2009), p. 336.
[213] Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling 6th July 1960. TCD MS 6113/3/40.
[214] Rev. Scott's motivation to buy from Clarke Studios is discussed in more detail in Chapter Four (*Meaning*).
[215] Mary Clark Moschella, *Living Devotions: Reflections on Immigration, Identity, and Religious Imagination* (Eugene: Pickwick Publications, 2008), p.76.

including food and entertainment.[216] The Los Angeles chapter of The Knights of Columbus, of which Rev. Scott was chairman, provided support and actively supported the Fiesta.[217] Through events such as the Archbishops 'Blessing of the Fleet' and candlelit processions it was also an opportunity for the Catholic Church to show its importance in the life of the community. Rev. Scott took advantage of the Fiesta as another way of generating funds for his building programme. He initiated an Annual Fund Raising Barbecue which took place as part of the Fiesta where separate groups set up booths to sell ethnic foods and organised games and contests. In addition to raising money for parish building projects and programmes, it had the added benefit of bringing people together to work for a common goal.[218]

The fundraising and donations allowed Rev. Scott to build a church which was large enough to accommodate the size of his congregation, and which was grandly decorated to reflect the prosperity of the city. The most striking aspect of the interior is the sanctuary area which features a marble altar with a five-metre tall baldachin of polished bronze designed from "ivory botticino, red alacante, greek ishyros and white carrara marble, with violetta columns" (figure 82).[219] Above the altar is a marble statue of *Our Lady of San Pedro*, depicted holding a fishing boat. The other prominent aspect of the interior is the stained glass. The Los Angeles Catholic newspaper *Tidings* described how the stained glass reflected the multi-cultural aspect of the parish:

> The stained glass windows and interior shrines honour patron saints of the various national groups represented in the cosmopolitan parish, all donated. For Italians from the island of Ischia, there are St. John and St Restituta; for the Croatians from Dalmatia, St Nicholas; for the

[216] Ibid. p.79.
[217] The Knights of Columbus was founded in 1882 on the principles of charity, unity and fraternity. It was set up to meet the needs of immigrants, refugees and families suffering from the death of a breadwinner. Rev. Scott's father, Joseph Scott, was considered the father of the Knights of Columbus in California as he established many local councils in the State. Anon, *100 Years of Service - Knights of Columbus*, published online at http://www.kofc1740a.org/images/1740History_030516.pdf (accessed 28th October 2021).
[218] Mary Clark Moschella, *Living Devotions: Reflections on Immigration, Identity, and Religious Imagination* (Eugene: Pickwick Publications, 2008), p.78.
[219] Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling 15th September 1958. TCD MS 6113/3/19.

> Irish, St Patrick and St Brigid; for the Mexicans, Our Lady of Guadalupe. Two large windows depict maritime scenes.[220]

Clarke Studios received the go-ahead for the first orders in September 1958 and Scott expected the fourteen nave windows, eight sanctuary windows, the two large windows, a three-light window and a baptistery window to be completed in eighteen months. He committed that no window would be ordered without it being paid for or promised by a donor, and he was confident that he could achieve that. Rev. Scott was particularly concerned about the two large windows with maritime scenes which are located in the nave, either side of the sanctuary. The windows depict *The Miraculous Draught of Fishes* and *Christ Stilling the Storm*, subjects which emphasise both the parish's connection with the sea and the Christian narrative of Christ's connection with fishing and fishermen (figure 83). He pushed for designs for the large windows as he believed that when potential donors saw the designs they would be encouraged to commit to sponsoring their own window. Rev. Scott was fortunate that the fishermen had had a good year and he did not have any difficulty finding donors.[221] Amber glass, sourced in Belgium, was used to fill the openings while the stained glass was being made.[222]

The first of the windows were shipped in April 1959 and the first of the large windows shipped in October of that year. All the windows that had been ordered were installed for the solemn dedication of the church on 28th August 1960. The first windows were shipped by sea and in order to speed up delivery, the final ones were sent by air freight. While the windows were being made Clarke Studios had visits from Bishop Timothy Manning and some of Rev. Scott's parishioners, including Mr Cahill, originally from Kilkenny and who donated the St Patrick window.[223]

---

[220] Press cutting from *Tidings* 26/8/1960. TCD MS 6113/3/41. The issue of creating for a non-Irish audience, in particular where subjects were unfamiliar to the Studios' designers is addressed in Chapter Four (*Meaning*).
[221] Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling 16th September 1958. TCD MS 6113/3/20.
[222] Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling, 9th April 1959. TCD MS 6133/3/24.
[223] Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling, 7th May 1959. TCD MS 6027/189. Also from various items of correspondence 1958 – 1960, TCD MSS 6025 – 6037, 6113 – 6135.

For that phase of the work Clarke Studios made twenty-nine windows for Mary Star of the Sea church. Rev. Scott was very pleased with the outcome, describing himself as:

> resting on 'Cloud Nine' as so many compliments keep pouring in about all those wonderful windows. Thanking you once again for your excellent work, which gives a maximum of gorgeous colour with a reasonably large amount of light too, so that one can read with a minimum of electricity being used.[224]

In terms of money spent on commissions Rev. Scott was the greatest patron of Clarke Studios in Los Angeles. In the first phase of the work he spent £11,680 and in a second phase in 1969 he spent a further £2,144 – all the windows in the church are made by Clarke Studios. [225] Only Rev. Arthur Cantwell in San Francisco and Rev. Thomas Connolly in Seattle spent more with the company. Scott was part of a widely connected network of religious in Los Angeles. At various times in his correspondence with William Dowling he refers to meetings with other clients of Clarke Studios including Bishops McIntyre and Manning, architect George Adams and pastors Rev. Maurice Dee, Rev. William O'Shea, Rev. Thomas O'Toole, Rev. Bernard Dolan, Fr. Enda (ODC) and Rev. George Gallagher (Holy Trinity parish San Pedro). Interactions within this network undoubtedly added to the way the work of Clarke Studios was regarded and benefitted the company in terms of new patronage.

Holy Trinity, San Pedro (1960 – 1962)

Holy Trinity Parish in San Pedro was established in 1927 as an adjunct to Mary Star of the Sea parish. In 1946 it became parish in its own right, with Rev. George Gallagher (1904 - 1983) appointed pastor.[226] A new parish church, designed by the architect George Adams, was constructed in 1959 - 1960 to cater for an increase in the Catholic population of the area.[227] Rev. Gallagher called to the Clarke Studios premises in August 1958 to discuss

[224] Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling 22nd September 1960. TCD MS 6130b/2343.
[225] Information derived from Studios correspondence. Adjusted for inflation the expenditure would be approximately €300k. Inflation calculator at https://www.cso.ie/en/index.html (accessed 7th July 2021).
[226] Rev. Gallagher was born in Sharavogue Co Offaly and was ordained for the Diocese of Los Angeles in 1928.
[227] George Adams was the architect up to time of his death in June 1959.

the proposed development of his new church. On receipt of the detailed blueprints for the church William Dowling provided alternative proposals for the work, with different pricing depending on the amount of detail required in each design.[228] There were thirty-seven window openings in the church.

William Dowling reminded Rev. Gallagher of previous work which they had done with George Adams for Rev. Dee in Monrovia and Rev. Scott in San Pedro. The pastor had already spoken to Rev. O'Shea at St Timothy's who had been very complimentary about the Clarke Studios work.[229] After he received approval to proceed with the first group of windows from the Diocesan Chancery, despite having been approached by local stained glass companies, he decided to give the work to Clarke Studios.[230] Rev. Gallagher did not have a clear idea about subjects for the windows, leaving the matter to Dowling to make suggestions. The agreed scheme had four themes to the windows: the Mysteries of the Rosary, the depiction of saints and others of historical importance, biblical scenes, and scenes from holy shrines. One of his concerns was that the stained glass would not darken the church too much. Having seen the windows made by Clarke Studios at other locations he informed Dowling that he wanted similar depth of colour to those at Mary Star of the Sea church.[231]

The cycle continued through 1960 and '61 where Dowling would suggest a subject and how it should be treated, sending a sketch of the proposed design for Rev. Gallagher to comment on and approve. A typical suggestion would be:

> Please find enclosed designs for Crucifixion, Ascension and Our Lady of Lourdes. In Our Lady of Lourdes we have adapted the picture to suit the medium of stained glass for the purpose of getting the most colourful effect. Suggestion for St Anthony's shrine a) the miracle of St Anthony's famous sermon to the fishes or b) the miracle of the

[228] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. George Gallagher 2nd April 1959. TCD MS 6027/116.
[229] Letter from Rev. George Gallagher to William Dowling 19th November 1958. TCD MS 6113/2/22.
[230] Ibid.
[231] Letter from Rev. George Gallagher to William Dowling 5th December 1959. TCD MS 6113/2/12.

> horse which refused oats placed before him, until he had knelt down and adored the Blessed Sacrament held by St Anthony.[232]

Rev. Gallagher was anxious to have some of the windows installed as quickly as possible as he was aware that the first one installed would act as an incentive for other prospective donors. The first windows, the Mysteries of the Rosary subjects of *Agony in the Garden*, *Christ Carries the Cross* and *Crucifixion*, were dispatched by sea in November 1960 and installed in late January 1961.

When production was delayed (for example, in January 1961 the Clarke Studios' glaziers were dispatched to Limerick to install a large 4-light window in St Mary's Cathedral) Dowling began shipping the finished work by air to Los Angeles in order to speed up delivery.[233] The deadline for completion was the planned date for the Solemn Dedication of the church, which was postponed from its initial date in 1961 until the following year when Cardinal McIntyre returned from a special mission to the Vatican in Rome. The complete scheme of thirty-seven windows which cost £9,530 was installed in time for the Solemn Dedication on 29th April 1962. Rev. Gallagher was very satisfied with the stained glass, as were the donors:

> The whole scheme looks very nice and everyone seems very pleased with the windows. You have been very gracious during the past few years and have carried out our order of windows most satisfactorily. It was a pleasure for me to have the opportunity to give the order for stained glass windows to a very well-known and reputable Irish firm, the Harry (sic.) Company.[234]

The Holy Trinity was the last of the series of significant commissions for Clarke Studios in Los Angeles until a large order for stained glass at Our Lady of Guadalupe Parish, La Habra in 1969.[235]

---

[232] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. George Gallagher 24th March 1960. TCD MS 6028/157.
[233] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. George Gallagher 16th March 1961. TCD MS 6029/148.
[234] Letter from Rev. George Gallagher to William Dowling 29th May 1962. TCD MS 6113/2/48.
[235] The La Habra commission was for three large 3-light windows, nineteen clerestory windows and three baptistery windows for a cost of £19,488.

3.5. Chapter Conclusion

A significant aspect of the narrative of the patronage of Irish stained glass in the twentieth century is the story of the power of Irish priests working in the United States. From the early nineteenth century Irish priests travelled to the United States as pastoral missionaries whose primary aim was to sustain the faith of Irish immigrants in North America. Waves of Irish Catholic immigration in the United States created this demand and as the corresponding numbers of Irish American clergy grew so did their power in the American Catholic Church.

In the twentieth century the population of the United States increased and the economy of the country expanded, particularly in the wake of the Great Depression and World War II. The Catholic population expanded in tandem, with a further growth in the numbers of Irish American priests, their numbers now swollen with American-born clergy of Irish descent. The congregations in their churches now also included immigrants from many European and Central/South American countries. Under the authority of an Irish-dominated Diocesan hierarchy the priests found themselves at the forefront of parish building projects where new schools and churches were needed to cater for a larger and more geographically-spread Church membership. This was especially true in the Western states and particularly in the State of California. However, they had the power and incentive to look to their Irish heritage when it came to stained glass commissions. It was in this milieu that Clarke Studios found a significant market for its stained glass, winning orders for more than four hundred and thirty stained glass windows in twenty-two locations – starting in the 1930s but at its peak in the 1950s and '60s.[236]

Evidence from the Clarke Studios business archive indicates that the patronage of a small number of influential Irish American Catholic priests was responsible for the extent of the business the company had in California. These pastors were part of the long line of immigrant Irish priests who trained in Ireland for pastoral missionary service in the United States. Galway-born Rev. Michael Lyons in Sacramento, Tipperary-born Rev. James

[236] In that period the Studios also won orders for stained glass in Waco Texas, New York, New Jersey and Seattle.

Cantwell in San Francisco and Wicklow-born Rev. Thomas O'Toole in Los Angeles were prepared to take on the risks and logistics associated with commissioning Irish-made stained glass for their churches, and these commissions acted as selling points for other building projects in their region. Not only did they have a vision for their own sacred spaces, they were engaged in a network of other religious, priests and sisters, who they influenced and encouraged to follow their lead. Through this network potential patrons were able to see the work of Clarke Studios, learn about the practicalities of doing business with the company and see for themselves aspects of stained glass they liked and disliked. As outlined above, the extent of their influence is evident from the Clarke Studios correspondence which describes some of the interactions among this group of priests.

Another important fact that emerges from correspondence between Clarke Studios and its clients was that many immigrant Irish priests were familiar with Clarke Studios work in Ireland, which they saw while training for priesthood. In addition, many Irish-born priests returned to Ireland for annual vacations, which gave another opportunity to see Irish stained glass either in churches or on visits to the Clarke Studios premises in Dublin. The common thread that runs through all the major commissions received by company was that the priest visited their studio in person to see their work and to outline their building plans before making any commitment to place a commission.

In many cases the windows were donated by parishioners and it is apparent from the names of those donors that it was not just Irish Americans who were sponsoring the windows. As is evident from the orders placed and the client's correspondence with Clarke Studios, in many cases the pastor was in a powerful position to influence the decision to choose Irish stained glass and was able to convince his parishioners, whether of Irish or other ethnic backgrounds, to support that decision and provide the necessary finances.

Evidence from correspondence also indicates that the strong Irish presence at diocesan level – whether on the Diocesan Building Committee, the Auxiliary Bishops or the Archbishops themselves – also provided support for the pastor's decision to buy from Clarke Studios. The explicit support of

Bishops McIntyre, Manning and McGuckan is shown in their approval of the expenditure for the windows and, on occasion, their approval of individual window designs. Their implicit approval is indicated by their occasional visits to Ireland and to the Clarke Studios premises.[237]

Archbishop John Cantwell's decision to buy Irish stained glass at New York's World's Fair 1939 was an important catalyst for some pastors when deciding to buy from Ireland. When placed at St John's Seminary it provided the opportunity to view the artistic quality of Clarke Studios work at close quarters and gave an explicit stamp of approval to their work. As outlined above, the correspondence shows that this window and Rev. Lyons' windows in Sacramento were instrumental in convincing clients of the merits of Clarke Studios stained glass for their new church buildings.

Not all priests who enquired about ordering stained glass followed through with a commission, generally either citing the time it took Clarke Studios to deliver the windows or their preference to have the stained glass made and installed by the same company. This did not appear to trouble Clarke Studios excessively, particularly in the 1950s when they had more work than they could cope with for the staff they had available.[238] While they welcomed the patronage they received, having too much work created challenges for the company in terms of resources and balancing the needs of Irish clients with overseas clients. Finally, none of this would have been possible without the Clarke Studios willingness to engage with the process and logistics of transacting business over such long distances.

The development of Clarke Studios overseas business was, as stated by Donnelly (2019), an ambition of its founder Harry Clarke, an ambition which was realised by the studio he formally established in 1930 and which was carried on by his widow Margaret until her death in 1961, and by his children until the business closed in 1973.[239] This ambition, coupled with

[237] Bishop Timothy Manning visited the Studios premises in September 1959. Letter from William Dowling to Rev. George Scott, 14th September 1959. TCD MS 6027/355. Bishop McGuckan also visited the Studios in the mid-1960s. Letter from William Dowling to Mr. O'Doherty (CTT) 11th January 1968. TCD MS 6036/44.
[238] See Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*) for further discussion on this point.
[239] Paul Donnelly, 'Legacy and Identity: Harry Clarke, William Dowling and the Harry Clarke Studios' in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds) *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish State* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019) p. 305.

patronage afforded by a number of Irish American priests, is responsible for the presence of hundreds of stained glass windows made by Clarke Studios in many churches in California and beyond.

4. Meaning in Stained Glass

4.1. Introduction

Chapter Three (*Patronage*) examined the background to, and the extent of, the American Catholic Church's patronage of Irish stained glass produced by Clarke Studios, namely 'what' was done. This chapter examines the Irish American experience in society in order to understand the meaning behind the purchases – 'why' Catholic priests and donors chose Irish stained glass.

As outlined in the previous chapter, the majority of the Irish immigrant arrivals to the United States during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries left their homes in Ireland in pursuit of a better life, or – more essentially - during the Great Famine era to avoid starvation and disease. Many settled in densely populated urban areas, an unfamiliar environment for previously rural inhabitants, and thus faced a new set of social and economic challenges in their adopted country. In particular they faced the challenges of fitting into a society which was, in many instances, anti-Catholic and anti-Irish.[1] The environment was anti-Catholic in terms of the immigrant's rejection by a suspicious and more established Anglo American Protestant society, and anti-Irish in terms of their perceived lack of education, English language skills and social sophistication.

Throughout the twentieth century, Irish Americans strove to improve their standing in American society. From the early 1930s to the late 1960s, which covers the main period of interest of this study, the Irish American community achieved higher levels of education, became more skilled and was presenting itself as being more cultured, its presence becoming increasingly impactful across all aspects of American life. By the 1960s Irish American voices could be heard in the White House and across the political establishment, in media, on radio, on television and in the cinema. Additionally, Irish art and design was on display and promoted at public exhibitions, and, as highlighted by this study, craftwork such as stained glass would be a significant feature in a number of Catholic churches. This chapter focuses on that aspect of cultural exchange and examines how Irish

[1] David Noel Doyle, 'The Remaking of Irish America, 1845 - 1880' in J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey, eds., *Making the Irish American: History and Heritage of the Irish in the United States* (New York: New York University Press, 2006), p. 213.

Americans came to achieve their agency and position within society, and the extent to which the commissioning of Irish stained glass for Roman Catholic churches in that period reflects this progress.

In order to construct an analysis, this chapter summarises the history of Irish immigration in the United States from the nineteenth century through to the mid-twentieth century. It traces the course of the integration of Irish immigrants, and their descendants, into American society. It explores how their identity transcended from being Irish to Irish American, from being perceived to be predominantly poorly-educated superstitious peasants in the mid-nineteenth century to becoming a formally educated citizen who made a significant contribution to the social, economic, political and religious life of the United States in the mid-twentieth century. The changes in American society which enabled the Irish to progress in the twentieth century are summarised and a number of the signifiers of Irish American progress are identified. The primary focus is placed on one such signifier – the placement of Irish-made stained glass in Catholic churches to demonstrate a quantitative and qualitative aspect of the Irish culture. The research examines what these religious art objects tell us about the circumstances associated with their commissioning and what agency their presence and visual language carried in terms of the construction of an immigrant Irish American aesthetic in Catholic churches in the United States.

The chapter presents a number of case studies which examine a selection of representative commissions won by Clarke Studios. Information gathered from correspondence archives, newspaper archives and local historical records is used to establish the meaning behind the commissioning of Clarke Studios stained glass. The commissions selected for examination have been chosen based on their location (examples are taken from two dioceses in the region), scale of commissions (locations where the majority of the stained glass is from Clarke Studios), the time period of the project specific to this dissertation (1950-1970), and where specific archival evidence exists that explains why Irish stained glass was chosen.[2]

[2] Sources include: Local newspaper texts, local history texts, the Clarke Studios business archive, Diocesan archives, correspondence and articles published in periodicals such as *The Tidings* and *All Hallows Annual*. A commission in San Francisco has been chosen as the city

4.2. Irish Immigration in the Nineteenth Century

The majority of Catholic emigrants from Ireland in the eighteenth and early nineteenth century journeyed to Great Britain to find work as agricultural labourers, or in urban industrial centres.[3] In that period a relatively small number travelled to the United States and this group was outnumbered by the volume of Ulster Presbyterians who travelled to and settled more easily into the mainly English Protestant-dominated areas of North America.[4] However, the mid-nineteenth century saw a change in this pattern with a significant increase in the number of Irish (and other European) people emigrating to the United States.[5] An estimated one million people emigrated from Ireland to the United States in the period 1820-1845. These were a relatively well-off group of individuals, comprised mostly of smallholders who had sold their Irish landholdings to invest in America, or artisans who, as Nolan (1989) argues, may have foreseen difficult times ahead in Ireland.[6] They were a mix of Catholic and Protestants, each group motivated by different circumstances – for Catholics it was driven mainly by economic necessity and, as asserted by Miller (2008), for Protestants it was largely due to an uncertain future due to the rise in Catholic power in Ireland, an increase in industrialisation in Ulster and the economic depression in produce such as flax, and a change in the balance of power in Ulster Unionism.[7]

The divisions between those from each religious background were re-produced where they settled, whether in the United States, Canada or Britain.[8] Different fundamental political concepts underpin each religion. As described by Whelan (2006), Protestantism was based on the principles of

---

has a strong Irish presence. Los Angeles has been chosen as it is the place where the majority of the Clarke Studios U.S work was commissioned.

[3] Lawrence McCaffrey, 'Ireland and Irish America: Connections and Disconnections', *U.S. Catholic Historian*, 22(3), (Summer, 2004), p. 1.

[4] Ibid. p. 3.

[5] The first large groups came from Germany and Ireland. These were later followed by emigrants from Poland and Italy, to name the largest groups. John Buenker and Lorman Ratner, *Multiculturalism in the United States* (Westport: Greenwood Press, 2005), p. xi.

[6] Janet Nolan, *Ourselves Alone: Women's Emigration from Ireland, 1885-1920 (*Kentucky: University Press of Kentucky, 1989), p. 44.

[7] Many protestant immigrants were Presbyterian small farmers and weavers, see "Heirs of Freedom" or "Slaves to England"? Protestant Society and Unionist Hegemony in Nineteenth-Century Ulster Kerby Miller p. 87 (accessed at https://www.researchgate.net/publication/339282229_Heirs_of_Freedom_or_Slaves_to_England_Protestant_Society_and_Unionist_Hegemony_in_Nineteenth-Century_Ulster on 18th June, 2021).

[8] These countries were the most popular destinations for Irish emigrants in the period.

self-responsible Christianity, free market economics and parliamentary government where citizens are free from slavery in all its forms be it by race or what they considered as spiritual slavery imposed by Rome.[9] This saw Protestants in the United States characterise Catholics as what they perceived themselves not to be – slovenly, vexatious, untrustworthy and ultimately slaves to Rome, thus going against the ideals of the 'new' liberal America. Reflective of British-Irish politics, groups of American Protestants united in the cause of fighting the encroachment of Catholic influence in society. However, it must also be recognised that some also worked at converting Catholics of all ethnic backgrounds from what they considered as servitude to Rome through the establishment of Protestant 'influencing' societies and through philanthropic work.[10]

Following the period of the Great Famine, which devastated much of rural Ireland in the late 1840s, many more Irish Catholics were forced to flee their home country. It is estimated that in the period 1845 to 1856 up to 1.8 million Irish people emigrated from Ireland to North America.[11] While some immigrants arrived in the United States with urban, educated backgrounds, many left a rural, peasant existence behind them. Wanting to live close to their own people and not having progressive agricultural skills, many preferred to live in towns and cities taking up some of the lower levels of employment such as domestic service, labouring and factory work.[12] They brought with them their own ways of life and, as Ellis (1969) observes, this first wave of peoples created enclaves where their respective languages, social customs and original cultures were cultivated to the extent possible in a foreign land.[13]

These Irish immigrants were predominantly Catholic, unskilled and had developed a reputation for rowdiness and disturbing public order. They were

[9] Irene Whelan, 'Religious Rivalry and the Making of Irish-American Identity' in J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey, eds., *Making the Irish American: History and Heritage of the Irish in the United States* (New York: New York University Press, 2006), p. 273.
[10] Ibid. p. 274. This was also happening in Britain and Ireland.
[11] David Noel Doyle, 'The Remaking of Irish America, 1845 - 1880' in J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey, eds., *Making the Irish American: History and Heritage of the Irish in the United States* (New York: New York University Press, 2006), p. 213.
[12] As Doyle (2006) states Irish Americans of the late nineteenth century became among the most urbanised people in the world. Ibid. p. 225.
[13] This was also true of immigrants from many other countries including Germany, Poland, Italy and China. John Tracey Ellis, *American Catholicism* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1969), p. 167.

still seen as an inferior class to the dominant Protestant-led society in the United States. In the face of anti-Catholic feeling they were made unwelcome and were subjected to ridicule, shunning and denial of opportunity.[14] The impact of this was the consolidation of Catholic Irish immigrants into communities where they looked after one another's needs. The Catholic Church became a powerful consolidating force which, in the face of anti-Catholic conflict, enabled the establishment of local schools, churches, hospitals and social care and community facilities.[15]

The majority of Irish immigrants in the latter decades of the nineteenth century could not read or write and hence many were locked into lower-paid work.[16] However, by the end of the century an increasing number of Irish Americans had overcome this and were working in better-paid skilled and semi-skilled jobs and becoming an integral part of American society.[17] Dolan (2010) attributes this advance to the endeavour of the children of immigrants who were able to absorb the Irish immigrant culture along with the 'new' American culture, enabling them to get better jobs than their immigrant parents.[18] The support mechanisms listed above also helped with this advancement. The number of Irish in America grew, with this next generation increasing the numbers of those with Irish heritage in society and by 1900 there were 3.37 million American-born Irish and 1.6 million Irish-born.[19] This new generation identified with a hybrid Irish emigrant and American culture.

The opportunities available to the Irish in America to progress both economically and within society were uneven across the United States. In east-coast states Irish Americans found it more difficult to advance than those in mid-west and western states. Society in east-coast cities, which were longer established, was Protestant, more rigidly class-structured and

[14] Chester Gillis, *A Brief History of Catholics in America* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), p. 60.
[15] McCaffrey also notes that there were elements of bigotry in the Irish, with attitudes of pro-slavery, anti-Jew and anti-black sentiment creeping in, as well as some hostility to other European Catholics. Lawrence McCaffrey, 'Ireland and Irish America: Connections and Disconnections', *U.S. Catholic Historian*, 22(3), (Summer, 2004), p. 5.
[16] Kerby A. Miller, *Emigrants and Exiles* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985), p. 351.
[17] Irene Whelan, 'Religious Rivalry and the Making of Irish-American Identity' in J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey, eds., *Making the Irish American: History and Heritage of the Irish in the United States* (New York: New York University Press, 2006), p. 281.
[18] Jay P. Dolan, *The Irish Americans: A History* (New York: Bloomsbury Press, 2010), p.92.
[19] Ibid.

more discriminatory against Irish Catholic workers.[20] An example can be found in the state of New England where, in 1900, an estimated seventy percent of male Irish immigrant workers were in unskilled jobs, compared to just thirty percent in California in the same year.[21] This situation favoured those willing to move to cities in the western United States where better prospects for work existed.[22]

Another factor which had an influence on Catholic immigrant economic progress was Catholic Church doctrine in relation to gaining material reward. Church leaders in eastern states were more inclined to sustain traditional Catholic beliefs and roles in relation to society, believing and teaching that the materialistic aspects of American culture were at odds with Catholic teaching. This approach was led by the Catholic Archbishop of New York, Rev. Michael Corrigan.[23] As McCaffrey (2004) observes, Corrigan and his colleagues taught Catholics to look for justice in the next world, not this one.[24] While Corrigan led many reforms in the Church in relation to church finances and dealing with multi-ethnic parishes, his antagonism to social change placed him and his fellow bishops in opposition to organised labour groups who were more concerned with the social and economic welfare of their members.[25]

The Catholic Archbishop of the Midwestern diocese of St Paul Minnesota, Rev. John Ireland, was more progressively-minded.[26] Ireland pushed for a more liberal approach to adapting to American life, promoting close working relationships with the labour movement to advance the social justice agenda. He was also open to interaction with non-Catholic groups and cooperated somewhat with the development of public schools.[27] A number of eastern-based bishops fought this approach by gaining support from Pope

[20] Ibid. p. 91.
[21] Ibid.
[22] Chapter Three (*Patronage*) describes how this westward migration and consequent growth in the Catholic population created a market for Irish stained glass in Western states.
[23] Born in 1839 to Irish immigrant parents, Corrigan was Archbishop of New York from 1885 until his death in 1902.
[24] Lawrence McCaffrey, 'Ireland and Irish America: Connections and Disconnections', *U.S. Catholic Historian*, 22(3), (Summer, 2004), p. 8.
[25] Ibid.
[26] Ireland was born in Ireland in 1838, his family emigrating to the United States in 1848. He was appointed Archbishop of St Paul in 1888, a position he held until his death in 1918.
[27] Public schools are funded by taxation whereas parochial schools are funded by parishes.

Leo XIII to brand 'Americanism' as a heresy.[28] Consequently, in addition to the struggles against nativism as practised by the incumbent dominant Anglo American society, there were also conflicting approaches to social guidance by Catholic Church leaders in different parts of the country.

While Anglo American cultural prejudice, poor education and limited access to financial support made it difficult for many Irish Americans to break into big business they found other ways of progressing in society. The growing power of Irish clergy in the Catholic Church was mirrored by Irish Americans who found pathways through labour organisations, politics, and through the civil services, including policing, teaching and healthcare to secure leadership roles in the wider community. In terms of politics, ambitious Irish Americans rose through the ranks of the Democratic Party, increasing their political power in many cities thus giving added voice to the causes of their own and other immigrants.[29]

Irish Americans were also prominent in popular sports such as boxing and baseball. As described by Wilcox:

> Searching for identity in a new home, Irish immigrants soon discovered that their participation in [sports such as] baseball pleased American leaders who saw it as their responsibility to forge a new and unified nation from thousands of culturally diverse immigrants. Immigrants also saw this as a ladder for socioeconomic advancement.[30]

Irish American baseball players such as Roger Connor, known for wearing a bright green shamrock stitched to his shirt, and Mike 'King' Kelly reached the top level of the sport in the late nineteenth century. Boxers such as James 'Yankee' Sullivan, John L Sullivan and 'Gentleman Jim' Corbett also became household names in the same period.[31]

---

[28] In this context Americanism was a term used to describe how leading American church leaders were perceived to be looking to American ideas of democracy and individualism and including those concepts in their theological teaching concepts. Ireland, and all US Bishops, denied that this was the case.
[29] Kevin Kenny, *The American Irish* (London: Routledge, 2014), p. 162.
[30] Ralph Wilcox, 'Irish Americans in Sports' in J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey (eds) *Making the Irish American* (New York: New York University 2006), p. 443.
[31] Timothy J. Meagher, *The Columbia Guide to Irish American History* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2005), p. 105.

However, in some popular cultural media publications the Irish continued to be portrayed in negative fashion such as ape-like barbarians in Thomas Nast's *Harper's Weekly* cartoons (figure 84).[32] Nast's portrayal of the Irish, often as a coarse, ignorant, brutal and comical element of society, reflected his belief that, as Halloran (2013) describes, Irish immigrants could not integrate into the culture of civic duty, personal responsibility, and educated progress that Nast believed American democracy required.[33] Curtis (1971) asserts that the reason Nast may have taken that view was that he saw the Irish as representing corruption, bossism, racial and religious (i.e. Roman Catholic) bigotry in American society.[34] However, with the rising stature of the Irish towards the close of the nineteenth century this brutish image of the Irish was changing.

Another enabler of the advancement of the Irish in American society was the influx of new waves of immigrants from Eastern and Southern Europe in the late nineteenth century. Dolan (2010) contends that the presence of these new arrivals made the Irish a comparatively more acceptable group in society as they originated from the British Isles and were by then primarily English-speaking. The nativist attitudes which had led to the discriminatory treatment that the Irish experienced in the mid-nineteenth century were revived and applied to these new arrivals.[35] As a result, opportunities became available to Irish Americans which enabled many of them to break out from the poorer levels of society to become more 'middle class'. As McCaffrey (2004) observes, they increasingly left their bleak overcrowded tenement surroundings for more pleasant urban neighbourhoods.[36] As the twentieth century dawned, those that identified as Irish were equipped to achieve the respectability they yearned for in American society.

---

[32] *Harpers Weekly* was an American weekly periodical which was published in New York between 1857 and 1916. It had a circulation of up to 200,000 and featured politically topical articles, cartoons and illustrations. This cartoon was published on 18th November 1871. It depicts a man cutting open goose labelled "Democratic Party" as Catholic clergyman recoils at the action. Eggs labelled "Parish school," "City council," "St. Bridget," etc., are on shelf in the background. The cartoon is a satirical comment on the close relationship between the Democratic Party and the Catholic Church at the time, and the greed of the Irish American.
[33] Fiona Deans Halloran, *Thomas Nast: The Father of Modern Political Cartoons (*Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2012), p. 33.
[34] Lee Perry Curtis, *Apes and Angels: The Irishman in Victorian Caricature* (Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1971), p. 58.
[35] Jay P. Dolan, *The Irish Americans: A History* (New York: Bloomsbury Press, 2010), p.104.
[36] Lawrence McCaffrey, 'Ireland and Irish America: Connections and Disconnections', *U.S. Catholic Historian*, 22(3), (Summer, 2004), p. 5.

4.3. Irish Americans in the Twentieth Century

The early twentieth century saw a change in the status of Irish Americans as they continued to shake off the image of an uneducated, disruptive group in society. By 1900 the number of second and third generation Irish outnumbered those who were Irish-born, with an estimated sixty-six percent of Irish Americans having been born in America.[37] Therefore, the majority of Irish Americans did not have immediate ties to Ireland, and with this distancing came a change in their attitude to living in the United States. While many Irish Americans retained attachment to their Irish roots by practising Irish social traditions such as language, sport, song and dance, they did so as American citizens.[38] The primary focus for many Irish Americans as the century progressed was to move on from having a distinct national identity in a multicultural society to become committed to ethnic pluralism, and consequently to become better Americans.[39]

Three factors allowed them to improve their status in society and move up the social and economic ladder – the common causes and interests that bound them together as an influential group in American society, societal changes that created opportunities for advancement, and an improved public perception of the Irish, each of which will now be considered.

4.3.1. *Common Bonds*

Strong support networks such as fraternal organisations, political party membership, social societies and Catholic church-centred groups existed which bound Irish Americans together and created opportunities to share and support their progress in society. Many supported shared political and nationalist causes by joining organisations such as Clan na Gael, the Friends of Irish Freedom and the Association for the Recognition of the Irish Republic.[40] Another important support avenue was through membership of

[37] Thomas J. Shelley, 'Twentieth-Century American Catholicism and Irish Americans' in J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey (eds) *Making the Irish American* (New York: New York University 2006), p. 575.
[38] Dolan describes one example at St Peters parish San Francisco where the Irish-born Pastor, Rev. Peter Yorke, sponsored classes in Irish language, dancing and music. Jay P. Dolan, *The Irish Americans*: *A History* (New York: Bloomsbury Press, 2008), p. 127.
[39] Matthew O'Brien, 'Hibernians on the March: Irish America and Ethnic Patriotism in the Mid-Twentieth Century', *Éire-Ireland*, Vol. 40 (1&2), (2005), p. 170.
[40] Michael Doorley, *The Friends of Irish Freedom: a case-study in Irish-American nationalism, 1916–20,* published online at https://www.historyireland.com/20th-century-contemporary-

Irish American fraternal associations such as the Ancient Order of Hibernians and the Knights of Columbus.[41] Yet another significant binding force for many of these Irish Americans was the practice of their Catholicism in their local parishes. Dolan (2008) argues that by the early years of the twentieth century religion outdid ethnicity as a means of defining this group as Irish Americans.[42] Although still identified as Irish, their Catholicism defined who they were. As the influence of the Catholic Church in American society increased through the first half of the twentieth century, so did the influence of the Irish who dominated church leadership positions.[43] While many Catholics were not Irish or of Irish descent, and not all Irish were practising Catholics, being Catholic and being Irish became synonymous with one another. This was influenced by the extent of Irish religious authority in the American Catholic Church and the faithfulness of Irish American Catholics to practising their religion in their local parish. As Dolan (2007) observes, it also mirrored in the United States the association of Irish nationalism with the Catholic Church in Ireland.[44] As noted by Miller (1985) "in the United States, as in Ireland, Catholicism became the central institution of Irish life and the primary source of expression of Irish identity".[45]

4.3.2. *Changes in American Society*

The significant societal changes that emerged in the first half of the twentieth century included changes to American immigration policies in the 1920s, the impact of two World Wars and the availability of economic and educational opportunities which arose in the post-Great Depression period– all of which were taken advantage of by many Irish Americans. In addition, as evidence of their increasing agency in American society, Irish Americans

---

history/the-friends-of-irish-freedom-a-case-study-in-irish-american-nationalism-1916-21/ (accessed on 3rd April 2020).

