

# Some Practical Considerations

By JOHN GOGARTY

## HISTORICAL FACTORS

Obviously goes back to the 19th Century when women were entering manufacturing industry and commerce in increasing numbers. Given particular stimulus during 1914-1918 war as very large numbers of women moved into industry and commerce in the U.K. and other European countries. Became matter of public discussion in 1919 in the U.K.—Royal Commission at that time—

Economic factors certainly indicate more pressure on equal pay in times of full-employment rather than during depression.

Certainly, one main-spring has been the protection of men's earnings but also cultural and political considerations involved.

For example, in 1918 a minimum wage for all occupations regardless of sex was decreed in 1918 in the U.S.S.R. and reinforced in 1936.

In U.S.A. Michigan State had Equal Pay Act in 1919. Also Montana. France 1937—people employed on Government Contracts.

I.L.O.—General Principle of 1919—re-affirmed in 1928.

Declaration of Human Rights and Declaration on the Elimination of Discrimination against women—General Assembly 1948.

June 1951 I.L.O. Convention No. 100 began the task of defining "Equal Pay". The convention was ratified by over 70 countries including E.E.C., U.K. and E.F.T.A., but not by the Republic of Ireland on the grounds that trends should be observed in collective bargaining.

Worth mentioning here that Article 41 Paragraphs 1 and 2 of the Republic Constitution are to some extent contrary to the philosophy of equal pay. Article 45 also has some bearing on the matter.

*European Social Charter* adopted by the Council of Europe 1961.

Article 4 provides for Equal Pay—this paragraph not ratified by Ireland. *E.E.C. Treaty of Rome* Article 119.

## BRITISH—EQUAL PAY ACT 1970

Consequences of Equal Pay to different countries and communities varies:

1. Constant areas of high employment with areas of unemployment.
2. Type and structure of industry and other economic activity.
3. Percentage of women in work force.
4. General Cultural considerations.

For example, the Lake Dwelling Tchambuli.\* (Paper A).

Also involved are the prevailing social attitudes of the community. These attitudes may be determined by deep and traditional cultural influences or simply as a result of existing circumstances.

For example, in Ireland last year a research project was commissioned by the Economic and Social Research Institute and undertaken with the help of Edinburgh University, which revealed that among a valid sample of male wage and salary earners that not only should there be an income differentiation between men and women, but also between married and single men! While the Republic of Ireland may be thought to be a special case, I suspect that a similar survey in certain regions of the U.K. might well produce a similar result. Similarly, even in a community there will be a wide range of attitudes to equal pay—I give two examples below:—

A letter in a recent D.A.T.A. Journal—presumably from a draughtsman, the general purport of the letter was that:

- (a) A married couple working push up the cost of living!
- (b) Income of joint couple falls when family arrives, some embarrassment, and husband sends wife back to work, as soon as possible, at expense of children, to restore previous affluence.
- (c) The affluence of the married couple working causes them to postpone marriage and children suffer from older parents, etc.
- (d) Married women returning to work for “luxuries” as against current male redundancies and unemployment.
- (e) Spinsters, divorcees, women who support a husband—these should be *allowed* to work and receive equal pay.
- (f) Goes on to say if women do not receive equal pay they will be *used* as cheap labour in place of men. Spinsters could be *used* in this manner.
- (g) Married women, with employed husbands, should be *allowed* to work by Union until all efforts have been used to employ male labour and spinsters, divorcees and married women with a dependent husband.

On the other hand a lady, one Leonora Lloyd of the National Joint Action Committee for Women’s Equal Rights, writing in the *Union Voice* declares that women must be economically free, that women should not be dependant on one man, and tied to home and family, and says that there should be an unconditional right to work for all adults. Right to do all jobs open to men and women. Equality of pay and promotion. Full pay during maternity and nursing with no loss of status. Her solution is shorter hours for all to take care of children and re-organise housework!

I have spent some time on cultural and sociological aspects of the problem as it seems to me that an *effective* equal pay policy is likely to be determined by social attitudes rather than by legislation or the supervision of collective bargaining.

For example, in third quarter of 1969 a survey was conducted by the E.E.F. (Coventry District) of Women’s Earnings as a percentage of men’s in the metal trades (excluding steel manufacture) of the position in Belgium, Netherlands, Norway, Sweden and U.K. (two E.E.C. countries—Belgium and Netherlands—the remainder).