[41] The Ancient Order of Hibernians is a Catholic fraternal organisation whose purpose was to unite, defend and assist Irish Americans. The Knights of Columbus was founded in 1882 on the principles of charity, unity and fraternity. It was founded to meet the needs of immigrants, refugees and families suffering from the death of a breadwinner.

[42] Jay P. Dolan, *The Irish Americans*: *A History* (New York: Bloomsbury Press, 2008), p. 105.

[43] Jay P. Dolan, *The Irish Americans*: *A History* (New York: Bloomsbury Press, 2008), p. 106. Through the first half of the twentieth century seventy-five percent of Bishops in the United States were Irish-born or of Irish descent. Charles R. Morris, *American Catholic: The Saints and Sinners Who Built America's Most Powerful Church* (New York: Knopf Doubleday Publishing Group, 2011), p. 52.

[44] Dolan comments that "Daniel O'Connell's campaign for Catholic Emancipation linked Ireland's national identity with Catholicism so tightly that it became the identifying trademark of what it meant to be Irish". Jay P. Dolan, 'The Irish Parish', *U.S. Catholic Historian*, Vol. 25(2), (Spring, 2007), p. 16.

[45] Kerby A. Miller, *Emigrants and Exiles* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985), p. 526.

continued to grow their power in institutions such as the Catholic Church, political parties, the labour movement and the civil service. Furthermore, a more positive perception of the Irish was portrayed in several strands of American popular life such as radio, television, cinema, stage and sport. These factors combined to enable Irish Americans to prove their value as citizens and to take opportunities to advance both socially, economically and culturally in twentieth-century American society. This section explores these changes in more detail, ultimately focusing on how this progress was reflected in the public sphere. Specifically, how the commissioning and importation of Irish-made art and crafts, such as that made by Clarke Studios for a number of US church-building projects, demonstrated to wider American society the sophisticated nature of the Irish, in terms of heritage, culture and capability.

Twentieth Century Immigration

As noted, one phenomenon which helped Irish Americans move up in society was the wave of new immigrants from Eastern and Southern Europe who had entered the U.S. at the end of the nineteenth century. These new arrivals were at a disadvantage to the more established, English-speaking, earlier generations of immigrants and in most cases they came in at the lower end of the economic ladder. This influx of poorer émigrés allowed many Irish Americans to move from their inferior accommodation and districts into better housing and areas, often in newly developing suburbs of larger cities.[46] The local suburban parish church - rather than the solidarity of physical close-living communities - became a unifying force for Catholic Irish Americans. As many of these parishes were staffed with priests from Ireland it was the Irish who were often seen as leaders in their neighbourhood, providing for their religious practice needs, the educational needs of their children, organising social events, charity work and offering spiritual and moral guidance. An important aspect of these activities was that they helped to cement an Irish American identity which may otherwise have been lost or diluted with the move to the suburbs. This was true even though many other nationalities were also represented in those same communities.

[46] Jay P. Dolan, *The Irish Americans*: *A History* (New York: Bloomsbury Press, 2008), p. 104.

Many of the new mainland European arrivals preferred to maintain their identification with their 'old world'. The Irish, with their better command of the English language, integrated with and adapted more quickly to American society.[47] Alternatively newly arrived Italians, for example, worked to keep alive their own national traditions such as holy festivals and carnival celebrations.[48] However, because of their leadership position in many parish communities, the Irish played a significant role in the induction of newcomers, particularly in developing cities where Irish American attitudes and values shaped the Americanisation of the newer immigrants.[49] Consequently, this Americanisation of newly arrived Catholics was characterised by distinctly Irish influences – more specifically through their educational institutions, devotional practices and Irish cultural symbolism. At work and at school, in the labour movement and in politics, on the vaudeville theatre stage and through popular music, these immigrants encountered an 'American' culture that was heavily invested with Irish American experience and ideas. Their accumulated social capital allowed the Irish to ensure that Americanisation was, for many new immigrants, "Irish Americanisation".[50] This also contributed to an enhanced patriotic image of Irish Americans as they worked to admit new ethnic groups into the core of the American national identity.[51] As Jeffrey Burns (2008) points out, church leaders sought to make good, practical American Catholics of immigrants, quoting Los Angeles archbishop John Cantwell, "In making better Catholics of them, we shall be making better citizens of them."[52]

In the 1920s, as a response to increasing anti-immigrant sentiment, the United States Congress passed new laws that severely limited the number of

[47] Although many Irish immigrants in the nineteenth century spoke the Irish language, they also understood and spoke English which by that time was becoming the dominant language in Ireland. Jeffrey Kallan notes that this contributed substantially to the process of language shift after immigrants arrived in North America. Jeffrey L. Kallen, 'Irish as an American Ethnic Language' in Thomas W. Ihde (ed) *The Irish Language in America* (Westport CT: Bergin and Garvey, 1994), p. 33.
[48] Julie Byrne, *Roman Catholics and the American Mainstream in the Twentieth Century*, http://nationalhumanitiescenter.org/tserve/twenty/tkeyinfo/tmainstr.htm (accessed on 3rd April 2020).
[49] James R. Barrett and David R. Roediger, 'The Irish and the "Americanization" of the "New Immigrants" in the Streets and in the Churches of the Urban United States, 1900-1930', *Journal of American Ethnic History*, Vol. 24(4), (Summer, 2005), p. 6.
[50] Ibid. p. 26.
[51] Matthew O'Brien, 'Hibernians on the March: Irish America and Ethnic Patriotism in the Mid-Twentieth Century', *Éire-Ireland*, Volume 40:1&2, (2005), p. 171.
[52] Quoted in Steven M. Avella, *Sacramento and the Catholic Church* (Reno: University of Nevada Press, 2008), p. 122.

immigrants allowed into the country and the number of new Irish immigrants reduced significantly.[53] These laws were a reaction to a post-World War I economic recession which left many Americans fearful of the numbers of (mostly poor) migrants coming from Europe and from Asia. As a result, the number of Irish immigrants that arrived in the United States during the 1920s numbered 220,000, a significant reduction on the 339,000 who had migrated in the first decade of the century.[54] The numbers reduced even more considerably in the 1930s, with less than 10,000 new Irish immigrants arriving. This reduction further increased the proportion of American-born Irish Americans over those born in Ireland.

As Dolan (2008) describes, Irish Americans wanted to be accepted as one hundred percent Americans, "as patriots not Paddies".[55] Being American was one element of their identity, as was their ethnic Irish background, their religion and their place in society. However, as they became more committed American citizens, many did not abandon their Irish heritage, seeing their identity with both as integral. Their heritage continued to be an important element of their self-identity, but the basis of that identity shifted away from their land of origin to become more firmly rooted in American patriotism.[56] Dolan (2008) observes that through the mid-twentieth century the desire to have a separate Irish identity was waning as being American became more important than being Irish.[57] For Americans of Irish descent, Ireland, while relevant, had become but a point of ethnic reference in a multicultural America.[58]

The Great Depression and Recovery

The 1920s, a period known as the 'Roaring Twenties', was a time of economic prosperity which brought benefits for many American citizens. However, the advent of the Great Depression which followed the Wall Street Crash of 1929 initiated a decade long period of economic recession and

[53] The Immigration Act of 1924 (The Johnson-Reed Act) limited the number of immigrants allowed entry into the United States through a national origins quota system.
[54] Jay P. Dolan, *The Irish Americans*: *A History* (New York: Bloomsbury Press, 2008), p. 217.
[55] Ibid. p. 105.
[56] Ibid. p. 221.
[57] Ibid. p. 105.
[58] Matthew J. O'Brien, *Irishness in Great Britain and the United States: Transatlantic and Cross-channel Migration Networks and Irish Ethnicity, 1920-90* (Madison: University of Wisconsin, 2001), p. 393.

recovery. As a result, the United States was no longer viewed as the land of opportunity it had once been. The effect of the economic collapse was to bring a period of high unemployment, poverty, business stagnation and reducing incomes. Many Irish suffered during this period, particularly those who were blue-collar workers.[59] However, as McCaffrey (2004) observes, as many others were employed as teachers, nurses, policemen, firemen, railroad workers and government officials, they survived better than some other, less educated, groups.[60]

The political reaction to these circumstances came in the form of President Franklin D. Roosevelt's (1882 – 1945) New Deal programme which aimed to stimulate the economy while working towards improving the wages, working conditions, and lifetime security of workers. To form his New Deal policies Roosevelt brought together people from a range of social and ethnic backgrounds as advisors. He not only engaged members of the 'knowledge community' such as professors of law, economics and social sciences, including qualified individuals with Irish and Jewish immigrant backgrounds and those working directly with the labouring classes.[61] The legislation aspired to introduce a measure of social justice for the lower paid workers in American society. Some of the ideas which drove New Deal originated in social writing by an Irish American priest Fr. John A. Ryan in 1917.[62] His ideas about societal improvement included proposals for post-World War I reforms such as the introduction of a minimum wage, equal pay, public housing, sickness insurance and collective bargaining for workers.[63] While Ryan's proposals may have been deemed too socialist when first published, many of his 'Social Reconstruction' concepts became elements of Roosevelt's New Deal programme fifteen years later.[64]

---

[59] Thomas J. Shelley, 'Twentieth-Century American Catholicism and Irish Americans' in J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey (eds) *Making the Irish American* (New York: New York University 2006), p. 590.
[60] Lawrence McCaffrey, 'Ireland and Irish America: Connections and Disconnections', *U.S. Catholic Historian*, Vol. 22 (3), (Summer, 2004), p. 12. The impact of the recession was also felt in Ireland as the amounts of gifts and remittances to relatives back in Ireland reduced dramatically. Jay P. Dolan, *The Irish Americans*: *A History* (New York: Bloomsbury Press, 2008), p. 218.
[61] Michael Janeway, *The Fall of the House of Roosevelt: Brokers of Ideas and Power from FDR to LBJ* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2004), p. 39.
[62] Ryan was born in 1859 to Irish parents in Minnesota. He was ordained a priest in 1898 and spent most of his career at Catholic University of America in Washington D.C.
[63] Ryan's ideas were published in 1917 by the National Catholic War Council, an organisation set up by the Catholic Bishops in the United States to support the war effort.
[64] Kevin Kenny, *The American Irish* (London: Routledge, 2014), p. 204.

During his 1932 campaign for the United States presidency, Roosevelt invited Fr. Ryan to contribute views on various areas of public policy. Ryan agreed and through the 1930s actively supported Roosevelt both privately and publicly. Fr. Ryan saw New Deal as a practical implementation of the papal social teaching he had reflected in his writing.[65] Roosevelt enacted many of Ryan's proposals through New Deal legislation, including the Wagner Act (which gave federal recognition to trades unions), the Social Security Act (giving old-age and unemployment insurance), and the Fair Labor Act (providing for a minimum wage and hours).[66] Prominent Irish American Catholic politicians such as Thomas J Walsh, James A Farley and Edward J Flynn also contributed to and supported the programme.[67] As a result, Irish Americans were publicly associated with progressive political, social and economic change, their national visibility becoming more pronounced.

Under New Deal, economic developments in Midwest and West Coast cities provided opportunities away from Anglo American strongholds in the east of the country. The western states, and in particular California, benefitted from investment in new industries such as engineering and armaments. Gold mining had attracted many to California in the nineteenth century, and later in that century the railroads paved the way for people to relocate to the West. The discovery of oil in the 1890s, especially in Los Angeles, brought an economic boom to the region, creating jobs and swelling the population.[68] Now, the New Deal programme was bringing new worker-intensive industries to the region. The resulting boom in population not only created economic opportunities for Irish Americans but also created the need for new social infrastructure, including schools and churches, to serve the influx

[65] Thomas J. Shelley, 'Twentieth-Century American Catholicism and Irish Americans' in J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey (eds) *Making the Irish American* (New York: New York University 2006), p. 591.
[66] Kevin Kenny, *The American Irish* (London: Routledge, 2014), p. 206.
[67] Walsh was made Attorney General by Roosevelt in 1933, Farley and Flynn were chief advisors to Roosevelt, the former being appointed as US Postmaster General in 1933. Roosevelt also appointed a number of Irish Americans to prominent positions in the judicial system. For example, he named an Irish Catholic, former Michigan governor and United States attorney general, Frank Murphy, to the United States Supreme Court. Jay P. Dolan, *The Irish Americans*: *A History* (New York: Bloomsbury Press, 2008), p. 256.
[68] Between 1900 and 1910 the population of Los Angeles increased from 102,000 to 320,000. Source: https://www2.census.gov/library/publications/decennial/1910/volume-1/volume-1-p3.pdf (accessed 14th August, 2020).

of people. A consequence of this growth was an increase in the visibility of Irish-led church building projects led by Irish American Catholic leaders such as aforementioned Archbishop of Los Angeles, Rev. John Cantwell.[69]

Another Catholic priest who came into prominence to provide social guidance in the 1930s was Fr. Charles Coughlin (1891 – 1979), nicknamed the 'Radio Priest'. Born in Canada to Irish parents, he began broadcasting on a Detroit radio station (WJR) in 1926.[70] By 1932 Fr. Coughlin, who maintained an Irish accent, attracted thirty to forty million listeners to his weekly radio broadcast from his church in Royal Oak, Michigan.[71] As Shannon describes, he addressed the subject of (Irish) Catholics not knowing how to deal with the Depression with "energy, assurance and an unceasing flow of colourful, exciting verbiage".[72] He made religion relevant to people by emphasising the socially revolutionary aspects of Christian teaching. In a broadcast he stated "I glory in the fact that I am a simple Catholic priest endeavouring to inject Christianity into the fabric of an economic system woven upon the loom of the greedy."[73] His popular broadcasts in the early part of his radio career brought an Irish Catholic voice into the public consciousness during the 1930s.

4.3.3. *Post World War II Opportunities*

Many Irish American Catholics enlisted in the United States military to serve in World War II, showing their commitment to American society and bolstering their image as committed patriots. At the start of the war, prominent republican Irish American opinion, as voiced by the American Friends of Irish Neutrality, faced two challenges – defending Ireland's stance on neutrality and supporting Britain as an ally in combatting Germany's aggression.[74] The Japanese attack on Pearl Harbour in December 1941 made

[69] Archbishop John Joseph Cantwell (1874 – 1947) was born in Limerick and grew up in Tipperary. He was ordained a priest and moved to San Francisco in 1899. He was appointed as the first Bishop of Los Angeles in 1917.
[70] Timothy J. Meagher *The Columbia Guide to Irish American History* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2005), p. 140.
[71] Thomas J. Shelley, 'Twentieth-Century American Catholicism and Irish Americans' in J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey (eds) *Making the Irish American* (New York: New York University 2006), p. 590.
[72] William V. Shannon, *The American Irish* (New York: McMillan, 1966), p.304.
[73] Quoted in William V. Shannon, *The American Irish* (New York: McMillan, 1966), p.304.
[74] Matthew J. O'Brien, Wartime Revisions of Irish American Catholicism: Stars, Stripes, and Shamrocks, *U.S. Catholic Historian*, Vol. 22(3), (Summer, 2004), p. 79. The American Friends

these debates redundant and the old-world campaigns of Irish republicanism gave way to Irish America's commitment to defending the new-world of the United States.[75]

The proportion of Catholics who enlisted for military service was higher than their proportion of the general American population, with an estimated thirty to forty percent of men and women who served in the armed forces during World War II being Catholic.[76] The Vicar to the armed forces was the then Archbishop of New York, Rev. Francis Spellman.[77] He was a prominent figure in the American Catholic Church, and highly regarded during and after the war. Spellman, whose grandparents were Irish immigrants, was born in the United States and although he was regarded as Irish, his own preference was to be called American.[78] His high-profile work during the war helped strengthen the image of American Catholicism as a pillar and protector of patriotism.

O'Brien (2004) recounts how two Irish American Catholic newspapers, *Irish World* and *The Gaelic American*, both of which were printed in New York, supported the military action and continually praised the record and sacrifices made by patriotic Irish Americans in the war effort. Newspaper articles listed the record of service among Irish American soldiers, sailors and airmen, and included excerpts of speeches made by prominent Irish American leaders such as Judge Melvyn Cronin's address to the Ancient Order of Hibernian San Francisco Chapter on Memorial Day 1943:

> Memorial Day is a typical American institution and custom.... It is fitting and proper, then, that today we, as Americans-and particularly as Irish-Americans-should pause with all our fellow Americans for a period to dwell upon the memory of the illustrious dead who gave their lives for their country, in the toil and moil of life.... Well may we be pardoned if we take pride in the patriotism, sacrifice, and heroism

---

of Irish Neutrality was established in the U.S. to promote Ireland's independent stance on neutrality.

[75] Ibid.

[76] Chester Gillis, *Roman Catholicism in America* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999), p. 76.

[77] Cardinal Francis Spellman was Archbishop of New York from 1939 until his death in 1967.

[78] Thomas J. Shelley, 'Twentieth-Century American Catholicism and Irish Americans' in J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey (eds) *Making the Irish American* (New York: New York University 2006), p. 597.

> of those of Irish blood and lineage who have fought, bled and died in the service of the United States of America.[79]

Almeida (2006) observes that overall, the Irish performed admirably in the war, putting to rest any lingering fears about their allegiance, patriotism and commitment to America.[80]

In the aftermath of World War II President Roosevelt introduced a set of measures which were intended to reward and support demobilised servicemen. The 1944 Serviceman's Readjustment Act (known as the G.I. Bill) triggered a post-World War II social revolution, with Irish Americans as significant beneficiaries. One important aspect of the G.I. Bill was that it gave college tuition support for those returning from military service after the war. The legislation also supported highway construction, home ownership and mortgage financing, which in turn made significant contributions to the rapid growth of suburbanisation in the United States. These measures provided war veterans with an opportunity to steer their way through society under their own power.[81]

Like other urban immigrant communities, Irish Americans took full advantage of the opportunities presented by the new laws and were able to subsequently climb further up the occupational and social ladder.[82] This new age of prosperity saw wages and salaries double, and it was a time for urban renewal with many cities being regenerated. This rising tide of affluence lifted many, now well-educated and successful, Irish Americans into the middle class.[83] For many, these advances enabled them to be the first of their family to attend college and purchase their own home, their Catholic

---

[79] 'Irishmen Have Fought and Died for This Land and Helped to Preserve Her Freedom', *Irish World*, 19th June, 1943, p. 3, quoted in Matthew J. O'Brien, Wartime Revisions of Irish American Catholicism: Stars, Stripes, and Shamrocks, *U.S. Catholic Historian*, Vol. 22(3), (Summer, 2004), p. 82.
[80] Linda Dowling Almeida, 'Irish America 1940 – 2000' in J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey (eds) *Making the Irish American* (New York: New York University 2006), p. 550.
[81] A significant aspect of the new initiatives introduced by the G.I. Bill was that it was now the State that was funding these employment measures. O'Brien comments that for generations patronage jobs had provided the glue to keep Irish American political networks together, but this loss of control to federal agencies meant that local allegiances were supplanted by a more general affinity for Roosevelt, and subsequent stronger ties to the Democratic Party. Matthew J. O'Brien, Wartime Revisions of Irish American Catholicism: Stars, Stripes, and Shamrocks, *U.S. Catholic Historian*, Vol. 22(3), (Summer, 2004), p. 77.
[82] Kevin Kenny, *The American Irish* (London: Routledge, 2014), p. 226.
[83] Jay P. Dolan, *The Irish Americans*: *A History* (New York: Bloomsbury Press, 2008), p. 226.

school education facilitating their taking advantage of same over other less integrated groups.[84] As McCaffrey (1985) summarises, among American ethnic groups at the beginning of the 1950s only Jewish people were sending a higher proportion (fifty-nine percent) of their children to college, compared to the Irish at forty-three percent.[85]

Access to third-level education and subsequent higher paid employment gave a significant number of Irish Americans the opportunity to move into the more affluent urban and suburban neighbourhoods. There they continued to mix and associate with those from other ethnic backgrounds, adding to the increasing pluralism of mid-twentieth century American society. The post-war economic boom and consequent population boom in the Western states also required the building of new suburbs with new schools, new hospitals and new churches. In the context of this research, this need for new Catholic churches, aligned with the dominant presence of Irish clergy and growing economic resources of (Irish American) Catholic communities, enabled the patronage of new building projects and it provided opportunities for material expressions of their Irish American cultural identity.

O'Brien observes that these wartime experiences meant the transformation of Irish American ethnicity rather than its demise.[86] The impact of World War II was to consolidate the bond of Irish Americans to America, and their position in society. By the 1960s, the evidence was clear that Irish America was now a solid, middle-class community, with its fair share of millionaires, political and civic leaders, academics, and with many entries in '*Who's Who'* in America.[87]

[84] Lawrence McCaffrey, 'Ireland and Irish America: Connections and Disconnections', *U.S. Catholic Historian*, Vol. 22(3), (Summer, 2004), p. 13.
[85] Lawrence McCaffrey, 'Irish America', *The Wilson Quarterly,* Vol. 9(2), (Spring, 1985), p. 89.
[86] Matthew J. O'Brien, Wartime Revisions of Irish American Catholicism: Stars, Stripes, and Shamrocks, *U.S. Catholic Historian*, Vol. 22(3), (Summer, 2004), p. 90.
[87] Lawrence McCaffrey, 'Irish America', *The Wilson Quarterly,* Vol. 9(2), (Spring, 1985), p. 89.

4.3.4. *The Irish in Public Life*

The American Catholic Church

Through the first half of the twentieth century Catholicism remained central to Irish American culture and the Irish continued to dominate the church hierarchy.[88] According to Morris (1997), seventy-five percent of the priests who were consecrated as bishops in the United States in the first half of the century were Irish or of Irish descent.[89] Furthermore, as Dolan (2008) observes, by the nineteen-twenties, the Roman Catholic Church and Irish America had achieved a high status and acceptance across the country and Catholicism came to define what it meant to be Irish.[90] However, as previously stated, it was now the American-born Irish, not the immigrant, who was now defining what it meant to be Irish and Catholic in the United States. They strove to reflect an image which strengthened their credentials as progressive members of society by building new schools and hospitals, staffing those institutions, building churches to bring communities together, organising social events to bring people together, and reaching out as leaders to all Catholic members of the community, no matter what their ethnic background was.[91] The social institutions created under the umbrella of the Catholic Church helped all their members to find more avenues for social advancement, leadership, community service, and respect than may have been possible in the broader community.[92]

While many Irish men served as priests and pastors in parishes, an even greater number of women served as religious sisters, working primarily in schools and hospitals. Sisters outnumbered priests by more than three to one, working as teachers, nurses and administrators in catholic schools and

[88] Kevin Kenny, *The American Irish* (London: Routledge, 2014), p. 204.
[89] The ethnic background of American bishops consecrated between 1850 and 1910 shows the rise in Irish influence. From the 1850s through the 1880s, the Irish, including native priests of Irish descent, accounted for half the consecrations, rising to 60 percent in the 1890s, and to 75 percent by the early 1900s, where it remained until the 1960s. Charles R. Morris, *American Catholic: The Saints and Sinners Who Built America's Most Powerful Church* (New York: Random House, 1997), p. 52.
[90] Jay P. Dolan, *The Irish Americans*: *A History* (New York: Bloomsbury Press, 2008), p. 217.
[91] The multi-ethnic character of parishes is described in Chapter Three (*Patronage*) *The Demand for Priests and Religious.*
[92] Charles Hirschman, 'The Role of Religion in the Origins and Adaptation of Immigrant Groups in the United States', *The International Migration Review*, Vol. 38 (3), (Autumn, 2004), p. 1229.

charitable institutions.[93] Religious Orders such as the Presentation Sisters, the Sisters of Mercy and Sisters of Charity had a strong presence in many cities in the United States where they educated children and cared for the sick and poor. Many of these women were Irish-born, entering convents in Ireland where they trained to work as missionaries across the world, including the United States. Their work in education and healthcare, particularly in areas where immigrant communities existed, represented a professional aspect of Catholic outreach with which Irish American clergy and nuns were strongly associated. One of the benefits to Ireland of the strong presence of Irish American priests and religious sisters in the Catholic Church was their influence in the promotion of Irish-made goods in the United States, including Irish stained glass in the 1950s and '60s, as will be explored further anon.

Politics

Through the early twentieth century the second and third generation Irish sought to participate in American institutions and society on an equal footing with 'mainstream' Americans, without sacrificing their religious identity. While there was generally more acceptance of the role of the Catholic Church in American society, a rising tide of anti-Catholic and anti-immigrant sentiment in the 1920s led by regional hate-groups such as the Ku Klux Klan made this a more challenging objective.[94] That group, with its base in Southern white Protestant areas of the country, re-emerged in the 1920s and targeted black people, Catholics, Jews and immigrants. Their intent was to defend themselves from what their members saw as attacks on the social fabric of their nation by external forces.[95] In response to such harassment, in addition to their involvement in the Catholic Church and their own ethnic institutions, Irish Americans joined organisations that served as defences and as bridges between their community and mainstream society, especially the labour movement and the Democratic Party.[96]

[93] Thomas J. Shelley, 'Twentieth-Century American Catholicism and Irish Americans' in J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey (eds) *Making the Irish American* (New York: New York University 2006), p. 580.
[94] Lynn Dumenil 'The Tribal Twenties: "Assimilated" Catholics' Response to Anti-Catholicism in the 1920s', *Journal of American Ethnic History*, Vol. 11 (1), (Autumn, 1991), p. 23.
[95] Jay P. Dolan, *The Irish Americans*: *A History* (New York: Bloomsbury Press, 2008), p. 211.
[96] Kevin Kenny, *The American Irish* (London: Routledge, 2014), p. 261.

McCaffrey observes that while anti-Catholics were drawn to the Republican Party, Democratic Party politicians welcomed Irish immigrants, organising welcoming parties at immigration offices as migrants arrived in the country, providing them with jobs and speeding their naturalisation.[97] In return, the Irish not only voted for their sponsors in elections, but joined the party and rose to powerful positions in many urban-based political organisations, ultimately wielding strong influence at national level.[98] In 1928 the Governor of New York Al Smith became first Catholic to run for President, declaring himself a "devout Catholic since childhood" when defending himself against an anti-Catholic attack during his campaign.[99] Smith represented the new generation emerging in the early twentieth century who were redefining what it meant to be Irish in America – proudly Catholic whilst asserting they were as American as the descendants of the puritans.[100] Although he lost the 1928 Presidential election, Smith was an example of how Catholic Irish Americans continued to gain power as leaders in the world of national politics.

In the 1930s the Irish American presence in leadership positions in the Democratic Party solidified when Franklin D Roosevelt came into power, inviting, as discussed previously, a number of them into his administration.[101] The ultimate manifestation of that power and influence was when the Democratic Party put forward John F Kennedy as their candidate in the 1960 United States Presidential election, a contest he won which made him the first Irish American, and the first Catholic, to hold that office.

4.3.5. *Portrayal of Irish in Popular Media and Culture*

Irish Americans engaged with, and utilised channels which continued to break down negative stereotypes and present an image which, while it was not always overtly Irish, was of Irish origin, and one that was appealing to

[97] Lawrence McCaffrey, 'Irish Americans' in John D. Buenker and Lorman A. Ratner (eds) *Multiculturalism in the United States: A Comparative Guide to Acculturation* and Ethnicity (Connecticut: Greenwood, 2005), p. 208.
[98] Ibid.
[99] Thomas J. Shelley '"What the Hell Is an Encyclical?: Governor Alfred E. Smith, Charles C. Marshall, Esq., and Father Francis P. Duffy', *U.S. Catholic Historian*, Vol. 15 (2), (Spring, 1997), p. 97.
[100] Jay P. Dolan, *The Irish Americans*: *A History* (New York: Bloomsbury Press, 2008), p. 217.
[101] As previously outlined in section 4.3.2 on post-Great Depression America.

an audience that was not exclusively Irish American, and not exclusively Catholic. Identifiably Irish American personalities became popular with the wider American public through cinema and television, becoming an established part of the mainstream of American cultural life.[102]

Cinema

The increasingly positive consideration of the Irish American Catholics was added to by their treatment in cinema, particularly in the 1930s and '40s. Some of the most popular movies of the time portrayed Irish American characters as fair-minded, socially just, skilled and patriotic people, looking out for those in need and generally doing the right thing. Actors such as James Cagney, Spencer Tracey, Bing Crosby, Barry Fitzgerald and Pat O'Brien generally played benevolent characters loyal to their country and loyal to their people be they workers, churchmen, lawbreakers, in military service or, in the case of Cagney, the bad guy with a heart of gold. Examples of their success include Spencer Tracy, who won the Best Actor Oscar for *Boys Town* (1938) in which he played a role based on the real-life work of Rev. Edward Flanagan who worked with a group of underprivileged boys. James Cagney won the Best Actor Oscar in 1943 for his performance portraying the Irish American entertainer and songwriter George Cohan. The 1944 movie *Going My Way*, a light-hearted, optimistic story of the a New York City Catholic parish starring Barry Fitzgerald and Bing Crosby, won seven Oscars, including one each for the Fitzgerald and Crosby, as well as the award for Best Picture.

The Catholic priest was often portrayed as the hero, and was generally Irish.[103] These acting parts enhanced the positive aspects of an Irish, synonymously Catholic, role in society breaking away from old images of an enclosed, self-serving ethnic group. As McCaffrey (2005) states, during the Great Depression and World War II years, audiences packing movie houses saw an on-screen (Irish) Catholicism, that was a constructive rather than a dangerous, alien force in American life.[104] As Dolan (2008) observes, the

[102] In addition to the popular portrayal in cinema and television appearances, Irish Americans also became well known in the literary arts, popular music, stage, sports and on radio.
[103] Jay P. Dolan, *The Irish Americans*: *A History* (New York: Bloomsbury Press, 2008), p. 231.
[104] Lawrence McCaffrey, 'Irish Americans' in John D. Buenker and Lorman A. Ratner (eds) *Multiculturalism in the United States: A Comparative Guide to Acculturation* and Ethnicity (Connecticut: Greenwood, 2005), p. 212.

movies promoted values that most Americans found appealing – loyalty, hard work, kindness and strong community spirit with the result that Catholic meant Irish in the popular mind.[105]

Berg (2002) comments that this complimentary treatment of Irish Americans in cinema was indicative of the power Irish Americans had achieved in Hollywood, both as actors and as movie-makers, and that this power was a consequence of the numbers of Irish Americans as a percentage of the overall US population.[106] He observes that the numbers of Irish working in Hollywood created a space for them to make "overt statements of ethnic pride".[107] This situation allowed Irish American directors such as John Ford, John Huston and Raoul Walsh to relate stories about the Irish experience from their own point of view.[108]

Berg also contends that from an audience point-of-view, seeing Irish Americans operating so successfully in this arena must have given a sense of pride to all Irish Americans as they saw some of their own people dominating aspects of the movie world.[109] Even though popular movies like *Singin' in the Rain* (1952) (co-directed by Gene Kelly and starring Kelly, Donald O'Connor and Debbie Reynolds) did not contain overtly Irish characters or themes, the presence of Irish actors and directors indicated how embedded Irish Americans had become in mainstream American culture.[110] This positive aspect of Irish artistic success was both a symptom and a cause of Irish American pride in their heritage and the part they played in everyday American life. For neutrals, the Irish element was just a part of the movie – and by extension, the national landscape.

---

[105] Jay P. Dolan, *The Irish Americans*: *A History* (New York: Bloomsbury Press, 2008), p. 231.
[106] Charles Berg, *Latino Images in Film* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2002), p. 267.
[107] Ibid. p. 268.
[108] Movies included Ford's Irish Republican Army drama *The Informer* (1935) and a trilogy based on Irish short stories *The Rising of the Moon* (1957).
[109] Charles Berg, *Latino Images in Film* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2002), p. 268. Also, the size of the Irish American cinema-going population created a market for Irish stars in movies, a market that would not have appreciated negative portrayal of their ethnic background.
[110] One of Gene Kelly's grandfathers was an Irish immigrant from Derry and in later life Kelly became an Irish citizen. Donald O'Connor's paternal grandparents were from Ireland and Debbie Reynolds great grandfather was from Donegal.

Television Broadcasting

With the arrival of television as a mass medium in the 1950's a number of Irish American hosts gained popularity on the small screen. Ed Sullivan, whose Irish grandparents had emigrated from Cork, presented and produced a popular Sunday night programme which ran from 1948 until 1971.[111] Another prominent Irish American who appeared on a regular Sunday evening television slot was Bishop Fulton Sheen (1895 – 1979).[112] Sheen had written a regular column in the *New York Journal-American* newspaper before becoming famous for broadcasting thirty minute sermons in his *Life is Worth Living* television series which ran from 1952 to 1957.[113] The show won an Emmy award in 1952 and Rev. Sheen appeared on the covers of a number of popular magazines, adding to his celebrity status.[114] His engaging appearance and his amiable approach had an appeal beyond his Catholic viewership, drawing an audience of between ten and thirty million viewers each week.[115] He maintained his connection with his Irish roots, visiting Ireland on a number of occasions and light-heartedly referencing the psychology and wit of the Irish in some of his programmes.[116]

By the 1950s the Irish American influence in popular media had become a symbol of their acceptance and influence within society. In particular, Catholics had moved to a point where their religion was not a barrier but an aid to social acceptance. When opportunities presented themselves, this pride in their Irish roots, as evidenced in this research, was expressed in their Churches' material culture.

[111] The Ed Sullivan Show aired on the CBS television channel. Irish singing and dance groups such as Dorothy Hayden's Irish Steppers in (1956) and The Little Gaelic Singers of Ireland (1957) appeared on the show, as did Irish folk music bands The Dubliners and The Clancy Brothers in the 1960s.
[112] Bishop Sheen's maternal grandparents emigrated from Roscommon in 1850's.
[113] Linda Dowling Almeida, 'Irish America 1940 – 2000' in J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey (eds) *Making the Irish American* (New York: New York University 2006), p. 552.
[114] Ibid. Bishop Sheen appeared on the cover of *Time* magazine in April 1952 and won the Emmy entertainment award for Outstanding Television Personality in 1952.
[115] https://www.sheencenter.org/about-archbishop-fulton-j-sheen/ (accessed on 5th May, 2020).
[116] Three of Bishop Sheen's programmes on this topic were released as a video package in 2003 - *The Divine Sense of Humor*, *Psychology of the Irish*, and *Why Do People Laugh?*.

4.3.6. *Ireland on Display at World's Fairs*

International Exhibitions, more commonly referred to in the United States as World's Fairs, were large scale public events which combined commercial, cultural, national and international exhibits with performing shows and amusements in order to attract, entertain and inform attendees. Ireland's participation at these World's Fairs, particularly in the 1930s, provided opportunities for the new Irish Free State to break away from outdated Irish tropes and present contemporary Irish life, including its art and craft, such as its stained glass, alongside displays of Ireland's learned and cultured past. Examples of the arts, crafts and intellectual life of contemporary Ireland were presented to enlighten international audiences and to market products that were available for export.

The first international Grand Exhibition was held at the Crystal Palace in London in 1851 and from there the events grew in scale and popularity in Europe and the United States.[117] For nations who wanted to promote their image abroad these exhibitions provided a platform to display their industrial and craft products and they also acted as a medium for the transmission of ideas about their national identities.[118] World's Fairs held in the United States, a nation largely built on immigration, also gave Americans of different racial origins the opportunity to celebrate and promote their own ethnic background.

For the Irish diaspora, these events presented an opportunity to re-engage with and promote what it meant to be of Irish extraction. They provided participants and immigrant attendees an opportunity to bolster the image of Irish Americans to the millions of Americans and visitors of diverse backgrounds that attended the events. This section traces Irish involvement in World's Fairs in the United States, focusing on the craft displays, and assesses their impact on Irish American patronage of Irish arts and crafts.

Complimentary research into the role art played in developing connections between Ireland and the United States in the first half of the twentieth

[117] Elfie Rembold 'Exhibitions and National Identity', *National Identities*, Vol. 1(3), (1999), p. 221.
[118] Ibid. p. 222.

century is published in Eimear O'Connor's *Art, Ireland and the Irish Diaspora* (2020). [119] O'Connor examines the individuals whose work as artists, gallery owners, critics and promoters in the United States helped invent Ireland in terms of visual art in the period. As will be described below, International Exhibitions held on American soil proved to be important venues for both for promotion of goods and services and, particularly in the 1930s, the presentation of ideas about Irish nationhood. Beginning with Chicago World's Fair 1893 and concluding with the New York World's Fair 1939, O'Connor describes the role these events had in appealing to the Irish diaspora in the United States, and sees them as the foundation of a cultural representation of Ireland which helped strengthen bonds between Ireland and Irish America.[120]

O'Connor's research then focuses on the part social and business networks in both countries in the early twentieth century played in the development of Irish visual culture. These networks provided channels for Irish artists to exhibit their work for sale through galleries, sales rooms and exhibitions. O'Connor concludes that despite the best efforts of visual artists the distinctive vision of Ireland that emerged was "conservative, inward-focused, nostalgic and premised on an official narrative of colonial victimhood".[121] The research finds that although they were successful in creating audiences for Irish visual culture in Ireland and further afield, other than commissions by the Church, they generated little in terms of direct artistic patronage.[122] O'Connor's conclusion therefore supports the research in this thesis which examines the role that public exhibition of Irish stained glass at World's Fairs had in developing the market for ecclesiastical art in the United States.

Chicago World's Fair 1893

Ireland was represented at a number of international fairs held in the United States in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The Chicago

[119] Eimear O'Connor, *Art, Ireland and the Irish Diaspora* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2020).
[120] O'Connor also considers the roles of a number of art exhibitions and Fairs that happened in the intervening years. While O'Connor does this in the context of Irish fine art, this thesis focuses on the role ecclesiastical art had in making those connections.
[121] Ibid. p. 262.
[122] Ibid. p. 165.

World's Fair, also known as the World's Columbian Exposition, took place from May to October 1893. The Fair was organised to mark the quadricentennial of Christopher Columbus's first voyage to the Americas, marking a significant event in American and world history. It was the largest event of its kind to that date and would give America the opportunity to display the cultural and technological prowess it had achieved in the intervening four hundred years.[123]

Two organisations which had been established to support the development of indigenous industry in rural Ireland exhibited at the Fair.[124] The Irish Industries Association founded by Lady Aberdeen (1857 - 1939) and the Donegal Industrial Fund founded by Alice Hart (1848 - 1941) presented cottage craftwork with the intention of creating an export market for products made in disadvantaged areas of the country. While initially working together, differences of opinion between the women led each enterprise to build its own Irish Village to attract visitors.[125] As described by O'Leary (2015) the purpose of ethnic-based 'villages' at exhibitions concerned the display of "perceived characteristics and customs of a given culture within the manufactured reality of a temporary wonderland of imperial spaces meant to inform and entertain visitors".[126] Both villages created idealised reproductions of what was sold as typical Irish settings and experiences – castles (including a scale replica of Blarney castle and a 120 feet tall Round Tower), Celtic crosses, thatched cottages and peasants working at their craft and selling their products (figure 85). The Aberdeen Irish Village was described as "much more than an exhibit of the cottage Industries of Ireland. It is, in fact, Ireland in miniature".[127] The crafts being demonstrated included lacemaking, bog oak-carving, weaving and jewellery-making. Irish food and drink including Irish stew, Limerick ham, Irish bread

[123] Norm Bolotin, Christine Laing, *The World's Columbian Exposition: The Chicago World's Fair of 1893* (Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1992), p. 1.
[124] Paul Larmour, *The Arts and Crafts Movement in Ireland* (Belfast: Friars Bush Press, 1992), p. 21.
[125] Janice Helland, *British and Irish Home Arts and Industries 1880 – 1914* (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 2007), p. 59.
[126] Jeffrey M O'Leary, 'Manufacturing Reality: The Display of the Irish at World's Fairs and Exhibitions 1893 to 1965' (PhD. Thesis, Kent State University, 2015), p. 138.
[127] Anon, 'The Irish Village at Chicago', *Freemans Journal,* 22nd July 1893, p. 10.

and butter, and Dublin porter was also available for sale.[128] Irish stained glass, which had not yet developed as an indigenous craft industry, did not feature at this Fair.

The sights, smells, tastes and sounds of Ireland were available for visitors to experience, with the anticipation that they would purchase products that were for sale and would be encouraged to visit Ireland as tourists. As O'Leary (2015) describes, the Irish Villages steered away from socio-political tensions from Ireland's past or obvious reminders of contemporary debates surrounding 'Home Rule' for the Irish.[129] Instead, they showed to all visitors a vibrant, ancient and welcoming aspect of Ireland which was developing its craft industry to improve the economic circumstances of its people. Irish Americans in particular, who made up the majority of visitors to the villages, were encouraged to support the revival and expansion of these craft industries.[130] Overall, the villages attracted thousands of visitors and, according to Harris (1992), realised a combined income of $201,000.[131] As O'Connor (2020) states, the Chicago Fair proved that 'authentic' Ireland had strong appeal abroad, and that a successful format had been discovered to display Irish produce.[132]

Ireland's participation at the 1893 Chicago Fair also became the catalyst for Irish Americans to organise a series of subsequent Irish Fairs in major cities across the United States. While these fairs had Irish nationalistic overtones, they were also set up to raise funds for local Irish projects (including church-building), and to encourage participation in Irish culture, thereby

[128] Ibid. For a more comprehensive description of the content of each Irish Village see Jeffrey M O'Leary, 'Manufacturing Reality: The Display of the Irish at World's Fairs and Exhibitions 1893 to 1965' (PhD. Thesis, Kent State University, 2015), pp. 139 – 145.
[129] 'Home Rule' was a political quest to restore autonomous government to Ireland in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Jeffrey M O'Leary, 'Manufacturing Reality: The Display of the Irish at World's Fairs and Exhibitions 1893 to 1965' (PhD. Thesis, Kent State University, 2015), p. 139.
[130] Anon, 'The Irish Village at Chicago', *Freemans Journal,* 22nd July 1893, p. 10.
[131] Neil Harris, 'Selling National Culture: Ireland at the World's Columbian Exposition" in T. J. Edelstein (ed), *Imagining an Irish Past* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992), p. 96. Quoted in Jeffrey M O'Leary, 'Manufacturing Reality: The Display of the Irish at World's Fairs and Exhibitions 1893 to 1965' (PhD. Thesis, Kent State University, 2015), p. 148. This amount would approximate to $6.5 million in 2021 terms. Calculation made at https://www.officialdata.org/ (accessed 17th November 2021).
[132] Eimear O'Connor, *Art, Ireland and the Irish Diaspora* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2020), p. 30.

promoting depictions of Irishness in the public sphere.[133] The fairs typically included reproductions of well-known Irish landmarks such as Blarney Castle (complete with a kissing-stone), a traditional Irish cottage, miniature replicas of the Lakes of Killarney, and a map of Ireland with 'real' soil from the thirty-two counties of Ireland.[134] Although Irish craft work featured at some of these fairs, for example Dun Emer Guild exhibited at the Irish Industrial Exposition in 1908 in New York, no evidence has yet emerged that Irish stained glass was included in any of these local exhibitions.[135]

St Louis Purchase Exposition, 1904

Whereas Ireland's craft representation at the Columbian Exhibition had a specific focus on cottage industries, the revival of other Irish art and design disciplines in the early years of the twentieth century would see an expansion of Irish arts and crafts participation in subsequent large international exhibitions in the United States. The next significant venture for Ireland at a World's Fair in the U.S. was the St Louis Purchase Exposition held in 1904. The management of Ireland's participation in the St Louis event differed from that at Chicago 1893. Whereas the Irish displays at the Columbian Exposition were the result of private philanthropist-led enterprises, the St Louis participation was jointly organised by Irish and Irish American agencies. The newly formed Department of Agriculture and Technical Instruction for Ireland organised the Irish involvement. Following its establishment by an Act of Parliament in 1899, DATI came into operation in April 1900.[136] Its purpose was to improve Ireland's agricultural and industrial output, and hence the country's economy, through educational and co-operative initiatives.[137] DATI worked in partnership with a local organisation of Irish Americans, the Irish Exhibition Company, presided over by the businessman Thomas E. Hanley.[138]

---

[133] Jeffrey M O'Leary, 'Manufacturing Reality: The Display of the Irish at World's Fairs and Exhibitions 1893 to 1965' (PhD. Thesis, Kent State University, 2015), p. 154.
[134] Ibid. p. 164.
[135] Paul Larmour, *The Arts and Crafts Movement in Ireland* (Belfast: Friars Bush Press, 1992), p. 159.
[136] *Irish Industrial Exhibition World's Fair St Louis 1904 Handbook* (accessed at https://dl.mospace.umsystem.edu/mu/islandora/object/mu%3A32289#page/1/mode/2up on 22nd June 2021), p. 46.
[137] Ibid.
[138] David Francis, *The Universal Exposition of 1904* (St Louis: Louisiana Purchase Exposition Company, 1913) . p. 573. Accessed at https://mdh.contentdm.oclc.org/digital/collection/expo/id/4 on 23rd June 2021. DATI had

In the introductory essay to the *St Louis Irish Art and Industrial Exhibition Handbook* DATI outlined the state of industrial development in Ireland and how the organisation was remedying deficiencies in training in order to make best use of the people and to take advantage of the material resources of the country. The introduction is explicit in how it describes the way British policies were introduced which repressed all Irish manufacturing, with the exception of the northern districts, in order to advantage producers in England and Scotland.[139] The effect of these policies was described as follows:

> The legal disabilities, religious and industrial, under which three of the four Provinces of Ireland had suffered so long had rendered that part of the country totally unfitted to cope with the new conditions of industry; the famine of '48 checked any hopes of an industrial revival that might have been entertained on the completion of Catholic emancipation: the lack of a rational system of education handicapped Ireland in an age in which education was counting ever more and more in the struggle for industrial success; and the sudden and rapid decay of the Gaelic language, with all its traditional literature and culture, under the influence of the board schools, had undoubtedly a powerful effect in stunting the intellectual vitality and growth of the Irish Celt, at the very time when the opening of a new industrial and commercial epoch made its severest demands upon him.[140]

At the opening of the Irish industrial exhibit the secretary of DATI, T. P. Gill (1858-1931), described the purposes of the Art and Industrial Exhibition:

> It was to present to American eyes a sort of conspectus of industrial Ireland in her actual condition of today-such an exhibit illustrative of her resources and her general progress as might prove to American and Irish-American business men that Ireland was now a country

previously been involved in the 1901 Glasgow International Exhibition. See Jeffrey O'Leary thesis for a further discussion on the motives behind Irish American involvement.

[139] *Irish Industrial Exhibition World's Fair St Louis 1904 Handbook* (accessed at https://dl.mospace.umsystem.edu/mu/islandora/object/mu%3A32289#page/1/mode/2up on 22nd June 2021), p. 8.

[140] Ibid.

> advancing in industrial spirit and offering good guarantees for the investment of capital.[141]

A significant portion of the Irish exhibition was given over to art and craftwork. DATI had been granted responsibility for the oversight of the Dublin Metropolitan School of Art and the School promoted the development of the craft industry by expanding arts and craft-teaching initiatives, with particular focus on metalwork and stained glass.[142] As Bowe comments in relation to the Irish Arts and Crafts Society, by 1904, when the Society was represented at the St. Louis World's Fair, "the rising spirit of nationalist optimism and Ruskinian endeavour had begun to be focused on the Art School and Dublin rather than the rural, often philanthropic ventures which had been flowering over the past twenty or so years."[143]

At the St Louis World's Fair, in addition to exhibits relating to agriculture, science and fisheries, a wide range of Irish arts and crafts were on display. This included lace, embroidery, furniture, pottery, wood carving, bronze, enamels, bookplates, Celtic illuminated work and stained glass.[144] The underlying theme of the exhibits was that the arts and craft products on display were distinctly of Irish design and manufacture. For example, the pottery was described as being made from native clay and "that the ornament and lettering are largely Celtic, it being the desire to show the possibility of starting an enterprise artistic in design and hall-marked as Irish, both as regards material and artistic embellishment."[145] Particular attention was given in the Irish display to lacemaking, with several full

---

[141] David Francis, *The Universal Exposition of 1904* (St Louis: Louisiana Purchase Exposition Company, 1913) (accessed at https://mdh.contentdm.oclc.org/digital/collection/expo/id/4%20on%2023rd%20June%202021 on 23rd June 2021), p. 573.
[142] John Turpin, 'N.C.A.D. Dublin's Oldest Art Institution: An Economic and Social Perspective', *Dublin Historical Record*, Vol. 49 (2), (1996), p. 141.
[143] Nicola Gordon Bowe, 'Two Early Twentieth-Century Irish Arts and Crafts Workshops', *Journal of Design History*, Vol. 2 (2/3), (1989) p. 193.
[144] Paul Larmour, *The Arts and Crafts Movement in Ireland* (Belfast: Friars Bush Press, 1992), p. 114. The St Louis exhibition included work by Dun Emer Guild (embroidery, bookbinds, rugs and tapestry), Oswald Reeves (enamel work), Killarney Furniture and J. M. Kavanagh RHA (metalwork). Stained glass-makers are listed below.
[145] *Irish Industrial Exhibition World's Fair St Louis 1904 Handbook Part II* (accessed at https://dl.mospace.umsystem.edu/mu/islandora/object/mu%3A32289#page/1/mode/2up on 22nd June 2021), p. 35.

pages of the exhibition handbook given over to photographs showing sample work (figure 86).[146]

The display of Ecclesiastical Art focussed on the efforts to replace imported church wares to America with Irish-made goods. At the time the majority of products such as stained glass, mosaic, church furniture, gold, silver and brass plate, and marbles for church decoration were imported, mainly from Italy, Belgium and Germany.[147] The purpose of the exhibition was to show that "It is possible to erect a church and furnish it throughout by Irish hands. It can be elaborate or it can be simple, but it can be all Irish and tasteful."[148] Products on display included examples of church furnishing, vestments and sacred utensils by William Egan and Sons of Cork and church metalwork by John Smyth and Sons, Dublin. A small exhibition of stained glass by three suppliers - James Watson of Youghal, Cork, Ward and Partners, Belfast and Miss Purser, Dublin (An Tur Gloine) - was on show. The size of this display indicates the limited extent of the Irish school of stained glass at the time.[149]

The Catholic weekly newspaper for the diocese of San Francisco, *The Monitor*, reviewed the Irish exhibition, commenting:

> A study of it [the display] helps to make us understand the actual material condition of Ireland more clearly than a hundred platform addresses.
>
> This St. Louis exhibit helps at once to show how far the ruin has gone, and what is being done to build up again the means of support for the Irish race in its own land.[150]

The *Kentucky Irish American* newspaper concluded that the Irish exhibit:

> did much to elevate the standing of the Irish in this country, and has disabused the minds of many thousands of the visitors of the opinion

[146] Also included embroidery and crochet to a lesser extent. Ibid. pp 36-37, 40–41. Notably, although Irish exhibits won three 'Grand Prizes', there were no wins for lace and embroidery, Eimear O'Connor, *Art, Ireland and the Irish Diaspora* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2020), p. 54.
[147] *Irish Industrial Exhibition World's Fair St Louis 1904 Handbook Part II* (accessed at https://dl.mospace.umsystem.edu/mu/islandora/object/mu%3A32289#page/1/mode/2up on 22nd June 2021), p. 36.
[148] Ibid.
[149] Stained glass classes at the DMSA had only been introduced in 1903.
[150] Anon, *The Monitor*, Vol. 58 (25), 24th September 1904, p. 7.

> that the Irish were not up in all the arts and industries of the present age.[151]

A report in *Harpers Weekly* by the Irish author and Managing Director of The Irish Industries Association, T. W. Rolleston, describes the Irish exhibit as a step forward in Ireland's progress, albeit while the country was not an autonomous state. Rolleston, wrote that Ireland was:

> on the way to play a distinct and worthy part in the civilization and thought of the world, for the first time since, over a thousand years ago, it was the missionary nation and the school of learning for Europe. [152]

He also outlined Ireland's industrial achievements which were on display, highlighting progress in shipbuilding, whiskey and stout production, linen production and artistic handicrafts.

The Irish display therefore indicated a move away from the customary tropes (including, for example, replicas of Blarney Castle, maps of Ireland with Irish soil and facsimiles of the historic Crosses) which had dominated public representations of the Irish at such fairs, towards a new revivalist style. This style was based on the past but was contemporary, designed for the future, and it was distinctly Irish. The merging of past and future together was becoming a metaphor for the Irish American story, which will be examined further anon.

In the time the Irish exhibition was open, from April to December 1904, it attracted the Governors from twenty-one States, many U.S Senators and Congressmen, many city mayors, Cardinals, Archbishops and prominent churchmen, and a large number of the twenty-million visitors to the Fair.[153] Overall, the exhibition presented the image of Ireland as a country taking

---

[151] Quoted in Jeffrey M O'Leary, 'Manufacturing Reality: The Display of the Irish at World's Fairs and Exhibitions 1893 to 1965' (PhD. Thesis, Kent State University, 2015), p. 170.
[152] T. W. Rolleston, 'Progress in Ireland as Shown at the Fair', *Harper's Weekly*, Vol. 48 (1904), p. 1707. Published online at https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=mdp.39015030326527&view=1up&seq=699&skin=2021 (accessed 10th July 2021).
[153] David Francis, *The Universal Exposition of 1904* (St Louis: Louisiana Purchase Exposition Company, 1913) (accessed at https://mdh.contentdm.oclc.org/digital/collection/expo/id/4 on 23rd June 2021), p. 575.

control of its future, which was worthy of investment and which had the ability to compete in many areas of endeavour. In the context of this research the success of the exhibition highlights the progress of Ireland's Arts and Crafts capabilities, and its development as an authentic Irish endeavour which had goods available for sale directly or indirectly through sales agents in the United States. DATI had succeeded in presenting the image of Ireland at the start of an autonomous industrial age, and the Irish Exhibition Company had succeeded in presenting an image of Ireland as a country which protected its heritage and looked forward to future economic success with the support of the Irish American community.[154]

World's Fairs in the United States in the 1930s

Two World's Fairs held in the United States in the 1930s were significant in terms of how they provided a vehicle to showcase how an independent Free-state Ireland was making strides into modernity while still referencing its cultured past.

The 1933 World's Fair in Chicago was the first where the newly independent Irish state took the opportunity to present itself at a World Exposition held on American soil.[155] This was followed in 1939 by a presence at the New York World's Fair where the organisers of the Irish exhibition presented a display of its contemporary visual culture in terms of architecture, the work of living artists and the products of art-based industries including stained glass.

While the events were commercially driven, as O'Leary (2015) asserts, the World's Fairs of the 1930s provided a platform for participating countries to showcase their "alleged superiority and acumen in technological, scientific and artistic affairs".[156] This was appealing to both the fledgling Irish state and to Irish Americans who saw the Fair as a way of cementing Ireland's cultural reputation and displaying its transition towards modernity to all attendees. The fairs also provided an opportunity to promote Irish trade and tourism and, specifically in the context of this research, the advertising of

[154] Jeffrey M O'Leary, 'Manufacturing Reality: The Display of the Irish at World's Fairs and Exhibitions 1893 to 1965' (PhD. Thesis, Kent State University, 2015), p. 159.
[155] The previous World Exposition in the United States was held San Francisco in 1915.
[156] Jeffrey M O'Leary, 'Manufacturing Reality: The Display of the Irish at World's Fairs and Exhibitions 1893 to 1965' (PhD. Thesis, Kent State University, 2015), p. 2.

the high-quality of Irish art and crafts products. In addition to showcasing the work of living artists the Irish Government invested in these exhibitions in order to show Ireland as a centre of cultural activity to the rest of the world.[157] They also provided local entrepreneurs with the opportunity to sell Ireland-themed goods at a well-attended event, although at times this conflicted with the highly cultured image 'official' Ireland wanted to present of itself.[158] Finally, a strong presence at the fairs provided an opportunity for the Irish diaspora in the United States to celebrate and take pride in the work from their 'homeland', which was their ethnic heritage, thus elevating their image in the eyes of fellow Americans.

Chicago World's Fair 1933/34

The overall theme of the Fair was to mark Chicago's centennial commemoration with a display of how far the United States had progressed since the city's foundation in 1833, and to project what the future could look like for society.[159] The 'Century of Progress' theme was conceived in order to give a boost to a population which had suffered because of the Great Depression (1929 – 1933).[160] The Fair would also provide a boost to the economy of Chicago by providing jobs for the construction and running of exhibits. It was marketed as providing an escape from daily activities and to provide hope for a better future.[161] The exhibition was envisaged as a spectacular event which combined educational exhibits with a general atmosphere of entertainment which it was hoped would attract families and individuals from all parts of the United States.

In addition to celebrating American progress, the Fair had a significant international dimension. The task of attracting foreign exhibitors was given to the Committee on Coordination of Nationalities led by Felix J. Streyckmans (1876 – 1953). He persuaded his committee to consider the experience of immigrants and their descendants as being more acculturation

[157] Catherine Marshall, Peter Murray (eds.), *Art and Architecture of Ireland Volume 5* (Dublin: Yale University Press, 2014), p. 159.
[158] For a further discussion on the cultural conflicts that arose at the Fair see Charles Fanning, 'Dueling Cultures: Ireland and Irish America at the Chicago World's Fairs of 1933 and 1934', *New Hibernia Review*, Vol. 15 (3), (2011), p. 95.
[159] The town of Chicago was founded in 1833 and city status was incorporated in 1837.
[160] Cheryl R. Ganz, *The 1933 Chicago World's Fair* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2008), p. 1.
[161] Ibid.

than assimilation – that the United States had become an ethnic "melting-pot".[162] In that way he believed that immigrant families could celebrate the cultural bonds of their ethnic heritage while continuing to contribute valuable service to the United States.[163] This objective was not lost on the Irish, both in Ireland and the United States.

The Fair provided a platform for the creation of national images by inviting foreign nations to participate in the event to showcase how they wanted to be perceived on an international stage. While the Fair organisers had originally invited foreign governments to participate with traditional-style exhibits and pavilion constructions, most European nations, including Ireland, had no desire to be identified as "quaint custodians of a picturesque past". [164] Instead they preferred to be depicted by architectural forms that presented themselves as progressive, modern industrialised societies – and that was how they participated in the event.[165]

The World's Fair opened on May 27, 1933. In that year, 22.3 million people attended, each adult paying a fifty cents entry fee. The response from the public was so positive that the directors extended the event for a second year in 1934, which drew 15.7 million more visitors.[166] This was a sizeable number of visitors, many of whom would have been introduced to or reminded of Ireland's cultural past and post-Independence future.

Participation in the 1933 Chicago World's Fair gave the Irish and Irish Americans a public opportunity to define and display, on American soil, what "Irishness" had come to mean since the period of rebellion, including the War of Independence of 1916-1921 and the formation of the Irish Free State.[167] Streyckmans wrote to Colman O'Donovan, the First Secretary of the Irish Free State Legation, Washington inviting Ireland's participation in the Fair. Streyckmans stated that an Irish-oriented display at Chicago would

[162] Ibid. p. 124.
[163] Ibid. p. 127.
[164] Lisa D. Schrenk 'From Historic Village to Modern Pavilion: The Evolution of Foreign Architectural Representation at International Expositions in the 1930s', *National Identities,* Vol. 1 (3), (1999), p. 294.
[165] Ibid.
[166] The visitors spent more than $61 million and the Fair broke even. Charles Fanning, 'Dueling Cultures: Ireland and Irish America at the Chicago World's Fairs of 1933 and 1934', *New Hibernia Review*, Vol. 15 (3), (2011), p. 94.
[167] Ibid.

be most welcome and that it "would be of great benefit in keeping thoughts of the fatherland fresh in the memory of the nationals of Irish origin living in the United States."[168] By late 1932, the Irish Free State government declared it would participate in the Century of Progress Exposition, seeing it as an opportunity to illustrate the accomplishments of the new twenty-six county nation — only eleven years old in 1933 — in an international context and to showcase the arts and intellectual achievements of the independent nation.[169] The event also provided an opportunity to market Ireland as a travel destination, potentially aiming for second and third generation Irish Americans seeking to explore the land of previous generations.[170]

Ireland's participation was organised by the Irish Free State Consul General in Chicago Daniel J. McGrath.[171] Before the Fair opened, McGrath made a radio address on the Chicago-based radio station WGN regarding Ireland's participation at the event, commenting that:

> The contribution of my Country to the World's Fair marks a new departure, in that this will be the first time at which an Irish government has ever participated in a foreign exhibition.[172]

In this way he signalled the Irish Free State's arrival on a world stage.

The Irish display, located in the Travel and Transport Building, focused on presenting images of contemporary life in Ireland and included examples from the worlds of arts and crafts together with technological advancements.[173] Also presented was an exhibition of archaeological

---

[168] Quoted in Jeffrey M O'Leary, 'Manufacturing Reality: The Display of the Irish at World's Fairs and Exhibitions 1893 to 1965' (PhD. Thesis, Kent State University, 2015), p. 267.
[169] Charles Fanning, 'Dueling Cultures: Ireland and Irish America at the Chicago World's Fairs of 1933 and 1934', *New Hibernia Review*, Vol. 15 (3), (2011), p. 96.
[170] Ibid. p. 99.
[171] Ibid. p. 96.
[172] Jeffrey M O'Leary, 'Manufacturing Reality: The Display of the Irish at World's Fairs and Exhibitions 1893 to 1965' (PhD. Thesis, Kent State University, 2015), p. 267. This was not the first overseas exhibition of Irish Art. In 1922 the Irish Free State had organised the 'World Congress of the Irish Race' in Paris to "showcase Irish sovereignty and cultural uniqueness". The Congress included an exhibition of Irish art, at which Harry Clarke was well represented with twenty-five pieces. The audience for the Congress was the worldwide Irish diaspora, attracting delegates from more that fourteen countries. The event focused solely on Ireland and was not an International Exhibition. See William Shortall, *Art and the Irish Free State - Visualizing Nationhood (1922-1934*), (PhD Thesis, TCD, 2020), pp. 102 – 146.
[173] The centrepiece of technological development was the development of the Ardnacrusha hydro-electric power station on the River Shannon.

artefacts, representing aspects of Ireland's ancient heritage. When visiting the Fair, the Irish Consul General to New York, W. J. B. Macaulay, declared:

> At former expositions, Ireland reproduced its typical peasant life. We had Irish cottages, with women making lace at hand looms. But the time has come to show more important aspects of Irish life.[174]

He concluded:

> Instead of the hand loom, we wish to show the development of our industries since 1922, such things, for instance, as the development of water power from the River Shannon.[175]

The exhibition included examples of how Ireland's craft industry had moved from locally produced handcrafts to more sophisticated and ambitiously designed products, including stained glass. In his radio address McGrath referenced the types of commodities on display at the Irish exhibit including "handwoven tweeds and linens, our gold and silver ornaments, our stained glass, and our wood, enamel and leather work, our poplins, laces and knitwear." In addition, McGrath continued, the Irish Free State "is presenting to you at our exhibit a large collection of paintings by our great modern [Irish] artists."[176] All the items were shown in a crowded display contained in cabinets, on the walls and on the floor of the exhibition area (figure 87). As can be seen from these images, more exhibits were included than the space available could accommodate, and therefore a number of paintings were stacked on the floor. The stained glass sketches and cartoons hung in a crowded display among the many oil and watercolour paintings, indicating that all work whether from an art or arts and craft source were considered to be of compatible importance.

The Arts and Crafts Society of Ireland exhibition was co-ordinated by the Guild of Irish Art Workers and included stained glass windows, lacework, furniture, embroidered napkins and handkerchiefs, worked leather purses

[174] The former exhibitions referred to are the Columbian Exhibition 1893 and the St Louis Purchase Exhibition 1904.
[175] Jeffrey M O'Leary, 'Manufacturing Reality: The Display of the Irish at World's Fairs and Exhibitions 1893 to 1965' (PhD. Thesis, Kent State University, 2015), p. 267.
[176] Ibid.

and pocket cases, hand-woven rugs and tapestries.[177] Harry Clarke Studios was well represented in the exhibition with six sketch designs and a completed stained glass panel on display. In addition, studio artists Richard King, George S. Walsh, William Dowling and Christopher Campbell (1908 – 1972) sent a selection of their own stained glass window designs, cartoons and completed panels.[178] Although all items were priced to indicate the cost of a commission, the only items that were presented for sale by Clarke Studios were two woodcuts made by C. B. Simmonds.[179] Hubert McGoldrick (1897 – 1967), the sole representative from An Túr Gloine, contributed a mosaic design, an opus sectile design a stained glass sketch and cartoon.

The exhibition of Irish archaeology was an integral part of the 1933 World's Fair, and its second season in 1934. The National Museum of Ireland, the Royal Irish Academy and the Royal Society of Antiquaries of Ireland collaborated to present 'A Century of Progress in Irish Archaeology'.[180]

The archaeological exhibits were presented alongside the contemporary arts and crafts items. As described by Shortall (2020):

> The intention was to show modern Irish crafts in a continuum from the Golden Ages as described by the museum, to the present day and ancient craftspeople as antecedents of modern Irish practitioners. This re-enforced the thesis that Ireland was not a new nation, but a country with an ancient heritage which it had reclaimed along with its independence.

The Royal Hibernian Academy provided original artworks for display (and sale) including work by the leading artists of the day including, Margaret Clarke, Letitia Hamilton, Paul Henry, John Keating, George Russell (A/E) and

[177] Charles Fanning, 'Dueling Cultures: Ireland and Irish America at the Chicago World's Fairs of 1933 and 1934', *New Hibernia Review*, Vol. 15 (3), (2011), p. 97. The Guild of Irish Art-Workers was established in 1909 by the Arts and Crafts Society of Ireland for the enrolment of professional artworkers by election themselves for united self-help and the general promotion of their work. Paul Larmour, 'The Arts and Crafts Movement of Northern Ireland', in Vera Kreilcamp (ed), *Making it Irish* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2016), p. 72.
[178] For the full catalogue see William Shortall, 'Art and the Irish Free State - visualizing nationhood (1922-1934)', (PhD Thesis, TCD, 2020).
[179] Letter from Richard King to Miss Gertrude Grew, 6th October 1933. TCD MS 6006/42.
[180] Mairead Carew, ''The Pageant of the Celt' World's Fair – Irish Archaeology at the Chicago world's Fair, 1933-4', *Archaeology Ireland*, Vol. 28 (1), (2014), p. 9. The display included replicas of bronze-age jewellery, the bell of St Patrick, the Tara Brooch and the Ardagh Chalice as well as facsimiles of Book of Kells and the Book of Durrow.

Jack B. Yeats.[181] The display combined both paintings and craftworks in the same exhibition area, enabling visitors to experience what was considered to be the best of Irish craft alongside the best of Irish art at the time.

An important publication that was available at the Fair was the *Saorstat Eireann/Irish Free State Official Handbook*. This was a collection of essays and images which described various aspects of contemporary Ireland. The aim of the three-hundred-page production was to provide "a survey of the progress made" by "the end of the first decade of national freedom".[182] While the essay on Modern Irish Art by Thomas Bodkin (1887 – 1961) focuses on a short 'recent' history of Irish artists and art display, the importance and success of Irish stained glass is emphasised, although he is less inspired with other craft endeavours:

> Miss Purser's "Tower of Glass" and the firm of Harry Clarke have sent stained glass windows widespread over the world, which have never been surpassed by the greatest masters of the art. But Irish furniture, pottery and textiles are, as a general rule, undistinguished.[183]

The *Chicago Tribune* described the Irish exhibition as being "one of the most interesting features of the exposition", referring to the Irish Free State display as being the "thin shaft of the wedge" in terms of increasing the awareness of artistic work at the Fair.[184]

The *Chicago Tribune* published an article by freelance journalist Jerry Curran, who was effusive about the Irish display:

> Learn, from this display of Irish ornamental metal work, that the precious metals, joined with varicolored enamels, are being molded by Irish hands into medals, plaques and shields of a delightful delicacy. Look there, that the glory of Irish stained-glass artists may not escape you. Feel underfoot, the consistency of these Donegal and

[181] Exhibition catalogue, *A Century of Progress: Exhibition of Irish Art*, (1933). The art exhibition was organised by the then President of the Royal Hibernian Academy, Dermod O'Brien.
[182] Charles Fanning, 'Dueling Cultures: Ireland and Irish America at the Chicago World's Fairs of 1933 and 1934', *New Hibernia Review*, Vol. 15 (3), (2011), p. 98.
[183] Bulmer Hobson (ed), *Saorstat Eireann; Irish Free State Official Handbook* (Dublin: Talbot Press, 1932) p. 243.
[184] Eleanor Jewett, 'Many Interesting Paintings Now to Be Found in Various Buildings on the Grounds of a Century of Progress' *Chicago Tribune*, 6th August, 1933.

> Dun Emer rugs, before the attractiveness of the ancient Celtic designs arrests your eye.[185]

Curran goes on to note how much of a break from widely held beliefs about the quality of Irish art the exhibition was:

> Citizens of these United States have certain difficulty in readjusting themselves to the revelations of this Irish Free State exhibit. Perhaps, in the classifying way of Americans, they expected corned beef and cabbage, and here they are offered the works of a school of modern painting genius. It is the Ireland too little known that shines forth from this Free State exhibit Here is the old country itself, uncaricatured, articulate in the loveliness of canvas and precious metals and the handiwork of its craftsmen.[186]

The organisers of Chicago's 1933 World's Fair used the idea of progress as a means of generating optimism in American society.[187] As Ganz observes, the event was the story of America, foreign nations, and ethnic groups expressing their own ideas of progress.[188] In that context an expression of Ireland's progress was its contemporary craftwork, including stained glass.

The success of the Century of Progress in 1933 led to the event being run again in 1934. On the second occasion the Irish Free State did not participate in the exhibition, citing the expense of participation and budgetary limitations.[189]

New York World's Fair 1939

The New York World's Fair 1939 was a pivotal occasion for the promotion of Irish stained glass in the United States. In the aftermath of America's Great Depression, a group of businessmen in New York looked for a means to stimulate the region's economy. Having investigated the success of the

[185] Jerry Curran, 'Irish Exhibit Clew to Boxers' Popularity', *Chicago Tribune*, 29th July 1933.
[186] Ibid.
[187] Cheryl R. Ganz, *The 1933 Chicago World's Fair* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2008), p. 3.
[188] Ibid. p. 4.
[189] William Shortall, 'Art and the Irish Free State - visualizing nationhood (1922-1934)', Vol. 1, (PhD Thesis, TCD, 2020), p. 359. In the absence of official Irish involvement an 'Irish Village' financed by a group of Irish American entrepreneurs, The Irish Village Corporation, was developed. The Irish Village went ahead without sanction or support from the Irish Free State Government.

Chicago World's Fairs in 1933 and 1934 the group set about establishing a similar venture in their own city.[190] The remit of the organisers was to celebrate past achievements in American society to show progress and possibilities for a better future.[191] The chosen theme of the Fair was 'The World of Tomorrow' and it was timed to celebrate one hundred and fifty years since the inauguration of George Washington as the first President of the United States.[192] In a statement to Congress the organising committee outlined the purpose of the Fair:

> It will present a clear, unified and comprehensive picture of the epochal achievements of a century and a half of modern civilization in the fields of art and literature, of science and industry, of government and the social services. It will exhibit the most promising developments of ideas, products, services and social factors of the present day in such a fashion that the visitor may, in the midst of a rich and colourful festival, gain a vision of what he might attain for himself and for his community by intelligent, cooperative planning toward the better life of the future; and it will emphasize the vital interdependence of communities, peoples and nations.[193]

The strong international dimension of American society was emphasised in the theme of the Fair:

> We intend to present a clear idea of the mesh of interdependence and interrelations in which all men, all peoples are caught; to show to individuals and communities the materials and the ideas, the things and the forces that affect their lives, their well-being; to show how closely knit together are all groups and classes, states and nations.[194]

---

[190] Grover A. Whalen, *Mr. New York: the autobiography of Grover A. Whalen* (New York: Putnam, 1955), p. 175.
[191] Marco Duranti, 'Utopia, Nostalgia and World War at the 1939-40 New York World's Fair', *Journal of Contemporary History,* Vol. 41 (4), (2006), p. 663.
[192] Washington was inaugurated on 30th April, 1789 in New York, then the capital city of the United States.
[193] *New York World's Fair 1939: Hearings Before the United States House Committee on Foreign Affairs, Seventy-Fifth Congress, First Session, on Mar. 23, 1937*. p. 12, published online at https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=umn.31951d02091973p&view=1up&seq=18 (accessed on 3rd July, 2020).
[194] Anon, 'Theme of World's Fair', *New York Times*, 9th October, 1936, p. 27.