Belgium	Netherlands	Norway	Sweden	United Kingdom	[Ireland 56%]
74.6%	80.3%	80.6%	84.9%	60%	56%

Notice the then position of women—worse in E.E.C. countries than in Norway and Sweden.

About the same time an O.E.C.D. mission to France, Germany and Netherlands concluded in France and Germany, where acceptance of equal pay principle more advanced; the implementation of equal pay has been primarily confined to the terms of collective agreements. The Report stated the introduction of equal pay had not, however, been so effective at the level of the individual, as it was accepted in both countries that employers would generally try to find excuses to pay a man more than a woman for comparable work—maintenance of prejudice. Reference to Table 1\* shows the participation rate of 35.2% or women were 25.8% of employed population as opposed to:—Canada 39.6%; U.S.A. 47.1%; Belgium 29.4%; Germany 47.1%; Sweden 57%; U.K. 51.6%.

**THESE TABLES ARE TAKEN FROM THE INTERIM REPORT ON EQUAL PAY—COMMISSION ON THE STATUS OF WOMEN, AUGUST 1971**

It might be thought that this lower participation rate indicated less of a problem but this may not be the case due to distribution of women in industry and commerce and age structure characteristics.

*Table 2 shows age structure in Ireland*

The biggest percentage being between ages 14-30, whereas in the U.K. the biggest percentage is the 40-50 age group. It could be that equal pay is now a more acceptable concept with this age structure than with the Irish—particularly where it would not be expected that younger women should receive the same pay as older men.

*Table 3* shows the percentage of single, married and divorced women in employment. In Ireland 81.4% were single, 8.9% married and 9.7% widowed.

In U.K. in 1968, 45% were single and 55% married. Again this wide difference between the percentage of married women is bound to affect social attitudes to equal pay.

*Table 4* shows the percentage of women in different types of industry and it will be seen that the Professions (60%), Personal Services (75.0%) and Entertainment and Sport (42.1%) are in the forefront. Again, compared with the U.K., 65.5% were in manufacturing generally and 34.5% in the professions, personal services, etc.

*Table 5* shows the occupations of women in Ireland and this clearly indicates that there may be complete occupational groups where equal pay may not be a significant matter.

In U.K. 30% of women are in clerical work etc., 11.7% in professional staff in medical and educational work and 10.7% in Sales Staff and 24% in manual occupations.

*Table 6* shows the women's earnings as a percentage of men's for various industries. It is at this point that I would like to depart from statistics . . .

In summary, we have seen that the demand for equal pay has come as a result of an increasing number of women entering the work force. That equal pay is a protection for men's wages. Probably also the impetus for equal pay has come from the progressive and, in the main, middle-class professional women.

More recently the word "discrimination" has become fashionable and, of course, "discrimination" is a function of majority/minority status—there are, of course, other minority groups—Pensioners, the Disabled, etc.

More importantly, it is increasingly apparent that all sections of the community have a reasonable expectation to share in the improving standard of living of the community.

Equal pay is also related to the problem of low pay in which the whole of the working population has an interest.

I believe, for the reasons I have given, that the problems of equal pay, particularly at establishment level, are likely to be concerned with sociological and psychological issues as much as traditional problems of differentials and other more material issues.

I would therefore suggest that the avoidance of disputes in relation to equal pay and their solution may have to be by methods different to those to which we are accustomed (Attitude Surveys, etc.).

The problems of implementing equal pay cannot be seen simply as a matter of negotiations about wages but rather, a matter which will have a profound effect on the total range of personnel policies and procedures, including recruitment, selection, training and re-training, wage and salary structure, incentives, (monetary and otherwise), promotion policies, job analysis, work measurement and employee services, and domestic disputes procedures. I would like to return to these matters again.