This reflection of the multicultural aspects of the United States created another opportunity for the Irish government and Irish industry to present itself on an international stage.

One of the principal organisers of the event was the Irish American businessman Grover Aloysius Whalen.[195] In 1935 he was appointed as President of New York's World's Fair Corporation. This group of businesspeople was charged with delivering an event that would aid the post-Great Depression economic recovery of New York by attracting new businesses and a significant number of visitors to the city.[196] Whalen's business and political background positioned him to be an important link with both the business community and successive New York City governments in the 1930s and 1940s.[197] His greatest achievement however, was the organisation and promotion of the 1939-40 New York World's Fairs.[198]

One of the key dimensions of the Fair was its focus on foreign participation. It was Whalen's responsibility to sell the concept of the exposition and encourage European governments to participate on as grand a scale as possible. In the autumn of 1936 he travelled to London, Paris and Rome (where he met with the Italian Prime Minister Benito Mussolini) persuading governments to participate in the Fair.[199] He was successful in his dealings, with Germany and Spain being the only large European countries to not participate.[200]

---

[195] Whalen was born in New York in 1886, his mother was French Canadian and his father was Irish, born in County Galway. Grover A. Whalen, *Mr. New York: the autobiography of Grover A. Whalen* (New York: Putnam, 1955), p. 5.
[196] Ibid. p. 178.
[197] Whalen studied law and after a period running his father's contracting business he was appointed as secretary to the City's Mayor John F. Hylan. He left that position to become general manager at Wannnamaker Department Store in New York but re-entered civic life in 1928 at the request of the then City Mayor Jimmy Walker, to become Police Commissioner. Ibid. p. 138.
[198] Art M. Blake, *How New York Became American, 1890–1924* (Baltimore: JHU Press, 2006), p. 145.
[199] Grover A. Whalen, *Mr. New York: The Autobiography of Grover A. Whalen* (New York: Putnam, 1955), p. 187.
[200] Germany agreed initially to participate but subsequently withdrew.

Whalen had spent the summer of 1936 on vacation with his family in Ireland.[201] In July of that year he met with the Taoiseach Éamon de Valera outlining the concept, plans and benefits of Ireland's participation.[202] In 1937 the Irish Government dispatched C. E. Reddin to the United States on a fact-finding mission to determine if and how Ireland should participate. Reddin, who was president of the Irish Tourist Association and member of Dublin Chamber of commerce, was aware of how the number of United States visitors to Ireland was increasing and realised the advantages of taking part in such a large global event in terms of boosting these numbers even further. [203] He also became aware of the urgency of committing to the lease of a separate display area for Ireland, reporting that many of the good site locations on the grounds had already been taken up and that urgent action was required.[204] The potential benefits of participation included greater exports from Ireland to the United States and an increase in tourist visits if sold properly on a "sentiment cum quality" basis.[205] However, this had to be balanced against the potential costs of participation and mixed feelings about the benefits achieved from the Chicago Fairs.

Despite any misgivings, the Irish Government decided to participate and final contracts were signed in April 1938. Ireland got the last available site, contracting for a 15,500 square feet area on which an Irish Trade Pavilion building covering 8,000 square feet would be built.[206]

The organisers of the New York World's Fair wanted to promote the Fair as a work of art in itself, where industrial manufacturing and cultural production would merge.[207] The Fair's organisers and its main industrial designers believed that by instilling the Fair with modernism, expressed through streamlined design, art and everyday life could be integrated.[208] The

[201] Whalen rented a cottage in Greystones Co. Wicklow and travelled extensively throughout Ireland in the summer of 1936.
[202] Anon, 'Ireland Interested in New York's Fair', *New York Times*, 29th July 1936, p. 17.
[203] Anon, 'More U.S. Tourists Visiting Ireland', *New York Times*, 27th August 1937, p. 36.
[204] Anon, 'The New York World Fair: Representation of the Saorstat', *The Irish Times,* 31st August, 1937, p. 7.
[205] Ibid..
[206] Anon, 'Four More Nations Join world's Fair: Eire, Venezuela, Lithuania and Sweden', *New York Times,* 15th April, 1938, p. 21.
[207] A. Joan Saab, *For the Millions: American Art and Culture Between the Wars (*Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004), p. 131.
[208] Julie Nicoletta, *Art out of Place, International Art Exhibits at the New York World's Fair 1964-65* (Tacoma: University of Washington Tacoma SIAS Publications, 2010), p. 501.

organisers of the Irish displays took this principle on board when designing the visual aspects of the Irish exhibits. There were two Irish exhibition spaces - the Cultural and Historical Pavilion which was located in the Hall of Nations and the Industrial and Trade Pavilion which was a purpose-built building on its own site within the grounds of the Fair.[209]

The Irish Cultural and Historical Pavilion was a plain rectangular building set among a promenade of similar buildings which were occupied by other smaller nations. The theme of the Irish exhibition was to show Irelands deep roots in the cultural history of Continental Europe and its contribution to the development of the modern-day United States. In a Radio Eireann broadcast to promote the Irish involvement on 8th January 1939, the Taoiseach Éamon de Valera described the concept behind the Irish cultural exhibit:

> The Irish exhibits show how present has evolved from the past. Our aim is not just to sell goods, it is to give an idea how the freedom that has been won has fructified in the developments of our national life - in our political institutions, in our national economy and in our social services. We shall also try to convey to you, particularly to those of you who are not of Irish blood, some idea of the cultural traditions which are the most precious heritage of our race, and which today, as in the past, determine the outlook of our people, and inspire their devotion to free institutions.
>
> Every Irishman looks back with pride to the contribution which Ireland made to the spread of learning and culture throughout the Continent of Europe is the seventh, eighth and ninth centuries. With pride also we recall the part which Irishman placed a thousand years later on another continent in the foundation and development of what is today your country-the United States of America.[210]

The cultural exhibition stressed the part Irish people had played in the development of both Europe and the United States. It featured a strong visual display of contemporary Irish art, illuminated manuscripts and significant archaeological artefacts including replicas of the Cross of Cong,

[209] The Hall of Nations was an area of the Fair which housed cultural exhibits from many participating countries. The two rows of identical buildings were constructed as part of the Fair's infrastructure and leased to participating countries to fit out to their own requirements.
[210] Anon, 'The Ireland of the Future', *The Irish Times*, 9th January 1939, p. 7.

the Ardagh Chalice and the Tara Brooch.[211] Visitors entered the building under a large stained-glass window designed by Evie Hone (1894 – 1955). The 6.3 metre by 2.4 metre "bold modernist window" entitled *My Four Green Fields*, was a representation of the four provinces of Ireland.[212] Although not clearly visible from the outside during the day, at night the panel was illuminated from the inside, presenting a symbolic representation of the whole of Ireland to all passers-by. The placing of the panel over the entrance indicates the importance placed on stained glass as a medium. Hone's window, however, stood as a nationalistic statement for general display and did not relate to the exhibition of ecclesiastical stained glass housed in the Industrial and Trade Pavilion. As will be explored further anon, the majority of religious patrons of Irish stained glass were not seeking modernist designs for their churches, preferring the more traditional imagery produced by companies such as Clarke Studios.

On entering the building visitors then encountered a 10 metre high oil painting by Maurice MacGonigal (1900 – 1979) which was described as "one of the most striking of the murals at the Fair".[213] The painting included representations of Liberty, America and more than thirty of the famous Irishmen who helped the United States win and hold its independence.[214] The importance of the Irish contribution to General Washington's campaign during the American Revolution was further highlighted with the display of a replica of the army order he issued declaring that 17th March, St Patricks Day, would be a holiday for his troops.

Various charts outlining different stages of Irish culture and history were mounted on the walls, finishing with a display showing the 'Dawn of Liberty in Ireland and America'.[215] Exhibition cases featured examples and

[211] William Bernbach, *Book of Nations, New York World's Fair* (New York: Winkler & Kelmans, 1939), p. 97.
[212] For further discussion on symbolism attached to the window Nicola Gordon Bowe, 'Four Green Fields', *Irish Arts Review*, Vol. 30 (3), (2013), p. 108.
[213] Anon, 'Double Irish Show Turns Clock Back', *New York Times*, 14th May, 1939, p. 40.
[214] McGonigal was assisted by in this project by fellow Dublin Metropolitan School of Art alumni Harry Kernoff and Micheál de Burca. http://www.nival.ie/collections/artists-database/view/artist/name/macgonigal-maurice/ (accessed 3rd June, 2020). For a description of MacGonigal's mural see Nicholas Sheaff 'The Shamrock Building' in *Irish Arts Review (1984-1987*), Vol. 1 (1), (Spring, 1984), pp. 26-29.
[215] Anon, 'Double Irish Show Turns Clock Back', *New York Times*, 14th May, 1939, p. 40.

photographs of Irish antiquities, including facsimiles of Irish manuscripts.[216] A sculpture representing an ancient Irish warrior standing guard over Irish Liberties and the Irish State, the principles of which were engraved in marble beneath the statue, occupied another area in the building.[217] An image of Padraig Pearse, one of the leaders of the 1916 uprising dominated another area within the building.

Overall, the display served to move attendees away from hackneyed images of Ireland and to inform attendees of the Irish nations rich and complex past, the significant role it played in the history of Europe and the United States, and its relatively recent struggle to take control of its own affairs and identity – all under the façade of Hone's stained glass window.

The Irish Trade Pavilion, which housed the commercial stained glass display, was one of the most distinctive buildings erected for the Fair. Designed by the Irish architect Michael Scott, the plan took the shape of an emblem strongly associated with Ireland, the shamrock. While this shape could not easily be seen from ground level it was a distinguishing feature on posters and maps used by visitors to navigate the Fair (figure 88). The structure was given a modernist treatment through the extensive use of glass, steel and a painted white exterior (figure 89). Outside the building was a pool containing water from the River Shannon in which was built a relief map of Ireland. The bold architectural statement made by what became known as the 'Shamrock Building' was one of the most attractive at the Fair, attracting extensive favourable comment.[218]

On entering the building, the visitor first encountered a large mural painted by Sean Keating depicting Ireland's industrial and economic progress since the foundation of the state and its ambition as a progressive nation in the

[216] Kate O'Malley, 'Róisín Walsh's Report of a Visit to American Libraries, Universities and Other Institutions, 1939', *Analecta Hibernica*, No. 44 (2013), p. 169. In the summer of 1939 Dublin City's Head Librarian Róisín Walsh visited the United States to study the American library system worked and to introduce American libraries to the publications of the Irish Manuscripts Commission.
[217] Anon, 'Ireland at the World's Fair', *The Irish Times*, 22nd March, 1939, p. 4.
[218] Kate O'Malley, 'Róisín Walsh's Report of a Visit to American Libraries, Universities and Other Institutions, 1939', Analecta Hibernica, No. 44 (2013), p. 169. The building was selected by an international jury as the best pavilion at the Fair and Scott was awarded honorary citizenship of New York. Dorothy Walker, *Michael Scott Architect - in (Casual) Conversation with Dorothy Walker* (Kinsale: Gandon Editions, 1995), p. 102.

modern world (figure 90). The composition moved diagonally from a farming scene on the lower left through an image of the Ardnacrusha hydroelectric power station in the centre, which feeds electric power to a range of industries on the top right.[219] The lower right section, the first to be seen when entering the building, contained images of various products being promoted in the pavilion including livestock, thoroughbred horses and Ireland as a vacation destination. In the midst of this group an Aer Lingus aircraft was featured, pointing toward the United States – modern Ireland was taking off. Keating's interest in combining new technological advances such as the Shannon Scheme with a strong degree of social realism placed him ideally to add to the 'official' positioning of Ireland as a nation of people willing to 'roll its sleeves up' and move into modern times while still providing a welcome to those who want to experience its natural environment and historic sites.

Although Keating's mural did not promote Ireland as a ground-breaker in terms of new technologies for a future world, the painting gave the impression of a solid, strong willed, vibrant nation, reaching towards the United States with pride in its achievements during its seventeen years of existence. Keating's stylistically conventional approach to the design and execution made a clear, accessible statement about the strengths and aims of Ireland as an independent state.[220] As Malloy comments "The mural was, above all, inclusive, evoking Ireland in a massive panoramic scale and inviting the fairgoers not only to engage with references to a nostalgic past, but also to embrace the potential of Ireland's industrial future."[221] The message that Ireland had moved into modern times without losing connection to its past was somewhat conveyed by Keating's realist painting and Scott's modernist building design.

The 'stem' of the pavilion building housed a gallery displaying works by a selection of Ireland's foremost artists of the day including John Lavery, Seán

[219] The mural covered a total area of 7.3 metres by 22 metres.
[220] Although the Clarke Studio's created work in their own distinctive style, their design approach was also largely conventional, conforming to traditional subjects and imagery, which also indicates the appeal of conservative imagery to a American audiences.
[221] Caroline R. Malloy, 'Exhibiting Ireland: Irish Villages, Pavilions, Cottages, and Castles at International Exhibitions, 1853-1939' (PhD. Thesis, University of Wisconsin-Madison, 2013), p. 264.

Keating, Jack Yeats, Leo Whelan, Harry Kernoff, Beatrice Elvery, Letitia Hamilton, Frances Kelly, Mainie Jellett, and J. P. Hanlon.[222]

The advance into modernity represented by Keating's mural was not reflected in the commercial exhibition of Irish-produced goods and craftwork housed in the Trade Pavilion, none of which, as O'Connor (2020) comments, could be considered particularly modern.[223] As described in a *New York Times* report on the Irish exhibition, the displays of Irish craft and industry were arranged over two floors:

> On the main floor are displays of Irish whisky, stout, pottery, smoking pipes, silverware, book-binding and printing and the one export of which Ireland is perhaps proudest, her thoroughbred hunters. On the mezzanine are displayed the Irish woollens, laces and linens, beautifully decorated church ornaments and vestments, rugs, blankets, handicraft furniture and stained glass windows.[224]

This range of craft products was a repeat of the type of goods which had been displayed at previous World's Fairs in the United States, indicating a degree of continuity in Ireland's craft production. As was customary at such large exhibitions, no representatives from the businesses with goods on display, including Clarke Studios, were present at the exhibition. Businesses relied on the Department of Industry and Commerce staff to channel enquiries and sales back to them.

The centrepiece of the stained glass exhibit was three complete panels made by three different Irish companies – *The Annunciation* by William Earley Church Art Studios (figure 91), *SS Brigid, Patrick and Colmcille* from Irish Craftworkers (figure 92) and *Ireland's Homage* (figure 65) from Harry Clarke Studios. The Clarke Studios window, which was designed by Richard King, portrays SS Patrick and Columba in adoration of the Holy Child in the arms of the Blessed Virgin Mary, symbolising the foundation of the Christian

[222] Ibid. Sean Keating's *The Race of the Gael* won Keating's first prize for The Race of the Gael in an IBM competition from seventy-nine countries where they have business. Eimear O'Connor, *Art, Ireland and the Irish Diaspora* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2020), p. 327.
[223] Ibid. p. 313.
[224] Anon, 'Double Irish Show Turns Clock Back', *New York Times*, 14th May, 1939, p. 40. For more detail see Eimear O'Connor, *Art, Ireland and the Irish Diaspora* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2020), p. 313.

Church in Ireland and its passage down the ages.[225] Side panels depict two additional Irish saints, St Brendan the Navigator and St Finnian of Clonard.

King designed a richly decorated window with strong colouring distinguishing each figure. St Patrick's outer vestments are in vibrant green. His cope is decorated with an anemone-like pattern and is trimmed with a sinuous pattern in blue. His crozier is richly ornamented, the crook bearing zoomorphic figures. In his right hand he holds a Romanesque-style church which represents his establishing the Christian faith in Ireland. St Columba's purple cloak is also richly decorated with floral patterns and is held together with strands of sparkling beading. The saint bears a solar cross, which he is accredited with introducing to Ireland, and a dove, from which his name is derived, hovers above his head.[226] The Blessed Virgin's robe is predominantly blue with sparkling star-like emblems, and is held closed with a large ruby clasp. She is surrounded by flowers, with pink roses and lilies behind her and her halo full of red roses. Her golden sash is decorated with spiral patterns, this Celtic Revival motif strongly associating her with Ireland.[227] The Christ Child sits on her lap clothed in red, gazing directly at St Patrick. The centre panel holds the image of a shamrock beneath a crown. This image is framed by the same decorative detail that surrounds the Blessed Virgin's halo, thereby indicating to her assignation in 1931 as 'Queen of Ireland' by Pope Pius XI.[228]

The side panels depict Saints associated with two important aspects of Irish Christianity – learning and propagation of the Catholic faith. The right panel holds an image of St Finnian who established Ireland's most important school of learning at Clonard, which spawned many more schools throughout

[225]Anon, 'Dublin Stained Glass: Three Windows for World's Fair', The Irish Times, 14th March, 1939, p. 5.
[226] The Solar Cross was assumed as being of Celtic origin and is thus associated with Irish symbolism. Also known as the Ionic Cross as it was brought to Ireland by St Columba from Iona.
[227] The Celtic Revival was a cultural development which included art, literature and architecture which sought to define an idea of Irish nationhood through the rediscovery of Irelands ancient past. The Irish Literary Revival of the late nineteenth/early twentieth centuries was associated with the Celtic Revival and was characterised by a flourishing of works of poetry, music and literature which also looked to Irish heritage to support a growing Irish nationalist movement.
[228] Pope Pius XI's address to the Eucharistic Congress of 1932, held in Dublin, spoke of the 'The Virgin Mary, Queen of Ireland'.

Ireland and the Scotland. The left panel depicts St Brendan, known for his missionary work.

The decision on the design of the Harry Clarke Studios window to be displayed was approved by Frederick H Boland at the Department of Industry and Commerce. King wrote to Boland describing his proposals for the exhibit

> We are submitting a suggestion in colour, and a black and white scheme of treatments for proposed window for the Irish Pavilion, New York's World's Fair, which we hope will meet with your approval. The subject chosen deals with the cultural heritage of Ireland, which should prove of interest to visitors to the Pavilion, and would lend itself admirably to treatment in glass, ensuring that the effect of the window would be the rich jewel-like colour characteristic of Irish glass.[229]

The black and white scheme King had proposed (and which was not used) was a more modernist design which used opalescent glass (figure 93). The choice of a more conventional figure is an indication of the duality of the Irish exhibition – traditional goods in a modern context. The message was that Ireland is modernising in terms of industrial capability but that its current strengths lie in its established endeavours in art, craft and food production.

The Archbishop of Los Angeles Rev. John Cantwell attended the Fair and his visit is significant for the development of the market for Irish stained glass in the United States (figures 94). While visiting the Irish Trade Pavilion he showed strong interest in the exhibition of ecclesiastical goods, and in particular the stained glass. Cantwell had seen the work of the Harry Clarke Studios when visiting Ireland in 1937 and had made enquiries about the company providing stained glass for the main chapel at the new Diocese of Los Angeles Major Seminary which was under construction at Camarillo.[230] While Clarke Studios were not successful in winning that commission, when

[229] Letter from Richard King to Frederick Boland, 2nd September, 1938. TCD MS 6010/460.
[230] The Clarke Studios responded with pricing but were not successful in receiving a commission. 6010/440 The work went to a local company of Paul L Philips Studio and an Irish artist working in America Joseph Tierney.

Cantwell saw the company's work on display at the World's Fair, he was determined to purchase them for another location at the seminary. This posed a difficulty for Clarke Studios as the *Ireland's Homage* window had been sold by King to another client, Rev. Senan Moynihan OFM Cap. prior to it being dispatched to New York.[231] The Irish Government, through the Department of Industry and Commerce, appealed to Clarke Studios to make the window available to Archbishop Cantwell, stressing the:

> national importance of a complete sale of all Irish Stained Glass in the World's Fair, particularly in view of the fact that Irelands contribution to this Art ranks very nearly highest if not the highest in the whole world. Also that such a purchase would be a very important advertisement for the artistic excellence of Irish Stained Glass, and be a great stimulus to the further spread of this Irish Craft abroad.[232]

Archbishop Cantwell indicated that although it was the Harry Clarke Studios panel that he was interested in acquiring, he would buy all three panels on display if *Ireland's Homage* was made available to him, otherwise he wouldn't purchase any of them.[233] The outcome was that the original purchaser, Fr Senan Moynihan OFM Cap, was persuaded by Archbishop Cantwell directly to allow the panel remain in the United States in the interest of promoting international trade and the reputation of Irish stained glass. [234] The three windows, while originally intended for a new library at the seminary donated by Mrs Estelle Doheny, were installed in an oratory adjacent to the main seminary chapel in Camarillo.

The episode illustrates three important points – the priority the Irish Government put on developing an export market for high quality ecclesiastical goods, the quality of the Clarke Studios stained glass which made it such an attractive object to the Archbishop, and the desire of a senior Irish American cleric to incorporate high quality Irish art in a cornerstone building in his diocese. As described above, although Éamon de

[231] Fr Senan Moynihan OFM Cap was the editor of the Capuchin Annual. To further complicate matters Richard King, who had designed and sold the panel, had left the employment of Harry Clarke Studios to work at the Capuchin Annual when the request from Rev. Cantwell was received.
[232] Letter from William Dowling to Richard King, 19th June 1940, TCD MS 6011/609.
[233] Letter from William Dowling to Richard King, 27th June 1940, TCD MS 6011/621.
[234] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. Senan Moynihan, 8th August 1940, TCD MS 6011/697.

Valera stressed the cultural exposure Ireland's participation at the Fair would bring, the investment in the Irish Trade Pavilion was a clear attempt to bolster Ireland's trade with the United States. The sale of high quality stained glass was an important achievement in that regard.

Furthermore, the Archbishop's recognition of the quality of Clarke Studios work adds to the acknowledgement of the high standing of Irish stained glass by well-respected international critics of stained glass such as Charles J. Connick and Dom Eugène Roulin as described in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*).[235] Barrett's (2002) assertion about Irish stained glass of the period supports this recognition:

> By the 1920s Irish stained glass was distinctive and in the hands of Harry Clarke (1889-1931) and Michael Healy(1873-1941), far superior to most of the glass produced on the continent and on a par with the best in England. It became a credit to the nation.[236]

Finally, by putting this Irish craft on display in his Diocesan Seminary, a location which was highly occupied with Catholic clergy, Archbishop Cantwell was clearly presenting the work available from skilled Irish craftspeople to an important religious audience. This was good advertising for Irish stained glass businesses, and as outlined in Chapter Three (*Patronage*), opened the door for further stained glass commissions.

The 1939 New York World's Fair had met the objectives of its organisers in terms of presenting a spectacle of progress and modernity. However it was not a financial success, blamed principally on high construction costs and the high cost of admission.[237] From the Irish Government's perspective, despite some criticism of the displays (discussed in the next section), the Irish exhibitions put forward a vision of a modernising Ireland which acknowledged its centuries-old cultural roots and which had rejuvenated this artistic heritage in the form of art and craftwork. The exhibition attempted

[235] Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*), describes the export drive for Irish stained glass and the quality aspect of the Clarke Studios products in more detail.
[236] Cyril Barrett, 'Irish Nationalism and Art II: 1900-1970', *Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review*, Vol. 91 (363), (Autumn, 2002), p. 224.
[237] Anon, 'Historical Note', in *New York World's Fair 1939 and 1940 Incorporated Records 1935-1945* (New York: The New York Public Library Manuscripts and Archives Division, 2008), p. ix.

to connect modern Irish Americans with modern Ireland through cultural ties by presenting the image of an ancient, skilled and learned race which had re-emerged since becoming a free state, and which was now, particularly in the realm of arts and crafts, among the best in the world. The expectation on behalf of the Irish Government, as seen with its push to accommodate Archbishop Cantwell, was that there would also be an economic bonus for Ireland through increased commercial ties in terms of tourism and the sale of goods. The success of this was demonstrated in the Archbishop's decision to buy the *Ireland's Homage* stained glass panel.

New York World's Fair 1940

The outcome of the 1939 Fair persuaded the organisers to run the event for a second season in 1940 with the hope that some of the financial losses could be recouped. Ireland's participation at the event however was not a certainty. There was criticism of the quality of display and presentation of Irish goods at the 1939 Fair, put down to ill-preparedness on the part of the staff sent by the Department of Industry and Commerce to market the Irish goods.[238] In a Dáil debate the Irish trade exhibition was described as being "unimaginative and poor" and that the staff employed to assist visitors and provide information seemed disinterested.[239] Dublin City's Head Librarian Róisín Walsh attended the Fair in 1939 and her report of the visit disputes this remark about the staff, praising the attention the officials paid to visitors. However, she did criticise the Irish exhibit, describing it as overcrowded and poorly arranged. This, Walsh commented, was exacerbated by the fact that Americans were so good at marketing which made the Irish presentation seem inferior to what was available elsewhere at the Fair.[240]

In December 1939 Grover Whalen made a return trip to Ireland, meeting with Taoiseach Éamon de Valera and President Douglas Hyde in an effort to persuade the Irish Government to exhibit at the 1940 season of the Fair. In

[238] Anon, 'Dáil Votes Many Thousands', *The Irish Times*, 23rd February, 1940, p. 6. When they arrived the staff had expected the displays to be set up, but that was not the case and work was required to get the exhibition ready.
[239] Dáil Éireann debate - Thursday, 22 February (accessed at https://www.oireachtas.ie/en/debates/debate/dail/1940-02-22/14/ on 22nd May 2021).
[240] Kate O'Malley, 'Róisín Walsh's Report of a Visit to American Libraries, Universities and Other Institutions, 1939', Analecta Hibernica, No. 44 (2013), p. 170.

February 1940 the Government decided to participate in the Fair, but with a reduced presence and with a cap of £7,500 put on expenditure.[241] This decision was made in response to a direct plea by the Mayor of New York Fiorello La Guardia (1882 – 1947) to Éamon de Valera.[242]

The Cultural exhibition remained at the Irish Cultural and Historical Pavilion in the Hall of Nations but the Shamrock Pavilion site was not renewed and the Trade exhibition did not fully reopen. A small number of the trade exhibits moved to the Cultural exhibition, as did a description of the River Shannon electrification scheme. There is no evidence that the display of Clarke Studios stained glass was included in the exhibition. The 1940 'Eire' exhibition was described in the *New York Times*:

> The Ould sod and all that flourishes on it are presented in this display in the Hall of Nations, south. Side by side with the ancient manuscripts, jewels and paintings of Irish history and culture are the linens, tweeds, woollens and whiskies of modern Ireland. Exhibits show Ireland's giant electrification project. In a number of displays the government presents its story of progress in education and social welfare.[243]

While trade promotion had been a perceived benefit of participation, the emphasis of Éamon de Valera's radio address in advance of the 1939 Fair was more on the cultural ties between Ireland and the United States and the visual representation of modern Ireland:

> A certain portion of the available space will of course be reserved for the display of the goods which we export to your markets. But our aim will not be the advertisement of goods we desire to sell, although, as we buy very many times as much from you as you buy from us, our desire to sell you more of our goods is naturally very keen. Rather will our aim be to give you, who taken such practical interest in our struggle for freedom, an idea of how the freedom which has been on

[241] Minute of a meeting of the Cabinet (G.C.2/149) (Item 2) (S 10133) Dublin, 28th February 1940, *New York World's Fair: Participation by Éire* (accessed at https://www.difp.ie/docs/Volume6/1940/3130.htm, on 22nd May, 2020). £71,000 had been spent in 1939.
[242] Anon, 'Eire's Fair Exhibit is to be Reopened', *The New York Times*, 2nd March, 1940, p. 9.
[243] Anon, 'Exhibits: Foreign Nations', *New York Times*, 5th May 1940, p. 140.

> has fructified in the developments of national life-in our political institutions, our in our national economy and in our social services. We shall also try to convey to you, particularly to those of you who are not of Irish blood, some idea of the cultural traditions which are the most precious heritage of our race, and which to-day, as in the past, determine the outlook of our people, and inspire their devotion to free institutions.[244]

This priority was echoed in the decision to prioritise the Cultural exhibit over the Trade exhibit in 1940. These factors, along with the unfolding difficulties presented by World War II led to the smaller Irish presence in the Fair's second season.

After the 1940 World's Fair Hone's *My Four Green Fields* stained glass window returned to Ireland to be held in storage for twenty years until a suitable location for a work of its size could be found.[245] It was then displayed in CIE's headquarters in Dublin for a number of years before finding its current home in Government Buildings, Dublin. The MacGonigal painting was lost in transit between New York and Dublin. Scott's Pavilion was demolished, along with Keating's large mural, and exhibits of marble, granite and limestone were presented to the Archbishop of Los Angeles.[246] As discussed earlier, the Clarke Studios stained glass window was bought by the Archbishop of Los Angeles and moved to the diocesan seminary in Camarillo, California.

Overall, the New York World's Fair provided an excellent opportunity for the Irish State to show itself to America as a nation embracing modernity while leaning on and supporting deep-rooted traditions of learning, education, craftsmanship and Christian mission work of Irish Americans. As Malloy (2013) observes, Ireland's participation highlighted the rejection of traditional tropes – the colleen, the donkey, and the jaunting cart were each components of the earlier visions of exhibitionary Irishness which were

[244] Anon, 'The Ireland of the Future', *The Irish Times*, 9th January 1939, p. 7.
[245] For further description see Nicola Gordon Bowe, 'Four Green Fields' in *Irish Arts Review*, Vol. 30 (3), (Autumn 2013), pp. 108-111.
[246] Anon, 'Losses on Irish Exhibit at World's Fair', *The Irish Times*, 10th April, 1942, p. 3.

explicitly eliminated in 1939.[247] In addition to showcasing its food production capability, a new vision of Ireland was projected through art and architecture. The exhibits also provided many Irish Americans with a new touchstone of their ethnicity, a standard to be proud of. Finally, in the context of this research, the purchase of the Clarke Studios stained glass and its installation in Los Angeles was the catalyst for a number of commissions for their work in the post-World War II decades, particularly in California.

4.3.7. *Twentieth Century Irish Americans - Summary*

As the century progressed the essence of Irish American identity, which had been traditionally working-class Catholic, was augmented by an increasingly educated and a more affluent membership, now bolstered by a positive form of Irish cultural identity promoted across American society through television, theatre, music, literature and cinema representation.[248] This identity was underpinned and enhanced by the Irish Free State's participation at World's Fairs in the 1930s which, in addition to showing Ireland as a modern, progressive state, highlighted the deep cultural roots of its people. The scene was now set for the incorporation of some of the symbols of this cultural heritage in everyday Irish American life, in particular the integration of Irish visual and material culture into church buildings through, amongst other forms, the medium of stained glass.

[247] Caroline R. Malloy, 'Exhibiting Ireland: Irish Villages, Pavilions, Cottages, and Castles at International Exhibitions, 1853-1939' (PhD. Thesis, University of Wisconsin-Madison, 2013), p. 238.
[248] Lawrence McCaffrey, 'Irish Americans' in John D. Buenker and Lorman A. Ratner (eds) *Multiculturalism in the United States: A Comparative Guide to Acculturation* and Ethnicity (Connecticut: Greenwood, 2005), p. 216.

4.4. Expression of Irishness in Stained Glass

As noted above, in the mid-twentieth century Irish American Catholic clergy held senior positions both at parish level and at diocesan level throughout the United States. Many of these priests had responsibility for erecting new church buildings to meet the needs of a growing Catholic population of both Irish and non-Irish heritage. Chapter Three (*Patronage*) discussed in detail the circumstances that led to the demand for craft work in these new church buildings. In a number of cases, priests chose to include Irish craft as a feature of these new churches, despite strong competition from American-based suppliers or from more established European stained-glass companies that were represented by agents working on the ground in the United States. This section explores what meaning can be attributed to the decision to buy Irish stained glass. To what extent did the commissioners believe that the inclusion of high-quality Irish craft would reflect a distinctive aspect of (Irish) American Catholicism and demonstrate a deep cultural intellectualism among the Irish, and consequentially the Irish American? Or, to what extent was the objective nationalistic, that is, that the commissioning of Irish stained glass was an expression of loyalty to a 'homeland' Irish industry and an attempt to support and generate revenue for Irish businesses? The approach to finding answers to these questions is to examine the role of art objects in expressing national and cultural identity, with particular focus put on the international aspirations of the Irish Arts and Crafts industry and the intentions of the Irish-American Catholic church in procuring this craftwork. Then, a number of case studies, which primarily draw on correspondence between Clarke Studios and their clients, will describe individual projects where the decision was made to purchase stained glass, and what meaning can be derived from those decisions.

Commissions for churches in the state of California have been selected as case studies as this region was marked by a significant growth in the Catholic population from 1930s to 1960s, and stained-glass companies found a significant market for their work from the resulting extensive church-building programme.

4.4.1. *Church-Building as a Cultural Expression of Irish Identity*

As stated by Bhreathnach-Lynch (2018), a national state is not just a physical territory, it can also be considered as a means of creating allegiances between people and communities in that territory and beyond.[249] For the concept of a 'state' to exist there must be a tangible sense of what the nation is all about, and art, literature, music and dance are some of the means of achieving this. [250] Sights, sounds and images that are presented as representative of a nation create a tangibility that is beyond a geographical area or a political identity. William Patrick Ryan in his survey of the Irish Literary Revival (1894) describes what he considered "true nationhood", including that people "love their own artistic and intellectual creations, and find in them something spiritually noble to rally to; distinctive but not insular."[251] In the early decades of the twentieth century the definition of Irish nationhood acquired a more significant political meaning as Irish nationalists strove to establish a politically and territorially-independent Ireland, with a distinctive cultural identity forming part of how the state would be recognised both at home and internationally.[252]

In the context of this research there is an added level of complexity as this idea of an Irish 'nation' is now part of a greater trans-national identity – that of the Irish American. For Irish Americans, one of the perceived benefits of an independent Ireland with a recognisably Irish cultural character was, as Miller (1985) describes, that it could provide a means of earning them the respectability they desired in American society.[253] The two concepts of cultural endeavour and national identity merge to create the situation which places Irishness as a promoter of certain enlightened aspects of society, in the case of this research through church-building and decoration.

---

[249] Sighle Bhreathnach-Lynch, *House of Art*, documentary broadcast on RTE Oireachtas TV, 26th February 2018.
[250] Ibid.
[251] William Patrick Ryan, *The Irish Literary Revival: Its History, Pioneers and Possibilities* (London: Ward and Downey, 1894), p. 179. Available online at https://archive.org/ (accessed on 15th January 2022).
[252] This concept is examined in detail in William Shortall, 'Art and the Irish Free State - visualizing nationhood (1922-1934)', (PhD Thesis, TCD, 2020).
[253] Kerby A. Miller, *Emigrants and Exiles* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985), p. 546. Miller is referencing the work of Thomas N. Brown in *Irish-American Nationalism 1870-1890* (Philadelphia: Lippincott, 1966).