I would suggest that Management devise an Equal Pay Policy under the following headings:—

#### EQUAL PAY POLICY—PAPER B

1. *Analysis*  
Understanding the issues. Identifying the broad problems and the opportunities. (Equal pay permits opportunities as well as liabilities.)
2. *Assembling the Facts*
  - i The Legal Requirements
  - ii Environment Research
  - iii The Industry Position Appraisal
  - iv The Company or Establishment Situation:—
    - (a) Costs
    - (b) Management Organisation and Executive Control
    - (c) Establishment Review Check list. (Paper C.)
3. *Determining the Policy and Formulating Objectives*  
Utilisation of women. Policy determined from Analysis and Assembled

facts. Determining and Controlling change. Securing and maintaining a realistic pace. Obtaining co-operation.

4. *Finally, Creation of the Action Plan*

Primarily a domestic problem, total management problem, preparation and training of management and supervision, industrial relations strategy, securing agreement.

## I ANALYSIS

Limited to purely "application issues"—many others—understanding the issues—the need for a "re-think". Traditional attitudes—as shown by the D.A.T.A. letter; men undertaking "heavy" work, women conventionally undertaking "fine" or "assembly" work—male watchmakers, toolmakers—multi-stage tools. Printing—a male preserve. Question why are women and/or men employed on certain types and categories of work? Women employed in certain departments. Why no male tracers, for example? T.U. Demarcation—for example. Construction Industry. Equal pay and Equal opportunity are, of course, related. Apprenticeship, Training, Staff Development implications—Equal Pay and related Low Pay.

The key question to be asked is "With Equal Pay (and for other valid reasons as well) is how the skills, abilities, aptitudes of individual women may be more (a) effectively identified; (b) utilised; (c) developed?"

### *Note*

Restricted selection techniques for women operatives. I say individual women because much of the literature tends to refer to women generally, and unless we remind ourselves that women are individual human beings the opportunity of greater utilisation will be lost and personnel management practice set back by years. This change of attitude will stimulate a further question. What changes are necessary in the job environment and work organisation to enable this greater utilisation of women's skills? In other words a "re-think" about our own attitudes and assumptions and even prejudices.

## II ASSEMBLING THE FACTS

### i *The Legal Requirement*

We know the recommendation comes into force as from 1977. No time to go into details but point out some difficulties.

1. What is Job Evaluation? Defined in Equal Pay Report of the Commission on Status of Women but well known that there are Job Evaluation Schemes of the most primitive kind. Some existing Job Evaluation schemes have built in discrimination as Trade Unions will be quick to point out. Some schemes may require a careful vetting.

2. Right of men to Equal Treatment with women—Number of firms make special provisions for women in terms of discipline, lateness, arrangement of bonus, etc.
3. Area of Comparison creates problems for Management Organisation and Executive Control.
4. Comparison between establishments, and associated employers, where terms and conditions of employment are common? What are the terms and conditions? The existence of a common collective Agreement. Possession or access to a common Contract of Employment?  
For example, in a factory, men and women may be employed on exactly the same task. This production may be concerned with a consumer article subject to demand fluctuation—the men give an undertaking on recruitment that they will undertake shift working if required. Not enforceable—statement of intent. Is this comparable even if job evaluated?
5. *Collective Agreements*—rate specifically for women in a particular category may be required. Women's rate of pay connected to level of lowest men's rates.
6. *Definitions*—problems of loose definitions—skilled, semi-skilled, unskilled.
7. *Tribunals*—keep away from the Law. A single Tribunal decision could upset wages structure.
8. In the U.K. the exceptions—Pensions, Marriage, Death, etc. The key area for implementation is the immediate work situation, and that is where the comparisons will take place.

## ENVIRONMENTAL RESEARCH

### ii *Environmental Research*

Effect of equal pay on local labour market, rates of progress towards equal pay by adjacent companies and industries. Current position *vis-a-vis* equal pay in adjacent companies and industries. The "end point" of equal pay in terms of different and adjacent companies. Effect on the general local wage and salary structure. Will equal pay cause local escalation? Unemployment position now and projected. Regional Development Plan and Regional Manpower Studies. School Leavers, etc., etc. Industry Manpower Studies.

### iii *Industry Position and Appraisal*

Position of Current National Agreements. The British C.B.I. have stated that industry wide agreements should be modified so that women's rates will not be increased more than necessary to provide equal pay for same or broadly similar work. This means basing the structure of jobs and rates on job content rather than sex. Adult age higher than 18—problems of apprenticeships and other training schemes.

In Britain:—Engineering Adult rate 21 Women, 20 Men.

Differences between firms' practices and agreements.

Problems of the Broad Definitions—Skilled, Semi-Skilled, Unskilled, "other workers".

If rates based on job content and precise definitions rather than sex, the problem of raising female rate to male minimum rate irrespective of job by 1977 is avoided. C.B.I. states Job Evaluation not appropriate at industry level, some exceptions e.g. Cable Making. Job Descriptions and Classifications recommended. Need for a common Terminology.

National Agreements may provide list of jobs within the broad categories and attach them to agreements.

Low cost employers should not travel too fast as they set precedent for others; on the other hand delay may mean more cost in the long run. If National Agreements, which discriminate between men and women, have to be amended by 1977. This could mean that in practical effect women will be paid the male minimum rate irrespective of the job they are doing so long as they are capable, unless the problem tackled beforehand. This poses the problem at Establishment level, the need to work out precise job classifications, and descriptions. In the U.K. the E.E.F. are currently advising member firms on practical implementation. In some industries—Groceries, Biscuit Making for example, equal pay issues largely settled at Industry level.

#### iv *The Company or Establishment Situation*

(a) Costs—knowing the development at industry level and others and taking account of the environment and other factors—the first task at establishment level is to create or update the Forward Manpower Plan bearing in mind the application of equal pay and its consequent productivity/cost effects. Future costs are extremely difficult to predict.

The Commission on the Status of Women asked the Economic and Social Research Institute to investigate the cost of equal pay to a sample of firms in the private sector and this survey gave a broad percentage increase in the range of 5.3 to 8%.\*

Calculating the possible costs is a very complex task, particularly when overheads, e.g. social welfare payments etc. are taken into account. Additionally equal pay may well produce a "spin-off" effect in that men will be seeking a variety of ways to maintain their male differential.

In one Midlands Engineering Company the estimate is that women's rates have to be doubled. Reason is that under engineering agreement, women's rates very common but men have very wide differentials. In Phillips (U.K.) 25% more increase to women over men over 5 years, i.e. 4 or 5% more to women per annum. At establishment level, there can be a review of the Manpower Plan and likely increased costs without doing much more, but this would be short-sighted.

*The Company View and Management Organisation*

(b) Reference to existing legislation in U.K. and North of Ireland indicates that by establishing the right of the individual women to equal treatment when she is employed

- (a) On work of the same or broadly similar nature to that of men;
- (b) in a job though different to men, has been given an equal value to men's jobs under a job evaluation exercise.

This produces the problem of comparisons and comparisons may be made:—

- (a) Within an establishment
- (b) Between establishments of the same company
- (c) Between establishments of associated companies (subject to certain conditions).

Under these conditions, depending upon existing agreements, a positive decision has to be made on the implementation of equal pay at "group level" or at company or individual establishment level. Management must decide (or be told) where the main policy decisions will be taken and at what level negotiations will take place.

*Avoiding conflict between Industry, Company and Plant Requirements*

There appear to be potentially serious difficulties as between the genuine needs and policies determined at industry, company and plant level, and it seems important that at an early date these difficulties be identified, and if possible remedied. Clearly, the possibility exists of some employees in a high wage area seriously influencing employees of the same company in a relatively low cost area of industrial action at one establishment securing improvements in the equal pay area which would similarly affect other establishments or even other employers.

Having cleared the management lines, we may now proceed with the Establishment Review Check list.

**ESTABLISHMENT REVIEW CHECK LIST**

1. How might female labour be more effectively utilised in the broadest sense?
2. Analysis of those women (a) qualifying for equal pay; (b) the size of gap between those females and males with whom they may compare themselves; (c) likely Union pressures.
3. Phasing—Reconciliation of National Agreement requirements and local manning needs e.g. some females will require higher percentage increases than men—related to problem of differentials.
4. Handling of claims, or concessions on process time, fatigue or other allowances, full back rates, guarantees, etc., which give an advantage to women. Result may be to bring men into line by date of implementation.