The building of a new church not only provides space for worship, it also offers opportunities both to promote cultural endeavours (such as art and architecture), and also to make distinguishing statements about the people involved in the building process.[254] An art historical survey of European ecclesiastical culture reveals that the Catholic Church had a long-embedded history in patronising the work of artists and architects.[255] This is also true in the context of Irish Catholicism where, during the first half of the twentieth century, the Catholic Church was the largest patron of art in Ireland.[256] This patronage was awarded at a time when, in the decades leading up to and after Irish Independence, art and culture were used as a means to assert Ireland's national identity, in particular through the work of the Irish Arts and Crafts Movement (discussed further anon).[257]

Chapter Three (*Patronage*) describes the extent of church building and the patronage of Irish art in the western United States. Where an Irish priest was the pastor of a newly building parish, church buildings were a source of pride to the Irish as they built them with their own community money, most of it as Dolan (2008) describes, from "nickels and dimes" of working-class Catholics.[258] These church buildings became symbols of the religious, social, ethnic and economic capability of those parish communities. Lee (2000) comments that the emotional solidarity generated by membership of a Catholic Church community through the parish system and the sheer physical grandeur of many Church buildings played a subtle role in raising the self-respect of Irish American Catholics and further helping them acculturate into America society.[259]

As Dolan (1973) comments, the early perception of the priest was as a pastoral minister to the poor and to the sick.[260] The priest's principal duties

[254] Distinguishing in the sense that it promotes personal values or aims of the people involved.
[255] Catherine Marshall, Peter Murray (eds.), *Art and Architecture of Ireland Volume 5* (Dublin: Yale University Press, 2014), p. 353.
[256] Sighle Bhreathnach-Lynch, *Ireland's Art, Ireland's History* (Omaha: Creighton University Press, 2007), p. 104.
[257] Jeanne Sheehy, *The Rediscovery of Ireland's Past: the Celtic Revival, 1830–1930* (London: Thames and Hudson Limited, 1980), p. 189.
[258] Jay P. Dolan, *The Irish Americans*: *A History* (New York: Bloomsbury Press, 2008), p. 111.
[259] J. Joseph Lee, 'Millennial Reflections on Irish-American History', *Radharc*, Vol. 1, (2000), p. 37.
[260] Jay P. Dolan, 'A Critical Period in American Catholicism', *The Review of Politics*, Vol. 35 (4), (October 1973), p. 532.

included administering the sacraments, including saying mass and hearing confessions, visiting the sick and preaching Catholic teaching. Then, as the Catholic Church began building new churches and schools, the priest also gradually became a minister of brick and mortar. On a visit to the United States in the mid-nineteenth century, Archbishop Gaetano Bedini believed that the drive to build impressive churches could be traced to the American desire for demonstrative success.[261] Large church buildings, as in the case of secular private mansions, were viewed as prestigious symbols. As the Catholic Church embedded itself more in American society, it gradually lost its poor immigrant nature and new grand monuments of a new generation Irish Americans enhanced the image of the Catholic community as well as the personal reputation of the 'priest-builder'.[262]

Starting in the 1930s, Irish American Catholic priests who wanted to make a statement about their Irish heritage through their church-building projects referenced, and augmented, Ireland's standing as a nation state by including Irish cultural signifiers in their buildings, engaging artists directly to provide Irish artworks for their building projects.[263] Many chose to include decorative elements such as Irish stained glass in their American-sited churches which referenced their Irish identity and projected a sophisticated, progressive and nuanced understanding of what it meant to an Irish American Catholic. They bought stained glass windows not simply because they were made in Ireland, but because they saw the works as high-quality art objects which held an intrinsic qualitative value. This value stemmed from the reputation Irish craft achieved in the first half of the twentieth century through the accomplishments of the Irish Arts and Crafts Movement and its leading artists. For stained glass in particular, many Irish American priests were familiar with the reputation of Clarke Studios and its founder Harry Clarke whose work they had either seen installed in Irish churches or through illustrations. Also, on occasion, they used overtly Irish subject matter and Irish decorative and symbolic elements to reflect the Church's, and the Irish American communities', association with Ireland and its rich cultural heritage. Designs inspired by an ancient Irish past, became symbolic of how

[261] Quoted in, Jay P. Dolan, 'A Critical Period in American Catholicism', *The Review of Politics*, Vol. 35 (4), (October 1973), p. 532.
[262] Ibid.
[263] The extent of this patronage is described in Chapter Three (*Patronage*).

people of Irish origin or descent saw themselves as a distinctive, progressive group, and one that was now an important value-contributing part of American society.

However, the procurement of Irish craft was not intended to promote Irish Americans as a separate and distinct ethnic group. It was commissioned to support the concept that the Irish, who, having moved on from being an immigrant peasant class, were now embedded in the social order of the United States and were taking full part in the affairs of the country, and who now also had a cultured contribution to make to society through art. The procurement of internationally recognised best-in-class Irish stained glass could therefore be seen as a statement about Irish America's ability to contribute as a cultural, and therefore political, transformative force integrated into, and strengthening, American society.

4.4.2. *Irish Arts and Crafts Movement*

The development of this indigenous Irish stained glass industry can be traced back to the emergence of the Irish Arts and Crafts Movement. The Celtic Revival, Literary Revival and Arts and Crafts movements of the late nineteenth/early twentieth centuries contributed to the forging of an Irish national identity. As Howes (2016) observes, writers and artists in these movements sought to re-animate elements of traditional Irish culture, to employ them to produce new cultural objects that would embody a distinctive Irish nationality.[264] The Irish Arts and Crafts Movement, which included figures such as Evelyn Gleeson, Mia Cranwill and Harry Clarke, pursued statements of this national identity through art and craft object-making that encompassed textiles, metalwork and stained glass, among other crafts.[265]

An underlying principle of the movement was that it was less important that designs specifically included motifs and symbols perceived as being authentically Irish, but that they were designed and made by Irish hands

[264] Marjorie Howes, 'The Arts and Crafts Movement and the Irish Literary Revival' in Vera Kreilcamp (ed), *Making it Irish* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2016), p. 46.
[265] Other crafts which were based on new original design work included woodwork, leatherwork, bookbinding, printing, marble inlaying and mosaic, and carpet making. Paul Larmour, *The Arts and Crafts Movement in Ireland* (Belfast: Friars Bush Press, 1992), p. 74.

using Irish materials. Gordon Bowe (1990) describes the movement as being as much an ideology as a style, which involved the attitude of the artist, craftsman or designer to materials, process and technique, production and iconography.[266] The movement strove for a high standard of technical execution, with artists expected to master all aspects of the process, from conceiving and making the design to completion of the object.[267] This objective was supported by the foundation of DATI, and the training objectives of the DMSA, as discussed above.

A recurring theme for the artists was the degree to which a national style could be expressed in their work. In many cases the heritage of Irish art, as discerned in early Christian Insular work, was used as a guide in design. [268] This source, identified as uniquely Irish and often described as 'Celtic', set their work apart from international peers. The approach was as was encouraged by texts from, for example, the archaeologist and antiquarian Margaret Stokes in *Early Christian Art in Ireland* (1894). In presenting examples of text from the Book of Kells (figure 95) she stated:

> The object is not to present a guide to the antiquities of Ireland, but rather to indicate how these antiquities should be approached, so as to draw forth whatever elements of instruction may lie hidden in them for workers in the present day.[269]

Characterised by zoomorphic imagery, spirals, and interlace/knotwork patterns these 'Celtic' designs would form elements of an emergent nationalist symbolism where, as Kreilcamp describes, the past was reimagined to fulfil the need of the present – and the future.[270]

The designs emerged in a range of craft mediums including carpet making (figure 96) metalwork, sculpture, stained glass and embroidery. In terms of

---

[266] Nicola Gordon Bowe, 'The Irish Arts and Crafts Movement (1886-1925)' in *Irish Arts Review Yearbook* (1990/1991), p. 172.
[267] A Sarah Purser comment in An Túr Gloine anniversary booklet, 1928, quoted in Nicola Gordon Bowe, 'Two Early Twentieth-Century Irish Arts and Crafts Workshops in Context', *Journal of Design History*, Vol. 2(2/3), (1989), p.194.
[268] Paul Larmour, *The Arts and Crafts Movement in Ireland* (Belfast: Friars Bush Press, 1992), p. 4.
[269] Margaret Stokes, *Early Christian Art in Ireland* (London: Chapman and Hall, 1894), p. 6. Available online at https://archive.org/ (accessed on 19th January 2022).
[270] Vera Kreilcamp, 'Introduction', in Vera Kreilcamp (ed), *Making it Irish* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2016), p. 17.

ecclesiastical art, medieval manuscripts such as the Book of Kells, with its 'Celtic' derived decoration, served as a source of inspiration for new design which would have immense popular appeal, establishing markets at home and abroad.[271] Buildings such as the Honan Hostel Chapel in Cork and Loughrea Cathedral in Galway became icons of Irish craftwork, each decorated with the work of Ireland's leading craft workers and standing as showcases of Irish Celtic Revival art.[272]

While Irish-designed and made crafts such as stained glass may have been regarded as symbols of Irish nationalism at home, this research has found that in the United States their source and the quality of their making gave them added significance beyond being purely decorative objects. The merging of past and contemporary culture to create an Irish identity was becoming a metaphor for the Irish American story. The remainder of this chapter considers the meaning that can be ascribed to the commissioning of Irish stained glass in the U.S. and the extent to which that meaning is expressed in the style and imagery present in individual windows. The next section examines what these objects tell us about why they came to be commissioned and what agency they carry in terms of the construction of an immigrant Irish aesthetic.

4.4.3. *Finding the Meaning in Commissions*

The methodology adopted to find the meaning inherent in the stained glass commissions is to examine a select, but representative, number of orders carried out by Clarke Studios in the U.S. Three case studies will describe the engagements with patrons, outlining the extent and content of each commission, and the motivation which drove each purchase. As described in Chapter Three (*Patronage*), a number of key individuals were the catalysts for the extent of the commissions that Clarke Studios received from the

[271] Ecclesiastical craft exports included religious vestments, altar textiles and religious metalwork.
[272] The Honan Chapel was built in 1915 and is decorated with craftwork from Ireland's leading craft workers of the time including, Harry Clarke, An Túr Gloine, Joseph Tierney, Dun Emer Guild and Egan and Sons. See Virginia Teehan & Elizabeth Wincott Heckett, *The Honan Chapel: A Golden Vision* (Cork: Cork University Press, 2004). Loughrea Cathedral includes work by An Túr Gloine, Dun Emer Guild, Michael Shortall and William Scott. See Jeanne Sheehy, *The Rediscovery of Ireland's Past: the Celtic Revival, 1830–1930* (London: Thames and Hudson Limited, 1980), pp. 155-158.

United States.[273] The work for these patrons was used to shortlist candidate locations for the case studies. The commissions selected for examination have also been chosen based on their location (examples are taken from two dioceses in California), scale of commissions (locations where the majority of the stained glass is from Clarke Studios), the time period of the project specific to this dissertation (1950-1970), and where sufficient archival evidence exists that explains why Irish stained glass was chosen.

Initial research indicated that the motivation behind the commissioning of the Clarke Studios stained glass includes that the patrons were making a cultural statement about Irish American identity, and/or that the patrons were economically-motivated. In relation to a statement of identity, this thesis contends that the stained glass objects made by Clarke Studios for American patrons, which became part of the material culture of Irish American Catholicism, embedded this nationalistic statement in American churches in the mid-twentieth century. For Irish Americans this craftwork, skilfully made with Irish hands, became a binding force which formed part of their cultural character and which offered a tangible signifier of their ethnicity. In addition, they also saw the stained glass as making a statement about the high quality of Irish, and hence Irish American, culture.

A parallel motivation for the procurement of Irish stained glass was an economic objective – to boost the sales of Irish goods in the United States in order to support Ireland's export economy. Throughout the history of Irish immigration in the U.S., Irish Americans directly supported family members who remained in Ireland by sending gifts and remittances. It is likely therefore that another purpose behind a pastor's decision to buy Irish stained glass and other Irish-made goods was a larger-scale version of this custom, to help the Irish economy directly. In doing so they would also be providing advertising for Irish goods, with the hope that their investment would lead to more sales for Irish companies.

[273] Key individuals included Rev. Michael Lyons, Sacramento. Rev. Thomas Kirby, Sacramento. Archbishop John Cantwell, Los Angeles. Rev. Thomas O'Toole, Rev. William O'Shea, Los Angeles. Rev. James Cantwell, San Francisco. Rev. George Scott, San Pedro. Their role is more fully examined in Chapter Three (*Patronage*).

These meanings are not mutually exclusive, and both will be considered when looking for evidence which provides insight into the reasons why the company was selected for the work.

An additional meaning that may be considered is that the pastor's ability to procure this stained glass is indicative of the agency these Irish American priests carried both in their diocese and in their parishes. Having Irish-made stained glass in a church was a material statement about the power and influence they carried in the American Catholic Church. While there is some implicit support for this contention, there is minimal evidence in the Clarke Studios correspondence to back the assertion, and hence it has not been specifically included in this analysis.

As described in the Introduction, the framework guiding this examination is a combined material culture and art-historical approach. The material culture aspect investigates the motivation behind the patron's commissioning of the windows and the art-historical approach investigates the extent to which the content of the windows explicitly reflect this motivation.

The primary source of information is the Clarke Studios business archive available at Trinity College Library.[274] This resource contains a significant amount of correspondence relating to commissions, some of which includes insights into the motivation behind the patrons purchase decisions. Each case study will describe the background to the commission, including the main personnel involved, and then outline documentary evidence which addresses the question of the meaning and motivation behind the purchase. Conclusions will then be drawn from the evidence obtained from the study.

4.4.4. *Case Study 2 – St Brigid's San Francisco*

Background

As described in Chapter Three (*Patronage*), in 1947 an extensive project to remodel and enlarge St Brigid's Church in San Francisco was undertaken by

[274] Information relating to orders is collected from the Harry Clarke Studios Order Book, TCD MS 6060, and various items of correspondence sent and received by the Clarke Studios, held in TCD MSS 6001 – 6038, TCD MSS 6109 – 6119, TCD MSS 5127 – 6130b.

Tipperary-born Rev. James Cantwell.[275] The pastor was a brother of the former archbishop of Los Angeles Rev. John Cantwell who, as described previously, had purchased the Irish stained glass on display at the New York's World's Fair, 1939.[276] Rev. James Cantwell, who was also Chancellor of the Archdiocese of San Francisco, had been appointed pastor to St Brigid's in 1926 and had previously undertaken projects to rebuild the parish school and convent.[277]

Located on the intersection of Broadway and Van Ness Avenue, St Brigid's occupied an important place in San Francisco's Irish community, and was second only to St Peter's Parish, long-regarded as the city's quintessentially Irish parish.[278] By the end of the 1940s, as described by Brundage (2016), the parish was losing some of its Irish character and was becoming more ethnically diverse.[279] However, Rev. Cantwell, having the financial resources to do so, chose to enhance his church with high quality ecclesiastical decoration, taking the opportunity to make St Brigid's a showcase for contemporary Irish liturgical arts. The Irish sculptor Seamus Murphy RHA (1907-1975) was commissioned to make an eight foot tall sculpture of the parish's patron St Brigid, to be placed above the exterior of the church entrance (figure 97). The sculpture is flanked by statues of twelve apostles on a smaller scale, also by Murphy.[280] The Dun Emer Guild provided altar cloths and designed a large carpet measuring 11m by 7.5m for the sanctuary (figure 98), which was made in Donegal:

> The carpet is a deep bluish green with a Celtic border of browns, reds, gold and touches of blue, green and purple. On the centre panel, which is encircled by an oak leave design, are symbols of the four Evangelists and St. Brigid's cross. Indicative of the amount of work

[275] Rev. James Cantwell was born in Fethard Co Tipperary and studied for the priesthood in St Bernard's Seminary, New York, and Menlo Park, California.
[276] The three windows purchased by Archbishop Cantwell were *The Annuncia*tion by Earley and Co., *Irish Saints* by Irish Craftworkers and *Ireland's Homage* by Harry Clarke Studios.
[277] Editor, 'St Brigid's Centennial Booklet 1863 – 1963', p. 6. (accessed San Francisco Diocesan Archive, San Francisco).
[278] Timothy J. O'Keefe, *The Irish in the San Francisco Bay Area* (San Francisco: Irish Literary and Historical Society, 2005), p. 53.
[279] David Brundage, 'Remembering 1916 in America', in R. Grayson & F. McGarry (eds.), *Remembering 1916: The Easter Rising, the Somme and the Politics of Memory in Ireland* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), p. 150.
[280] The twelve apostles with Judas replaced by either St Mathias or St Jude.

involved in the making of the carpet is the fact that there are 20,735 knots in every square yard.[281]

Clarke Studios were invited to make a proposal to provide the stained glass windows. Rev. Cantwell initially requested designs and an estimate for two windows depicting St Brigid and St Mel specifying that he would like to have the same 'Irish type' in the windows as in Seamus Murphy's statue.[282] To achieve this William Dowling, the manager of Clarke Studios, contacted Murphy to get an impression of his design for the St Brigid sculpture and in January 1948 the sculptor visited the Clarke Studios premises to discuss how Dowling's design would reflect Murphy's.[283] The resulting proposal for the stained glass was satisfactory to Rev. Cantwell and he placed an order for the two windows.[284]

Motivation to Buy Irish Stained Glass

It is clear from the sequence of correspondence between Rev. Cantwell and Clarke Studios that he intended the stained glass for his church to be a shining example of Irish craftsmanship. The first two windows were to be placed in the most sacred space in the church, the sanctuary, and as such would make a bold statement about the importance of the Clarke Studios work. When approving the design for the St Brigid window Rev. Cantwell revealed how prominent the windows would be:

> Your windows [St Brigid and St Mel] will be the only windows in the sanctuary itself, and will attract great attention. We shall be very proud of the Irish workmanship.[285]

Having seen the St Mel design he re-emphasised the importance of the windows:

---

[281] Anon, 'St. Brigid's Celebrates Centennial', *The Monitor*, Vol. 105 (7), 17th May 1963, p. 7.
[282] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 17th October 1947, TCD MS 6127/369. It can be assumed that Rev. Cantwell wanted to reflect the predominantly Irish character of his parish, and by specifying 'Irish type' Rev. Cantwell was looking for figures with a naturalistic, western European appearance.
[283] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. James Cantwell, 14th January 1948, TCD MS 6015/549.
[284] Rev. Cantwell provided a photograph of the face to be used for St Brigid, perhaps a close relative. These two windows were the first of forty-three made by the Clarke Studios for St Brigid's – all the stained glass in the church.
[285] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 22nd December 1947, TCD MS 6127/375.

> The sanctuary is nearly complete and the great arch entering the sanctuary, in which your beautiful workmanship will reign supreme, is being decorated with the emblems of the great Irish saints.[286]

Both windows are distinctly of Irish origin both in iconography and design. St Brigid is depicted standing on lush green grass holding the Church she founded in Kildare (figure 99). She is surrounded by native Irish birds and flowers and stands in front of a calf indicating her traditional association with nature and nurturing. The aspect of the design which most associates the image with Ireland is the interlace and zoomorphic decoration which fills the borders and surround the figure in the base of the window. This patterning, derived from medieval Irish manuscripts and associated with pre-historic Celtic La Tène style, is the dominant ornamental element in the window. The base contains a St Brigid's Cross (figure 99a) and a narrative panel that details a scene from the Saint's life where she aids the poor by distributing food.

St Mel, the Bishop of Ardagh and mentor to St Brigid, is represented in his Bishop's vestments holding a crozier and a book and pen, representing his authority and learning (figure 100). Below the figure is depicted a stone church and an Irish round tower, and a detailed reproduction of the iconic Ardagh Chalice, an eight century metal object housed in the National Museum of Ireland since 1874 - each element a symbol of medieval Irish devotion and artistry (figure 100a).[287] The base depicts a narrative scene where St Mel receives the final vows of St Brigid, who is attended by a number of companions, including St Macaille.[288] The borders in this window are also decorated with interlace and zoomorphic patterns, in a similar fashion to the St Brigid window. It is an indication of Rev. Cantwell's strong intent to promote Irish art and proclaim the Irishness of the parish that the

[286] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 21st January 1948, TCD MS 6127/377.
[287] The Ardagh Chalice is a ceremonial object thought to have been used in Christian ceremonies. Its manufacture includes elements of casting, engraving, enamelling and cloisonné. It is decorated with interlace patterns, animal interlace, plaits of gold wire filigree, enamelling and various coloured glass studs.
[288] This detail is outlined in the printed booklet which describes all the stained glass in the church. Anon, 'St Brigid's Centennial Booklet 1863 – 1963', p. 6. (accessed San Francisco Diocesan Archive, San Francisco).

first two figures installed were figures of Irish Saints – and both placed in the Sanctuary of the church.

Rev. Cantwell chose more conventional religious subjects for the next commissions to be ordered – *Sacred Heart of Jesus* and *Immaculate Heart of Mary*. These were followed by ten windows in the nave depicting the *Mysteries of the Rosary*, ten clerestory windows depicting saints (including Irish saints St Patrick and St Columbanus), three large rose windows, fourteen small windows for the dome of the sanctuary and a number of small windows and door panels.[289]

Rev. Cantwell stressed that he wanted the windows to have a strong Irish appearance. His preference was to have Irish-type faces on the figures, at one point suggesting "You have lots of good looking men in Ireland to act as models".[290] He also specified that the door panels be based on the Cross of Cong.[291]

As the project progressed through 1951 and 1952 Rev. Cantwell was very satisfied with the work of Clarke Studios, and in particular how they showed the quality of Irish artistry. His comments included:

> Except for some altar covers which are coming from Dun Emer the sanctuary is nearly finished and looks really beautiful - a monument to your Irish artistry.[292]

He was also satisfied that the windows reflected an Irish character:

> Our [windows] are lovely and so Irish in appearance.[293]

Also, that the windows had a strong aesthetic appeal:

> Above all it is the beauty of the Irish artistry and colouring which delights me. I feel the Irish are second to none.[294]

---

[289] Details listed in Studios Order Book TCD MS 6060 and various items of correspondence in TCD MSS 6015 – 6036, TCD MSS 6127 – 6129 and TCD MS 6112.
[290] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 6th February 1950, TCD MS 6112/3/3.
[291] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 19th October 1954, TCD MS 6127/416.
[292] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 15th October 1948, TCD MS 6127/389.
[293] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 16th November 1949, TCD MS 6128/663.

Finally, he was satisfied that the donors approved, noting in particular the design for the Coronation of the Virgin (figure 101):

> I like the Irish faces on the angels especially the two who look out from behind the Blessed Virgins cloak. The donor happy is too.[295]

The church had many clerical visitors and Rev. Cantwell was a great advocate for the work of Clarke Studios.[296] To assist the company finding new clients he provided William Dowling with a list of pastors in San Francisco and Los Angeles who he believed were potential clients of Clarke Studios:

> I enclose addresses. There is a big field for Irish goods in the church here and I am doing my best to push them. The beginning is slow.[297]

On occasion he let William Dowling know the style of church being built so that they could tailor their proposal accordingly. For example, when Rev. Bernard Collins, a priest-friend of Rev. Cantwell, , was building the new St Cecilia's Church in San Francisco he gave Dowling some advice for his bid to provide the stained glass:

> The same person told me to tell you that the design of Rev. Collin's church is to be Spanish Colonial, hence the type of window should be different from ours. He suggests a Mexican type.[298]

Dowling researched this style of architecture and the life of St Cecilia, and provided suggestions and a proposal for the work, which was not accepted by Rev. Collins.[299]

---

[294] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 6th February 1950, TCD MS 6112/3/3.
[295] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 3rd February 1951, TCD MS 6128/687.
[296] Visitors included the Vicar General of Armagh, Canon Hurson of Drogheda, the architect for another San Francisco church St Cecilia's, Pastor of St Agnes's Rev. Thomas Millett (who placed an order), Rev. Collins (a member of the Diocesan building committee) and Archbishop of Los Angeles Rev. Joseph McGuckan.
[297] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 13th September 1952, TCD MS 6127/323. Los Angeles included Msgr. Bernard Dolan at St Anthony's, Long Beach.
[298] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 8th April 1953, TCD MS 6112/3/11. Rev. Harold Collins was building a new church at St Cecilia's parish in San Francisco.
[299] As outlined in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*), in addition to texts owned by the Clarke Studios Dowling used information researched at the National Library and Catholic Lending Library in Dublin to inform his plans and designs.

William Dowling recognised the efforts Rev. Cantwell was making on their behalf:

> Ever since we did your first two windows we have had numerous enquiries from the United States and have more commissions on hand for there than we ever remember before. This is a very gratifying position for us to be in, and makes us feel we have a great friend in yourself. Our problem is to keep commissions in rotation as far as possible and yours is of course well in front.[300]

In a separate letter Dowling acknowledged:

> St Brigid's windows and your enthusiasm has become a great advertisement.[301]

However, as the project progressed Rev. Cantwell became increasingly frustrated with the slow pace of delivery. In January 1954 he almost abandoned his plan to order ten clerestory windows but was persuaded to continue by a visit from Harry Clarke's son David Clarke, who assured him that the company would increase their production rate to speed delivery.[302] Rev. Cantwell wrote:

> The competition is fierce but you can meet it if you increase your capacity by a hundred percent. I must say I was not thinking about placing the order for the next ten windows until Mr Clarke assured me that I would not have to wait an indefinite period.[303]

The difficulty for Rev. Cantwell was that because the windows were donated by parishioners, they wanted to see results, and the slow progress was causing frustration and difficulties when donations for additional windows were required:

> It would be grand to have one church complete with Harry Clarke windows. However, the time element enters in. I have now been taking up a collection once a month for 15 months and have nothing

[300] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. James Cantwell, 7th July 1952, TCD MS 6020/316.
[301] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. James Cantwell, 10th November 1952, TCD MS 6020/540.
[302] David Clarke was a member of the Dublin Players, an Irish theatrical group which toured the United States in the 1950s.
[303] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 21st January 1954, TCD MS 6127/403.

> to show for it. This delay makes it impossible for me to collect for the clerestory windows. I prefer to ask individuals. They will ask how long they must wait. I could have the windows done locally but I think I would prefer to leave them as they are.[304]

Rev. Cantwell persisted with Clarke Studios and completed the fitting of his church with their stained glass and the final clerestory windows were installed in January 1956 (figure 102). Although he was disappointed that the windows noticeably darkened the interior, he was happy that many came to visit the church to see and admire the Irish craftwork:

> The last ten windows are beautiful and the door is a great success. The colours in the Sacred Heart are grand. I think you could not beat Mary Magdalen. Many are calling to the church, some taking pictures.[305]

As more windows were delivered he continued to relay his overall satisfaction to William Dowling:

> An Italian came recently and said the windows are finer than any he had seen in Italy.[306]

Finally, when the last window was installed he commented:

> Many come to admire the stained glass, some call it Harry Clarke's Church. When you get a start in Los Angeles all will go well.[307]

This last remark indicates that Rev. Cantwell did not believe San Francisco would produce many new orders for Clarke Studios – which was what transpired.[308] However, the company did win many orders in Los Angeles and other locations on the West Coast, due in part to the boost given by the work done for in San Francisco. The colouring, style and quality of the stained glass in St Brigid's was specifically referenced when commissions

---

[304] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 29th April 1954, TCD MS 6127/409.
[305] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 29th May 1955, TCD MS 6127/424.
[306] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 15th November 1955, TCD MS 6127/427.
[307] Letter from Rev. James Cantwell to William Dowling, 6th February 1956, TCD MS 6128/467.
[308] The only other significant order the Clarke Studios received for stained glass in San Francisco was from Rev. Cantwell's brother Rev. Arthur Cantwell for St Elizabeth's Church in 1961. In total, sixty-two windows were ordered for that church.

were received for St Anthony's Church, Long Beach (1952), St Thomas Seminary, Seattle (1958), Holy Trinity Church, San Pedro (1964) and Immaculate Conception Church, Sacramento (1964).[309]

St Brigid's Conclusion

This case study uncovers a number of aspects of the meaning that can be attributed to the commissioning of Clarke Studios to provide all the stained glass for St Brigid's. Firstly, Rev. Cantwell had great pride in Irish workmanship and was determined to have a strong, visible Irish dimension to the artistic decoration in his church. In addition to sculpture and carpet making, this artistry was exemplified by the style of Irish stained glass Clarke Studios produced, which featured both Irish subject matter and distinctive symbolism associated Ireland. The decorative motifs in a number of the windows were intended as a clear statement of the 'Irishness' of the church. Rev. Cantwell's motivation was to display the quality of Irish artistic achievement for all visitors to his church, and hence to show one aspect of the cultured pedigree of Irish Americans.

Secondly, the case study indicates that Rev. Cantwell's interest was not just to decorate his church but also to advertise and stimulate interest in the Irish craft industry in the U.S. His comment above that there was "a big field for Irish goods in the church here and I am doing my best to push them" indicates his motive to boost Irish sales in the U.S. He became a great advocate for Irish stained glass and promoted the work of Clarke Studios among his network of clerical connections throughout the West Coast of the United States in the 1950s.[310]

4.4.5. *Case Study 3 – St Timothy's Los Angeles*

Background

The parish of St Timothy in the Rancho Park/Cheviot Hills districts of Los Angeles was established by Archbishop John Cantwell in 1943 to meet the needs of the growing Catholic population in that part of the city. A temporary building was constructed adjacent to the site to act as the parish

[309] Various items of correspondence in TCD MS 6129, MS 6135, MS 6111 and MS 6113.
[310] These connections were mostly Irish American priests, many of whom would have trained in Ireland. See Chapter Three (*Patronage*) for further discussion on this.

church until a permanent structure was erected. Construction work on the new church commenced in January 1949 and the building was completed within a year. The Church of St Timothy opened for its first mass at Christmas 1949 and was formally dedicated on March 5, 1950.

The parish was named in honour of Archbishop Cantwell's personal secretary Rev. Timothy Manning.[311] Manning, born in Ballingeary Co Cork, had moved to Los Angeles in 1934 to complete his studies for the priesthood. After a period of further study in Rome he returned to Los Angeles and was elevated to the position of Auxiliary Bishop in 1946.[312]

St Timothy's first pastor was Rev. William O'Shea (1902-1963) a native of Clonakilty, County Cork. The architect for the church was Harold Gimeno who designed the building in the Spanish Colonial Revival style. Gimeno's mother was born in Ireland and his father was the Spanish-born artist Patricio Gimeno (1865 – 1940). Harold Gimeno qualified in architectural engineering at Harvard University and spent his career designing buildings, mostly in the Spanish Colonial Revival style in Oklahoma, New Mexico and California.[313]

The church was built at a time when the newly appointed Archbishop of Los Angeles, Rev. James McIntyre (1886-1979), was in the early days of a campaign which saw twenty-six new parish churches built in a five-year period.[314]

The Spanish Colonial Revival style of the building, characterised by red-tile roofs, stucco walls, ornate carvings and plaster work and wrought-iron features and railings, was popular in Los Angeles in the second quarter of

[311] Archbishop Cantwell had appointed Rev. Manning as his personal secretary in 1938.
[312] Bishop Manning was President of the Archdiocesan Building Committee and hence very influential in approving building plans in the Diocese. In a private capacity, in 1960 Rev. Manning commissioned the Clarke Studios to make a window for his family parish church in Ballingeary, Co. Cork.
[313] Biography of Gimeno family at https://npgallery.nps.gov/GetAsset/b0af08cd-f711-451c-a93c-0af6f49cd580 (accessed 15th June, 2021).
[314] McIntyre was appointed Archbishop of Los Angeles in 1948 following the death of Archbishop John Cantwell. In his first 4 years in office he established 26 new parishes, 64 parochial schools, and 18 high schools. Francis B. Thornton, *Our American Princes: The story of the seventeen American Cardinals* (New York: Putnam, 1963), p. 226.

the twentieth century.[315] The internal decoration of the church was a combination of new fittings, donations of religious objects (including statuary which had been used as movie props) and work bought at auction (including the three hundred-year-old gold-leafed reredos originally from Spain but arriving in Los Angeles via Mexico and New York, (figure 103).[316] As the location was close to a number of large movie studios, Rev. O'Shea was also able to engage some of the movie-set craftspeople to work on the woodwork and metalwork aspects of the churches decoration such as altar rails, pedestals, light fittings and side altars.[317] O'Shea was very satisfied with his church building, commenting that:

> The beauty of this new church is due entirely to our very gifted architect, and to very fine craftsmanship in the interior done by old craftsmen who were originally brought to this country by the motion picture industry, and whom we were able to contact as we live in the midst of the movie world.[318]

While the sanctuary is the central focus of the building, with the reredos providing an imposing aspect of the interior, the most striking architectural feature when entering the church is its collection of stained-glass windows (figure 75). The nave features sixteen 8-metre-tall lancet windows and eleven 3-metre-long clerestory windows. A large rose window is in place over the entrance and the sanctuary area has six smaller windows. In all there are thirty-five stained glass windows in the church, twenty-eight of which were made by Clarke Studios.[319]

---

[315] As described in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*) the architectural style of a building did not tend to influence the designs produced by the Clarke Studios. A more important factor was the dimensions of the opening, particularly the width which would impact the composition for a narrow window. Although the form at the top of the window (straight, arched or pointed) had an influence on the overall appearance of the window it had a minor influence on the design of the subject matter.

[316] Description of History and Artwork of St Timothy's https://sttimothyla.org/altar-woodwork-and-interior-finishes (accessed 15th June, 2021).

[317] The tabernacle, made of silver and gold, was made by artists from the special effects department from the nearby 20th Century Fox studio. Description of History and Artwork of St Timothy's https://sttimothyla.org/altar-woodwork-and-interior-finishes (accessed 15th June, 2021).

[318] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 1st July 1952. TCD MS 6135/5/5.

[319] The sixteen large windows incorporate two additional panels which, if counted separately, would mean there are 60 individually designed stained glass windows.

Selection of Clarke Studios as a Supplier

Rev. O'Shea had been educated and had trained as a priest in Ireland. Following his emigration to the United States he regularly visited his home town of Clonakilty. He was familiar with the work of Clarke Studios and specifically commented on their work that he had seen in churches in Cork and in Dublin. He was impressed with the stained glass windows which the Clarke Studios had made for the Franciscan Church in Cork in 1950, which he "liked very much" (figure 104).[320] He had also seen the Clarke Studios work at the Missionary College, Kimmage Manor in Dublin (1941/42).[321] Importantly, he was also familiar with the Clarke Studios 3-light panel erected at St John's Seminary, Camarillo, *Ireland's Homage*, which was, as described earlier in this chapter, brought to Los Angeles by Archbishop John Cantwell in 1940. This work was the most explicit reference to the type and quality of work he wanted for his own church – "I have in mind the kind of window that you sent to the New York World's Fair".[322] O'Shea had also seen the Clarke Studios work which was then underway for Rev. Thomas O'Toole at another Los Angeles church, St Ambrose, and while he liked the windows he was somewhat critical of the details in some of the completed windows there.[323]

This exposure to the work of Clarke Studios was useful to Rev. O'Shea as it helped him to be clear about what he wanted and what he did not want in the stained glass for his new church. He sought to keep the church bright, so while liking a rich effect, he wanted to keep the interior lightsome. He commented to William Dowling that his church was well built and finely decorated and therefore he did not want it to be "a victim of poor taste in windows".[324] Rev. O'Shea, on a trip to Ireland in August 1950, visited the Clarke Studios premises where he was assured that any windows he would order would be made with the finest craftsmanship and materials.[325]

[320] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 27th July 1953. TCD MS 6135/5/15.
[321] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 1st July 1952. TCD MS 6135/5/5.
[322] Ibid.
[323] For example, Rev. O'Shea was critical of the image of St Patrick, who he considered was too "dead pan" in appearance. Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 1st July 1952. TCD MS 6135/5/5.
[324] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 18th January 1951. TCD MS 6135/5/3.
[325] TCD MS 6084 (Visitor Book), and letter from William Dowling to Rev. O'Shea, 31st August 1950. TCD MS 6018/415.

O'Shea had many proposals for the provision of stained glass for the new church from stained glass studios in the United States and in Belgium, but from the outset he was determined to buy Irish stained glass from Clarke Studios. He was satisfied that the style and quality would meet the standards set by himself, his architect and the Diocesan Building Committee. So much so that he did not seriously consider alternatives.

> I have perhaps forty others [sketches] here in my office, but yours was the only one I submitted to the Archbishop and his Council for approval. You have permission to go ahead with four at once.[326]

Although Rev. O'Shea was leading the project, all designs were also subject to the approval of the Archbishops' Building Committee and input from the architect.

Discussions about the subject matter and design for first window went on for a long period. At the time Clarke Studios were working on a contract to provide twenty-nine windows for St Ambrose church in Los Angeles, therefore while the go-ahead was given in July 1952 it was October 1953 before first window, *The Annunciation* (figure 105), was shipped. The delay caused Rev. O'Shea a degree of frustration. In September 1953 he wrote:

> Please get our order shipped as soon as possible. I appreciate the difficulties you had in getting other orders through before beginning ours but I am under constant pressure here to give the order to an American company as they make much more of rapid delivery.[327]

However, this slowness in fulfilling the initial order didn't deter him and he pressed Cardinal McIntyre for approval for the next seven windows, while letting William Dowling know that there was a possibility for orders to provide up to thirty-five windows in all.[328] The *Annunciation* window was shipped to Los Angeles in October, via Glasgow, and was installed two days before Christmas 1953.

---

[326]Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 1st July 1952. TCD MS 6135/5/5. Although Rev. O'Shea was leading the project all designs were also subject to the approval of the Archbishop's Building Committee.
[327] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 8th September 1953. TCD MS 6135/5/16.
[328] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 29th September 1953. TCD MS 6135/5/17.