5. Tackling problems of Job Definitions, Classifications, etc. For example, Equal Pay on same Job Title could create problems.
6. Recognition of likely consequential claims to maintain differentials:—the importance of the minimum domestic unskilled rate. For example, overtime rates, shift premiums, condition payments, long service anomalies.
7. Traditional relations between women where only some qualify under equal pay.
8. Relationship with other local employers and danger of negotiated comparisons.
9. Identify those female workers who are “unique” and those who are in the “grey areas”.
10. The problem of the Adult Rate in its fullest sense.
11. Segregation of females on certain tasks e.g. Tracers—doubtful benefit. Shops—Trainee Managers and Assistants.
12. Review existing range of Personnel Policies and Procedures.
13. Review of existing domestic consultative and dispute procedures.
14. Analysis of the factors involved in the *Environmental Appraisal* Labour Sources, Recruitment, Unemployment situation, etc., etc.
15. Analysis of such matters as Labour Turnover, Absenteeism, Lateness, need for shift work, part time employees (as equal pay develops, part-time employment will become increasingly attractive)—see tables.
16. Relative comparisons between male and female unit costs of production
17. Comparisons, where possible, of relative efficiencies.
18. Pattern of Trade Union membership, role of Shop Stewards, male or female.
19. In short all the elements concerning improvement in productivity must be considered.

Formulating the objectives will not simply be a matter of pay structures. It will involve taking into account over a planned period of time, most or all of the elements that have been suggested—and probably more.

The Primary Objectives are:—

1. The greater utilisation of women;
2. Determining and controlling change; and
3. Securing and maintaining a realistic pace in the implementation of equal pay.
4. Obtaining co-operation.

#### CREATION OF THE ACTION PLAN

The key aspects of the Action Plan are the following:

1. Recognition that the Problem of Implementation is primarily a matter for domestic solution—with the constraints mentioned earlier.

2. The involvement of all the appropriate management functions, perhaps on a critical path basis.
3. The preparation and training of Management and Supervision to assist in the process of change and to accomplish changes of attitudes in Management and Supervision.
4. To implement Equal Pay in terms of the existing total Industrial Relations situation as an integrated element of the industrial relations strategy.
5. Finally, and because it is the most important, is securing the co-operation of the employees and their union representatives. If it is agreed that the union problem of implementation is at shop floor level, it is to this end that the maximum attention should be given. I would recommend the fullest involvement of local (domestic) union representation.

The relevant background facts for the environmental appraisal, the Industry position, and the company policy and action should be fully discussed with the Trade Unions' representation.

The implementation will only come to successful conclusion if much time is spent on changing existing attitudes.

I would therefore suggest that:—

#### *Steps to be taken with Domestic Unions*

1. The existing consultative machinery be jointly examined to see if it is capable of handling the problem of implementation of equal pay.
2. This involves the Joint Examination of existing domestic management/Union procedures.
3. The creation, perhaps, of a special Joint Management Union Committee to assist in the programme.
4. Make available all relevant literature, even I.L.O. Convention Reports. (There are some interesting Egyptian cases).
5. Discuss the industry and company implications including equal opportunity—on the basis of the manpower planning.
6. Take account of environment circumstances, joint discussion on local employment level, market for labour, social problems (if any).
7. Agree the approach—further job analysis—job evaluation etc.—careful scrutiny of any new jobs to be filled or created. In many companies Union agreement needed to do this.
8. Try to secure agreement on steps to be taken to avoid premature settlements which will create further difficulties, and agree priorities.
9. Discuss costs, productivity, performance levels, and if needs be, effect on profitability.
10. Review working arrangements, part-timers, hours of work, shift working, etc.
11. Effects on Recruitment, Training, Incentive Schemes, Promotion Policies, Redundancy Procedures, Fringe Benefits.
12. Encourage female shop stewards to be elected.

## SUMMARISES—PAPER C

Finally, the programme for implementation of Equal Pay emphasises the contention that industrial change and negotiations are part of a general continuum and today's negotiations are influenced by what has gone before and create the situation for the future. The impact of equal pay implementation will continue long after the legislation that brings it into being.