The elongated shape of the window determined William Dowling's layout of the design. The biblical scene, where the Angel Gabriel visits the Virgin Mary to announce to her that she is to become the Mother of God, is commonly portrayed with the main subjects arranged horizontally as seen in a window made by Clarke Studios for the Church of St Louis, Waco, Texas in 1967 (figure 106). In this window however, due to the narrowness of the window opening, the subjects are arranged vertically.[329] Dowling's overall design decision was to have individual subjects in each window rather than using the two lights to portray a single scene. This arrangement does not affect the impact of the window as there is no loss of the narrative of the subject despite the limited scope to connect the two main protagonists with gazes or gestures. In his design, Dowling unifies the elements by extending the arch which frames the Angel Gabriel down the window to include the Virgin Mary. Her sensitively portrayed figure portrays the humility traditionally associated with the scene.

The distinctive design features of Clarke Studios style are evident in the stained glass. The dominant colours in the window come from the Virgin's striking blue and magenta cloak over a pale blue gown, which match the colours of the Angel's garments. The small pieces of glass that make up the yellow floral garland in her hair, the surround of her halo and the trim on the Angel's cloak combine to give a glistening jewel-like effect when lit with bright Californian sunshine. The elongated necks and the modelling of the hands and facial features of the subjects are also characteristic Clarke Studios design features. Arcs and arches of stained glass give the sense of an enclosed space. Dowling, however, has not designed an entirely passive scene. The descending dove, a symbol of the Holy Spirit, and flames from a burning bush which appear to lick around the feet of the Angel Gabriel, animate the scene to an extent.[330]

[329] This window is paired with another subject from the Mysteries of the Rosary, *The Visitation*.
[330] The burning bush relates the Old Testament text where the prophet Moses witnesses an Angel appearing from bush which burned but was not destroyed, presenting an image of God. St Gregory of Nyssa related this episode to the Virgin Birth, in that the bush was not consumed, just as the virginity of Mary preserved. C. W. Macleod, 'Allegory and Mysticism in Origen and Gregory of Nyssa', in *The Journal of Theological Studies*, Vol. 22 (2), (October 1971), p. 377.

Unlike St Brigid's in San Francisco, there is no overt symbolism associated with Ireland in the window. Furthermore, no windows in the church, including those depicting Irish saints, include Ireland-related symbolism. As will be discussed below, this implies that the source of Rev. O'Shea's satisfaction with the window was the artistry in its design and the quality of the making of this Irish stained glass.

The completed window exceeded the expectations of Rev. O'Shea and his parishioners.

> The Annunciation surpassed all of my expectations, and you know, I expected a great deal from Harry Clarke Stained Glass Limited. The window is wonderful and the parishioners are delighted, the only question now is when are the rest coming?[331]

David Clarke, a director of Clarke Studios, was working in California at the time and visited St Timothy's to see the first installation and reported back the client's satisfaction with the first window.[332] He also saw the potential for more work in California and pressed the Studio to try to respond to the growing market, although he accepted that this would have to be balanced against the needs of Irish clients.[333]

The success of the *Annunciation* window within his parish and with Bishop Manning convinced Rev. O'Shea that he had made the right choice and that he wanted all the stained glass to be provided by Clarke Studios:

> I will be able to give you more orders right away, and thus get this whole place finished.[334]

He was very satisfied with the next set of designs provided, as was Bishop Manning who declared himself "well pleased" with what had been delivered and planned.[335] Over the next decade Clarke Studios continued to deliver all but seven (small) windows in the church.[336] Progress on orders for St

[331] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 27th May 1954. TCD MS 6135/5/24.
[332] David Clarke was a member of the Dublin Players, an Irish theatre group which toured the United States in the 1950s.
[333] Letter from William Dowling to David Clarke, 19th January 1954. TCD MS 6022/30.
[334] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 20th August 1954. TCD MS 6135/5/25.
[335] Ibid.
[336] The final large window with the subject of the *Holy Family* was made by the Clarke Studios in 1961 and three small windows were made by them in 1963. Of the people involved, Rev.

Timothy's was slow on occasion mainly due to the volume of work on hand at the company. Rev. O'Shea also allowed work for another Los Angeles parish to proceed ahead of his own.[337]

As the parish was made up of people from many ethnic backgrounds the subject matter of the donated windows reflected this multi-cultural aspect of St Timothy's. The windows include representations of locally significant saints, including St. Vibiana, a patroness of the Archdiocese of Los Angeles, Blessed Junipero Serra and Our Lady of Guadalupe. O'Shea was conscious of ensuring correct representation of saints who were important to these ethnic groups, and in particular those from Mexico. Some of these 'local' saints were unfamiliar to the Clarke Studios artists, and despite their research O'Shea had to correct the artist's interpretation of symbolism associated with Our Lady of Guadalupe to ensure that the Irish designers successfully produced work with unfamiliar subject matter:

> I am not too happy with *Our Lady of Guadalupe* sketch. We have a strong Mexican tradition in Southern California, and many of the people go to the shrine of Guadalupe for vacations and prayer. They are very conscious of certain peculiar things about this picture. Among them is that peculiar ray effect all around the Madonna. There actually is no crown on the Guadalupe picture, though I understand that on very great occasions they hang a gold crown on it. It could well be that your artist had a picture of such an occasion. I sent for and will send a picture of the shrine itself. You will see by it that your figure work on the Madonna was perfect, but that it needs the other things peculiarly associated with this apparition.[338]

Rev. O'Shea sent an article relating to Our Lady of Guadalupe to William Dowling and the artist amended the design accordingly. The result (figure 107) was very satisfactory to both Rev. O'Shea and the donor:

> The window of *Our Lady of Guadalupe* was quite a worry to me as the donor, who is chairman of the Missile Division of the largest aircraft

---

O'Shea, Bishop Manning and Harold Gimeno visited the Clarke Studios in Dublin at different stages in the project.

[337] Rev. O'Shea allowed the work for St Philip the Apostle church in Pasadena to proceed ahead of his own. This will be covered in more detail below.

[338] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 21st February 1956. TCD MS 6135/5/40.

> business in the world, is quite an authority on things Mexican, and can be very critical. I have a letter from him which reads in part "I was delighted yesterday while at mass to notice that you had installed the stained-glass window. It is truly magnificent. The people who made that window are wonderful artisans."[339]

This is further indication of Rev. O'Shea's concern that his trust in the quality of the Irish craftwork was well placed, and he did what he could to ensure that the studio's artists had all the information needed to produce exceptional stained glass windows. He also offered advice on the Junipero Sera window which he indicated "should have California Mission effect in background", a point which was reflected in the final design (figure 108).[340] Through these interventions O'Shea was able to guide the artists to not only provide accurate interpretations of these subjects, but also to show potential clients in Los Angeles that they could adapt to new subjects for multi-cultural audiences, thus further adding to O'Shea's satisfaction with their work.

While the choice of building design and some of the interior features (for example, the reredos) reflected the Hispanic character of the church's location in Los Angeles, from the beginning it was clear that Rev. O'Shea wanted his church to be an exemplar for Irish stained glass, a showcase in California for the skills of Irish craftspeople. Evidence contained in the correspondence between he and Clarke Studios indicates that he had dual reasons for doing this. Firstly, he wanted to boost the sale of Irish art products in the United States and thus make a contribution to Ireland's export economy. Secondly, he was proud of his own achievement in bringing the high quality work of Irish artists to the United States and he wanted to instil that sense of pride in the members of his congregation and in particular in other Irish Americans. These two aspects of Rev. O'Shea's motivation will now be examined in more detail.

[339] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 23rd April 1957. TCD MS 6135/5/55.
[340] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 5th November 1956. TCD MS 6135/5/48.

Promoting Irish Art and Craft

One significant indication of Rev. O'Shea's commitment to Irish stained glass was the extent of his investment. Every significant window in the church, with the exception of seven small windows which were installed after his death in 1963, was made by Clarke Studios. Through the 1950s and early 1960s he purchased £11,400 worth of stained glass from Clarke Studios.[341] He recognised the quality of their work and was willing and able to convince his parishioners, his donors, his Bishop and the Los Angeles Diocesan Building Committee that this was a worthwhile investment.

It is also clear from correspondence that Rev. O'Shea wanted Clarke Studios to succeed in finding more work in the United States. Even before his first window was delivered he made William Dowling aware of the potential opportunities for more business:

> I hope that your borders will be jewel-like, and I don't think you will get a better church for catching light than this-so you have plenty of opportunity to show what you can do.[342]

With his church as a showcase, he then proceeded to encourage other priests who were building and fitting out new churches to consider Ireland, and Clarke Studios in particular, as a supplier of stained glass.

One close ally was Msgr. Thomas O'Regan, pastor at the parish of St Philip the Apostle in Pasadena. Rev. O'Regan, who was born in County Limerick, was an influential Irish American priest who also served on the Diocesan Building Committee. Having seen Rev. O'Shea's *Annunciation* window he became dissatisfied with the stained glass in his own church and with Rev. O'Shea as mediator he proceeded to order thirteen windows of the same quality as those at St Timothy's for his own church.[343] He was directly involved in the project, at one point climbing a ladder steadied by the

[341] TCD MSS 6074, 6075 (Costing books). In 2021 terms this amounts to approximately €300,000. Calculated on line at https://www.cso.ie/en/interactivezone/visualisationtools/cpiinflationcalculator/ (accessed 2nd November 2021).
[342] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 1st July 1952. TCD MS 6135/5/5.
[343] Rev. O'Shea asked William Dowling to "Wire estimate immediately for thirteen windows size three feet by 7 1/2 feet in another church Mysteries of the Rosary same quality as ours". Cable from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 3rd September 1954. TCD MS 6135/5/26.The total value of the order was £2,990. TCD MS 6075 (Costing Book).

eighty-two –year-old Rev. O'Regan, to get measurements of the windows.[344] Rev. O'Shea regarded Rev. O'Regan's standing in the diocese as a great boost for Clarke Studios:

> Msgr. O'Regan is a grand old Irishman and this church, St Philips, is the third major church erected by him in this diocese. He is a member of the cardinals Building Commission, and I'm sure the most beloved and influential priest in this Archdiocese.[345]

Rev. O'Shea encouraged Clarke Studios to complete work quickly for Rev. O'Regan's church, even allowing them to put aside work for his own church to achieve this. The subject for the first window to be dispatched was The Annunciation. When the date for the solemn dedication of St Philip's was approaching, he was aware that there would be a large gathering of priests for the event and appreciated that this was a good opportunity for Clarke Studios to show their work to a large audience of potential clients.

> I am suggesting now that you drop all my work for the time being and get one window to Pasadena with all possible speed. Msgr. O'Regan has a very fine new church. Very elaborate murals have been installed and a truly magnificent altar. Early in April he will get a delivery from Rome of perhaps the most elaborate mosaic work in this country. We are very anxious that there should be a good selection of Clarke windows in for his dedication, which will draw the largest gathering of priests that will be seen out west for a long time to come.[346]

Msgr. O'Regan, who was then in his eighties, had had a long career and was highly respected in the diocese. It is clear from Rev. O'Shea's close involvement with St Philip's that he wanted Irish stained glass to be placed among the finest examples of ecclesiastical art in Los Angeles, commenting to William Dowling that "there are many who will now see what can be done in Ireland".[347]

From this episode is it clear that Rev. O'Shea's priority therefore was to promote Irish art and design in the best way possible. Unfortunately, Rev.

---

[344] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 24th January 1956. TCD MS 6135/5/39.
[345] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 15th September 1954. TCD MS 6135/5/29.
[346] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 24th January 1956. TCD MS 6135/5/39.
[347] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 21st February1956. TCD MS 6135/5/40.

O'Regan did not live to see his windows completed. The last shipment arrived when he was gravely ill in hospital, but was installed in time for his funeral. O'Shea commented to Dowling that "He was a great and holy priest and the windows you made for him were his pride and joy in the closing months of his life."[348]

Rev. O'Shea took every opportunity to promote the work of Clarke Studios with visiting clergy. The work for St Timothy's was directly referenced in the decisions to procure Clarke Studios stained glass by Rev. James McLaughlin at St Augustine's Parish and Rev. George Gallagher at Holy Trinity Parish, San Pedro. In 1957 Rev. McLaughlin commissioned a twenty-seven-light and tracery stained glass window for his church in Culver City, Hollywood.[349] In the period 1959 to 1962 Rev. Gallagher purchased thirty-seven windows to the value of £9,530 for his church in San Pedro. Rev. O'Shea's windows also helped Clarke Studios win a major commission in Seattle.[350]

A Source of Irish Pride

Rev. O'Shea declared that his favourite window in the church was the rose window over the entrance (figure 109).[351] It was one of the principle sources of light for the building, especially in the afternoon when the evening sun was reflected in from a large building about five-hundred metres away, then owned by Twentieth Century Fox film studio. The subject chosen for the window was Symbols of the Evangelists and the design is attributed to Terence Clarke.[352] Clarke's richly coloured design places a white dove representing the Holy Spirit dominating the centre of the window. Surrounding the dove are four decorative panels and four panels depicting the symbols of the evangelists. Although offset at ninety degrees from each other, the decorative panels are identical in design and colouring, giving the impression of mixed designs. Their colouring is predominantly blue and red with a green floral motif common to all four. The winged symbols of the ox (St Luke), the eagle (St John), the lion (St Mark) and the man (St Matthew)

[348] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 11th November 1957. TCD MS 6135/5/57.
[349] This commission is described in more detail in Chapter Three (*Patronage*).
[350] Rev. Thomas Connolly, Archbishop of Seattle, visited the Clarke Studios in Dublin where the manager, William Dowling advised him to visit St Timothy's. Rev. Connolly subsequently commissioned thirty-six windows to the value of £15,340 for St Thomas seminary in his diocese.
[351] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 27th May 1954. TCD MS 6135/5/24.
[352] TCD MS 11182/1400/251.

are illustrated as relatively large figures, ensuring that they are distinguishable in their elevated position in the church. The arrangement of the symbols is perfectly balanced, with the two four-legged creatures opposite each other in the horizontal plane, and likewise for the two-legged creatures in the vertical plane. The glowing effect of the rich colours can be seen in the strong Californian sunlight. The cool, calming effect of the dominant blue sections is complemented by the dynamic background of red which surround the mainly yellow figures. Great consideration has been given to the rendering of the symbols, with the aciding of the glass, incorporation of leadlines and staining giving a dynamic effect to the figures.

Rev. O'Shea was extremely pleased with the window when it was installed, commenting that, "I could not imagine a finer window. And in the opinion of visiting priests there is nothing out here to compare with it."[353] This comment not only describes how Rev. O'Shea was showing the Clarke Studios work to visiting priests but also emphasises the pride he held for Irish work.

Other than three windows depicting three Irish saints (figure 110) there are no overt symbols or emblems associated with Ireland. These windows depict St Patrick flanked by St Fachtna and St Finbarr. Rev. O'Shea chose the subjects for the windows which are located at clerestory level to the side of the altar in the sanctuary, opposite three matching windows depicting St Paul flanked by St Luke and St Timothy.[354] The placement of these windows in the sanctuary indicates the special status the subjects had for Rev. O'Shea.

St Fachtna was the founding Bishop and patron saint of the Pastor's native diocese of Ross in West Cork. He is depicted holding a crozier and a church, symbols of his status in the church and the monastery he established at Roscarbery Co. Cork. The youthful figure is depicted with blue and magenta garments and the coat of arms of Ross diocese is included in the window. His mitre contains the only element of Celtic Revival iconography in the

[353] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 5th November 1956. TCD MS 6135/5/48.
[354] Rev. O'Shea specified that the windows depict St Patrick and "Fachtna for my native Ross and Finbarr of Cork" Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 27th May 1954. TCD MS 6135/5/24.

church – a minimal amount of interlace pattern (figure 110a). Saint Finbarr, the patron saint of Cork, is depicted in red garments. He holds a bishops crozier and a book representing the school of learning he established in Cork. Similar to Harry Clarke's *St Finbarr* in the Honan Chapel Cork, his right hand glows in a mystical flame. St Patrick is in his customary green chasuble with a golden crozier. He stands on a green mound behind the fire he lit at the Hill of Slane, symbolic of him bringing the light of Christianity to Ireland.

The three windows appear as a well-executed, coherent group, with few distinctive artistic features or details which, given their height above ground (approximately ten metres), is unsurprising. Neither is there any overt nationalistic Irish symbolism other than the subject matter. Therefore, it can be deduced that the stained glass at St Timothy's was not intended to just appeal to Irish Americans, but to impress all visitors to the church. The windows were representative of high quality craftwork made in Ireland. He was "very proud of them, not only as windows, but especially as windows that came from Clarke Studios in Dublin."[355] Rev. O'Shea received compliments from members of his parish and from visitors from all over the country.[356] As the project progressed the parishioners' satisfaction grew – "People [of the parish] are delighted so far, each extra one is improving all the others. We are very proud to say they are made in Ireland".[357]

St Timothy's – Conclusion

Choosing Clarke Studios to provide his stained glass was not an easy option for Rev. O'Shea. He had a number of obstacles to overcome, including the pressure to buy from local suppliers and the need to gain the confidence of the Diocesan Building Committee and his donors. Throughout the process he also had financial difficulties and health issues to deal with.[358] However, he deemed that the struggles were worth the effort and he was not disappointed with the outcome.

[355] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 7th July 1955. TCD MS 6135/5/33.
[356] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. O'Shea, 19th May 1962. TCD MS 6030/272.
[357] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 29th May 1956. TCD MS 6135/5/45.
[358] In late 1958 Rev. O'Shea had several heart attacks, from which he recovered. The Clarke Studios also offered long term credit while Rev. O'Shea sought donors for windows already ordered.

Rev. O'Shea took great pride in the quality of Irish workmanship. He built a showcase of stained glass craft to demonstrate an exceptional aspect of the Irish, not just within his parish but also in the diocese. He showed fellow priests, parishioners and all who visited the church what Irish artists were capable of. Other than the three Irish saints depicted in the sanctuary there was no other obvious symbolism associated with Ireland in the stained glass and therefore the windows had to sell themselves without any Irish nationalistic overtones. The sense and meaning of Irishness to be found in the stained glass was in their making not the subject matter or iconography, a point Rev. O'Shea would have made to parishioners and visiting clergy.

Evidence from correspondence between Rev. O'Shea and Clarke Studios suggests that while his pride in the work of Irish stained glass artists was an important factor for him, the promotion of Irish craft in the United States, and in particular the work of Clarke Studios, was his primary concern. A testament to that is the amount of follow-on work in other locations on the West Coast that he was able to stimulate.

One of his letters to William Dowling summarises his experience:

> I have no words with which to express my thanks, every window that comes makes church more beautiful. You kept you promise made to me in Dublin that the windows would make Clarke Studios and we in California proud.[359]

4.4.6. *Case Study 4 – Mary Star of the Sea, San Pedro*

The background to the commissioning of stained glass windows for the new Mary Star of the Sea Church, San Pedro in 1958 - 1960, is outlined in Chapter Three (*Patronage*). Mary Star differs from the majority of other Clarke Studios commissions in California in that the pastor was not Irish but was born in the United States. Rev. George Scott was raised in Los Angeles to an English father and an American mother. His father Joseph Scott (1867 – 1958), whose mother was Irish, was an attorney and a civic leader with a strong attachment to the Catholic Church in Los Angeles.[360] He was an

[359] Letter from Rev. O'Shea to William Dowling, 23rd April 1957. TCD MS 6135/5/55.
[360] Joseph Scott was he awarded papal honours five times by three Popes: Knight of St. Gregory and later Knight Commander with Star, Knight of the Holy Sepulchre with Grand

advocate of Irish nationalist causes and was a strong supporter of Éamon de Valera's campaign in California in 1919/20 to raise funds for the establishment of an Irish Republic.[361] In the early 1920s he was Vice-President of the American Association for the Recognition of the Irish Republic and in the late 1940s he became a founding member and President of the American League for an Undivided Ireland.[362]

Rev. George Scott, who was chaplain of the Los Angeles chapter of The Knights of Columbus, continued his father's strong Irish nationalist support.[363] This is indicated in one of his letters to William Dowling:

> My beloved father, less than a year away from this "Valley of tears", has already managed to have such a heart-to-heart talk with Saint Patrick, that Sean O'Kelly is FINALLY going to be the guest of President Eisenhower this St Patrick's Day. For years, my father, President of the National Society for the Recognition of the Irish Republic, worked towards this end both "Dev" and Seán knew of his efforts in behalf of this much desired recognition. Erin go braugh.[364]

When he was assigned to Mary Star in 1946 he found a parish which was made up of people with a variety of national backgrounds, predominantly the families of immigrants from Croatia (then part of Yugoslavia) and Italy.[365] In October 1957 the pastor visited the Clarke Studios premises in Dublin where he outlined his plans for the new church and in January 1958 he awarded the contract for stained glass to the company, despite there being "hectic competition" for the order.[366]

Cross, Knight of Malta, and Privy Chamberlain of the Papal Sword. M. Anita Weyer, 'Joseph Scott: A Life of Service', Southern California Quarterly, Vol. 48 (3), 1966, p. 248.

[361] The American Association for the Recognition of the Irish Republic was established by de Valera to support Irish independence from Britain. M. Anita Weyer, 'Joseph Scott: A Life of Service', *Southern California Quarterly*, Vol. 48 (3), 1966, p. 251.

[362] Ibid.

[363] See Chapter Three (*Patronage*) for further information on Scott's involvement with the Knights of Columbus.

[364] Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling, 9th March 1959. TCD MS 6133/3/23.

[365] The parish had 10,000 Croatians and 5,000 Italians, most of who were earning their living from the sea. The parish community also consisted of immigrants from Japan, Scandinavia, Slovenia, Portugal, Ireland and Central America. Burt A. Folkart, 'Led San Pedro Parish From 1946 to 1975', *Los Angeles Times,* 12th July 1986.

[366] Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling, 20th January 1958. TCD MS 6133/3/11. Chapter Three (*Patronage*) outlines the extent of the order, which was one of the largest the company received in California.

Correspondence between the pastor and Clarke Studios indicates Rev. Scott's priorities, and hence the meaning that can be found in the stained glass commissions. These priorities relate to the design and fit of the stained glass to the architectural scheme and furnishings in the church, that the subject in each window links to religious and secular lives of the parish community and that their commissioning as original Irish artworks would encourage more orders for the Clarke Studios windows in the United States.

Stained Glass Design

The central focus of the church interior is the chancel area with its Carrara marble altar which is dominated by a large statue of the Virgin Mary holding a tuna clipper, all of which is housed under a bronze baldachin (figure 82). The pastor was very concerned that the stained glass would complement the chancel furnishings and hence he specified that the windows would provide a "golden glow of light" to harmonise with the altar and baldachin which were being imported from Italy. Terence Clarke, who designed all of the windows in the chancel, chose a colour scheme which is predominantly amber and yellow to achieve the desired effect (figure 111). Each window contains a single figure situated in a warm-coloured background.

The stained glass in the nave windows is less constrained in terms of palette. However, the pastor did request that the windows be lightsome enough to "let the light drift through", particularly on the west-facing side of the church which only received afternoon sun.[367] This is evident in the colour scheme used by the designers, a task shared by William Dowling and Terence Clarke. Blues and reds are the principal colours used in the colouring of the nave subjects, with less of the amber shades used in the chancel windows (figure 112). In particular the two large nave windows adjacent to the sanctuary depicting *Miraculous Draught of Fishes* and *Christ Stilling the Tempest* (figure 83) show a vibrancy which contrasts with the other more subdued window designs which contain solitary figures.

The subject for the *Miraculous Draught of Fishes* is an episode from the Luke's Gospel which relates an account of a miracle performed by Jesus Christ when he was calling his disciples. Through Christ's divine intervention

[367] Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling, 28th March 1960. TCD MS 6113/3/35.

a group of fishermen made an abundant catch of fish when earlier they had been unsuccessful, despite the doubt expressed by Simon Peter. An interpretation of the miracle is that by placing trust in the Lord good things will come. The window was designed by Terence Clarke who created a dynamic scene which includes figures of the fishermen hauling full nets into their boats which appear to be almost at the point of sinking due to the weight of the catch. The blue and violet sea appears to surge in waves around the boats, all under a pale blue sky. A flock of seabirds surround the boats looking for scraps, which brings a familiar element into the scene. On the main boat Simon Peter kneels before Christ who blesses him, confirming him as a disciple.

Christ is robed in red and stands out against the blue background, making him the central figure in the composition. While there are large background areas of sea and sky, there is also some detailed painting, particularly the detail of more than twenty fish and fifteen birds. Clarke has designed a well-balanced window in terms of colour, composition and movement, with a clear focus drawn to the main characters in the scene.

While the fishermen in the parish may not have related to the manual hauling of nets, they would relate to the delight of having an abundant catch. The spiritual message presented through this window is that such hope and joy is related to their own faith in Jesus Christ.

When it was installed in March 1960, Rev. Scott considered that the *Miraculous Draught of Fishes* far overshadowed anything that had been installed to that date.[368] When all the large nave and chancel windows were installed (twenty-six windows in total) Rev. Scott was very pleased with the overall appearance of the windows and the balance between the richness of colour and light:

> Thanking you once again for your excellent work which gives maximum of gorgeous colour with a reasonably large amount of light too so that one can read with a minimum of electricity being used.[369]

[368] Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling, 28th March 1960. TCD MS 6113/3/35.
[369] Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling, 22nd September 1960. TCD MS 6130b/2343.

This comment summarises his overall satisfaction with the overall effect of the stained glass windows, and how they fit with other aspects of the interior of the building.

Subject Matter

The imagery chosen by the pastor for the stained glass includes well-known Roman Catholic subjects such as St Paul, St Francis of Assisi, St Bernadette and Our Lady of Fatima, as well as three of the patron saints of Los Angeles Diocese – St Patrick, St Vibiana and St Emydius. Other subjects chosen reflect the importance of the sea to the community, such as the two large nave windows listed above, and two saints associated with fishing – St Peter and St Andrew.[370] The two large windows are of great spiritual significance in the church. Their subject matter connects Christ's mandate to his disciples as "fishers of men" to the everyday concerns of the fishermen of the parish – finding an abundant catch and safe passage at sea.[371]

A number of the windows depict saints associated with the national background of the parishioners, including St Brigid of Ireland, St Nicholas of Croatia, Our Lady of Guadalupe from Mexico and a symbol of the island of Ischia in the Mediterranean Sea (Italy). The final grouping of subjects was of personal interest to Rev. Scott including his namesake St George, St Frances Xavier Cabrini and St Pius X.[372] Rev. Scott was very complimentary of the design for his patron St George (figure 113), commenting that the figure "has such nice big eyes, as he nonchalantly 'knocks the daylights' out of the dragon".[373]

Rev. Scott took a detailed interest in the design of all the subjects, particularly where the artist was straying from conventional imagery. For

[370] A full list of the windows is given in Appendix 1.
[371] Matthew 4:18-20 "And Jesus, walking by the Sea of Galilee, saw two brothers, Simon called Peter, and Andrew his brother, casting a net into the sea; for they were fishermen. Then He said to them, "Follow Me, and I will make you fishers of men." They immediately left their nets and followed Him". Published online at https://www.biblegateway.com/passage/?search=Matthew%204%3A18%2D20&version=NKJV (accessed 27th November 2021).
[372] Rev. Scott's father had assisted St Francis Xavier Cabrini on her arrival in the United States. He also owned a photograph of St Pius X, which the pope had signed with his own hand in 1908 and was a gift to his father and his mother. Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling, 6th February 1959. TCD MS 6113/3/22.
[373] Letter from Rev. Scott to William Dowling, 9th April 1959. TCD MS 6113/3/24.

example, in response to Rev. Scott's question regarding what he considered was an unusual representation of St Patrick William Dowling responded that:

> We want to portray him somewhat different from the usual representation as a very old man with a long beard, because we feel that he should be shown as a virile and strong character in his prime.[374]

Rev. Scott accepted this explanation without further comment.

Similarly, Dowling described the idea behind St Brigid (figure 114) wearing a blue cloak rather than more earthy brown or green garments – "Brigid is in a blue cloak, a custom of ours which associates with her designation of Mary of the Gael."[375] Although Rev. Scott reviewed all the designs produced by Clarke Studios he was content to leave the details of each to the artists, commenting:

> Throughout, I have insisted that YOU be the final judge about all the details. After all, you have been doing this work for so many years, and you certainly know the answers to so many questions, even before they are asked.[376]

Dowling's design for the St Brigid window is a modest rendering of the subject. The saint is depicted with two of her typical attributes, an abbess's crozier and a church. Her golden nimbus represents her association with light and the sun. There are no additional features often included with depictions of St Brigid such as a calf, an oak leaf or a cross made of rushes. The window is at clerestory level and therefore such detail would not be easily visible from floor level. Also, the pastor's request to maintain lightsomeness in the church meant that the general approach to the design of these windows was a single figure against a light background; hence there is no detailed working in the borders of any of the clerestory windows. Each window is also captioned with the name of the saint, thus simplifying the identification of the subject.

---

[374] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. George Scott, 2nd March 1959. TCD MS 6027/75.
[375] Letter from William Dowling to Rev. George Scott, 22nd March 1960. TCD MS 6028/144. St Brigid's assignation as Mary of the Gael is discussed further in Aodh de Blacam, 'Mary of the Gael', *The Irish Monthly* , Vol. 67, (1939), pp. 577-586.
[376] Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling, 28th March 1960. TCD MS 6133/3/36.

Mary Star is also a good example of how Clarke Studios were able to readily adapt to needs of a multi-ethnic congregation. As is described in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*) the designers carried out detailed research on unfamiliar subjects, often with the assistance of the patron. If the artist was unsure of a detail regarding the subject, the pastor would clarify what was required. The project folder for the Mary Star commissions contains a range of prayer cards, booklets and other images of potential subjects.[377] These include sketches of the shrines and baptismal font in the church, an advertising leaflet for C. F. Horan and Co. showing a Carrara marble statue of St Emydius, a pamphlet on the life of St Maria Goretti *A Model for Millions* produced by Catholic Truth Society of Ireland (1960) and a pamphlet in honour of St John of the Cross.[378] When William Dowling was unsure about the garment worn by St Frances Xavier Cabrini he asked Rev. Scott for more detail on the colouring and a bow worn under the chin.[379] The pastor sent an image of a clay model of the saint and a photograph of the nun's habit (figure 115), commenting "The habit is all black with quite a light-weight veil over the head (much like the Mantilla worn at Audiences with the Holy Father), and a funny big bow-tie."[380] Dowling used the photograph to inform the final design for the window (figure 116).

Overall however, other than where different national groups can associate with an individual saint, there are no explicit references to the differing ethnic background of the parishioners. Similarly, there are no suggestions in the decoration or iconography in the windows that indicates that the stained glass is of Irish origin. Looking at the subject matter and decoration of the windows, it would not be possible to identify them as being Irish-made.

Promoting Irish Made Stained Glass

The restrained architecture of the building allows the decorative features in the church to dominate the experience of those who enter the building. In addition to their spiritual significance, the furnishings were designed to

[377] TCD MS 6113/3 holds the majority of inward correspondence, sketches and epherma related to the project.
[378] St Maria Goretti is an Italian saint associated with mercy and St John of the Cross is the patron saint of the Italian island of the Ischia.
[379] St Frances Xavier Cabrini (1850 – 1917) was an Italian-born nun who worked with Italian immigrants in the United States.
[380] Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling, 3rd February 1960. TCD MS 6133/3/32.

recognise and celebrate the diverse ethnic background of the parish. The selection of an Irish company to provide all of the stained glass for the church indicates the high value the pastor placed on the quality of the work of Clarke Studios, and he promoted their work among his peers in Los Angeles as such:

> Wherever I go, especially among the clergy, I hear nothing but praise for what you have done and will continue to do for us. I sincerely hope it will bring you a lot of business.[381]

Visiting pastors, including for example Rev. John Clarke of St Anselm's parish, Rev. Finnian Carroll of St Francis of Assisi parish (both in Los Angeles) and Rev. George Gallagher of Holy Trinity San Pedro, were impressed by the Clarke Studios work and were encouraged to consider the company's stained glass for their own new churches by Rev. Scott.[382]

Many non-clerical visitors also praised the stained glass and Rev. Scott described how happy he was that the "compliments keep pouring in".[383] The decoration of the church was described in local newspaper articles announcing the various stages of the church's development like, for example, an article on the dedication ceremony for the church:

> Furnishings, including the altars, statues and shrines, executed in bronze and marble and imported from Italy were the donations of individuals and parish organisations, as were the stained glass windows, designed, executed and imported from Ireland.[384]

On another personal level, Rev. Scott was also happy to be able to continue the patriotic work his father had been doing for Ireland. Specifically, he worked to support Ireland's standing in the production of ecclesiastic art for export, acting as an ambassador for the best of Irish stained glass. He was a regular visitor to Ireland and on more than one occasion he met with Taoiseach Éamon de Valera who, as he related to William Dowling, was "was

[381] Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling, 5th March 1960. TCD MS 6133/3/34.
[382] Although all three pastors received proposals from the Clarke Studios, only Rev. Gallagher proceeded with an order. Rev. Clarke had windows made that were designed by David Clarke. Various items of correspondence in Clarke Studios Letterbooks, TCD MSS 6024, 6027.
[383] Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling 22nd September 1960, TCD MS 6130b/2343.
[384] Anon, 'Solemn Rites and Pageantry to Dominate Mary star Dedication', *San Pedro News Pilot*, 27th August 1960, p. 1.

more than delighted to know that [he] was obtaining [his] windows from you in Holy Ireland."[385]

Conclusion

As was the case with St Timothy's, but unlike that of St Brigid's, there is no evidence to suggest that the motive behind the commissioning of Irish stained glass for Mary Star of the Sea was to identify the parish as an Irish parish, or to highlight the Irish heritage of the parish leadership. This was an example of Irish craft which was assimilated into the fabric of a multi-cultural parish – symbolic of the Irish who themselves had integrated into a multi-cultural American society.

The procurement of Irish stained glass, with all the risks associated with cost and delivery, was also a statement of the power Rev. Scott had, both within his parish and at diocesan level, to drive through his own agenda in terms of the furnishing of the church. He persuaded his parishioners, his sponsors, his architect, his archbishop and the diocesan officials that his ambition for the church was worthwhile and achievable – and he succeeded in making that happen.

Evidence from correspondence between Rev. Scott and Clarke Studios suggests that once he was satisfied that Clarke Studios could provide the quality of work that he demanded, then it was the promotion of Irish craft in the United States which became his primary concern. He established a reference point of excellence in stained glass-making in the Los Angeles Diocese where the work of an Irish company produced windows that fit with the architecture of the building, were visually appealing to its multi-cultural audience and accurately presented subjects that they could associate with. Therefore, the meaning to be found in the Mary Star of the Sea commission is that the Irish excel in the craft of making stained glass, that the patron is extremely satisfied with what was delivered and wholeheartedly recommends it to any prospective buyer.

[385] Letter from Rev. George Scott to William Dowling, 16th September 1958. TCD MS 6113/3/20.

4.4.7.*Comparison with other Commissions*

A search of all correspondence associated with commissions in the United States indicates that the findings in these case studies are indicative of the motivations of the majority of commissioning clergy. For example, following the installation of ten windows at Our Lady of Mercy Convent, Auburn Sacramento, the Sister Superior, Sr. Barbara, commented:

> I hope they will bring you more orders for such windows in the United States, especially in California, as they are the most beautiful to be seen anywhere in this part of the country.[386]

Rev. Maurice Dee at Immaculate Conception parish, Monrovia, Los Angeles, expressed how satisfied he was following the installation of the first of fifteen windows at his church:

> I have had many visiting clergy already, and nothing but praise. of course it should be good coming from Clarkes.[387]

The Archibishop of Seattle Rev. Thomas Connolly, when declining a request to delay installation of one of his windows in order to allow it to be displayed at an Irish ecclesiastical art exhibition in London, outlined his wish to support Irish exports:

> While, under ordinary circumstances, I would do everything in my power to promote and encourage Irish exports and any exhibition of Irish religious art, I feel that in this instance I would prefer to have our beautiful Annunciation window installed in the seminary chapel in time for the dedication of the institution in mid-april. In fact, I believe the complete installation here will do more for you in the way of advertising.[388]

Rev. Michael O'Callaghan expressed his pride in the fifty-seven windows installed at St Edward's Church, Seattle:

[386] Letter from Sr. Supr. Barbara to William Dowling, 16th January 1953. TCD MS 6129/900.
[387] Letter from Rev. Maurice Dee to William Dowling, 1st May 1956. TCD MS 6128/831.
[388] Letter from Rev. Thomas Connolly to William Dowling, 31st December 1958. TCD MS 6117/2/11. The window was made for St Thomas the Apostle Seminary Kenmore, Seattle.

be assured that there is nothing like them in Seattle or the West Coast. Thank you and all your staff most sincerely. You all did a grand job for stained glass, for St Edward's and for me.[389]

The number of windows represented by these examples, plus those included in the case studies, amounts to almost three hundred windows - more than half of the total number windows installed by Clarke Studios in the western states of the U.S.

4.5. Chapter Conclusion

Throughout the twentieth century Irish Americans continued to improve their standing in American society. This was achieved through a wide ranging involvement in civic leadership, public service and media. As the century progressed the image of Irish Americans, aided by a more benevolent portrayal in popular arts such as cinema and radio broadcasting, rebuffed negative nineteenth-century stereotypical representations of Irishness. In the 1930s the image of the new progressive Ireland which grew from the nation's rich cultural past was presented at World's Fairs held in the United States. Economic developments in the aftermath of the Great Depression and World War II provided Irish Americans with further avenues for advancement. This research has focused on how Irish Americans conveyed one aspect of their ethnic identity in American society, revealing how a large Catholic Church building programme in the 1950s and '60s was used to demonstrate a cultured aspect of their heritage through the procurement of contemporary Irish church craft.

Chapter Three (*Patronage*) identified the extent of the patronage of Clarke Studios work in California. This chapter has examined in detail the meaning inherent in the commissions, arguing that the choice of Clarke Studios stained glass was driven by two factors. Firstly, the desire of patrons to enhance an aspect of the Irish American cultural identity by having high quality Irish craft on display in their churches which would enhance the standing of Catholic Irish Americans in society. These finely produced Clarke

[389] Letter from Rev. Michael O'Callaghan to William Dowling, 3rd May 1966. TCD MS 6117/1/26.

Studios windows were indicative of the sophisticated capabilities of Irish artists in terms of style, erudition and complexity, and this was presented as reflecting one cultured aspect of Irishness. The second aspiration was more nationalistic, where patrons wished to support Ireland economically by buying Irish-made products, thus creating income for Irish craftspeople.

These conclusions are supported by evidence from the case studies presented above. For the priests concerned, it is clear from their correspondence with Clarke Studios that it was a matter of pride for them to be able to show the artistic capabilities of Irish craftspeople. The Clarke Studios stained glass represented a positive aspect of their own ethnic heritage which in turn reflected positively on their identity as Irish Americans – either explicitly as was the case in St Brigid's, or implicitly as was the case with St Timothy's and Mary Star of the Sea. These stained glass objects, now part of the material culture of their churches, would stand as a permanent totem of their Irish origins and the role they played in American society.

Conclusion

Research Context

The MPhil dissertation *The Rise and Fall of Harry Clarke Stained Glass Limited* (2014), revealed the output of a company which in the course of its existence produced more than one thousand stained glass windows for clients worldwide.[1] That research presented a broad view of the achievements of Clarke Studios and laid the foundation for a more detail investigation into the work of this artist-led enterprise. Focusing on the region which provided most of the company's business in the mid-twentieth century, the United States, the new research carried out as part of this study has exposed how and why this was achieved.

A survey of texts currently published into the subject of Irish ecclesiastical art revealed two significant gaps in current research which could explain this phenomenon. Firstly, although several publications focus on the work of individual artists, there is no detailed study of the making of Irish stained glass as a business endeavour. Related to this is the dearth of research from the perspective of art-production by a collective of artists whose work conforms to a studio style and not the personal style of each artist. Secondly, while many sources consider the history of American Catholicism and the Irish in America, none deal specifically with the patronage of ecclesiastical art by the Irish diaspora. These gaps are interrelated, and set the context for this research.

This thesis argues that the choice of Clarke Studios as a supplier was driven by two main aspirations of the company's patrons – their desire to have high quality Irish craft on display in their churches which would enhance the standing of Catholic Irish Americans in the United States, and their wish to support Ireland economically by buying Irish craft, creating work and income for Irish people with whom they continued to identify. In doing so the research has looked at the phenomenon from two perspectives – Clarke Studios as a business and the company's clients as patrons of Irish art - who they were and why they bought Irish stained glass.

[1] Paul Donnelly, 'The Rise and Fall of Harry Clarke Stained Glass Limited' (MPhil Dissertation, TCD, 2014).

This has required an art-historical study of the contexts in which Clarke Studios was established by Harry Clarke and how the company earned and sustained a reputation for its stained glass work. A close examination of the business records of the company has revealed how it operated on a day-to-day basis – how it advertised and promoted its work, how it found patrons, and how it made and delivered stained glass to the satisfaction of its clients.

The research then considered two dimensions of the patronage Clarke Studios received from American ecclesiastical clients. Firstly, it has investigated the historical contexts relating to the American Catholic Church and the Irish diaspora, which was an important element in creating a demand for Irish stained glass. Research into the company's order books uncovered the full extent of this demand as it relates to Clarke Studios. Having established the context and extent of patronage, further examination of the Clarke Studios business archive has revealed the main findings of this research – the motivations which drove U.S.-based patrons to commission stained glass from Clarke Studios.

The stained glass windows can be considered as objects which are part of the material culture of American Catholicism. Therefore, this thesis takes a material culture approach to analysing the installed stained glass to reveal the meaning inherent in the presence of the windows in American Catholic churches. This approach to the topic has allowed conclusions to be drawn about how Clarke Studios contributed to the cultural aspirations of Irish Americans in the mid-twentieth century.

When setting the bounds of this thesis a number of strands of research associated with the subject were considered and deemed to be outside the scope of enquiry. Although Clarke Studios made stained glass for clients in a number of locations across the U.S., the focus of the research was on commissions from patrons based in California as they provided the largest amount of contracts during the period and proved to be representative of all the Clarke Studios' American commissions. Also, although many churches were built in California in the timeframe of this research, not all Irish-led projects considered Clarke Studios as suppliers. The reasons behind those

decisions are not the focus of this research, unless Clarke Studios was involved in bidding for work at those locations.

Research Questions

As outlined in Chapter One (*Research Goals*), three questions provided a basis for the research goals of this project. The first question was to identify how the company positioned itself as an Irish artist-led business to win a significant number of orders for its work in California in the 1950s and '60s. The second question related to the patronage of Irish stained glass by American clients – specifically, what were the circumstances that created a level of demand for Irish stained glass in the period, how did Clarke Studios respond to that demand, and what was the extent of that patronage? The final question addressed by the research was to determine the meaning inherent in the commissions. To what extent did the windows serve as indicators to Irish Americans of their past heritage, signifying their ongoing contribution to American society and culture and/or, to what extent was the patron's primary motivation to support Ireland's economy by increasing Irish craft exports?

Answering these research questions has determined how Clarke Studios operated as a business to sell and deliver their work, what form did Californian commissioned stained glass take, and the reasons why they were commissioned to do so.

Research Approach

The primary source of information which has informed this research is the Clarke Studios Archive held in the Library of Trinity College Dublin. The first objective was to discover the extent of the Clarke Studios work in the United States.[2] The review required the examination of more than thirty thousand pages of documentation and the recording of helpful information. This revealed an inventory of six hundred and forty windows across eight States

[2] This large undertaking involved examining the Studios order book 1929 – 1950 (TCD MS 6060), sales book (TCD MS 6079), all outward correspondence records between 1930 and 1970 (TCD MSS 6001 – 6038) and all inward correspondence records (TCD MSS 6109 – 6119, TCD MSS 6127 – 6130b).

in the U.S., more than four hundred of which are in California.[3] The correspondence records for all American locations were examined to discover and record the most relevant information which would inform this research project. Information from more than two thousand three hundred mail exchanges has been captured in a database, the format of which is given in Appendix 3.[4] The result of this enquiry was to confirm California as having the most revealing group of locations, and within that group a number of specific locations emerged which had informative correspondence exchanges which would provide insight into how and why commissions were awarded. These locations, which became the subject of the case studies detailed in Chapter Four (*Meaning*), also represent work in the three significant geographical clusters of commissions – Sacramento, San Francisco and Los Angeles. The findings from the case studies were checked against other locations to ensure that they were representative of the broader picture, which was the case.

A research visit to all locations in California with installed windows was essential for capturing the exact number and location of all extant windows, and understanding their visual and elucidative impact. This resulted in a collection of photographic evidence for each location and the gathering of empirical information, such as the physical details of each window for a database.[5] Due to the scale of information gathered for this research, these databases and the digitised content of the Clarke Studios archive were critical tools in the searching, sorting and filtering of source data for the project.

Research Findings

At a high level, this research has proven that the extensive presence of Clarke Studios stained glass in Californian Catholic churches is due to two related elements. The first is the practical marketing actions Clarke Studios took as a business to win commissions in the United States. The second is the nationalistic motivation of a number of Irish American pastors to

[3] The majority of the Californian windows are in Sacramento, San Francisco and Los Angeles. The next largest concentration of Clarke Studios is in Seattle where more than one hundred windows are installed.
[4] The database uses MS Excel to store the information.
[5] The format of this database, which also uses MS Excel, is included in Appendix 2.

incorporate Irish stained glass in their new church buildings in order to demonstrate how an Irish company could compete with and outshine competitors in this field of artistic endeavour, and in so doing promote the status of the Irish in America.

The findings from the research into the Clarke Studios business archive has exposed the working methods of the company and demonstrates that Clarke Studios relied on two important factors to be successful in winning commissions – sustaining the quality and style of their work to standards established by its founder Harry Clarke, and the company's active pursuit of business in the United States. This included utilising an international network of Irish clerics, and at times seeking the support of the resources of the Irish government.

Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*), describes how Clarke Studios built on Harry Clarke's reputation as an international glass artist and emulated his original aesthetic style. Following the approach of their founder, the company emphasised to clients that their designs were also inspired by sources from medieval church stained glass, and were informed by Arts and Crafts and Irish Revivalist principles, movements that had gained a significant reputation internationally.[6] Throughout the period that Clarke Studios operated, the 'Harry Clarke' factor continued to be an important aspect of its business. The company was established with his name in the title and hence it appeared on every piece of correspondence, every design drawing and many of the finished windows. Although this created a degree of vagueness regarding authorship, as illustrated in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*), the company was happy to let the ambiguity persist as it explicitly associated the artists with their founder's work.

Harry Clarke had created distinctive and highly desirable form of stained glass which determined the Clarke Studios style. However, although the company purported to maintain his original aesthetic in their designs, as described in Case Study 1, visual analysis conducted for this research

[6] Texts which describe these movements and inform this research include Sheehy, *The Rediscovery of Ireland's Past the Celtic Revival, 1830–1930* (1980), Larmour, *The Arts and Crafts Movement in Ireland* (1992) and Gordon Bowe, 'The Irish Arts and Crafts Movement (1886-1925)' in *Irish Arts Review Yearbook* (1990/1991).

demonstrates that the style of the windows produced by Clarke Studios evolved over time in order to serve both the company's and the patron's needs. As argued in the case study, many of the creative elements that made Harry Clarke's windows unique are less evident in later designs. Artists such as William Dowling and Terence Clarke had developed a contemporary 'Clarke Studios' style, which was derived from but did not slavishly copy Harry Clarke's approach. Later design elements become flatter and less detailed. These developments proved acceptable to clients, and in some cases it was preferred, as the now less labour-intensive processes led to less cost and to faster delivery times while still producing what they considered to be excellently designed windows.

Although Clarke Studios did create some work in what they considered a more 'modern' style, characterised by a more abstract approach to design (see for example figure 21), the composition of the majority of the company's work was in a traditional vein – figurative depictions of religious subjects that would be traditionally seen in stained glass. This style was described by Dowling as 'modern traditional'.[7] As proved by this research, this type of work was the Clarke Studios' strength and was what their clients wanted. However, when this type of imagery and style went out of favour in the late 1960s, so also did the market for the Clarke Studios' work shrink.

Clarke Studios actively pursued American business, realising by the mid-twentieth century that there were good opportunities to sell stained glass there. The company built on the reputation of early commissions won during Harry Clarke's lifetime in New Jersey and Sacramento, and they used their presence at the state-sponsored Irish Pavilion at the New York World's Fair in 1939, to show prospective clients what they could do.[8] As described in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*), they advertised in Irish and American religious publications and used connections they had made with Irish figures within the American Catholic Church to directly lobby potential clients. The Clarke Studios correspondence records confirm that Irish clergy were at this time in a dominant position in the American Catholic church and when Irish

[7] The term 'modern traditional' is described in more detail in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*).
[8] The window made for the 1939 New York World's Fair, *Ireland's Homage*, was later installed at the Los Angeles Diocesan Seminary at Camarillo. This high-profile location which had a large throughput of diocesan priests provided great exposure for the company's work.

American pastors were building new churches, particularly during the post-World War II economic boom, Clarke Studios ensured that they were well placed with a number of those priests to compete for stained glass commissions.

As established in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*), the contribution of the Clarke Studios' manager, William Dowling, was an important factor in building good relationships with the clergy and in winning new business. Many of the correspondence records show that Dowling, who was also principal designer and head salesperson, had an empathetic way of dealing with clients. He spoke directly to their ideals and concerns, emphasising that Clarke Studios was not just made up of skilled artists but skilled Catholic artists, with a deep understanding of Christian subject matter and Catholic dogma. He could communicate in an informed and convincing manner, particularly when questions arose about religious subject matter and its representation in glass, assuring them of the artists' experience in representing those subjects as beautiful windows.[9] In that way he built good relationships with patrons, who trusted his opinion and generally took his advice.[10]

As described in Chapter Three (*Patronage*), another way that Clarke Studios won the trust of their patrons was the company policy to only deal directly with clients, eschewing approaches from American ecclesiastical goods suppliers to act as agents for their work. This also allowed them to develop good personal relationships with their clients, and in particular with a small number of influential senior Irish American clergy and pastors who persuaded architects to engage Clarke Studios, and who also recommended their work to other clergy.

---

[9] The Studios' artists were also amenable to client's suggestions, and were open to design assistance when dealing with unfamiliar with subjects such as Saints of American or Mexican origin to serve the needs of the local communities from other ethnic backgrounds. This was required for common American subjects such as St Junipero Sera, Our Lady of Guadalupe, Mother Ann Seton and St Emydius. TCD MS 6113/3 holds a number of prayer cards with images associated with these saints sent by patrons.

[10] An example of this was the case at St Augustine's, Culver City where in response to William Dowling's suggestions for a theme for the windows the pastor responded "I am very pleased with suggestions, I will accept the second one as I feel the people will understand more easily and consequently will mean more to them." Letter from Rev. James McLoughlin to William Dowling, 27th June 1956. TCD MS 6130/1704. This interaction is described in Chapter Three (*Patronage*).

While the Clarke Studios archive contains details of the extent of the company's advertising efforts in the United States, it also reveals that its greatest selling point was not marketing or sales visits but installed work and word-of-mouth recommendations from a small number of patrons.[11] The greatest advertisement for Clarke Studios in the United States was the stained glass that was already in place in churches. Chapter Three (*Patronage*) demonstrates how, as observed in some of the correspondence, good endorsements from existing clients were a significant factor in how the company won more orders. Seeing the work in position in churches and hearing the testimony of satisfied customers, including the practicalities of doing business at long distances, won new clients and was a way of convinced architects of the suitability of the Clarke Studios' stained glass for their buildings.

Buying Irish did have disadvantages however, principally the time it took to make and deliver the windows – usually months and in some cases such as St Brigid's in San Francisco, more than a year. Although for the most part pastors were willing to wait, from time to time their patience waned and the company received criticism for delays and, on occasion, lost orders for additional stained glass in that location.[12] Other disadvantages described in correspondence included having to find a local installer to put in the windows, shipping delays, import difficulties at the receiving ports, dealing with breakages on arrival and dealing with a slow postal service.

Supported by evidence from the Clarke Studios correspondence, this thesis argues that a principal factor in the decline in the company's success at winning orders was the reduced influence of Irish American priests in the church decoration decisions. As discovered by William Dowling during his visit to the United States in 1968, a downturn in business was happening at the same time as a shift in the power balance between pastors and their architects was occurring. This loss of power by Irish American pastors is

[11] As described in Chapter Two (section 2.3.5), the company advertised in Irish publications which had worldwide circulation such as *The Capuchin Annual*. In the United States they advertised in Diocesan Annuals issued by Catholic publications such as *The San Francisco Monitor*, *The Catholic Herald* (Sacramento) and *The Tidings (Los Angeles).*

[12] This was the case for example at St Anthony's, Long Beach, when a repeat order for an additional two windows was lost. Letter from Rev. Bernard Dolan to William Dowling 12th March 1956. TCD MS 6129/978.

described in detail in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*). The change also coincided with liturgical reforms which were accelerated by the impact of the Second Vatican Council. These reforms resulted in a change in the architectural style of many new church buildings and as a result figurative stained glass produced by Clarke Studios was less in favour and was replaced with abstract designs. New buildings were more likely to feature these new forms which were less expensive to produce but more expensive to import as lower cost stained glass attracted heavy import duties.[13] This was another key factor in the fall-off of the Clarke Studios business in the late 1960's.

Motivation Behind Commissions

Chapter Four (*Meaning*) describes how, through the twentieth century, the standing of Irish Americans in society improved, and argues that Clarke Studios windows were one manifestation of the upward mobility of Irish Americans in American society. The agency of the Irish diaspora and their descendants was signified in Clarke Studios glass through both their subject matter and their Irish provenance. The mid-twentieth century expansion of the population of California and the consequent boom in the number of practising Catholics put many Irish American pastors in influential positions with respect to building and decorating new Catholic churches. The integration of Irish visual and material culture into church buildings through the medium of stained glass, amongst other forms, enabled them to include symbols of their Irish heritage in everyday American life.[14]

The three detailed case studies in Chapter Four (*Meaning*) illuminate differing motivations behind commissions – there were patrons who bought Irish stained glass because of their pride in the quality of 'their' Irish work which they wanted to display to visitors, and these were aligned with those who were more overtly nationalistic, wishing to financially support the Irish craft industry, and hence Ireland's export economy. In summary, the case studies reveal that, at St Brigid's in San Francisco the pastor's motivation

[13] As described in Chapter Two (*Clarke Studios*), stained glass which cost less than $15 per square foot (which would include abstract designs) attracted import duty when entering the United States. The Clarke Studios figurative stained glass averaged between $20 and $30 per square foot.

[14] Other forms, as listed in Chapter Three (*Patronage*), include carpets, altar cloths, statuary and metalwork.

was twofold - to show the quality of Irish artistic achievement, and hence to show one aspect of the cultured pedigree of Irish Americans, and also to boost the sales of Irish stained glass in California.[15] At St Timothy's in Los Angeles, while the pastor's pride in the work of Irish stained glass artists was a factor for him, the promotion of Irish craft in the United States, and in particular the work of Clarke Studios, was his primary concern.[16] Finally, at Mary Star of the Sea Church in San Pedro, it was the promotion of first-rate, attractive Irish craft in the United States which was primary concern of the pastor.

Research Contribution

As outlined in the Introduction, this research set out to examine one specific aspect of the patronage of Irish art, that is, the value a group of Ireland's religious diaspora perceived in commissioning Irish stained glass for churches in the United States. It also set out to investigate the 'tension' between maintaining Harry Clarke's creative legacy and serving the demands their overseas patrons whilst negotiating the challenges of running a business producing artwork for export worldwide.

The findings of this enquiry have created new insights into the history of Irish craft and its role in Irish American history. The results highlight an international dimension of Irish art history and how, with the resurgence of stained glass making in Ireland from the early decades of the twentieth century, the quality of Irish craft held its own on a global stage.

As this research not only focuses on the works themselves, but also on the significance of their commissioning and their presence in the heart of multi-ethnic communities in the United States, it enlightens aspects of the making and meaning of this Irish craft. It shows that for a cohort of Irish American priests it was a valued way of making a positive and affirming statement about what it was to be Irish, addressing any negative stereotyping of the Irish by earlier generations of Americans. It also further highlights the power

[15] The pastor, Rev. James Cantwell, succeeded in achieving this, for locations in both San Francisco and Los Angeles.

[16] Correspondence records indicate the pastor, Rev. William O'Shea, actively persuaded other pastors to choose the Studios to supply their stained glass, with at least three other major commissions (for St Augustine's Culver City, St Philip the Apostle Pasadena, and Holy Trinity San Pedro) coming as a result of his recommendations.

of senior Irish American clergy and pastors in the American Catholic Church in the mid-twentieth century. Descriptions of the achievements of senior Irish American clergy found in biographies, newspaper articles and journals focus on their accomplishments in advancing the work of the Catholic Church in terms of social developments such as schools, hospitals, churches and charitable institutions.[17] To date there has been little focus on their role as patrons of art, and specifically Irish art which is the subject of this thesis.

This research also highlights the extent of the investment in Irish stained glass, as outlined in Appendix 1. This is a significant feature of the study as the windows are now an enduring, physical manifestation of the Irish presence in the United States. Existing histories of Irish Americanism such as Kenny (2000) *The American Irish: A History* and Dolan (2008) *The Irish Americans: A History* describe and analyse the impact of people and events on creating a sense of Irishness, the Clarke Studios stained glass windows can be regarded as permanent monuments to the Irish influence in Catholic America.

From an art-historical perspective, while much current research focuses on the work of individual stained glass artists and individual locations, other than Bateman (2019) there is no other intensive study of Irish stained glass in locations outside of Ireland.[18] In that regard this original research will generate more recognition of the achievements of Irish craft on a global level, prompting a greater understanding of the role of the Irish diaspora in promoting Irish design abroad, and will provide a platform for further study in other areas of the world including Africa, Australia and New Zealand. It will also stimulate research into the work of other Irish stained glass artists and other Irish craft workers who found commissions outside of Ireland.

[17] A number of these texts are referenced in Chapters Two (*Patronage*) and Three (*Meaning*) including, for example, the biography of Cardinal James McIntyre Archbishop of Los Angeles, Francis J. Weber, *His Eminence of Los Angeles: James Francis Cardinal McIntyre* (Los Angeles: St. Francis Historical Society, 1997).
[18] Fiona Bateman, 'Clarke Studios and the Foreign Missions: Windows with 'A Very Irish Look' in Africa' in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds) *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish State* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019). This essay relates the history behind the stained glass windows from Clarke Studios which were designed for churches in a number of African countries.

This research also contributes to discussions on diasporic identity, a field which is concerned with the construction of cultural identities among immigrants. One facet of this multidisciplinary field of research is an examination of the literary, cultural, or political sensibilities that connect widely dispersed migrant groups with one another and with their homeland.[19] While this research carried out for this thesis has a specific focus on one aspect of establishing identity, this can provide further input to broader discussions on the subject of theorising cultural identity among immigrant groups.[20]

This research has also discovered previously unknown examples of the artistic legacy of Harry Clarke. The Clarke Studios style originated from Clarke's original work, and developed in line with both the skills of the in-house artists, and the changing aesthetic in art and architecture in Ireland, and internationally, in the twentieth century. This research catalogues the work these artists made for locations in California, establishing a register of their achievements in that region.

Also emphasised in this thesis is the fact that this is not just a group of artists working at creating new artworks. Clarke Studios was a business, doing all the things that businesses must do to survive – creating a product branded as their own style of stained glass, advertising their work, selling to clients, and then designing, making and shipping their stained glass. However, a key feature that defined Clarke Studios as a business is that at its core it is an artistic endeavour, and all business decisions taken were to preserve their art and design integrity. Furthermore, the role of the Irish State in supporting and sponsoring businesses involved Irish craft exports both from a nationalistic and economic perspective is emphasised, with particular reference to Ireland's participation at World's Fairs and the services provided by the Irish Export Board.

[19] Kevin Kenny, 'Diaspora and Comparison: The Global Irish as a Case Study', in The *Journal of American History*, Vol. 90 (1), (2003), p.135.
[20] For further discussions on this subject see Kenny (2003), Chiang (2010) *Diasporic Theorizing Paradigm on Cultural Identity*, and Rainer Bauböc, Thomas Faist (eds) *Diaspora and Transnationalism: Concepts, Theories and Methods* (2010).

Finally, a distinctive feature of the research is that it considers the work of a studio of artists both collectively and individually, which differs from more traditional art history analyses of the work of individual artists or movements.

Future Research Opportunities

In order to focus on the core elements addressed in this research, a number of alternative channels of enquiry have been considered and excluded from the scope of this project. These topics present opportunities for further research which would build on the findings presented in this thesis.

In dealing with the volume of correspondence data generated by commissions for the United States, by necessity due to the limitations posed by a project with a particular focus such as this, the content of many other mail exchanges between the company and its clients has been set aside. This research has focused on one specific geographic region, while recognising that Clarke Studios also carried out many commissions for patrons in other parts of the U.S. (more than two hundred windows were made for other U.S. locations).[21] However, other parts of the world also have Clarke Studios work installed, including Britain (more than one hundred and twenty windows), Australia (more than one hundred windows), New Zealand (more than thirty-six windows) and a number of countries in Africa (more than thirty-seven windows).[22] The aspirations of patrons in these locations will differ to some degree from those in the United States as the 'Irish American' influence will not apply. However, the commonalities and differences between diasporic (or other) commissions invite investigation. As previously stated, while Fiona Bateman's (2019) recent research provides valuable insights into the Clarke Studios work for locations

[21] Selecting the work in California is justified as it representative of work done in the United States as a whole in terms of scale of commissions (in most cases Clarke Studios provided all windows at a location). Also, a review of correspondence records with all U.S. clients revealed similar concerns across all locations. One advantage in using commissions in California was how it revealed the degree of networking that was happening between clergy in the state.
[22] All statistical information is extracted from the Studios order books and correspondence records - order book 1929 – 1950 (TCD MS 6060), outward correspondence between 1930 and 1970 (TCD MSS 6001 – 6038) and inward correspondence records (TCD MSS 6109 – 6119, TCD MSS 6127 – 6130b).

in Africa, there is no such research for other parts of the world.[23] This thesis provides a framework for such an enquiry.

In a number of US locations where Clarke Studios glass was installed , other Irish ecclesiastical craft products were also commissioned, for example altar cloths from Dun Emer Guild and metal work by Larry Gunning and Sons.[24] Further research into the procurement of Irish craft, either religious or secular, by clients in the United States will reveal the extent of such commissions and the motivation behind a client's decision to purchases Irish goods, which would support or discover alternatives to the findings in this research.

While the research for this thesis lists a number of the Studio's competitors there is an opportunity to examine in more detail the careers of Irish artists who moved to and worked in the United States, including Joseph Tierney and George S. Walsh. Both artists trained in Ireland before emigrating, and they worked at studios based in New York and Wisconsin respectively. Also, further academic research into Earley Studios of Dublin and the work of Evie Hone and Michael Healy in the United States deserves greater consideration, although findings from this project does not indicate that those artists carried out the same extent of work as Clarke Studios.

Building on recent research by Dr. William Shortall (2020) into the role of art in projecting a vision of Irish nationhood in the period 1922 – 1934, there is an opportunity to further examine the extent to which the Irish State continued to use art, craft and design to build an image of a Irish national identity on an international stage in the mid-twentieth century.[25] This would include Irish State involvement both in promotion of craft as an export commodity and also as means to promote an Irish cultural identity through participation in events such as trade promotion fairs and the New York World's Fair of 1964/65.

---

[23] Fiona Bateman, 'Clarke Studios and the Foreign Missions: Windows with 'A Very Irish Look' in Africa' in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds) *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish State* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019).
[24] Described in more detail in Chapters Two and Three.
[25] William Shortall, *Art and the Irish Free State - visualizing nationhood (1922-1934*), (PhD Thesis, TCD, 2020).

As this research has focused on the international dimension of the Clarke Studios work there remains a body of research which would identify and examine the stained glass made for clients in Ireland. While research has been carried out on individual locations, and many of the stained glass windows made by the Studio's artists are included in the *Gazetteer of Irish Stained Glass* (2020), there is much work to be done to fully expose the extent of the company's work in Ireland.[26] In the course of this research a database of information about the Clarke Studios output has been established, but this is not complete for Irish locations, and would be greatly enriched by further examination of the Clarke Studios correspondence and sales records. The publication of such information would complement the content of the *Gazetteer of Irish Stained Glass* and would be a valuable resource for researchers, educators and heritage and tourism policy makers and promoters.

Finally, the theoretical framework which framed the methodology underpinning this research is based on a material culture and art-historical approach. Other opportunities exist to examine the subject from differing perspectives such as Identity Politics, Irish Studies, Catholic Church History or Ethnic Studies. From the art-historical perspective, a valuable course of enquiry would also be to consider the reception of the windows by a contemporary audience, using semiotic theory as a framework for the analysis.

It is anticipated that this research will bring the international achievements of Clarke Studios to a wider audience - from scholars with an academic interest in twentieth century Irish art and design, diaspora studies, church history, to practitioners and educators in stained glass, heritage and conservations agencies, international and cultural relations groups, and importantly, the communities in whose churches the Clarke Studios' work exists. This thesis will augment research by groups such as the Stained Glass Association of America, the Irish Association for American Studies, the British Society of Master Glass Painters and the Irish American Cultural Institute. These bodies actively encourage and promote studies in the

[26] David Caron, Nicola Gordon Bowe, Michael Wynne (eds.), *The Gazetteer of Irish Stained Glass* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2021).

history of Irish arts and culture, including stained glass, and further research opportunities may emerge from this exposure. The digitisation of a portion of the Clarke Studios archive material under the auspices of the Digital Repository of Ireland project continues to facilitate greater access to company's business archive, informing and directing new research.

Closing

This project has exposed a history of Irish artistic endeavour in the mid-twentieth century on the international stage. The research has revealed the close ties that existed between the United States and Ireland at religious, artistic and economic levels and makes an important contribution to the understanding of this shared history. It also illuminates the role of the art object in identity formation, in this example how Irish craft projected a positive sense of Irishness in American society. Furthermore, the project has created a valuable resource of information pertaining to specific Clarke Studio commissions in the United States. This is a significant aspect of the history of Irish art, in particular Irish stained glass, which is expected, as a result of this research, to have wider recognition. To date, this has been an untold story of skilled artists whose work achieved world-wide exposure - a gap in the history of Irish art. The publication of the findings of this research project will remedy that situation.

Bibliography

Primary Sources

Trinity College Dublin Library

Harry Clarke Stained Glass Studio Archive, TCD Library.

Correspondence sent: Letter books 1930 – 1970, forty volumes, approximately 28,000 items, TCD MSS 6001 – 6038a.

Estimates produced: Estimates 1936 – 1959, two volumes, approximately 600 items, TCD MSS 6056 – 6057.

Stained Glass Orders received: Orders 1926 – 1950, two volumes, approximately 550 pages, TCD MSS 6059 – 6060.

Job Costings: Costing Books 1951 – 1963, three volumes, approximately 900 pages, TCD MSS 6074 – 6076.

Sales: Sales Book 1930 – 1953, one volume, approximately 600 items, TCD MSS 6079.

Visitors: Visitors Book 1930 – 1953, one volume, TCD MSS 6084.

Client Folders: Inward correspondence from clients and prospects 1952 - 1965, forty-seven folders, approximately 1,800 items, TCD MSS 6109 – 6119.

Correspondence received: Letters from clients not included in Client Folders 1949 – 1967, five folders, approximately 2,470 items, TCD MSS 6127 – 6130b.

Correspondence received: Letters from clients in alphabetic order, four folders, approximately 760 items, TCD MSS 6132 – 6135.

Newspaper Cuttings: Newspapers and magazines with reference to Clarke Studios, six folders, approximately 35 items, TCD MSS 6167.

Diocesan Archive, Los Angeles

Diocesan History Publication.

Diocesan Archive, San Francisco

Files relating to the parishes of Saint Agnes, Saint Brigid and Saint Elizabeth.

Private Collection of Ms. Mary Clarke

Clarke, John, 'List of Stained Glass Windows designed by Terence Clarke in the Harry Clarke Studios' (unpublished document).
Clarke, John, 'William Dowling (1904 – 1980) Biographical Note' (unpublished document).
Dowling, William, 'Irish Stained Glass – The Harry Clarke Studios' (unpublished document).
Dowling, William, 'List of Stained Glass Windows designed by William Dowling in the Harry Clarke Studios' (unpublished document).
Dowling, William, 'Recollections of Harry Clarke R.H.A. During the Years 1928 – 1931' (unpublished document).

National Library of Ireland

Margaret Clarke correspondence: NLI MSS 48 424/4, MSS 425, MSS 426.
Correspondence between Harry Clarke and Thomas Bodkin re Clarke's work: NLI MSS 39/202a.
Harry Clarke correspondence re set up of Harry Clarke Studios: NLI MSS 48/422, MSS 421 and MSS 419.

National Archives of Ireland

Companies Registration Office records relating to set-up of Clarke Studios: CRO 2013/80/172.

National Gallery of Ireland

Harry Clarke Studios epherma.

DCGHL

Harry Clarke Studios designs by William Dowling.

Consultations with Clarke Family Members

In the course of this research a number of members of the extended Clarke family have been helpful in contributing insights into the workings of the Clarke Studios business. These included Ms Mary Clarke (R.I.P.), Ms Sara Bourke, Ms Ann Bourke, Ms Sunniva Sheridan, Mr Terry Mahon and Ms Fiana Griffin.

Secondary Sources

Books and Chapters in Books

Aiello, Giorgia, 'Visual Semiotics: Key Concepts and New Directions', in Luc Pauwels, Luc, Mannay, Dawn (eds.), *The SAGE Handbook of Visual Research Methods* (London: Sage, 2019).

Almeida, Linda Dowling, 'Irish America 1940 – 2000' in J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey (eds.), *Making the Irish American* (New York: New York University 2006).

Avella, Steven M., *Sacramento and the Catholic Church* (Reno: University of Nevada Press, 2008).

Barr, Colin, *Ireland's Empire: The Roman Catholic Church in the English-Speaking World, 1829-1914* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2020).

Barthes, Roland *Elements of Semiology* (New York: Hill and Wang, 1968).

Bateman, Fiona 'Clarke Studios and the Foreign Missions: Windows with 'A Very Irish Look' in Africa' in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds.) *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish State* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019).

Bauböc, Rainer, Faist, Thomas (eds.), *Diaspora and Transnationalism: Concepts, Theories and Methods* (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2010).

Berg, Charles, *Latino Images in Film* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2002).

Berger, Arthur Asa, *What Objects Mean* (London: Routledge, 2016).

Bernbach, William, *Book of Nations, New York World's Fair* (New York: Winkler & Kelmans, 1939).

Bhreathnach-Lynch, Sighle, *Ireland's Art, Ireland's History* (Omaha: Creighton University Press, 2007).

Blake, Art M., *How New York Became American, 1890–1924* (Baltimore: JHU Press, 2006),

Bolotin, Norm, Laing, Christine, *The World's Columbian Exposition: The Chicago World's Fair of 1893* (Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1992).

Brown, Terence, *Ireland: A Social and Cultural History 1922 – 2002* (London: Harper Perennial, 2004).

Brundage, David, 'Remembering 1916 in America', in R. Grayson & F. McGarry (eds.), *Remembering 1916: The Easter Rising, the Somme and the Politics of Memory in Ireland* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016).

Buenker John, Ratner, Lorman, *Multiculturalism in the United States* (Westport: Greenwood Press, 2005).

Caron, David, Gordon Bowe, Nicola, Michael Wynne (eds.), *Gazetteer of Irish Stained Glass* (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 2021).

Casey, Christine, *Dublin: The City Within the Grand and Royal Canals and the Circular Road with the Phoenix Park* (New Haven, Conn.; London: Yale University Press, 2005).

Clerkin-Higgins, Mary, 'Origins, Materials and the Glaziers Art' in Virginia Chieffo Raguin, *The History of Stained Glass* (London: Thames & Hudson, 2003).

Condon, Kevin, *The Missionary College of All Hallows 1842-1891* (Dublin: All Hallows College, 1986).

Connick, Charles J., *Adventures in Light and Colour* (New York: Random House, 1937).

Coriden, James A., *The Parish in Catholic Tradition: History, Theology, and Canon Law* (New York: Paulist Press, 1997).