TABLE 1

MEN AND WOMEN IN THE LABOUR FORCE 1946 AND 1966:  
(ROUNDED TO NEAREST 1,000)

	1946		1966	
	Males	Females	Males	Females
Labour Force ... ..	964,000	335,000	829,000	289,000
Percentage of Total Labour Force	74.2%	25.8%	74.2%	25.8%
Population in age group 15-64	920,000	897,000	840,000	821,000
Labour Force Participation Rate*	104.8%	37.3%	98.7%	35.2%

\*By participation rate is meant the total male (or female) labour force expressed as a percentage of the male (or female) population aged 15-64. Since the total labour force can exceed the total population in the age-group 15-64, the participation rate may exceed 100%.

TABLE 2

WOMEN IN THE LABOUR FORCE BY AGE GROUP  
(ROUNDED TO NEAREST 100)

Age Group	Number		Percentage of total		Percentage of total number of women in age group	
	1946	1966	1946	1966	1946	1966
14-19	67,800	71,300	20.2	24.7	45.6	46.6
20-24	68,900	60,500	20.6	20.9	60.8	66.8
25-29	43,400	26,400	13.0	9.1	41.8	35.6
30-34	27,100	16,200	8.1	5.6	26.8	22.2
35-39	20,900	14,800	6.2	5.1	22.1	19.0
40-44	16,500	14,700	4.9	5.1	20.3	17.9
45-54	32,600	33,100	9.7	11.4	21.2	20.2
55-64	27,800	29,200	8.3	10.1	22.0	21.8
65 and over	29,800	22,900	8.9	7.9	18.7	13.2

TABLE 3  
MARITAL STATUS OF WOMEN IN THE LABOUR FORCE IN 1946  
AND 1966 (ROUNDED TO NEAREST 100)

Marital status	Number gainfully occupied		Percentage of total		Number gainfully occupied as a percentage of the total number aged 15-64 in each category	
	1946	1966	1946	1966	1946	1966
Single	269,200	235,400	80.4	81.4	61.6	70.0
Married	22,600	25,800	6.8	8.9	5.6	5.9
Widowed	43,000	27,900	12.8	9.7	77.4	62.4

TABLE 4  
WOMEN AT WORK BY INDUSTRIAL GROUP, 1966  
(ROUNDED TO NEAREST 100)

Industrial Group	Number	Women as percentage of the total number at work in the Industrial Group
Agriculture ... ..	33,100	10.0
Manufacturing Industry ... ..	63,100	31.0
Professions ... ..	56,200	59.9
Commerce ... ..	49,700	33.1
Personal Service ... ..	47,300	75.0
Public Administration and Defence	9,400	21.8
Transport, Communication and Storage ... ..	8,300	14.5
Insurance, Banking and Finance	5,600	34.9
Entertainment and Sport ... ..	4,700	42.1
Other Industries ... ..	3,300	3.2

TABLE 5  
MAIN OCCUPATIONS OF WOMEN EMPLOYEES IN 1966  
(ROUNDED TO NEAREST 100)

Occupation	Number of Women	Women as percentage of total number of employees in each occupation listed
Clerks and Typists ... ..	54,600	61.8
Producers, Makers and Repairers (excluding agricultural occupations) ... ..	39,900	21.4
Maids and Related Workers ... ..	22,900	95.9
Shop Assistants ... ..	22,100	59.8
Nuns* ... ..	13,400	100.0
Teachers ... ..	11,600	60.9
Nurses ... ..	9,800	82.8
Packers ... ..	7,800	74.5
Housekeepers, etc. ... ..	6,500	99.6
Waiters and Waitresses ... ..	5,000	79.5
Other Occupations ... ..	28,400	14.5