Cormack, Peter, *Karl Parsons 1884–1934*, Exhibition Catalogue, William Morris Gallery, *c*. 1987.

Costigan, Lucy and Cullen, Michael, *Strangest Genius: The Stained Glass of Harry Clarke* (Dublin: The History *Press*, 2010).

Curtin-Kelly, Patricia, *Harry Clarke & His Legacy: The Stained Glass in St. Joseph's Church*, *Terenure* (Dublin: Liberties Press, 2018).

Curtis, L. Perry, *Apes and Angels: The Irishman in Victorian Caricature* (Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1971).

D'Alleva, Anne, *The Methods and Theories of Art History* (London: Laurence King Publishing, 2005).

Carpenter, Andrew (General Editor), *Art and Architecture of Ireland,* Volumes IV, V (Dublin: Royal Irish Academy, 2014).

Didron, Adolphe, Stokes, Margaret, *Christian Iconography Volume 2* (London: Bell and Sons, 1907).

Dolan, Jay P., *In Search of an American Catholicism* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2002).

Dolan, Jay P., *The Irish Americans: A History* (New York: Bloomsbury Press, 2010).

Donnelly, Paul, 'Legacy and Identity: Harry Clarke, William Dowling and the Harry Clarke Studios', in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds.), *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish state* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019).

Doyle, David Noel, 'The Remaking of Irish America, 1845 - 1880' in J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey, (eds.), *Making the Irish American: History and Heritage of the Irish in the United States* (New York: New York University Press, 2006).

Editor, *All Hallows Annual 1922-30* (Dublin: Browne & Nolan Limited, 1930).

Editor, *All Hallows Annual 1938-39* (Dublin: Browne & Nolan Limited, 1939).

Editor, *All Hallows Annual 1950-51* (Dublin: Browne & Nolan Limited, 1951).

Editor, *All Hallows Annual 1955-56* (Dublin: Browne & Nolan Limited, 1956).

Editor, *All Hallows Annual 1957-58* (Dublin: Browne & Nolan Limited, 1958).

Editor, *All Hallows Annual 1967-70* (Dublin: Browne & Nolan Limited, 1970).

Editor, 'Historical Note', in *New York World's Fair 1939 and 1940 Incorporated Records 1935-1945* (New York: The New York Public Library Manuscripts and Archives Division, 2008).

Editor, *Official Guidebook of the World's Fair 1934* (Chicago: A Century of Progress, 1934).

Editor, *St Brigid's Centennial Booklet 1863 – 1963* (San Francisco: St Brigid's Parish, 1963).

Ellis, John Tracey, *American Catholicism* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1969).

Evans, Toshie, *A Dictionary of Japanese Loanwords* (Westport: Greenwod Press, 1977).

Francis, David, *The Universal Exposition of 1904* (St Louis: Louisiana Purchase Exposition Company, 1913).

Gamboni, Dario, *The Destruction of Art: Iconoclasm and Vandalism since the French Revolution* (London: Reaktion Books, 2007).
Ganz, Cheryl R., *The 1933 Chicago World's Fair* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2008).

Gillis, Chester, *Roman Catholicism in America* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1999).

Godson, Lisa, Brück, Joanna (eds.), *Making 1916: Material and Visual Culture of the Easter Rising* (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2015).

Gordon Bowe, Nicola, 'Harry Clarke, An Túr Gloine and the Early Twentieth-Century Irish Stained Glass Revival' in John M. Hearne (ed.), *Glassmaking in Ireland* (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 2010).

Gordon Bowe, Nicola, *Harry Clarke: The Life and Work* (Dublin: The History Press Ireland, 2012).

Gordon Bowe, Nicola, *Harry Clarke* (Dublin: Douglas Hyde Gallery, 1979).

Gordon Bowe, Nicola, *Wilhelmina Geddes: Life and Work* (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2015).

Hall, James, Dictionary of Subjects and Symbols in Art (London: John Murray, 1996).

Halloran, Fiona Deans, *Thomas Nast: The Father of Modern Political Cartoons (*Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2012).

Harris, Neil, 'Selling National Culture: Ireland at the World's Columbian Exposition" in T. J. Edelstein (ed.), *Imagining an Irish Past* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992).

Haughton, Johnathon, 'Historical Background', in John O'Hagan and Carol Newman (eds.), *The Economy of Ireland: National and Sectoral Policy Issues* (Dublin: Gill & Macmillan, 2008).

Hearne, John (ed.), *Glassmaking in Ireland* (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 2010).

Helland, Janice, *British and Irish Home Arts and Industries 1880 – 1914* (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 2007).

Higgins, Mary Clerkin, 'Preface', in Lucy Costigan & Michael Cullen (eds.), *Strangest Genius*: *The Stained Glass of Harry Clarke* (Dublin: The History Press, 2010).

Hobson, Bulmer (ed.), *Saorstat Eireann; Irish Free State Official Handbook* (Dublin: Talbot Press, 1932).

Hogan, Edmund, *The Irish missionary movement: a historical survey,1830 – 1980* (Dublin: Gill and Macmillan, 1990).

Hogue, Dean and Okur, Aniedi, *International Priests in America: Challenges And Opportunities* (Collegeville: Liturgical Press, 2006).

Howes, Marjorie, 'The Arts and Crafts Movement and the Irish Literary Revival' in Vera Kreilcamp (ed.), *Making it Irish* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2016).

Hurley, Richard, *Irish Church Architecture in the Era of Vatican II* (Dublin: Dominican Publications, 2001).

Ilson, Bernie, *Sundays with Sullivan* (Plymouth: Taylor Trade Publishing, 2009).

Janeway, Michael, *The Fall of the House of Roosevelt: Brokers of Ideas and Power from FDR to LBJ* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2004).

Kallen, Jeffrey L., 'Irish as an American Ethnic Language' in Thomas W. Ihde (ed.) *The Irish Language in America* (Westport CT: Bergin and Garvey, 1994).

Kennedy, Róisín, 'The Geneva Window: A Precious Gift Never Given', in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds.), *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish state* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019.

Kennedy, Róisín, 'The Capuchin Annual: Visual Art and the Legacy of 1916, One Generation On', in Lisa Godson, Joanna Brück (eds.), *Making 1916: Material and Visual Culture of the Easter Rising* (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2015).

Kenny, Kevin, *The American Irish* (London: Routledge, 2014).

Kieckhefer, Richard, *Theology in stone: church architecture from Byzantium to Berkeley* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004).

Kreilcamp, Vera, 'Introduction', *Making it Irish* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2016).

Larmour, Paul, *The Arts and Crafts Movement in Ireland* (Belfast: Friars Bush Press, 1992).

Larmour, Paul, 'The Arts and Crafts Movement of Northern Ireland', in Vera Kreilcamp (ed.), *Making it Irish* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2016),

Lee, Lawrence, *The Appreciation of Stained Glass* (London: Oxford University Press, 1977).

Lee, Joseph, Casey, Marion R. (eds.), *Making the Irish American* (New York: New York University Press, 2006).

van Leeuwen, Theo, Jewitt, Carey, 'Introduction', in van Leeuwen, Theo, Jewitt, Carey (eds.), *The Handbook of Visual Analysis* (London: Sage, 2001).

van Leeuwen, Theo, 'Semiotics and Iconography', in van Leeuwen, Theo, Jewitt, Carey (eds.), *The Handbook of Visual Analysis* (London: Sage, 2001).

McAvoy, Thomas T. C.S.C., 'The Irish Clergyman' in Patrick J. Corish (ed.), *A History of Irish Catholicism* (Dublin: Gill and McMillan, 1970).

McCaffrey, Lawrence, 'Irish Americans' in John D. Buenker and Lorman A. Ratner (eds.) *Multiculturalism in the United States: A Comparative Guide to Acculturation* and Ethnicity (Connecticut: Greenwood, 2005).

Meagher, Timothy J., *The Columbia Guide to Irish American History* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2005),

Miller, Kerby A., *Emigrants and Exiles* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985).

Montebelo, Philipe de, 'Preface', in Paula Lieber Gerson, ed., *Abbot Suger and Saint-Denis: A Symposium* (New York: Metropolitan Museum of Art, 1987).

Morgan, David, *The Sacred Gaze* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005).

Morris, Charles R., *American Catholic: The Saints and Sinners Who Built America's Most Powerful Church* (New York: Random House, 1997).

Moschella, Mary Clark, *Living Devotions: Reflections on Immigration, Identity, and Religious Imagination* (Eugene: Pickwick Publications, 2008).

Nash, Gerald D., *The Federal Landscape: An Economic History of the Twentieth-century West* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1999).

Nicoletta, Julie, *Art out of Place, International Art Exhibits at the New York World's Fair 1964-65* (Tacoma: University of Washington Tacoma SIAS Publications, 2010).

Nolan, Janet, *Ourselves Alone: Women's Emigration from Ireland, 1885-1920* (Kentucky: University Press of Kentucky, 1989).

O'Brien, Matthew J., *Irishness in Great Britain and the United States: Transatlantic and Cross-channel Migration Networks and Irish Ethnicity, 1920-90* (Madison: University of Wisconsin, 2001).

O'Connell, John, *The Honan Hostel Chapel Cork – Some Notes on the Building and the Ideals Which Inspired It* (Cork: Guy & Co., 1916).

O'Connor, Eimear, *Art, Ireland and the Irish Diaspora* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2020).

O'Donnell, Jessica, 'A Gorgeous Gallery of Poetic Pictures', in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds.), *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish state* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019).

O'Hanlon, Rev. John, *Lives of Irish Saints Volume 5* (Dublin: James Duffy & Sons, before 1875).

O'Keefe, Timothy J., *The Irish in the San Francisco Bay Area* (San Francisco: Irish Literary and Historical Society, 2005).

O'Leary, Barry, 'Richard Pierce: Architect and Acolyte of the Gothic Revival', in Michael McCarthy and Karina O'Neill (eds.), *Studies in the Gothic Revival* (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2008).

Osborne, Catherine R., *American Catholics and the Church of Tomorrow: Building Churches for the Future, 1925-1975* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2018).

Panofsky, Erwin, *Studies in Iconology: Humanistic Themes in the Art of the Renaissance* (Oxford: Westview Press, 1972).

Panofsky, Erwin, *Meaning in the Visual Arts* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1970), quoted in Preziosi, Donald (ed.), *The Art of Art History: A Critical Anthology* (London: Oxford University Press, 2009).

Preziosi, Donald, 'Mechanisms of Meaning', in Preziosi, Donald (ed.), *The Art of Art History: A Critical Anthology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009).

Price, Jay M., *Temples for a Modern God: Religious Architecture in Postwar America* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013, 2018).

Tilley, Christopher, 'Introduction', in Christopher Tilley, et al (eds.) *Handbook of Material Culture* (London: Sage, 2006), p. 4.

Raguin, Virginia Chieffo, *The History of Stained Glass* (London: Thames & Hudson, 2003).

Roddy, Sarah, *Population, Providence and Empire: The Churches and Emigration from Nineteenth-Century Ireland* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2014).

Roulin, Dom E., *Modern Church Architecture* (London: B Herder, 1947).

Rowley, Ellen, 'Catholic Churches and Cathedrals in the Twentieth Century', Andrew Carpenter (ed.), *Art and Architecture of Ireland Volume IV* (Dublin: Yale University Press, 2014).

Ryan, William Patrick, *The Irish Literary Revival: Its History, Pioneers and Possibilities* (London: Ward and Downey, 1894).

Saab, A. Joan, *For the Millions: American Art and Culture Between the Wars (*Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004).

Shannon, William V., *The American Irish* (New York: McMillan, 1966).

Sheehy, Jeanne, *The Rediscovery of Ireland's Past the Celtic Revival, 1830–1930* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1980).

Sheehy, Ruth, *The Life and Work of Richard King* (Oxford: Peter Lang Ltd., 2020).

Shelley, Thomas J., 'Twentieth-Century American Catholicism and Irish Americans' in J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey (eds.) *Making the Irish American* (New York: New York University 2006).

Smith, William L., *Irish Priests in the United States: A Vanishing Subculture* (Lanham: University Press of America, 2004).

Snoddy, Theo, *Dictionary of Irish artists: 20th century* (Dublin: Wolfhound Press, 1996).

Sowers, Robert, *Stained Glass an Architectural Art* (New York: Universe Books, 1965).

Spillane, Rita, *A Brief History and Architectural Overview of Sacred Heart Church Sacramento, California* (Sacramento: Sacred Heart Parish, 2001).

Stokes, Margaret, *Early Christian Art in Ireland* (London: Chapman and Hall, 1894).

Sullivan, Kelly, 'Harry Clarke's Natural World', in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds.) *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish state* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019).

Teehan, Virginia, Heckett, Elizabeth Wincott, *The Honan Chapel: A Golden Vision* (Cork: Cork University Press, 2004).

Thornton, Francis B., *Our American Princes: The story of the seventeen American Cardinals* (New York: Putnam, 1963).

Torgerson, Mark A., *An Architecture of Immanence: Architecture for Worship and Ministry Today* (Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2007).

Walker, Dorothy, *Michael Scott Architect - in (Casual) Conversation with Dorothy Walker* (Kinsale: Gandon Editions, 1995).

Walsh, Laurence OSCO, *Lumen Christi – The Stained Glass Windows of Mount Saint Joseph Abbey* (Roscrea: Cistercian Press, 2009).

Weber, Francis J., *His Eminence of Los Angeles: James Francis Cardinal McIntyre* (Los Angeles: St. Francis Historical Society, 1997).

Weber, Francis J., *John Joseph Cantwell: His Excellency of Los Angeles* (Hong Kong: Cathay Press, 1971).

Whalen, Grover A., *Mr. New York: The Autobiography of Grover A. Whalen* (New York: Putnam, 1955).

Whelan, Irene, 'Religious Rivalry and the Making of Irish-American Identity' in J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey, eds., *Making the Irish American: History and Heritage of the Irish in the United States* (New York: New York University Press, 2006).

White, Susan J., *Art, Architecture, and Liturgical Reform: The Liturgical Arts Society (1928-1972)* (New York: Pueblo Publishing Company, 1990).

Wilcox, Ralph, 'Irish Americans in Sports' in J. J. Lee and Marion R. Casey (eds.) *Making the Irish American* (New York: New York University 2006).

Wilson, Ann, 'Harry Clarke: The Honan Chapel Windows (1915-17)', in Angela Griffith, Marguerite Helmers and Róisín Kennedy (eds.), *Harry Clarke and Artistic Visions of the New Irish state* (Kildare: Irish Academic Press, 2019).

Wölfflin, Heinrich, *Principles of Art History,* 7th edition, (1950: Dover Publications, 1950).

Wynne, Michael, *Irish Stained Glass* (Dublin: Eason, 1977).

Yeats, Padraig, *A City in Turmoil: Dublin 1919 – 21* (Dublin: Gill & Macmillan, 2012).

Journal Articles

Avella, Steven M., 'Catholicism on the Pacific', *U.S. Catholic Historian*, Vol. 31 (2), (2013), pp. 1-24.

Bal, Mieke and Bryson, Norman, 'Semiotics and Art History', *The Art Bulletin*, 73(2), (1991), pp. 174-208.

Barr, Colin ''Imperium in Imperio': Irish Episcopal Imperialism in the Nineteenth Century', *The English Historical Review*, Vol. 123 (502), (June, 2008), pp 611-650.

Barrett, Cyril, 'Irish Nationalism and Art II: 1900-1970', *Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review*, Vol. 91 (363), (2002), pp. 223-238.

Barrett, James R. and Roediger, David R., 'The Irish and the "Americanization" of the "New Immigrants" in the Streets and in the Churches of the Urban United States, 1900-1930', *Journal of American Ethnic History*, Vol. 24 (4), (2005), pp. 3-33.

Barry, Frank, O'Mahony, Clare, 'Regime Change in 1950s Ireland: The New Export-Oriented Foreign Investment Strategy', *Irish Economic and Social History*, Vol. 44 (1), (2017), pp. 46-55.

Bhreathnach Lynch, Sighle, 'The Church and the Artist 1922 – 1945', *Irish Arts Review Yearbook* (1991/1992), pp. 130-134.

Bodkin, Thomas, 'The Art of Mr Harry Clarke', *Studio* 79(320), (November, 1919), pp. 45-46.

Blacam, Aodh de, 'Mary of the Gael', *The Irish Monthly*, Vol. 67, (1939), pp. 577-586.

Burns, Jeffrey M., 'Transitions in Catholicism in San Francisco, 1950 – 1970', *Records of the American Catholic Historical Society of Philadelphia*, Vol. 109 (1, 2), (1998), pp. 19-37.

Carew, Mairead, ''The Pageant of the Celt' World's Fair – Irish Archaeology at the Chicago world's Fair, 1933-4', *Archaeology Ireland*, Vol. 28 (1), (2014), pp. 9-12.

Carville, Gary, '"Scrupulous and Timid Conformism": Ireland and the Reception of the Liturgical Changes of Vatican II' *Religions* 12 (no. 7:545), (2021), pp. 1-24.

Chiang, Chih-Yun 'Diasporic Theorizing Paradigm on Cultural Identity', *Intercultural Communication Studies,* Vol. XIX (1), (2010), pp. 29-46.

Dolan, Jay P., 'A Critical Period in American Catholicism', *The Review of Politics*, Vol. 35 (4), (October 1973), pp. 523-536.

Dolan, Jay P., 'The Irish Parish', *U.S. Catholic Historian*, Vol. 25(2), (2007), pp. 13-24.

Dowling, William, 'Harry Clarke: Stained Glass Artist', *Dublin Historical Record*, Vol. 17 (2) (1962), pp. 55-61.

Dowling, William, 'Irish Stained Glass', *Dublin Historical Record* Vol. 22(2), (1968), pp. 225-226.

Dumenil, Lynn, 'The Tribal Twenties: "Assimilated" Catholics' Response to Anti-Catholicism in the 1920s', *Journal of American Ethnic History*, Vol. 11 (1), (1991), pp. 21-49.

Marco Duranti, 'Utopia, Nostalgia and World War at the 1939-40 New York World's Fair', *Journal of Contemporary History,* Vol. 41 (4), (2006), pp. 663-683.

Editor, 'Editorial', *Journal of Material Culture*, Vol. 1 (1), (1996), pp. 5-14.

Fanning, Charles, 'Dueling Cultures: Ireland and Irish America at the Chicago World's Fairs of 1933 and 1934', *New Hibernia Review*, Vol. 15 (3), (2011), pp. 94-110.

Garces-Foley, Kathleen, 'From the Melting Pot to the Multicultural Table: Filipino Catholics in Los Angeles', *American Catholic Studies*, Vol. 120 (1), (Spring 2009), pp. 27-53.

Godson, Lisa, 'Catholicism and Material Culture in Ireland 1840 – 1880', *Circa*, No. 103 (2003), pp. 38-45.

Godson, Lisa, 'Charting the material culture of the 'Devotional Revolution': the Advertising Register of the Irish Catholic Directory, 1837–96', *Proceedings of the Royal Irish Academy: Archaeology, Culture, History, Literature* (2016), Vol. 116C, pp. 265-294.

Gordon Bowe, Nicola, 'Four Green Fields', *Irish Arts Review*, Vol. 30 (3), (2013), pp. 108-111.

Gordon Bowe, Nicola, 'Patrick Pollen Metaphysician in Glass', *Irish Arts Review*, Vol. 28 (2), (2011), pp. 102-107.

Gordon Bowe, Nicola, 'The Irish Arts and Crafts Movement (1886-1925)', *Irish Arts Review Yearbook* (1990/1991), pp. 172-185.

Gordon Bowe, Nicola, 'Two Early Twentieth-Century Irish Arts and Crafts Workshops', *Journal of Design History*, Vol. 2 (2/3), (1989) pp. 193-206.

Hasenmueller, Christine, 'Panofsky, Iconography and Semiotics', *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, Vol. 36 (No. 3), (1978), pp. 289-301.

Elfie Rembold 'Exhibitions and National Identity', *National Identities*, Vol. 1(3), (1999), p. 221-225.

Hogan, Edmund, 'The Motivation of the Modern Irish Missionary Movement 1912-1939', *Journal of Religion in Africa*, Vol. 10 (No. 3), (1979), pp. 157-173.

Kenny, Kevin, 'Diaspora and Comparison: The Global Irish as a Case Study', *The Journal of American History*, Vol. 90 (1), (2003), pp. 134-162.

Larkin, Emmet, 'The Devotional Revolution in Ireland, 1850-75', *The American Historical Review*, Vol. 77(3), (1972), pp. 625-655.

Lee, J. Joseph, 'Millennial Reflections on Irish-American History', *Radharc*, Vol. 1, (2000), pp. 1-76.

MacDonagh, Michael, 'Ireland's Attitude to External Affairs', *Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review*, Vol. 48 (189), (1959), pp. 78-83.

Macleod, C. W., 'Allegory and Mysticism in Origen and Gregory of Nyssa', *The Journal of Theological Studies*, Vol. 22 (2), (1971), pp. 362-379.

McCaffrey, Lawrence, 'Ireland and Irish America: Connections and Disconnections', *U.S. Catholic Historian*, 22(3), (2004), pp. 1-18.

McCaffrey, Lawrence, 'Irish America', *The Wilson Quarterly,* Vol. 9(2), (1985), pp. 78-93.

McConville, Kieran, 'A Biographical Directory of 19th Century Catholic Clergy from the Parish of Lower Creggan, County Armagh', *Seanchas Ardmhacha: Journal of the Armagh Diocesan Historical Society*, Vol. 23 (2), (2011), pp. 76-136.

O'Brien, Matthew, 'Hibernians on the March: Irish America and Ethnic Patriotism in the Mid-Twentieth Century', *Éire-Ireland*, Vol. 40 (1&2), (2005), pp. 170 – 182.

O'Brien, Matthew J., 'Wartime Revisions of Irish American Catholicism: Stars, Stripes, and Shamrocks', *U.S. Catholic Historian*, Vol. 22(3), (2004), pp. 75-96.

O'Malley, Kate, 'Róisín Walsh's Report of a Visit to American Libraries, Universities and Other Institutions, 1939', *Analecta Hibernica*, No. 44, (2013), pp. 121-243.

Prown, Jules David, 'Mind in Matter: An Introduction to Material Culture Theory and Method', *Winterthur Portfolio*, Vol. 17 (1), (1982), pp. 1–19.

Reeves, Percy Oswald, 'The Irish Arts and Crafts Society', *The Studio,* Vol. 72, (1918), pp. 15-21.

Roddy, Sarah, 'Spiritual Imperialism and the Mission of the Irish Race: The Catholic Church and Emigration from Nineteenth-century Ireland', *Irish Historical Studies*, Vol. 38 (152), (November 2013), pp. 600-619.

Ryan, Vera, 'Divine Light: A Century of Stained-Glass', *Irish Arts Review,* Vol. 32 (2), (2015), pp. 272–75.

Seasaltz, R. Kevin, 'From the Bauhaus to the House of God's People', *U.S. Catholic Historian*, Vol. 15 (1), (1997), pp. 105-122.

Shelley, Thomas J., '"What the Hell Is an Encyclical?: Governor Alfred E. Smith, Charles C. Marshall, Esq., and Father Francis P. Duffy', *U.S. Catholic Historian*, Vol. 15 (2), (1997), pp. 87-107.

Schrenk, Lisa D., 'From Historic Village to Modern Pavilion: The Evolution

of Foreign Architectural Representation at International Expositions in the 1930s', *National Identities,* Vol. 1 (3), (1999), pp. 287-311.

Smith, William L., '"Euntes Docete Omnes Gentes": Emigrant Irish Secular Priests in America', *History Ireland*, Vol. 8 (3), (2000), pp. 39-43.

Theophilus, Jr, 'Where to See Windows of Representative Craftsmen in Stained Glass in the United States', *Liturgical Arts,* Vol. 6 (No. 2), (1937), pp. 71-79.

Torgerson, Mark, 'An Architect's Response to Liturgical Reform: Edward A. Sövik and his "Non-Church" Design', *Worship*, Vol. 71 (1), (1997), pp. 19-41.

Turpin, John 'Modernism, Tradition and Debates on Religious Art in Ireland 1920–1950', *Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review*, Vol. 91 (363), (2002), pp. 252-266.

Turpin, John, 'N.C.A.D. Dublin's Oldest Art Institution: An Economic and Social Perspective', *Dublin Historical Record*, Vol. 49 (2), (1996), pp. 130-148.

Warner, R. Stephen, 'Work in Progress Toward a New Paradigm for the Sociological Study of Religion in the United States', *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 98 (5), (1993), pp. 1044-1093.

Weyer, M. Anita, 'Joseph Scott: A Life of Service', *Southern California Quarterly*, Vol. 48 (3), 1966, pp. 241-264.

Wills, Barry, 'Memories of a Catholic Boyhood', *Esquire*, (February 1991).

Academic Theses

Caron, David, *An Tur Gloine and Michael Healy (1873-1941)* (PhD Thesis, Trinity College Dublin, 1991).

Donnelly, Paul, *The Rise and Fall of Harry Clarke Stained Glass Limited* (MPhil Thesis, Trinity College Dublin, 2014).

Gibson, Michael Joseph, *Creating Sacred Spaces in the Suburbs: Roman Catholic Church Architecture in Postwar Southern California* (Master's Thesis, University of Southern California, 2009).

Gordon Bowe, Nicola, *The Life and Work of Harry Clarke*, (PhD Thesis, Trinity College Dublin, 1982).

Malloy, Caroline R., 'Exhibiting Ireland: Irish Villages, Pavilions, Cottages, and Castles at International Exhibitions, 1853-1939' (PhD. Thesis, University of Wisconsin-Madison, 2013).

Moschella, Mary Clark, *Mary Star of the Sea: The Interplay of Immigration and Religion in Italian Catholic Devotional Practices in the Port of Los Angeles* (PhD Thesis, Claremont School of Theology, 2001).

O'Leary, Jeffrey M, 'Manufacturing Reality: The Display of the Irish at World's Fairs and Exhibitions 1893 to 1965' (PhD. Thesis, Kent State University, 2015).

Shortall, William, *Art and the Irish Free State - Visualizing Nationhood (1922-1934*), (PhD Thesis, Trinity College Dublin, 2020).

Wilson, Ann, *Catholic Ireland: The Catholic Church and the construction of an Irish Catholic Identity, 1879-1923* (PhD Thesis, National College of Art and Design, 2011).

Zalot, Charlotte, *Revisioning liturgical space and furnishings in American Roman Catholic churches, 1947—2002* (PhD. Thesis, Drew University, Madison New Jersey, 2004).

Newspapers and Periodicals

Anon, 'The Irish Village at Chicago', *Freemans Journal,* 22nd July 1893, p. 10.

Anon, *The Monitor*, 24th September 1904, p. 7.

Anon, 'Ireland Interested in New York's Fair', *New York Times*, 29th July 1936, p. 17.

Anon, 'Theme of World's Fair', *New York Times*, 9th October, 1936, p. 27.

Anon, 'More U.S. Tourists Visiting Ireland', *New York Times*, 27th August 1937, p. 36.

Anon, 'The New York World Fair: Representation of the Saorstat', *The Irish Times,* 31st August, 1937, p. 7.

Anon, 'Four More Nations Join world's Fair: Eire, Venezuela, Lithuania and Sweden', *New York Times,* 15th April, 1938, p. 21.

Anon, 'The Ireland of the Future', *The Irish Times*, 9th January 1939, p. 7.

Anon, 'Dublin Stained Glass: Three Windows for World's Fair', The Irish Times, 14th March, 1939, p. 5.

Anon, 'Ireland at the World's Fair', *The Irish Times*, 22nd March, 1939, p. 4.

Anon, 'Double Irish Show Turns Clock Back', *New York Times*, 14th May, 1939, p. 40.

Anon, 'Dail Votes Many Thousands', *The Irish Times*, 23rd February, 1940, p. 6.

Anon, 'Eire's Fair Exhibit is to be Reopened', *The New York Times*, 2nd March, 1940, p. 9.

Anon, 'Exhibits: Foreign Nations', *New York Times*, 5th May 1940, p. 140.

Anon, 'Losses on Irish Exhibit at World's Fair', *The Irish Times*, 10th April, 1942, p. 3.

Anon, 'C. J. Connick Dies: Glass Craftsman'', *The New York Times*, 29th December 1945, p. 13.

Anon, 'Irish Church Art Exhibit Opens at Ireland House', *The Tablet (Brooklyn, New York)*, 20th June 1959, p. 7.

Anon, 'Solemn Rites and Pageantry to Dominate Mary star Dedication', *San Pedro News Pilot*, 27th August 1960, p. 1.

Anon, 'U.S. Market for Irish Stained Glass', *The Irish Times*, 24th December 1960, p. 11.

Anon, 'St Elizabeth Church to be Dedicated', *The Monitor*, 9th February 1963, p. 3.

Anon, 'St. Brigid's Celebrates Centennial', *The Monitor*, 17th May 1963, p. 7

Anon, 'Craftsmen in Glass', *The Irish Times,* 19th November 1963, p. 4.

Bodkin, Thomas, 'Mr Harry Clarke's New Windows', *The Irish Times*, 24th July 1923, p. 4.

Clarke, David, 'New Trend Forces Art Studio Out Of Business', *Irish Independent*, 21st February 1973.

Curran, Jerry, 'Irish Exhibit Clew to Boxers' Popularity', *Chicago Tribune*, 29th July 1933.

Dowling, William, 'Antiquated Training for Artists', *The Irish Times*, 27th January 1972, p. 15.

Dowling, William, 'Future of Stained Glass Industry', *The Irish Independent*, 5th June 1974, p. 12.

Folkart, Burt A., 'Led San Pedro Parish From 1946 to 1975', *Los Angeles Times,* 12th July 1986.

Fox, R. M. 'Pioneer in Irish Stained Glass', The Irish Press, 10th August 1966, p. 7.

Jewett, Eleanor, 'Many Interesting Paintings Now to Be Found in Various Buildings on the Grounds of a Century of Progress' *Chicago Tribune*, 6th August, 1933.

Mac Alla, 'Irish Stained Glass for Hollywood Church', *The Irish Press*, 15th June 1951, p. 4.

McCarthy, Kerry, 'The Church is Like Everyone Else Hit by Inflation', *Irish Independent*, 13th May 1974.

Rolleston, T. W., 'Progress in Ireland as Shown at the Fair', *Harper's Weekly*, Vol. 48 (1904), pp. 1707-1707.

Broadcasts

Bhreathnach Lynch, Sighle, *House of Art*, documentary broadcast on RTE Oireachtas TV, 26th February 2018.

Web Sources

Irish America

Byrne, Julie, *Roman Catholics and the American Mainstream in the Twentieth Century*, at http://nationalhumanitiescenter.org/tserve/twenty/tkeyinfo/tmainstr.htm accessed 3rd April 2020.

Byrne, Julie *Roman Catholics and Immigration in Nineteenth-Century America*, accessed at http://nationalhumanitiescenter.org/tserve/nineteen/nkeyinfo/nromcath.htm accessed 3rd April 2020.

California Government Department of Finance statistics published at http://www.dof.ca.gov/Reports/Demographic_Reports/documents/2010-1850_STCO_IncCities-FINAL.xls accessed on 16th August 2021.

California population statistics based on census data published at http://www.laalmanac.com/population/po02.php accessed on 16th August 2021.

Doorley, Michael, *The Friends of Irish Freedom: a case-study in Irish-American nationalism, 1916–20,* published on line at

https://www.historyireland.com/20th-century-contemporary-history/the-friends-of-irish-freedom-a-case-study-in-irish-american-nationalism-1916-21/, accessed 3rd April 2020.

Gimeno family history at https://npgallery.nps.gov/GetAsset/b0af08cd-f711-451c-a93c-0af6f49cd580 accessed on 5th February 2020.

History of Los Angeles at http://www.laalmanac.com/population/po02.php accessed on 5th February 2020.

Los Angeles statistics at http://www.laalmanac.com/population/po02.php accessed on 5th February 2020.

Miller, Kerby Miller *"Heirs of Freedom" or "Slaves to England"* at https://www.researchgate.net/publication/339282229_Heirs_of_Freedom_or_Slaves_to_England_Protestant_Society_and_Unionist_Hegemony_in_Nineteenth-Century_Ulster

Sheen, Bishop Fulton biographical information on https://www.sheencenter.org/about-archbishop-fulton-j-sheen/ accessed on 5th May 2020.

Sövik, Edward biographical information at https://wp.stolaf.edu/news/retired-art-professor-campus-architect-edward-sovik-dies

U.S. Census Data from https://www2.census.gov/ accessed on 12th February 2019).

U.S. inflation calculator at https://www.officialdata.org/

Stained Glass

Clarke, Joshua biographical note at http://www.dia.ie/architects/view/1054/CLARKE,+JOSHUA+* accessed 25th January 2021.

Clokey Studios Archive information at https://www.rascal.ac.uk/institutions/northern-ireland-environment-agency-built-heritage/clokey-collection-stained-glass accessed 20th November 2022.

Connick, Charles Studios history at https://www.cjconnick.org/studio-history accessed 13th September 2021.

Gunning Family Tree, at http://jillgilmerfamilytree.blogspot.com/2015/04/ancestor-profile-gunning-family-part-one.html accessed 11th December 2020.

Harry Clarke Studios Archive demonstrator project for the Digital Repository of Ireland at https://dri.ie/demonstrator-projects/harry-clarke-studios-archive, accessed 4th January 2022.

Harry Clarke Studios Business Archive, at http://digitalcollections.tcd.ie/ , accessed frequently.

Irish Cost inflation calculator at https://www.cso.ie/en/interactivezone/visualisationtools/cpiinflationcalculator/

Judson Studios history at https://judsonstudios.com/

Loire, Gabriel work at https://www.ateliers-loire.fr/en/references-stainded-glasses.php?reset=1 accessed 1st May 2021.

Stained Glass Association of America at http://stainedglass.org/history-of-the-sgaa/

Tierney, Joseph biography at http://www.nival.ie/collections/artists-database/view/artist/name/tierney-joseph/

Welsh stained glass artists biographies published online at http://stainedglass.llgc.org.uk/person/441 accessed 2nd April 2021.

Catholicism

Biography of Rev. Paul Cullen at https://dublindiocese.ie/paul-cullen-1852-1878/ accessed on 12th November 2022.

Catechism of the Catholic Church at https://www.vatican.va/archive/ccc_css/archive/catechism/p123a9p6.htm accessed on 22nd March 2021.

Code of Canon Law of the Catholic Church, at https://www.vatican.va/archive/cod-iuris-canonici/eng/documents/cic_lib2-cann460-572_en.html#CHAPTER_VIDouai-Rheims Bible at https://www.drbo.org/index.htm accessed on 5th December 2022.

The Holy Bible: New International Version, at https://www.biblegateway.com/

Parish Histories

All Hallows Annuals at https://allhallows.ie/missionary-college/publications/

Knights of Columbus history at http://www.kofc1740a.org/images/1740History_030516.pdf

Sacramento Diocese archive records at https://www.scd.org/archives

Sacred Heart Parish History (Sacramento), at https://sacredheart.church/parish-history accessed 29th January 2021.

St Monica parish history at http://smstaparishsf.org/about/history/

St Timothy parish history at https://sttimothyla.org/history-artwork

World's Fairs

St Louis Universal Exposition of 1904 report at
https://mdh.contentdm.oclc.org/digital/collection/expo/id/4

Irish Industrial Exhibition World's Fair St Louis 1904 Handbook Part II at
https://dl.mospace.umsystem.edu/mu/islandora/object/mu%3A32289#page/1/mode/2up

World's Fair 1939: Hearings Before the United States House Committee on Foreign Affairs, Seventy-Fifth Congress, First Session, on Mar. 23, 1937 at
https://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=umn.31951d02091973p&view=1up&seq=18
accessed on 3rd July, 2020.

Dail debate 22nd February 1940 at
https://www.oireachtas.ie/en/debates/debate/dail/1940-02-22/14/.

Irish foreign policy documents relating to York World's Fair: Participation at
https://www.difp.ie/docs/Volume6/1940/3130.htm,

New York World's Fair records at https://digitalcollections.nypl.org/collections/new-york-worlds-fair-1939-1940-records#/?tab=navigation

Other

Biographical information at

https://www.ancestry.com/

https://www.findagrave.com/

Library of archived published texts at

https://archive.org/

Newspaper Publications at

https://www.newspapers.com/