TABLE 6  
AVERAGE HOURLY EARNINGS OF MEN AND WOMEN INDUSTRIAL  
WORKERS—DECEMBER 1970

Industry	Number of Industrial workers on adult rates of pay		Average Hourly Earnings		Women's earnings as percentage of men's
	Men (000)	Women (000)	Men p	Women p	Percentage
<b>Food:</b>					
Bacon factories	2.7	0.8	48.6	29.9	61.5
Canning of fruit and vegetables and manufacture of preserves, etc.	1.6	1.7	48.5	29.8	61.4
Bread, biscuit and flour confectionery	5.0	2.4	53.4	34.2	64.0
Cocoa, chocolate and sugar confectionery	1.3	2.5	58.3	33.8	58.0
<b>Textiles:</b>					
Woolen and worsted	3.5	2.6	49.4	29.5	59.7
Linen and cotton, spinning, weaving, etc.	1.6	0.7	51.0	31.6	62.0
Jute, canvas, rayon, etc.	2.1	0.9	49.4	28.0	56.7
Hosiery	2.1	3.9	53.4	27.8	52.1
<b>Clothing:</b>					
Men's and Boys' Shirtmaking	0.8	2.4	57.7	33.9	58.8
Women's and Girls' Miscellaneous	0.2	1.6	45.5	28.6	62.9
	0.8	4.3	49.1	30.4	61.9
	0.1	0.5	50.2	26.3	52.4
<b>Other Manufacturing Industries:</b>					
Boot and Shoe (wholesale factories)	1.8	1.9	52.8	33.3	63.1
Tobacco	0.7	0.7	65.6	39.9	60.8
Manufacture of paper and paper products	2.7	1.2	57.1	31.9	55.9
Printing, publishing and allied trades	4.9	1.5	69.3	33.5	48.3
Chemicals and drugs	0.8	0.9	52.2	28.2	54.0
Glass and glassware, pottery, etc.	2.5	0.7	55.5	28.1	50.6
Metal trades	8.0	1.0	54.1	27.7	51.2
Manufacture of electrical machinery, etc.	3.4	3.6	53.6	29.2	54.5

(These figures and those contained in Table 7 are estimates based on information obtained in the Quarterly Industrial Inquiry which carried out on a sample basis and are subject to possible revision.)

TABLE 7

THE EFFECTS OF EQUAL PAY ON SECTOR PRICES AND ON THE  
GENERAL LEVEL OF PRICES

## 1. SECTOR PRICES

The effects of equal pay on sector prices assuming no reduction in female employment and no increase in female labour productivity over a five year phasing period:

Sector	(i) Annual Prices Increase over a Five Year Period	(ii) Cumulative Five Year Total Increase
	%	%
Food ... ..	0.21	1.07
Drink/Tobacco ... ..	0.30	1.51
Textiles (excl. Hosiery) ... ..	0.61	3.04
Hosiery/Clothing/Shoes/Leather ...	1.34	6.69
Wood/Furniture ... ..	0.22	1.11
Paper/Printing ... ..	0.54	2.73
Chemicals ... ..	0.21	1.05
Clay/Glass/Cement ... ..	0.17	0.88
Metals/Engineering/Vehicles ... ..	0.21	1.04
Other Manufactures ... ..	0.19	0.95

THE LAKE-DWELLING TCHAMBULI—PAPER A

The Tchambuli people, who number only six hundred in all, have built their houses along the edge of one of the loveliest of New Guinea lakes, which gleams like polished ebony, with a back-drop of the distant hills behind which the Arapesh live. In the lake are purple lotus and great pink and white water lilies, white osprey and blue heron. Here the Tchambuli women, brisk, unadorned, managing and industrious, fish and go to market; the men, decorative and adorned, carve and paint and practise dance-steps, their head-hunting tradition replaced by the simpler practise of buying victims to validate their manhood.

EQUAL PAY POLICY—PAPER B

1. *Analysis*

Understanding the issues. Identifying the broad problems and the opportunities. (Equal pay permits opportunities as well as liabilities.)

2. *Assembling the Facts*

- i The Legal Requirements
- ii Environment Research
- iii The Industry position and Appraisal
- iv The Company or Establishment Situation:—
  - (a) Costs
  - (b) Management Organisation and Executive Control
  - (c) Establishment Review Check List.

3. *Determining the Policy and Formulating Objectives*  
Utilisation of women. Policy determined from Analysis and Assembled facts. Determining and Controlling Change. Securing and maintaining a realistic pace. Obtaining co-operation.
4. *Creation of the Action Plan*  
Primarily a domestic problem, total management problem, preparation and training of management and supervision, industrial relations strategy, securing agreement.

#### EQUAL PAY STRATEGY - SOME GUIDE POINTERS—PAPER C

1. *Environment Research*  
Labour Market. Supply Education. Training Unemployment Position Social Attitudes Traditions Regional Manpower Plans Industrial Development Present Position of Adjucent Companies. Industries Rate of Pace towards Equal Pay by Adjucent Companies.
2. *The Law*  
Definitions, Company Structure, Exemptions, Development of Case Law, Role of Tribunals, Competence of Tribunals, Use of Industrial Court.
3. *Company Organization Analysis*  
Identifying Comparison and Negotiating Areas. Executive Responsibility, Group Co-ordination, Reconciliation of Plans and Company Needs, Analysis of Group Terms and Conditions of Employment, Review of Company or Group Manpower Policies.
4. *Industrial Appraisal*  
Current National Agreements National Agreements on Equal Pay, Agreements in respect of utilization and demarcation between men and women. Industrial Training Schemes. Costs. Application of different National Agreements Influencing National Negotiations. Known Future. Indicators Need for Information and co-ordination at Industry level.
5. *Position Review*  
Establishment Review Check List. Introduction or Establishment of Manpower Plan. Analysis of Labour Utilization. How far along the road to Equal Pay. The minimum male rate. Correct Wage/Salary Structure, Training and Re-training Capability, Statistics on Labour Turnover, Absenteeism, Sickness, etc. Relative efficiencies Unit costs, Analysis of existing job titles and grades—terminology. Need for review of job evaluation or further job analysis Identification of equal areas, grey areas, Segregation.
6. *Creating the Policy and Formulating Objectives*
7. *Framing the Action Plan*  
Management Organization and Involvement. Joint Consultation and Attitude Changing Negotiations as part of strategy. Agreed approach, Long term Implications.

## DISCUSSION

*Dr. Geary (communicated after the meeting):* As a member of the Committee of Independent Experts set up to review reports of governments adhering to the European Social Charter (promoted by the Council of Europe), I have evidence which may have some interest. The relevant paragraph of the Charter reads as follows:—

*Article 4, paragraph 3*

“With a view to ensuring the effective exercise of the right to a fair remuneration, the Contracting Parties undertake:

“to recognise the right of men and women workers to equal pay for work of equal value;

“... The exercise of [this right] shall be achieved by freely concluded collective agreements, by statutory wage-fixing machinery, or by other means appropriate to national conditions.”

Nine countries, including Ireland, have accepted the Charter, i.e. have bound themselves to conform with a specified minimum number of paragraphs of the Charter. The following information is derived from the first report of the Committee (“Conclusions II”) relating to the reports of the seven governments then accepting the Charter. The undertaking of the paragraph was not accepted by Denmark, Ireland or the United Kingdom.

The Committee takes the view that, if it is not possible for an accepting State to conform completely by collective agreements, it must take legal measures for fixation of salaries or otherwise, to satisfy the Committee as to conformity. The Charter goes further than Convention No. 100 of I.L.O. in this respect in that the Charter *recognises* a right whereas the Convention requires only that an accepting State should *promote* equal pay.

For a State to give effect to equal pay for work of equal value, comparisons and multiple and complex judgements, which may require modification in space and time, are required.

The Committee praised the efforts of the four accepting countries, Federal German Republic, Italy, Norway and Sweden, to achieve equal pay. However, in the Committee’s view, none of the four States conformed with the undertaking of the paragraph and each was the subject of a Recommendation to persevere in its efforts. This paragraph 4.3 is the only one in the Charter in which the Committee rejected *all* presumed acceptances, evidence, in my personal view, of the extreme practical difficulty of conforming with the ideal of equal pay rather than of a lack of disposition to do so. In fact, the general level of social services in some of the Charter countries is exemplary in scope and depth in most other respects.

The following comment is also my own. Comparisons of average pay within industry and *a fortiori* at the national level prove nothing. However, international comparisons show Ireland as low in the ratio women’s to men’s earnings per head and these comparisons are significant of injustice to women in Ireland. Towards improvement, unions and the State ensure

that in every collective agreement in future involving women, the percentage rise in women's pay should systematically exceed that of men. In agreements concerning women only, the percentages should exceed those generally recognised for men. The differences between male and female percentages should be small, for large differences, at a single step, as Dr. Walsh and Mr. Geary have pointed out, might be inimical to women's employment prospects. In time, a more equitable ratio would thereby be attained without harming women's employment situation. This proposal is simple, indeed self-evident. In Ireland we are far from the stage where regard must be had to those "multiple and complex judgments" referred to above.